Working together on Education for Sustainable Development

Proceedings of the International Conference
Bordeaux, 27-28-29, October 2008

French national Committee
United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development

by Michel RICARD
with the collaboration of Jacqueline DENIS-LEMPEREUR
Proceedings of the International Conference

Working together on Education for Sustainable Development

Bordeaux, 27 - 29 October 2008

by Michel RICARD,
with the collaboration of Jacqueline DENIS-LEMPEREUR

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27- 29, 2008
FOREWORD

The problems raised by the impact of human activity on the environment and their consequences on the future of our societies are ones to which the only satisfactory and sustainable answer lies in an improvement of our behaviour. This improvement calls for new initiatives in terms of educating citizens everywhere: established initially in school, the function of which is irreplaceable, education must be a lifelong concern, adjusted to the new issues facing our society in order to achieve the set objective: making sustainable development the very foundation of our actions.

In order for education to lead everybody to adopt new behaviours which are consistent with sustainable development, it is vital that these issues are clearly presented and their contents disseminated through concerted educational, training and informational initiatives geared to a wide variety of audiences.

A permanent, progressive, adaptable and multifaceted educational approach should therefore be promoted so that people of all ages are better able to assimilate information regarding environmental, socioeconomic and cultural issues and take on board the relevant logic and issues with a view to sustainable development. This education should be carried out in the long term, so that appropriation is both genuine and durable and so that our societies learn to take better care of our planet's resources and become more focused on fairness, equality and solidarity between individuals and generations alike.

Changes in behaviour cannot be made by decree or instantly assimilated. Raising awareness of sustainable development alone, however persistent it is, will not achieve the objective either.

Despite the need to act quickly in order for changes in behaviour which are consistent with sustainable development to be adopted rapidly, this education needs to be based on continuous, concerted efforts by all stakeholders and be implemented according to a strategy which has been established and adopted on a partnership basis. This also means that this approach needs to be continuously assessed, by means of specific indicators, in order to be able to identify progress clearly and adjust educational actions to changes in our societies.

For the last four years, the French Committee for the Decade has worked to implement the recommendations of the United Nations Decade. To this end, it has benefited from the support of institutional partners and also from the active involvement of local authorities, businesses and the private sector. As part of UNESCO, through the French Commission, or as a member of the steering committee of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE) which emerged from the Vilnius strategy, the French Committee has played an active role in all work and initiative related to the Decade.


The highest point of this first phase was the occurrence of the UNESCO world conference on Education for Sustainable Development "Moving into the Second Half of the UN Decade" held from March 31 to April 2, 2009 in Bonn, Germany. This world conference had four principal objectives:

- Demonstrating the essential contribution of ESD to education as a whole and to the construction of quality education;

"Working together on Education for Sustainable Development"
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
- Promoting international discussion of ESD;
- Establishing an initial assessment of the implementation of the Decade for ESD since its launch in 2005;
- Establishing strategies for the rest of the Decade through to 2014.

It is certain that France, through the French Committee for the Decade and the French UNESCO Commission, will continue to adopt a similarly proactive approach, thereby contributing to this Decade being a key means of leading all of us to harmonise our behaviours with the requirements of sustainable development.

Professor Michel RICARD
Université Michel de Montaigne - Bordeaux 3

***************
SUMMARY

FOREWORD

PROGRAMME OF THE CONFERENCE

ALLOCUTIONS

Michel RICARD, chairman of the French Committe on ESD

Alain JUPPÉ, former Prime minister, Mayor of Bordeaux

Alain ROUSSET, Member of Parliament, President of the Aquitaine region, Président of the Association of French Regions

Mark RICHMOND, director for the coordination of United Nations priorities in education, UNESCO

Andreas KARAMANOS, Professor, Athens University, chairman of the United Nations Decade for Education in sustainable Development

Elisabeth BITTNER, General Directorate for Education and Culture, European Commission

Tsunashige SHIROTORI, First secretary, Permanent delegation of Japon at UNESCO

Jean-Michel VALANTIN, high functionary, ministry of national Education

Alastair BLYTH, senior analyst, directorate for Education, Organisation for economic cooperation and development - OECD

Jean-Louis BERGEY, Regional delegate, French Environment and Energy management Agency (ADEME)

Roland GÉRARD, co-chair, Group for Environment and Sustainable Development Education (CFEEDD)

Hubert HÉMARD, Director of Marketing, Communications and Sustainable Development, Monoprix

Fatimata DIA TOURÉ, Director, Energy and Environment Institute for French-Speaking Communities (IEPF-OIF)

Jean-Louis ÉTIENNE, doctor and explorer

Patrick VIVERET, philosopher and political scientist

Michèle PAPPALARDO, High commissioner for sustainable development, ministry of ecology, energy, sustainable development and Town and country planning (MEEDDAT)

THEMATIC SESSIONS

- Session 1: Progress made and outlook for the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development in EU member countries

- Session 2: Placing teachers within an educational continuum which involves of other stakeholders, whether institutional or otherwise, who
contributes to a common socially-oriented project concerning SD

- **Session 3**: Education for Sustainable Development in the French-speaking world.

- **Session 4**: The role of the media in educating and informing about sustainable development

- **Session 5**: Teaching resources for Education for Sustainable Development: review of current resources and new schemes

- **Session 6**: Education for Sustainable Development in France: 2005-2008 stakeholder review and proposals for the second part of the Decade, 2009-2014

- **Session 7**: Regional coordination and implementation of Education for Sustainable Development: the example of the Aquitaine regional authorities

- **Session 8**: Education for Sustainable Development in the Euro-Mediterranean basin

- **Session 9**: Education for sustainable consumption and lifestyles

**SESSIONS SPÉCIALES**

- Raising public awareness

- ESD in the French-speaking world

**CLOSING PLENARY SESSION**

- Presentation of the final recommendations

**APPENDICES**

- **Appendix 1**: French companies and ESD: 2005-2008 assessment and proposals for 2009-2014 *(by Olivier CLASSIO "Des Enjeux et des Hommes")*

- **Appendix 2**: Thematic workshop on Education for Sustainable Consumption: Background paper *(by Dr. Fabienne PIERRE, UNEP)*
PROGRAMME OF THE CONFERENCE

Monday October 27, 2008

➤ Morning : Official Opening of Conference

Introduction :

Michel RICARD, President of the French Committee for the Decade

Allocations :

Alain JUPPÉ, former Prime Minister, Mayor of Bordeaux
Alain ROUSSET, MP, President of the Aquitaine region, Président of the Association of French Regions (ARF).
Mark RICHMOND, director for the coordination of United Nations priorities in education, UNESCO.
Andreas KARAMANOS, Professor, Athens University, Chairman of the United Nations Decade for Education in sustainable Development.
Elisabeth BITTNER, Directorate for Education and Culture, European Commission.
Tsunashige SHIROTORI, First secretary, Permanent delegation of Japan at UNESCO.
Jean-Michel VALANTIN, high functionary, ministry of national Education.
Alastair BLYTH, senior analyst, directorate for Education, Organisation for economic cooperation and development – OECD.
Jean-Louis BERGEY, Regional delegate, Environment and Energy Agency (ADEME).
Roland GÉRARD, co-chair "Collectif français pour l'éducation à l'environnement et au développement durable (CFEEDD)".
Hubert HÉMARD, Director of Marketing, Communications and Sustainable Development, Monoprix.
Fatimata DIA TOURÉ, Director, Energy and Environment Institute for French-Speaking Communities (IEPF-OIF).
(With the participation of Jean-Louis CAFFIER, Journalist)

➤ Afternoon : thematic sessions

• Session 1 :
Progress made and outlook for the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development in EU member countries

• Session 2 :
Placing teachers within an educational continuum which involves of other stakeholders, whether institutional or otherwise, who contribute to a common socially-oriented project concerning SD.

• Session 3 :
Education for Sustainable Development in the French-speaking world

• Session 4 :
The role of the media in educating and informing about sustainable development

• Session 5 :
Teaching resources for Education for Sustainable Development: review of current resources and new schemes.

• Side event :
Meeting for representatives from the Balkans, the Caucasus and the Carpathians.

➤ Evening : Informal event

Informal buffet featuring organic vegetables, cheeses from the Aquitaine region and Bordeaux wines (With the student brass band "Los Teoporos")

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
Tuesday October 28, 2008

**Morning : thematic sessions**

- **Session 6 (1st part):**

- **Session 7 (1st part):**
  Regional coordination and implementation of Education for Sustainable Development: the example of the Aquitaine regional authorities (part 1/2).

- **Session 8:**
  Education for sustainable development in the Euro-Mediterranean basin.

- **Session 9:**
  Education for sustainable consumption and lifestyles.

- **Side event:**
  Raising public awareness to sustainable development.

**Afternoon : thematic sessions**

- **Session 6 (2nd part):**

- **Session 7 (2nd part):**
  Regional coordination and implementation of Education for Sustainable Development: the example of the Aquitaine regional authorities (part 2/2).

**Evening : side event “ESD in the French-speaking world”**

Wednesday October 29, 2008

**Morning : communications orales et restitution des travaux en plénière**

- Oral presentations on ESDD
  - Education for Sustainable Development in schools.
  - Education for Sustainable Development in higher education.
  - The different facets of ESD in various parts of the world.

- Reports from the various sessions

**Afternoon : Closing plenary session**

- Presentation of the final recommendations of the conference
  Final Recommendations presented in the presence of various representatives of the state, local government, civil society and the private sector.

- Closing speeches
  Andreas KARAMANOS, Professor, Athens University, Chairman of the United Nations Decade for Education in sustainable Development
  Jean-Louis ÉTIENNE, doctor and explorer
  Patrick VIVERET, philosopher and political scientist
  Michèle PAPPALARDO, High commissioner for Sustainable Development, ministry of ecology, energy, sustainable development and town and country planning (MEEDDAT).

*******************
Introductory remarks

by

Michel RICARD

Chairman of the French Committee for the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development

Prime Minister and Mayor,
Honourable Member of Parliament, President of the Aquitaine Region,
The representative of the Director General of UNESCO,

Ladies and Gentlemen,

On behalf of the French Committee for the Decade, I am delighted to welcome you to this international Conference "Acting together for education for sustainable development". We have been meeting every two years since 2004, and since then, there has been an increasingly diverse variety of nations; 32 at the first meeting at the Paris Natural History Museum in 2004, 42 in 2006 at the UNESCO and 74 here today in Bordeaux. This broadening of international representation parallels the breadth of experts, who now represent all the stakeholders of Society; from the world of education of course, but also those who develop education, training and information for sustainable development from the private sector, local authorities and the world of business.

This Conference is particularly important in that it forms part of the discussion in France following on from the Grenelle environmental summit, at a time when France holds the EU presidency, two months before the international Form on education for sustainable development which is to be held in Japan in December 2008 and, above all, five months before the world half-way Conference on the United Nations Decade organised by Germany and UNESCO in Bonn, Germany at the end of March 2009.

During this Conference, there will be a number of reports illustrating the progress which has been made nationally and at the European and international levels. Firstly, an assessment of action by France and its stakeholders, the State, naturally, but also local authorities, business and the private sector including associations and NGOs. Secondly, an assessment of actions by European Union member states assisted by the ENSI network, members of the French-speaking world with the Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie and the IEPF, as well as the countries around the Mediterranean basin and other nations represented at this conference.

This is therefore a significant event, because as well as providing results about initiatives taken in terms of education, training and information for sustainable development during the 2005-2009 period, it will also make a certain number of proposals for the second half of the Decade from 2009 to 2014.

To conclude this brief introduction, I would like to underline the support of local authorities and businesses, without which this Conference would not have taken place. This support, along with that provided by the State and local government, illustrates the very real nature of synergies and co-operation between stakeholders as we progress to sustainable development involving all citizens everywhere in their daily lives, irrespective of the type of activity in which they are engaged.

The fact that we have representatives of all national stakeholders and, to a lesser degree, European and international stakeholders present here in Bordeaux, confirms the highly positive trend we have observed since the launch of the Decade: education for sustainable
development requires the mobilisation of all, increasingly committed to a partnership-based approach which aims to make sustainable development a reality.

Thank you for being here and for your active involvement in this conference. I invite you to join me again at the end of this event for the final plenary session which will include the final recommendations.

******************************************
Ladies and gentlemen,

Welcome to Bordeaux! Our City is delighted to welcome representatives from 76 Nations under the patronage of leading international organisations, in particular UNESCO, which is responsible for implementing the United Nations Decade for Education for Sustainable Development 2005-2015. I also wish to welcome the representatives from the United Nations, the OECD, and the European Union who are with us today. I would especially like to thank Professor Michel RICARD, Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade, who with his team has organised this major event.

Our local authorities, the Bordeaux City Council, the Metropolitan district, the Regional Council and the Aquitaine Département Council have been keen to support this initiative. They have met to prepare the workshops which will take place tomorrow and which will demonstrate their involvement in terms of education for sustainable development.

I am committed to this challenge on a personal level. Not a day goes by without us hearing about the financial and economic crisis, but this should not obscure the fact that in the shadow of this crisis which, like all crises, will come to an end some day, more fundamental changes are afoot which we need to face, particularly the environmental revolution which should lead us to a radical change in our modes of production, consumption and other behaviours.

The 21st century will either be that in which mankind is reconciled to the planet or that in which an increasing number of plant and animal species become extinct. Here in Bordeaux, Hubert Reeves has gone so far as to wonder whether the human race itself might not end up on the list of extinct species A response on our part is therefore necessary - as a famous native of Bordeaux, Jacques Ellul, would say, thinking globally to act locally.

Major international institutions and international agreements take place at a global level, but there is also mobilisation on the part of nations; we are once again discovering that they have a major role to play. I am particularly pleased to note that the Grenelle environmental summit in France, launched in 2007 when I was the least sustainable Minister for Sustainable Development, produced a virtually unanimous vote in the French National Assembly on a foundational text which I hope to see completed by a law implementing appropriate resources. As part of these measures, I attach particular importance to everything relating to renovation of existing housing, a subject which is of particular interest to mayors.

Acting locally is something that happens at the level of towns and cities, which are highly involved in this struggle. 50% of the world's population today live in cities, and 80% live in developing countries. Abdou DIOUF, the General Secretary of the International Francophone Organisation, said last week in Quebec that the 21st century would be an urban century. This places cities on the front line and means that they must act.

Here in Bordeaux and in our Metropolitan District, we have taken action by addressing one of the principal sources of greenhouse gas emissions - transport. We have developed a mass transit policy which is acclaimed as a success, with a tramway which extends for 45km and which will be extended in the years to come. What is more, we also encourage soft-mode travel, which means that there are plenty of bicycles in the streets of Bordeaux and the surrounding district.

We have also taken up the challenge of drafting a "climate" plan. Each of our local authorities has adopted one of these plans; Bordeaux is currently in the process of adopting its own plan...
as part of an "Agenda 21" which will be submitted to the city council next December. As part of this initiative, we are attaching prime importance to everything related to education.

I was delighted to hear you discuss the education of the media with respect to sustainable development issues. There has been spectacular progress and in the written press, on the radio and on the television today we regularly see features given over to such questions written by competent journalists. I would therefore like to salute the work you have done in this field.

Education involves educating young people. In the Bordeaux Metropolitan District a few years ago, I launched an experiment in the district's schools to raise children's awareness of all the issues relating to sustainable development. This experiment was successful and is continuing to expand today in several dozen schools in the Metropolitan District, with the City naturally continuing to be fully involved.

We have also approached the general public, whose awareness we have also sought to raise. To prepare our "climate" plan and our Agenda 21 initiative, we launched a major awareness initiative involving sustainable development workshops taking place in each neighbourhood, and citywide eco-citizen conferences to which a number of specialists were invited.

In addition, we also attempted to get alongside local residents through a highly successful experiment involving an eco-friendly house, which travelled to the various Bordeaux neighbourhoods, providing the population with a database, lectures and discussions to raise everyone's awareness of the major issues relating to sustainable development and more particularly the individual initiatives which can be taken to do our bit in this global struggle. We also carried out a temperature map of the city and provide residents with a thermal image of their home - which often produces reactions of surprise and leads to a great many questions.

Bordeaux cannot claim to be a leading example, but we are keen to get mobilised and continue to be active in this major undertaking. Over and above what nations can do through major international conventions, or what the European Union - which does very well in this field - can do, particularly by issuing standards, or what our governments and local authorities can do, the decisive element remains individual behaviours, and at the end of the day it is these that will determine whether or not we take up this challenge successfully.

Sustainable development is all about aiming to leave a viable and liveable-in planet. Who better to encourage us in this than children themselves, since they are those who will be most concerned by this? This is why educational initiatives are a priority in my view. I find it quite moving when I visit schools in Bordeaux and ask children right from infant or junior school what they could do to enable the planet to continue living in harmony. The answers are frequently relevant, surprising and demonstrative of a degree of awareness and desire for commitment which can give us cause for hope. This is why I am convinced that this Conference will also send out a message of confidence and hope in terms of our taking up the challenge facing us.

I wish you three busy and fruitful days at work here in Bordeaux. In addition, I trust it is appropriate to express my wish that you manage to have an opportunity to escape from this auditorium to go from walk in the city and explore Bordeaux. Generally speaking, once you have seen it once, you return; it's a beautiful city where we enjoy quite exceptional quality of life - sustainably, I trust.
I too extend my greetings to the representatives of the 76 nations who have honoured us by coming here to Bordeaux in Aquitaine from the UNESCO, the United Nations, the OECD, the European Union, and Professor Ricard, the Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade, for organising this event.

I would like to tell you how delighted and honoured I feel to be able to address such a Conference on such a vital and important theme and bringing together so many distinguished figures from around the world.

The title of this Conference is vast and also expresses the key aspects of what the right to the environment, the issue of the environment and of sustainable development mean today.

I agree with Alain Juppé about the fundamentals of this combat, because today we can see our world drifting towards the most detestable and certainly the most cowardly effects of human responsibility in a number of areas, be it biodiversity, pollution, or our treatment of air, water or the soil. Mobilisation on a massive scale is urgently required and only education can achieve this.

France, through the Grenelle environmental summit, has made commitments with all local authorities and economic and social stakeholders with this objective. Regions were also involved in the Grenelle summit and will continue to be involved in its outworkings. Like other local government entities, they had already been proactive in some areas, particularly mass transport. As is the case with urban transport, there has never been such an effort to improve regional rail transport, with commitments to programmes to acquire plant, renew tracks and build new lines. The Aquitaine is currently in discussion with neighbouring regions with respect to the largest rail project in Europe, a high-speed line which would also cater for goods transport by rail from Spain to northern Europe. This is a gigantic challenge in terms of local planning as well as being an environmental and economic challenge.

The Grenelle summit was a visible aspect of an issue involving society, employment and industry. The Germans were the first to talk in terms of ecological industrial policy and my discussions with Jean-Louis Borloo on this subject lead me to believe that there is much at stake in terms of jobs, eco-business, eco-innovation and research.

For several years now, the Aquitaine Region has taken the initiative of launching a request for eco-innovation projects which has been an outstanding success; every year, more and more businesses take part. This request for projects relates to production processes which aim to have no waste entering rivers, the air, or the environment around the business, as well as to alternative conceptions of all the goods and products around us: eco-designs for the products in our society, including those which sometimes seem to be the most remote from sustainable development, for instance aeronautics and other fields including military applications. We could talk in terms of an eco-conception of what we consume and what a life will be made up of.

Not very far from here, a company called SAFRAN is currently engaged in a completely revolutionary design of aircraft engines for the future which will cut aircraft fuel consumption by 50%. There is a lot of other activity in this field, as well as in the fields of textiles and steelmaking. As elsewhere, our laboratories are thinking about the products of tomorrow.

Alain Juppé mentioned Jaques Ellul. I happened to be Mayor of the City of Pessac where Jacques Ellul lived. We should honour his memory; he sounded a clarion call to us and continues to do so today. He questioned the notion of progress, and while we may not be able to follow him in every aspect of his thinking, we are definitely right to question progress.
Questioning progress also involves questioning and addressing ourselves to young people. In my view, education is also related to where you live. The first duty of local authorities is to envisage space which is in itself exemplary. This is what is known as High Environmental Quality; incorporating new energy technologies in high schools; the way high schools work in terms of pupils' living conditions, how much water and paper they use, the way they view their environment; all this already forms a factor of environmental progress in and of itself.

In this respect, we have set up a regional network of environmental education and involved all high school students in the regional "climate" plan, which encourages students to use less water and heat, be more attentive to their individual behaviours and communicate to their parents what education has taught them.

One particularity of Aquitaine within France and Europe is that it is the French region which has been the most affected by global warming. In the 20th century, an additional 1.1° has been recorded; 30% more than the national average - and I am not capable of explaining the reason for this at present. Could it be the fact that the region acts as a truck corridor, located as it is between Spain, the Iberian Peninsula and northern Europe? Could it be marine currents which bring us more warmer air? Whatever the reason, we are faced with this challenge, and even our famed winegrowing industry needs to adjust.

Through the Aquitaine network for environmental education, Agenda 21 in all high schools, and because the fight for a sustainable environment is an expensive one, we have committed over €100 million to cutting greenhouse gas emissions by 10% between now and 2013. Through working parties, investment decisions and changes in behaviour, our local authorities are mobilised along with the State and the Grenelle summit to set ourselves obligations and educate in order to strengthen biodiversity and combat greenhouse gas emissions, even if this involves accelerating research in a number of fields, particularly with respect to biofuels.

The Association of French Regions (ARF) has had the opportunity of launching a cooperative study on the carbon balance of biofuels in collaboration with the Ecole des Mines in Paris. This analysis demonstrates that a global balance is required. There is no use using corn, wheat or soya to make biofuels if the related soil use has even more harmful environmental effects; there is no use in using second-generation biofuels if the knock-on effects are more dramatic still. It is therefore necessary to continue launching research teams to study future sources of energy which do not consume products which have an impact on the environment and which do not produce waste. Educating our children in this field today could lead to a number of scientific careers which could lead us in turn to major discoveries.

In conclusion, it is not enough for Northern countries to be thinking about such issues; they also need to have a positive attitude in their cooperative behaviours with southern nations. In terms of agrarian and farming methods and industrial transfers, precautions need to be taken and some critical analysis is perhaps required. Everybody knows that even as the Sahel was being decimated by famine, it was exporting cut flowers to northern Europe - and the same thing is happening in Africa today. Our States need to set up standards, including in areas such as these, and international organisations need to be attentive to consequences of this nature.

"Think global, act local". Alain Juppé mentioned this phrase just now, and I too would like to own this phrase, penned by one of the great thinkers in our nation's history. In any event, this is a significant and vital issue for our society; one which is interwoven with the dynamism of the younger generation.
Ladies and Gentlemen,

C'est avec beaucoup de plaisir que je participe à l'ouverture de la conférence internationale de Bordeaux sur l'éducation pour un développement durable. Au nom du Directeur général, je tiens à adresser nos sincères félicitations au Professeur Michel Ricard qui en tant que Président du Comité français de la Décennie des Nations Unies pour l'EDD, a organisé cette importante rencontre.

Je suis heureux de voir que des spécialistes en éducation, en environnement et en développement durable, venant de France, d'Europe et de pays francophones vont partager leurs différentes expériences pour faire un bilan des actions entre 2005 et 2008 ainsi que pour suggérer des stratégies pour la deuxième moitié de la Décennie.

The Decade of Education for Sustainable Development, running from 2005 to 2014, is a framework for partnership and collaboration, bringing together a great diversity of interests and concerns. It is an instrument of mobilization and advocacy. And it is an opportunity for governments, international organizations, civil society, the private sector and local communities around the world to demonstrate their practical commitment to learning to live sustainability.

In conceptualizing education for sustainable development (ESD), UNESCO has given strong emphasis to four main considerations. First, there is the obvious need for a clear focus on education and not only education ‘about’ ESD but ‘for’ ESD, with all the implications of this distinction; moreover, all types, levels and settings of education are included. Second, we have stressed the need to engage, through education, with all three pillars of sustainable development – the economic, the social and the environmental – as well as with the cultural dimension. Third, UNESCO has consistently drawn attention to North/South and South/South relationships as fundamental aspects of ESD. And, fourth, we have championed the need for a broad scope so that all partners can contribute to this common endeavour according to their particular interests, concerns and points of departure. The metaphor of an orchestra comes to mind, in which different instruments and sections make their distinctive contributions but, through their combination and interaction, a coherent piece of music emerges. Indeed, harmonisation implies the recognition and the use of difference, after all. For UNESCO, education for sustainable development provides a wide and pluralistic vision which is unified by shared understandings and common goals. We believe that such an inclusive approach serves as a stimulus to improving the quality of education - an education that is relevant to the key challenges of living in the twenty-first century; an education that empowers people to exercise their rights with a sense of responsibility; and an education that cultivates good citizenship locally, nationally and globally.

I would like to share a few examples of the diversity of implementing ESD in different parts of the world. In Africa, we are working with UNEP and African universities in mainstreaming environmental sustainability in higher education. In Europe and North America, the focus among others is on responsible consumption and sustainable lifestyles. In the Arab region, the concern is about teacher education and the curriculum. In Asia and the Pacific, substantial work has been put into setting up national mechanisms and enhancing capacities for the monitoring and development of ESD indicators at the national level. In Latin America and the Caribbean, the focus has been on the introduction of sustainability issues into teacher education materials.
These are just a few selected examples but each shows that ESD concerns us all. It provides us with the opportunity to work together interdependently, across countries, across regions - so that together we can build a better world. Designated as the lead agency for the Decade, UNESCO is responsible for coordinating the efforts of governments, partners and educators to integrate sustainable development issues in educational systems, both formal and non-formal, at all levels.

One lesson learnt since the beginning of the Decade, coming from all regions of the world, is that teachers are the cornerstone of effective ESD programmes. Teachers always work at the ‘local’ level and, to make ESD relevant and real to learners, they must draw upon local inputs, contexts and values as well as foster community ownership of the curriculum. Hence, an efficient implementation of the Decade requires engaging the world’s over 70 million teachers and the countless numbers of non-formal educators in professional development to learn the pedagogy, content, values and good practices associated with ESD.

The initial preparation of new teachers and their in-service professional development in ESD are essential for ensuring that the values, principles and practices of sustainable development are integrated into educational programmes. It is with the teachers and educators that we can revisit our teaching and learning methodologies and thus ensure that the citizens of tomorrow, our children, will be equipped with the skills and critical understanding required for sustainable living. Furthermore, it is important to facilitate and reinforce the exchange of information and good practices among teacher education institutions active in ESD. For UNESCO, teachers and teacher education are central to its substantive programmatic contribution to ESD and the foundation of its promotion of quality education through ESD.

As facilitator of this Decade, UNESCO is assisting countries and regional bodies to develop policies, plans and strategies for ESD that are relevant to their different realities and concerns. This engagement should be integrated into agreed development frameworks at country level. This is a considerable challenge and requires the support and collaboration of not only national governments but also their development partners, both bilateral and multilateral.

At the same time, we cannot wait for all the pieces to be put in place before doing something. We must encourage and facilitate the use of the ESD perspective in existing teaching/learning processes. Education must show its relevance to the challenges of sustainability now and we must learn from each other about what works and what does not work. This is not to advocate an ad hoc approach but, within a consistent application of the ESD vision, we must take advantage of the opportunities that already exist and make the most of them.

This conference in Bordeaux is a valuable opportunity to reflect upon lessons learned and future directions in the perspective of the various constituencies represented here. At the same time, it is a very welcome contribution to the overall mid-Decade review process that will feed into the Bonn Conference in 2009 and then into the mid-Decade report that UNESCO will prepare for submission to the UN General Assembly in 2010. It is important to capture the regional and sub-regional perspective, which so often serves as a key vector of linkages between the local and the global.

The global context must always be kept in mind. The current financial and economic crises are providing many lessons about the reality of global interdependence. I would argue that the whole vision of sustainable development and ESD is built on an understanding of how such global interdependence is now inescapable. Such interdependence might be considered ‘bad’ in the sense that we are all in the same ship and we will all sink to the bottom of the ocean together if the ship becomes unseaworthy. But it is crucial to recall that such interdependence is also ‘good’ in the sense that the whole is greater than the sum of its parts and that many extra benefits flow from our cooperation, partnership and collaboration. Interdependence is at the heart of the problem but it is central to the solution too. And it is
here where UNESCO is called upon to play a critical role as a catalyst of ‘good’ interdependence.

Thus, as the financial, economic, environmental, social and cultural aspects of sustainable development and educational strategies become increasingly intertwined, UNESCO will pursue its role as an intellectual leader, an honest broker, and a clearinghouse for ideas, propelling both countries and the international community in what we believe is the right direction. While UNESCO’s role as coordinator and facilitator is important, it must be remembered that the Decade is a commitment that will be implemented primarily by countries according to their priorities and approaches. To be sure, each of us has our own individual responsibility but it is through working together that the greatest gains can be made – and government leadership and accountability are key to this. Indeed, I would argue that sustainable development and education for sustainable development are a democratic challenge.

In conclusion, let me thank France, the host country of UNESCO, for organizing this conference and let me also thank the historic city of Bordeaux for hosting it. Earlier, I spoke of the imperative of keeping in mind the global but it is equally important to galvanise the community, at all levels, in order to promote ESD. It is gratifying to see all of you here today at this conference so that we may focus our unified efforts on this vital task.

Thank you.

***************************
Prime Minister and Mayor of Bordeaux,
Mr. Chairman of the Aquitaine Region,
Delegates, ladies and gentlemen

I am highly honoured to be able to address the Bordeaux International Conference on Education for Sustainable Development, representing the Steering Committee of the ESD Economic Commission for Europe in my capacity as its Chairman. I would like to express my gratitude to the conference organisers, particularly my distinguished colleague Professor Michel Ricard, the Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade, for their invitation and their very warm welcome. This Conference, which welcomes French and international ESD stakeholders - teachers from schools and universities, government officials, local authorities, scientists, students and pupils, representatives of the private sector, NGOs and the media - offers a unique opportunity to share experiences and discuss the practical problems which arise during the course of implementation of ESD.

Today I am going to give you a short, concise description of the regional Strategy for ESD adopted by the Economic Commission for Europe. I would then like to say something about how the Strategy is being implemented and note the critical points to be envisaged thereafter.

The notion of sustainable development constitutes the principal aim and development model for contemporary societies, at least at a verbal level. It is a mode of development which satisfies the existing needs of society without endangering the possibility of future generations satisfying theirs. Consequently, it is determined not only by protecting the environment through intelligent management of natural resources, but also by sound financial health, justice and social cohesion. At first sight, the motions of "sustainability" and "development" appear contradictory, because the acceleration of the pace of growth suggests greater use of natural, human and financial resources and therefore a decrease in sustainability, and vice versa. Given that the needs of development are becoming more intense, not only due to the continuing increase in global population, but also because of the increased requirements in terms of the improvement of quality of life, political governments are being obliged to look at the issue of "development" and "sustainability" sooner rather than later, and attempt to maintain the delicate balance between these two notions and avoid excesses in one direction or the other.

The notion of sustainability is a decidedly dynamic one: it is constantly evolving. This is why the emergence of a sustainable society should be considered as a continuous process of learning, during which various problems and dilemmas must be envisaged, solutions and answers will be forthcoming and, ultimately, transformed as experience accumulates. Consequently, the goals of education for sustainable development (ESD) must ultimately include acquiring knowledge and skills, a profound understanding of problems and the establishment of behaviours and values.

It is therefore clear that ESD goes beyond the scope of environmental development and extends into the fields of social and economic order, relating as it does to solidarity and the fight against poverty, the defence of human rights, multiculturalism, equality of the sexes, health, collective responsibility, the economy, models of consumption and production and so
on. ESD is a process of ongoing training which starts in childhood with the establishment of values, behaviours and attitudes to life, right through to higher education and adult education. More specifically, it should apply at every level of ordinary education and extend beyond it into other dimensions. In any event, co-operation between the state, local authorities and social partners is of prime importance.

It was during the United Nations summit on development and the environment in Río in 1992 that the significance of education as an instrument of sustainability was emphasised for the first time and that the term ESD was devised. Since then, several major initiatives have taken place to promote ESD. The UN, and its various agencies (UNESCO, UNECE, UNEP and UNICEF) have played the foremost role in this, but we should also mention various regional inter-nation initiatives, university networks and NGOs. During the 5th Environment for Europe Conference in Kiev in 2003, the Environment Ministers from the UNECE nations (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe) demanded the drafting of the implementation of a Strategy for ESD in the 55 member states in coordination with the parallel initiative carried out by UNESCO for the 2005-2014 Decade. The Strategy established by governments, academic institutions, NGOs and other partner groups was approved unanimously during the inter-ministerial meeting in Vilnius in March 2005, since when it has become the foundational instrument for the implementation of ESD in all member states.

PRINCIPAL ASPECTS OF THE STRATEGY

Implementation at the national level

The Strategy must be translated into all the languages of member states. Each country must have its own national coordinator, and the components of sustainable development must be introduced at every level of education.

Collaboration by various public administrations (Ministries of Education, Environment, etc.) and local authorities, social partners and businesses is particularly important for the introduction and effectiveness of ESD at every stage of education and during continuous training. Preparation through participative procedures of National Plans for the implementation of ESD by a coordinating body defined by each country is absolutely necessary.

International collaboration

International collaboration constitutes a response to the philosophy promoting sustainable development which requires mutual understanding, a respect for cultural values and friendly relations between nations.

Regional collaboration also needs to be sought because the problems are the same, and also because working parties, university networks and research centres can work effectively, just as well as existing international NGOs. Collaboration of this nature serves to compensate for any respective deficiencies in terms of infrastructure, educational resources and competent personnel.

Target actions

Political, legislative and functional

The creation of ESD programmes for every level of education, the introduction of the notion of sustainable development in the initial training (i.e. in university syllabuses) of teachers at every level, development of continuous training programmes for active teachers and creation of teaching resources.

Public awareness

Informing society of the need for sustainable development. One important resource in this respect is continuous training in both the public and private sectors, in the fields of industry, transport and farming.
Increasing competency of the educational system

Initial education or continuous training of teachers at every level with respect to ESD is a foundational element of this.

Creation of appropriate resources and teaching materials

This concerns every level of education: formal, non-formal and informal - on both general and specific topics, applied to teaching and self-training and destined for teachers as well as students. The use of electronic and audiovisual resources, multimedia resources and the promotion of distance learning constitute a major means of improving the competency of the educational process.

Promotion of research as part of ESD

There is an urgent need for research, but also an enormous field in several areas relating to ESD, such as educational content, teaching methods, assessment tools, establishing behaviours and values, implementation of information and communications technologies (ICT) and so on. Research results should immediately be made use of within the educational system.

Assessment of implementation

Calendar

Although the implementation of the Strategy is a constant process, three phases of development have been specified in order to enable us to monitor this more easily: 1) First phase (to 2007): This is the initial phase during which each country is to assess the existing situation, identify any deficiencies, envisage resources to address these and start preparatory activities (for instance, translation of the Strategy, appointment of a national coordinator, developing a national action plan, development of assessment methods and quality indicators relating to the implementation of the Strategy, etc. 2) Second phase (to 2010): Starting to accomplish planned Strategy objectives, inspection of how some specific initiatives already under way are developing. 3) Third phase (to 2015 and beyond): The implementation of ESD should have undergone considerable progress.

Establishing indicators

A system of indicators is required to facilitate quantitative and qualitative assessment of how the Strategy is being carried out. The development of the system has been entrusted to a group of experts.

Coordination of the implementation of the Strategy

A Steering Committee has been set up, comprising members appointed by the Governments of the 55 UNECE member states. International organisations (the EU, UNESCO, OECD, the Council of Europe, Regional Environment Centres, the European Environmental Bureau, etc) and NGOs (European ECO-Forum, ENSI, BIOM etc) appoint representatives with the status of observers. The Committee is chaired by a chairman elected by the members for two years and supported by a secretariat supplied by the UNECE. It meets once a year in Geneva. The Committee is responsible for promoting and coordinating implementation of the Strategy in liaison with other similar international initiatives. In addition, it is responsible for recording progress of the implementation, the establishment of priorities, resolution of problems, the organisation of working parties, etc.

The Steering Committee has appointed an executive committee consisting of the Committee Chairman and five members designated by the Committee to deal with matters relating to current affairs. This meets twice a year and informs the Committee of its activities.

It must be stated that the operation and administrative support for the entities in question are not subsidised by the UN budget but by donations in cash and in kind from member states.
DEVELOPMENTS ACHIEVED TO DATE

The UNECE Steering Committee met for the first time on December 13-14, 2005, then again on December 5-6, 2006 and on March 31-April 1, 2008.

During these sessions, the Committee was able to monitor the progress of the implementation of the Strategy by UNECE member states and the deployment of best practices, promote similar collaborative activities at a regional level and approve the constitution of a system for assessing the progress of the Strategy on the basis of a number of indicators. Following systematic work to this end, the Committee also imposed a special session on ESD at the "Environment for Europe" Conference in Belgrade, October 10-12, 2007, worked on the competency of the Education process with respect to ESD and drafted an Action Plan for the implementation of the second phase of the Strategy (2008-2010).

More particularly, during the Belgrade Conference, the participation of an impressive number of ministers, general secretaries and national delegates at the special ESD session (chaired by the Greek Deputy Minister for Education Mr S. Taliadouros) was noted. The Joint Declaration by the Ministers encouraged all countries to intensify their efforts with a view to the implementation of the Strategy. Furthermore, improvement of the competency of the education process, the acceleration of the transformation of environmental education into ESD, the promotion of the necessary resources and the dissemination of best practices were judged to be priority areas.

The programme for the assessment of the implementation process of the Strategy by means of indicators is close to completion in 2008. The expert group has suggested a number of indicators and is in the course of formulating detailed instructions to facilitate implementation of the system. 36 countries have already carried out experimental assessment of the implementation of the Strategy at a national level, with considerable success. The complete implementation of the system in all countries is planned for 2010.

A catalogue of the "best practices" applied by 49 countries and Organisations with respect to ESD has been published by the UNECE and is available on its website (www.unece.org/env/esd).

During this same period, the Executive Committee was convened eight times to prepare items for discussion at the sessions of the Steering Committee, and took an active part in organising the Belgrade Conference.

To conclude, I would like to set out some excerpts from the vision of the Strategy which embodies the whole philosophy of ESD, this objective which is crucial and decisive for the future of our planet:

"We dream of a region which adopts the values of solidarity, equality and mutual respect between peoples, countries and generations. A region characterised by sustainable development, including economic vitality, justice, social cohesion, protection of the environment and sustainable management of natural resources ... education is not only a human right, but also a necessary condition for sustainable development and an indispensable tool for good governance, intelligent decisions and the promotion of democracy. Consequently, ESD can contribute to achieving our aim ... It can encourage a change in mentalities and thereby enable the creation of a safer, healthier and more prosperous world in which quality of life is better..."

It is this change in mentality and attitude to life which we are invited to teach to the younger generations by means of ESD. This is the best possible investment we can make for the future of our planet.
Ladies and gentlemen,

It is a pleasure to be here and to address you on this crucial topic which lies at our hearts.

There is broad consensus in Europe on the key role of the education and training systems have to facilitate the changes that are needed to achieve the objectives of ESD.

As the European Member States have the prime responsibility for education and training of their citizens, it is the Commission's role to support Member States via the Open Method of Coordination. In this role the Commission helps to facilitate an enabling environment for the achievement of the objectives and goals of the UN Decade. Other methods of cooperation are fostering peer learning, to maintain and encourage dialogue between the Commission and key stakeholders and finally the Commission monitors progress.

On EU level, the Lisbon agenda has led to a commonly accepted work programme. This policy framework "Education and Training 2010", accepted at the Barcelona Council in 2002, has served as the umbrella for the various areas of education policies and support programmes.

On operational level the "Lifelong Learning Programme 2007-2013" is a main tool aiming at developing the role of education and training systems and providing adequate financial support. The generic actions of the programme include funding for individual mobility, partnerships, projects and networks, reference material and for operating grants and the dissemination of results.

"Education and Training 2010" has led to launching a number of major policy initiatives in recent years and has supported numerous projects under the Lifelong Learning Programme and under the ESF. Numerous projects on ESD and partnership exchanges have been funded via this programme.

The policy initiatives relevant to ESD are: the Communication on equity and efficiency, the Recommendation on Key Competences for Lifelong Learning, the Communication on the Quality of Teacher Education in Europe, the two Communications on adult learning and finally a Communication on school education which was adopted this summer. This Communication is an agenda for future cooperation on three main areas: key competences, equity, and teachers and school staff.

From an EU perspective, European cooperation can provide added value on these issues.

Let me draw your attention on the concept of key competences for a moment. Education for Sustainable Development is a concept deeply interlinked with basic set of civil life values, integrity and responsibility and we therefore stress the importance of key competences and their implementation in all levels of learning. These are skills for life including sense of initiative, critical thinking, problem solving and other and they are closely interconnected with ESD.

If we are to move forward in Europe, a timely implementation of existing policy is vital now as some Member States are lagging behind in one area or another.

From an European perspective the main key concerns relate to what I will call the equity gap and the quality gap. Despite all efforts it remains a major challenge to:

1 http://ec.europa.eu/education/policies/2010/objectives_en.html#basic
ensure that systems become more equitable in raising the general level of skills,

speed up progress in the agreed indicator and benchmark areas of the Lisbon Agenda.

Early school drop out, upper secondary attainment and key competences continue to be a problem in large parts of Europe. Data shows for example, that every sixth young person aged 18 to 24 in EU-27 still leaves school with no more than lower secondary education and does not participate in any kind of education or training after this. This is a percentage of 15.3 and the EU benchmark is 10% by 2010:

- target support for teacher training and boost their skills and to build capacity of decision makers and practitioners at regional, national and local levels

- use the potential higher education has to influence the direction that Europe will take.

As long as basic obstacles linked to these challenges are not overcome we will not fully succeed to implement Education for Sustainable development broadly.

On the other hand, the aims set for the UN Decade have also brought a number of achievements. Let me summarize from the Commission's First Progress Report on Sustainable Development:

- Several countries have drawn their own national programmes or strategies for Education for Sustainable Development; some have provided guidelines and or action plans.

- The majority of Member States referred to the objectives, principles and commitments included in the Millennium Declaration and to the implementation of the UNECE Strategy on Education for Sustainable Development.

- All Member States have explicitly embedded environmental education issues in their framework curricula. Social or economical issues tend to be dealt with more in secondary education or in adult learning.

- ESD is part of in-service training in most EU MS, with a tendency to also include active citizenship, human rights, inter-cultural issues and go beyond environmental dialogue.

- Also, university courses for teachers or centres for excellence related to ESD have been put into place.

A recent Commission Inventory of innovative practices in Member States and EEA countries underlines a substantial activity in ESD, reflecting a shift from environmental education to ESD. Innovation in the content was the most recurrent element in the practices including topics from issues linked to globalisation (e.g. human rights, north-south relations etc.), to healthier lifestyles (e.g. healthy eating patterns) and to energy consumption and renewable energy. Innovation in the delivery method was illustrated by different multi-stakeholder approaches. This section clearly highlighted the emergence of new technologies.

Forging new partnerships and networks facilitated the creation of networks between universities at national and international level, including business communities and experts on the wide variety of topics addressed by these projects. Innovation at the institutional level meant to involve ministries in the projects like for example for the granting of a national award.

I would like to conclude with the following thoughts:

- Europe has made considerable progress in ESD; however, it needs to further develop competence within the education sector for a different role and profile of teachers and trainers.
- Policy makers in education are invited to support capacity building in ESD by embracing the policy frameworks and implementing them.

- Forging new partnership between the world of education and training and business and civil society will foster the continuous dialogue it needs to draw tangible connections between environmental, social and governance practices.

- Europe has been successful in developing good practice cases. This is a main asset, however these practice examples need to be shared. The challenge remains to mainstream this good practice into existing systems, from primary education to universities.

- The year dedicated to creativity and innovation in education and training in 2009, will give extra depth to the Commission's broad-based innovation strategy, which emphasises the role of education as a core policy. The "Year" can be an excellent opportunity to promote ESD further, to stimulate policy debate on the many facets of ESD and to highlight practical approaches. It can provide a fertile ground for innovation in ESD and I would like to invite you here and today to benefit from the year.

With this let me wish you an excellent conference. Thank you.
Our Excellencies, ladies and gentlemen,

In deep appreciation for the generosity of Professor RICARD, who has given me the opportunity, at this opening session, it’s my great honor to introduce briefly the international forum on education for sustainable development dialogue 2008.

Tokyo ESD international forum will occur in Tokyo from December 2 to 5th, organized by UNESCO and the Minister of education in Japan and the Japanese national commission for UNESCO.

The forum is composed of 2 segments. One is the Asian-Pacific regional review meeting of ESD focusing on best practices and educational materials for ESD in this region. And the other is of a more global nature, expecting wider geographical range of participation and focused on 3 points: the formulation of friendship projects; partnerships; ESD research and innovation.

The human beings are facing with serious challenges both globally and regionally. National disasters, climate change, frictions between civilizations, financial crises, I can’t exclusively enumerate all those things but there are the challenges we urgently have to rise against by playing together with the involvement of public and private sectors and all level of partners, countries, regions, communities, schools and individuals.

There might be many activities which have been done, and potentially will be done, but most of them are implemented individually and need to be done more interdependently.

More over, what matters, I believe in ESD. The citizens, us, need to realise this is an issue of ourselves, the future of the human beings and go into action regardless of the differences of social, economic backgrounds. Therefore, in Tokyo ESD International forum, for such concrete actions, we try to identify strategic projects which correspond to area needs and development of stages of participating countries, communities and other partners, and also to focus on partnerships with the private sector and civil societies to explore the possibility of a global cooperation on ESD, and as well as to focus on research agenda.

Professor RICARD, president of the French national council for sustainable development has kindly accepted to join one of these sessions as a panellist. It’ll be definitively enrich the discussion in the Tokyo forum by reflecting the discussions that we’ll have here in Bordeaux.

We are excited to be here today with so many key partners on ESD, from various regions and various backgrounds, to get together. Also, I’m interested in joining all the sessions starting this afternoon.

I look forward to listen to all the reports from the sessions during the last day, in particularly the point that will effectively involve all the diversified partners in the activities for sustainable development.

Thank you very much for your attention. I hope this conference will attain its objectives.

*******************
Speech
by
Jean-Michel VALANTIN
Senior civil servant with responsibility for Sustainable Development, Department of scholar Education, ministry of Education (France)

I would like to thank the Bordeaux City Council and the Aquitaine Region, the Chairman of the Committee for the Decade for education for sustainable development, the representatives of international institutions, and the representatives of the many countries present here today.

One of the reasons for us being gathered here today is to assess the progress made in the field of education for sustainable development. This field, which has been opened up considerably in France by the National Committee for the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development, is a key issue to bring the 21st century into a fresh dynamic. In this respect, I wish to acknowledge in particular the remarkable work done by Professor Michel Ricard in his capacity as Chairman of the Committee for the Decade.

As the Mayor of Bordeaux and the Chairman of the Aquitaine Region have said, without education, it would be impossible for sustainable development to become a sustainable concept. The Department of Education is therefore particularly committed to this educational policy by generalising education for sustainable development, a practice to which the Minister for National Education is particularly attached.

Furthermore, although he is unable to be with us today, the General Director of School Education specifically asked me to remind you of the particular importance which he attaches to your work and his personal interest in these questions, since our ministry has become one of the major players in this field.

I would like if I may to give you some elements of context, since not all of you may be fully familiar with the rather vast institution which constitutes national education in France.

The French Department of Education employs 850,000 teachers who work with almost 12 million students. France is divided into 30 academies. The mission of the Minister is to ensure pupils become well-rounded, responsible citizens. The issues of our day therefore make it natural for him to incorporate questions of sustainable development.

It has to be said that for some 30 years, the French Department of Education dealt rather remotely with such issues. Fortunately, a whole network of partners, particularly specialist associations, took them up because it was difficult for the ministry to get fully involved. However, things have changed considerably within the last few years.

Between 2040 2007, the Department of Education has embarked on a policy of generalising education for sustainable development. Furthermore, the 2007/2008 academic year saw the introduction of education for sustainable development into an accelerated phase of generalisation, while foundational work, notably that begun as a result of the Grenelle environmental summit, specifically through the inter-ministerial and inter-category "Education" workshop working party chaired by Jacques Brégeon, published significant reports. I would like to take this opportunity to honour those who took part in this workshop and who are here today.

The issue for the French Department of Education is therefore to educate pupils in the complexity of the issues of the 21st century and make them citizens who are capable of making intelligent choices and assuming responsibility for these.

I would like if I may to review some of the principles of this education. First and foremost, it should be remembered that sustainable development, defined in 1987 in the report by Mrs Brundtland, Chair of the World Commission on the Environment and Sustainable
Development, is set out as being development which meets the needs of present generations without comprising the capacity of future generations to meet theirs.

Since it embraces the complexity of relationships between the environment, social life and economic practice, sustainable development is transverse by nature. It therefore establishes a relationship between preserving the environment, dissemination and long-term establishment of social and solidarity practices and an economy which increasingly integrates notions of fairness. In a world of limited resources, whether mineral or agricultural, it is important to understand the complexity of the world today.

This is the complexity with which the French Department of Education has decided to engage, and this is why education and sustainable development is present in the common core of knowledge and competencies, the document which sets out what pupils must master by the time they leave the school system, in order for them to be able to fully take their place as citizens. The common core of knowledge and skills is divided into seven pillars. Education for sustainable development is present particularly, but not exclusively, in pillar 3 "scientific and technical culture", pillar 5 "humanistic culture" and pillar 6 "social and civic competencies".

The Department of Education has decided to introduce issues relating to sustainable development into all teaching syllabuses. This work began in 2004, particularly in the syllabuses for history/geography, life and earth sciences, and physics/chemistry, and is being extended and developed.

For instance, a recent review of initial level schooling has allowed for pupils to be introduced to these concepts from the third year of junior school: in other words, at an age of around seven or eight. In addition, the new geography syllabuses for second-year secondary education which are to be deployed next year are fully given over to the topics of "humanity and sustainable development". Once teaching syllabuses have changed, all the pupils in question will be receiving this education.

Many convergent topics such as water and energy are suggested so that teachers can direct their teaching and facilitate interdisciplinary approaches, again with an eye to the transverse nature of the subject.

However, education for sustainable development is not restricted simply to syllabuses. As the memorandum dated March 2007 sets out, education for sustainable development also relates to the way establishments themselves operate. They are now able to take a global sustainable development approach, known in our jargon as "E3D". Each school's project can therefore incorporate both the teaching dimension which is the preserve of discipline-related and interdisciplinary teaching, school life, educational initiatives and sustainable management within a whole which is consistent in terms of sustainable development. Schools and establishments are places in which people live and work and where sustainable development may be implemented in a very practical fashion. When an academic institution adopts a global sustainable development approach, it becomes the key factor in this strategy.

Since 2005, initial experimentation with the global sustainable development approach in schools has given way to a much more generalised phenomenon which is now well underway. Several hundred establishments are now involved and in the long term, all should be adopting this approach. The Directorate General of School Education is currently in the process of drafting a sustainable development approach guide for establishments which is designed to facilitate implementation of this approach by teaching staff and pupils.

Teachers are key players in education for sustainable development. They therefore need to benefit from initial and continuous training in education for sustainable development. One initiative which is worth noting is the national coordination programme dating from last March, which has established the scientific and pedagogical link between geosciences and education for sustainable development, and which has enabled a large number of teaching
and support staff to be trained. Indeed, training is important not only for teachers, but also for support staff.

The Higher Institute for National Education will soon be offering ESD training, and in an increasing number of the 30 academies into which France is divided, "education for sustainable development" training courses are increasingly cross-disciplinary and multi-category in nature. This means that teaching staff, support staff and technical personnel can all be trained together with respect to sustainable development issues, and together become aware of their complex and transverse nature in order to interact with these issues in an optimum manner within schools and other establishments. Lastly, these training courses take place in partnership with recognized stakeholders from outside the world of education.

Teaching resources represent a key challenge. The National Centre for Teaching Resources and the network of Regional and Department Teaching Resource Centres, particularly the national resource centre for education for sustainable development in Amiens, are vital producers of high-quality materials, but they are not alone. Within the administrative academies, top-level partners also offer a number of resources which clearly integrate the transverse nature of this education.

Teachers need to be able to have access to teaching resources which are appropriate for the transverse approach required by ESD. These resources are required both for their teaching and for their self-training. Work on this subject is being carried out by the ministry, the National Centre for Teaching Resources and the National Centre for education for sustainable development in Amiens.

ESD has particular support in the shape of an increasing number of partnerships, both from decentralised government departments, state institutions, approved associations, local government and businesses. I feel it is important to note that amongst other initiatives, there are now over 12 regional education for sustainable development plans bringing together administrative academies, local authorities, non-profit networks and businesses. Without such partnerships, education for sustainable development would lose its transverse dimension. It is therefore important for them to be strengthened; it is by working together, coordinating every dimension of education for sustainable development, along with academic and non-academic aspects, that education for sustainable development can be a success.

Thank you for your attention.
Professor RICARD, thank you very much for inviting me to address this audience today. I hope you have a good conference over the next 3 days, plenty of interesting subjects to discuss.

As we’ve heard, education for sustainable development is about building a sustainable future for today’s and tomorrow’s generation. It aims at preparing all people to live a successful life, now and in the future, and preserving those assets require for economic, social, cultural and personal development. As we’ve already heard, teachers are a cornerstone of these efforts in ESD, so it includes teachers as well as learners.

In the OECD, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, we have 30 member countries and we act as a policy forum for discussing matters of common interests and policies. We also engage with 70 countries and indeed, not just at a national level but at local level too.

The OECD has been working across a number of different areas in ESD over the last 20 years. We’ve been looking at lifelong learning for all, the competences needed for the knowledge economy whereas skills are changing to include work place competences, such as teamwork and problem solving skills.

Over the past 5 years, OECD has been working on skills needed for preserving all assets, including skills for developing social capital, such as enhance social relationships within, among and between communities. In terms of environmental awareness, the OECD set up the environmental school initiative, ENSI, in 1986.

The OECD is continuing to work on ESD. The annual meeting of sustainable development experts will continue to work on issues on the curriculum. The OECD’s consumer policy committee will follow through on education for sustainable consumption. Whilst we, at the education directory, we’ll be reviewing national approaches and frameworks for formulating and implementing ESD.

We’re also carrying out further analysis of the 2006 PISA assessment, a program on international student assessment; some of the questions in that look at awareness environmental concerns among student population. We’ve also been working on school leadership and the skills that teachers need.

We hope to publish a paper on higher education for sustainable development towards the end of the year. That piece of work shows some of the challenges on implementing ESD strategies in higher education. For example, the lack of strategy leadership in both higher education institutions and governments, and also low importance sometimes placed on the issues still by students and more so by some employers of students.

However, the role of higher education institutions in the sustainable development of communities has been shown by the OECD work looking at how universities are key drivers in regional economies by providing local business with research and innovation necessary for global competition, as well as by providing communities and businesses with important skill training. This is thinking global but acting local.

We are also looking at the physical infrastructure with a project to evaluate the building performances and the usability of the school environment. We publish case studies of exemplary education buildings in our compendium where sustainability, including environmental performance, safety, security, special need educations, is one of the essential
criteria for selection by an international jury. This aims to show not only what has been done but also what can be done and be an inspiration for others to follow suite.

Education buildings, indeed buildings overall, make a substantial contribution to carbon emissions and education buildings have that part play in that too, through their construction, maintenance and use. Also, that location can lead to a significant generation of road traffic with consequent use of energy and carbon emissions.

In our 2009-2010 program of work, we’ll be looking at the cost benefits of sustainable facilities. Some benefits are perhaps more easily quantifiable than others such as improving energy use and efficiency. But there are other benefits too, for example developing student awareness on understanding of the environment through their interaction with the physical environment, perhaps using it as a learning tool, as well as their interaction with the curriculum, their interaction with other students and staff. Schools are places where essential learning happens and it’s important to look at how the questions of sustainability are incorporated holistically within the school environment.

Finally, at an OECD workshop on ESD, held about 6 weeks ago, the participants observed some of the challenges to implementing national ESD strategies, included in some cases the lack of political commitment and, indeed, inadequate funding. With the current worldwide deep economic concerns, there is a danger that ESD will fall lower on the list of priorities. However, a sustainable future demands that we give everyone access to education and keep this at the top of the list of priorities.
Speech
by
Jean-Louis BERGEY
Regional Representative,
French Environment and Energy Management Agency (ADEME)

Mr Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade,
Ladies and gentlemen,

I would firstly like to pass on the apologies of the Chair of the ADEME, Mrs Chantal Jouanno, who is unable to be with us today because of responsibilities relating to current affairs in France with respect to the environment. I am delighted on her behalf to open this symposium on education for sustainable development - a subject which is vital for the future of our society.

In Europe, we have set ourselves the objective of cutting our energy consumption by 20% by 2020. Perhaps one quarter of this target or even more could be achieved simply by changing our habits in our professional environment and private lives. Switching off computers and lights, driving less aggressively, not overheating in winter, keeping the heat out in the summer, stopping compressed air leaks in factories are just some of the vital actions required to make progress towards a world which is less greedy in terms of energy and materials.

The same applies in the field of waste. Sorting is only beneficial if the producers of waste sort effectively and extensively; better still is when those sorting become responsible consumers who minimise wastage of materials and energy throughout the cycle of production, consumption and disposal. Water and transport are two other fields in which improvement is also reliant on our behaviours.

In all these sectors, progress will be made only if we raise citizens' awareness and educate them not only within the educational system, but throughout life, unremittingly and tenaciously - because we are confronted with two major obstacles.

The first is the ease with which *Homo sapiens* is able to forget to perform certain actions as soon as the messages cease or the situation eases. In the 1980s and 1990s, the drop in the price of oil led to a resurgence of behaviours which wasted energy. Similarly, in France, 18-30 year-olds who have left their childhood home are amongst the worst waste sorters despite the fact that they discussed this at school and sort waste when they are back home.

The second obstacle is that messages on sustainable development run counter to four fundamental characteristics of our contemporary society: consumerism, selfishness, hedonism and immediacy. We are suggesting that our fellow citizens consume differently and less, that they consider others close to home and across the globe, that they accept restrictions today in order to be less restricted in the future, to consider future generations and indeed their own future if they are likely to live for more than another 50 years.

We therefore need to accomplish social change, not to turn the clock back but to devise another society which is more restrained and cleaner. None of this can be achieved without raising awareness, informing and educating all kinds of people of all ages. This is the measure of the immense and inspiring task which lies before us. The United Nations Decade of education for sustainable development is therefore a welcome initiative at this key time, in fact it is vital in order to generate a worldwide dynamic. However, it can only be a beginning because the way will be long and hard; although this in turn means that success will be all the more satisfying.

The ADEME is a state body in France, where it will play its role as it does in cooperation carried out with certain other countries in its sphere of competency, along with all other
stakeholders in society. We have much to learn from the practices of other countries, which is why we are present at this symposium and supporting it.

I trust that you will gain much from these three days and that you will have the opportunity to enjoy the delights of this city and its region, so that your memory of this stay is also sustainable!

Thank you for your attention.

***********************
There was one man and a few others alongside him who, in 1789, caused France to become known as a land of freedom and the country of human rights. If you go to Paris and more specifically to the Odéon crossroads, you will see a statue of Danton inscribed with the following quotation: "After bread, education is the primary need of the people". Condorcet must have had a word in his ear!

Today things are urgent. Much has been said, written and signed, but little has been done. Is it not time for us to work from where we are today so that during these three days we have together we can make much more progress?

Where would we be without History?

During the 1970s, awareness of the crisis in the environment became genuinely collective for the first time. Our economy and our industry; in short, our development, were already causing serious harm to the environment. In Stockholm in 1972 we were already talking in terms of incalculable harm, considerable damage and a solemn duty to protect and improve the environment for present and future generations. 35 years later, has this been done? Those of my generation were teenagers at that time, an age at which lifelong commitments are made.

The message of the United Nations was very clear and this clarity saw many grassroots players advance with confidence. There were declarations from the highest level of what was expected from associations and local authorities. In terms of education, the declarations at Stockholm mirrored this new awareness: "It is essential to dispense education on environmental issues to younger generations and adults". Did we really only make a start 35 years ago?

In Tbilisi in 1977, during the intergovernmental conference on education and the environment organised by UNESCO and the UNEP, there was talk of creating an informed, attentive attitude with respect to the environment. The conference raised a fundamental question which we can never avoid: "We need to understand and solve the eternal problem of the relationship between nature and man". In Tbilisi, it was already being said that education for sustainable development was a matter of global importance: "These objectives require significant changes relating to various aspects of the educational process; furthermore the latter will be all the more relevant, socially effective, better connected with life and more open to the practical issues faced by communities. Any such education will involve a cross-disciplinary approach and focus on the quest for solutions to the problems. It also requires plenty of room for participation, in other words individual and collective initiative, and requires the education to be permanent in nature." How many initiatives have been stifled over the last 31 years due to a lack of resources?

In the face of such serious perils, the participants nevertheless drew an optimistic conclusion: "Education can help mankind to triumph over itself and prepare it to exercise its responsibilities." Being an educator is a noble profession! They go on to say this: "Education relating to the environment must adopt a holistic perspective taking into account ecological, social, cultural and other aspects. It is therefore cross-disciplinary by nature."

And I quote again: "This means that education relating to the environment is not simply a question of learning about it but also of drawing lessons from it. In many instances this will require a review of some well-established teaching methods, particularly within academic education. If such an approach, directed towards problem-solving and action, is adopted, education relating to the environment will become permanent training geared to the future. Its
cross-disciplinary nature and the fact that it draws education closer to the environment and living mean that it could play a significant role in the reform of educational systems." So far, it hasn't worked!

At Rio, we were still taking the same line and principle 10 appeared to be self-evident: "The best way of dealing with environmental issues is to ensure the participation of all the citizens in question at the appropriate level."

In Rio there was talk of ensuring effective participation of the public in the decision-making process: "Governments should seek to establish or update strategies designed to incorporate the environment and development into every aspect of teaching, at every level, within the next three years, in cooperation with every sector of society." That was in 1992. Today, in France in 2008, on behalf of one sector of society, with respect to this precise issue, I can tell you that if that has been achieved, it has only been in a very few places. The hour of general mobilisation for co-operation - in other words, getting together to do something, has still not yet come.

In 1998, when the Aarhus agreement on participation was signed, we were again taking this same line when the 39 signatory nations declared that they were convinced that application of that agreement would help strengthen democracy within the region covered by the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe. Strengthen democracy? That could almost be our subject. Are not the least democratic nations those which are the most threatened by environmental catastrophes? One look at history, one look at the world today is enough.

In France, proof has come with the environmental charter coupled with the Constitution in 2005.

- Article 1: All have the right to live in a balanced environment in which health is respected.
- Article 2: All persons have the duty to take part in the preservation and improvement of the environment.
- Article 8: Education and training with respect to the environment must contribute to the exercise of the rights and duties defined in this charter.

Environmental education is therefore an institutional obligation. Yes, being an educator is definitely a noble profession!

In 2005 in Europe, with the Vilnius strategy, we once again find the same line. I quote from the strategy: "Education with a view to sustainable development must draw inspiration from the experience of real life and work outside the classroom. The educators in question play an important role in promoting this process and in encouraging dialogue between pupils and students on the one hand and authorities and society at large on the other. In this way, education with a view to sustainable development enables teaching to emerge from its isolation with respect to society."

And I continue: "Education with a view to sustainable development requires co-operation and partnerships between all stakeholders."

In 2006, the European Union, in its strategy to promote sustainable development, once again took the same line: "The principal challenge is to progressively adjust our present modes of consumption and production, which are not sustainable, and our cloistered approach to policy-making." The issue of how policy is made is stated here, with two key messages: transversality and participation. And thus the new culture which it is our responsibility to see emerge is defined.

This text talks in terms of responsible, global citizenship: "The need for this global citizenship, so strongly felt in so many ways, is here stated."

So there is a little History, but without History, we will go round in circles.
What kind of clarity can we offer youth today in order for it to become committed? Here in France in the 1880s, men reiterated in law something which was evident: instruction for all: secular, free and mandatory. Nobody should be left behind on the road of culture.

This action has today enabled democracy to progress. We need to go even further; a new educational project lies before us. Together, it is our responsibility to write it. I would like to say a few words about our language because from it spring two words for a single story: firstly “environment”, secondly “sustainable development”. Whichever particular set of acronyms we may identify ourselves with, let us act together. While we may not all be stirring the same pot, it is certain that we are all working in the same kitchen. This new educational project is both ecological and global. It began to be written 31 years ago in Tbilisi; let us not waste time over these three days repeating everything which has already been said, written and signed so many times. Now, today, we need to be in action to serve those who are also in action. Now, in our workgroups and at our keyboards. Today, we are walking on this road towards freedom and human rights.

Thank you very much.

**************************
Speech
by
Hubert HÉMARD
Director of Marketing, Communications and Sustainable Development, Monoprix

Monoprix is a company which became aware at a very early stage that it was necessary to enable customers to choose the option of responsible, sustainable consumption. That was 18 years ago, and it can now be seen just how pioneering that commitment was.

At that time, many companies remained decidedly single-minded, with the sole objective of economic profitability. We chose a more daring path, less obvious and not so swift; the path of sustainable development. This was because we were already persuaded that it was our responsibility to devise sustainable city-centre commerce and take our place in a vision of the future.

Today, we are of course glad to recognize that this topic has become a driving force in corporate strategy. We are delighted that, as a result of the Grenelle environmental summit, public policy is taking a similar tack by getting behind practical and far-reaching action plans.

How has sustainable development led us to change?

Over the last 18 years, this decision in favour of sustainable development has taken us a long way and will take us further still. It has changed us, helped us to grow up and is continuing to cause us to progress every day in our relationships with partners, customers and staff.

For us, sustainable development is not just a slogan to be bandied about for the sake of being trendy. It is an opportunity to be creative; a unique and pioneering vision of our business as city-centre retailers in which we are well aware of our responsibilities and the issues relating to our business. We are not treading well-worn paths, but this is highly rewarding and beneficial in the long term.

The launch of the first organic and fairtrade products, selling textiles which use fairtrade and organic cotton, the launch of a sustainable development management tool for stores; these are just some of the commitments which have profoundly changed us and the workings of our company and directed our investment decisions and development. As we produce and sell, we are constantly aiming to minimise our impact on the environment, society and the world around us.

Today, all our Paris stores are supplied by train and natural-gas-powered vehicles. This has enabled us to reduce our environmental impact, cut a total of 12,000 return truck journeys in Paris per year and produce 337 less tonnes of CO2.

This is much more than corporate spin: today, it is a reality in our company at every level. Every stakeholder in business can see the evidence of this: the customers in our stores, staff at head office and in our retail outlets and our public and private-sector partners.

What impact does this decision have on our staff and customers?

If we look back over the last 18 years and the way in which sustainable development has changed us, we can see the measure of how meaningful this approach has been and continues to be.

Very quickly, we had the desire to enable real ownership of the Group's approach by company staff and make sustainable development one of our internal driving forces. We achieved this by entrusting development to 55 key players representing every aspect of company life. We deploy initiatives promoting education for sustainable development internally (information, awareness and training) in order to change people's behaviour. It has therefore become a matter of concern for all, regardless of the business sector (purchasing, logistics, stores).
With respect to our customers, each of us here can ask ourselves the following question: whose responsibility is it to share and raise awareness amongst the general public? Government? Companies? Private-sector stakeholders? NGOs?

I believe it is the responsibility of us all. At Monoprix, we do our bit in our own particular style and with our own blend of enthusiasm.

With over 300 stores in city centres, 800,000 clients a day represent as many practical opportunities to act as consumers with a strong commitment to sustainable development and create a desire in each of us to engage in responsible consumption in response to an offer which combines quality, enjoyment and value for money.

We leave our customers the freedom to choose; our role is not to educate or be moralising, but to provide the keys to sustainable consumption. Our customers are informed citydwellers seeking both information and sustainable development. They are looking for meaning in the act of purchasing, and are concerned by ethical issues and observance of international standards in terms of traceability and quality. They want to be able to understand what they are buying.

Our business as retailers is to apprehend these expectations, anticipate them and respond to them. It is also to make education for sustainable development a pleasure and not a chore. This involves a varied, stimulating offer and an accessible, educational approach which is a far cry from moralising, guilt-inducing and tiresome lectures. We address ourselves to our customers' intelligence. We are responding to their desire for understanding by explaining our product offer, the role of eco-labels and the origins of organic and fairtrade cotton.

In conclusion, we are proud to be fully involved in education for sustainable development even as we retain our distinctiveness and our personality. We are convinced that this choice creates value and meaning in our company for both our employees and our customers.

Our city dwelling customers, who are well informed and aware of sustainable development, are on the front line of this trend towards responsible consumption. Every day, they bring us the challenge of being inventive and of supplying them with practical and increasingly precise and detailed information. They encourage us to stay on course and be ever more creative and dynamic. They are the reason we manage to keep one step ahead, keep finding inspiration and live up to our motto: "What can we do for you today? What can we do for tomorrow today?"

Thank you very much.

**************************
Speech
by
Fatimata DIA TOURÉ
Director of the Institute for Energy and the Environment of the Francophone World
(OIF/IEPF)

Mr Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade,
Representatives from national and international organisations and institutions,
Ladies and Gentlemen,

I would like on behalf of the General Secretary of the Francophone World, Abdou DIOUF, to thank Professor Ricard for being willing to accept our organisation as a partner in this international meeting and to acknowledge this French initiative which forms part of the implementation of the action programme relating to the Decade for Education for Sustainable Development, and to provide all the support of our organisation. Since the Ouagadougou Summit in 2004 on collective co-operation for sustainable development, we have been developing a dynamic partnership with all categories of stakeholder to make a global, integrated approach to sustainable development a reality.

This commitment on the part of the OIF has just been confirmed in Quebec at the 12th summit which brought together Heads of State from Francophone communities, and one of the topics for discussion was the environment as it relates to sustainable development. I invite you to consult the resulting declaration which features on the OIF website.

This approach to sustainable development must, at every level and in every sector, be based on awareness, information, training and education for sustainable development of all stakeholders concerned and all citizens.

For my part, I would like to tell you something about actions which have been carried out by our organisation on the basis of four missions which it has set itself as part of the OIF’s 10-year strategy. These four missions are as follows:

- Promoting the French language and linguistic and cultural diversity. Within the Francophone universe, it is important to have a resource for dialogue and communication in order to have political influence and help to achieve the objective of sustainable development by being one of its driving forces.
- Peace, democracy and human rights, without which sustainable development would hold no meaning for the related populations.
- Education, training and higher education. These are some of the principal foundations of any development which is to be sustainable and supported by the populations in question.
- Solidarity and sustainable development. This mission is fundamental, because it is always necessary to be interested in something in order to identify with a larger group. Today, collective co-operation among Francophone nations in favour of sustainable development is of invaluable use; all the more so amidst current globalisation in which the need for better regulation and better control of the system of development is necessary for every community which has a role to play in sustainable development. Promoting and encouraging Francophone expertise be it technical, scientific or other, forms part of this dynamic and provides valuable assistance for various aspects of development for developing Francophone nations.

The Institute for Energy and the Environment of the Francophone World has been in existence for 20 years. It is based in Quebec and is one of the subsidiary bodies within the
OIF. Its mission is to assist developing Francophone nations in the management of issues relating to energy and the environment in order to establish sustainable development policies in these nations.

At the same time, the OIF is developing transverse programmes relating to gender and young people. Sustainable development cannot become a reality without these two major groups of stakeholders who have a part to play in this dynamic.

Education for sustainable development must accompany individuals throughout their lives, at every level and in every field. This means that there are a number of stakeholders involved in this approach. For academic environments, universities, consumer groups, NGOs and other stakeholders including major industries, the public and private sectors, leisure and other informal activities, actions for sustainable development are structured around the following key components:

- Training.
- The development of partnerships.
- Grounding in local communities.
- Developing networks.

In terms of training, the Francophone world has made this a major concern; and a challenge which forms part of all programmes and projects emanating from the Francophone world, via the IEPF, the Department of Solidarity and Sustainable Development, the Department of Education and Training and through the practical projects which are deployed by these departments. For instance, this could concern the development of a national sustainable development strategy and all its related issues. This strategy also relates to corporate social responsibility in sustainable development, sustainable modes of production and consumption, local sustainable development and education for all. In each of these programmes, education for sustainable development is foundational. No development can be aspired to without providing a minimum of education to the stakeholders destined to benefit from this development.

As to the development of partnerships, the OIF works in close partnership with its operators, the Francophone University Agency (AUF), the International Association of Francophone Mayors, the Francophone Parliamentarian Assembly and so on, as will structures such as the Conference of Francophone Ministers for State Education and the Francophone Conference for Youth. These stakeholders constitute partners ready to take on board the training we carry out in these sectors, training which is geared to the priorities raised by developing countries in terms of energy, the environment and environmental resource management in favour of sustainable development.

The 21st century will be the century of urban development. In this respect, a programme is currently being developed with the International Association of Francophone Mayors. With respect to sustainable development, the issue is to see how local authorities, cities and municipalities should engage in this dynamic, just like what is being done here today in Bordeaux.

Furthermore, we have programmes relating to national sustainable development strategy, social responsibility and education for sustainable development in relationship with United Nations structures.

All this forms part of the implementation of the Johannesburg action plan which serves as a route map for sustainable development in this Decade decreed by the international community.

As to grounding locally, which also involves respecting cultural particularities and related environmental concerns, the emphasis is on a neighbourhood dynamic. The IEPF has decentralised most of its training to individual nations or local areas, particularly where this relates to learning about environmental management tools, sustainable energy use and
information for sustainable development. These resources relate to environmental questions, farming and how to integrate issues of adjusting to climate change with farming concerns, and how to develop energy policy which preserves the environment and which is efficient in terms of energy.

As to the development of networks, links are being developed on a daily basis with stakeholders on the international scene. This is one of the OIF's principal challenges: it is not a funding agency, and its principal mission is to work with member states and other stakeholders in the Francophone world to implement the networking of technical experts. This network may be significant for developing countries, as it enables them to grasp the issues, familiarise themselves with the actual resources which exist within the Francophone world, benefit from these and use them without being confronted with some of the difficulties with which we are familiar on a global level.

The Francophone world makes it easier to access this information by standardising inventory tools and making information available as the IEPF does, and implementing partnerships with other national and international stakeholders. We have a website called "Mediaterre" which has some 23 themed and regional portals providing information about sustainable development.

In terms of education and training for sustainable development, the Francophone world is playing its part by means of practical initiatives of interest to those countries which are members of the Francophone world and which are developing countries, in order to make them aware of these questions, own them and deal with them as rationally as possible.

It is also with this in mind that the Francophone world organised a gathering in 2005 on the subject of the Decade for Education for Sustainable Development within the Francophone world. At the end of this meeting, the participants set up an initial discussion group to work in a network. This event concluded with a series of initiatives including the implementation of an Internet portal dedicated to education for sustainable development which forms part of the broader "Mediaterre" portal, and the actual start-up of the "Francophone education for sustainable development" network.

This is the same orientation which has brought us to be with you here today at this conference in Bordeaux. The steering committee will be able to have discussions with Francophone stakeholders who are present to see how to lay out the broad outline of a working programme for the years ahead. This preliminary programme will be the subject of discussions at the level of the principal Francophone Departments: the IEPF, the Department of Education and Training, the Department of Solidarity and Sustainable Development, and at the level of operators such as the Francophone University Agency.

In conclusion, I would like to adopt the slogan of this Conference, "Acting Together", as my own. This has to be done in synergy; cooperation is the only method by which appropriation of education for sustainable development can succeed in the aim of achieving the millennium goals which we as an international community have set ourselves, as well as in the aim of achieving sustainable development for the greater benefit of the populations which make up our various communities.

Thank you for your attention.
ESD is a subject which we have been examining for a long time and is fully deserving of our attention. We are not in the process of examining how to adjust our current knowledge, expertise and culture to the accelerating course of history. We are in the process of inventing something completely different. This is a matter of urgency, with an obligation to establish teaching which will prepare humanity to take responsibility for a better future. This is extremely ambitious and highly complex due to the interdependency of the major phenomena for which we need to be prepared. Plenty of conviction, willpower and wisdom will be required to adjust to the world to come. Plenty of pedagogy will also be required and this is perhaps what is most lacking. The task is enormous for everyone, all citizens, and too for decision-makers.

Some time ago, I was the guest of honour at the European Parliament for a meeting of mayors from the world’s major cities. I had to ask myself what I was doing in front of so many important figures and mayors of major cities for whom I was a complete unknown. So I decided to be pedagogical and simply talk to them about what the greenhouse effect is. One of the people who was there was the Mayor of Chicago and his "Environment" officer, who came to thank me at the end and tell me that he had got the message.

The fact is that the politicians who making the decisions today come from a generation for whom the issue of the environment was a completely new one. There are now emergency situations on every front, not just environmental ones, and all of them deserve to be dealt with. It is therefore necessary to find space in the cluttered minds of political decision-makers and succeed in indicating a short, simple and memorable message. Memory has to do with the ability to remember and subsequently recall without distortion. It is therefore necessary to find the few words which will mean that a political decision-maker grasps the issue, owns it, lives with it as part of their day-to-day thinking and takes decisions in the light of what they know.

Exhaustion of resources means that we need to think about recycling raw materials indefinitely. Since quantities are finite and consumption is multiplying, everything will have to be recycled. Every manufactured product must form part of an infinite recycling of its components. And so we find Lavoisier's celebrated law: "Nothing is lost, nothing is created, everything is transformed". One of the best examples is a drop of water. A drop of water travels far and wide during the course of its existence; the available quantity of water on the planet remains the same. Water arises from the sea by evaporation, travels through a whole cycle and is recycled indefinitely. As luck would have it, the trend is towards smaller and smaller things which means that we are using less and less materials and using them in increasingly intelligent and complex ways.

The dual challenge with which humanity is confronted relates to both climate and energy. A few days ago I was addressing a class at the Ecole Centrale, and I told them that they were responsible for solving the equation of the century: how to move from a century which is 80% dependent on fossil fuels to something else? A great deal of inventiveness will be required; we will need to find other ways of producing energy. Before us lies a prodigious energy renaissance which will require massive mobilisation of intelligence. The issue of how to have access to comfortable and satisfactory levels of energy is a passionate challenge given that both demand and demographics are on the rise.

As to global warming, we have done ourselves a disservice by talking in terms of "0.6°C in a century", because this seems very slight. If you consider the difference in temperature between summer and winter or night and day, which sometimes runs into double figures, I
think that talking in terms of a fraction of a degree is not helpful because it is not a value with which people are familiar; that's something I as a doctor like to do. If your body temperature is 37.8°C, that's only 0.8°C more than usual. In medicine, we call that a slight fever. However, we need to see this in terms of the accumulating warmth right across the Earth's surface. In other words, the temperature of all the oceans, land and biosphere has increased by 0.8°C. That takes a lot of accumulated heat. If we talk in terms of two additional degrees, for the human body, that would mean a temperature of 39°C. It takes a lot of energy to heat up your body mass by 2°C. In the best possible scenario, in one hundred years' time, the Earth will have warmed up by two or 3°C: it will have a fever. We therefore need to be prepared for this; these are powerful teaching points; we need to find imagery which will make an impact on public opinion. The issue is not one of temperature but of accumulated heat. To cool down that quantity of accumulated heat will take time, which is why this phenomenon has so much inertia.

In addition, when it comes to preserving ecosystems, nature is not simply the decor in front of which we live out our lives. It is the largest mutual organisation in the world, in which all inhabitants and species live together. We all depend on each other.

If an ecosystem is destroyed, as we have seen in Africa, suddenly a deadly virus such as Ebola emerges. An ecosystem was damaged and part of the host which neutralised this virus was destroyed. Having been set free, this virus affects humans and is fatal. When an elephant crosses the savannah, zoologists see a pachyderm, parasitologists see a bag of fleas - and ornithologists see something whose digestive system enables the fertilisation of seeds which will be used by a bird to feed something else. And so we see that there is interdependency in nature between species. Nature is not simply decorative; we form a part of it and each of us pays something of our life into this immense mutual fund. Protecting biodiversity means protecting all the lives on which ours depends.

Who is at the controls to maintain the level of oxygen at stable levels? You have to look at who is consuming oxygen and who is producing it. Nature is a vital player in maintaining this balance. With a little more oxygen in the atmosphere, everything would go up in flames. If there is a little less, hypoxia would ensue. This is just one of the major balancing acts in nature for which we need to have respect and all ecosystems have a part to play in this balance.

Environmental issues are not persuasive unless they relate closely to industrial or economic issues or issues of public health. We owe a debt of thanks to ozone for having drawn world attention to a hitherto unsuspected phenomenon: man is capable of altering the composition of the atmosphere. The composition of chlorofluorocarbons - CFCs - has destroyed certain ozone molecules in very specific conditions of cold above Antarctica. The word "ozone", previously quite forgettable, made the headlines of magazines around the world and awoke global awareness. Ozone is a good example, because it went from being a simple problem of atmospheric chemistry to becoming a problem for industry and then an issue of public health. This is because as the hole grew, it began to threaten countries in the southern hemisphere who were beginning to be on the receiving end of a higher-than-normal dose of ultraviolet radiation. This lead to general mobilisation, and suddenly a couple of multinationals that produced these CFCs were forced to find alternative products. This was the Montréal protocol: for the first time, there was a global mobilisation. Production was halted, alternative products were found and things have changed. Today, the beginnings of a repair can be seen. For the first time, man realised that he was capable of altering the composition of the atmosphere.

The same thing is happening today with CO2, but the problem is a much more complex one. The guilty party, CO2, is invisible, has no smell, and leaves only a trace. 79% of the atmosphere consists of pure nitrogen which has no impact on the greenhouse effect, 20% is oxygen, also with no impact on the greenhouse effect; just 1% is gas, 0.035 thousandths of it is of carbon dioxide, and it is this tiny fraction of carbon dioxide which is responsible for the
greenhouse effect. This very thin layer of atmosphere around the Earth is like a layer of cellophane round a pumpkin. It is possible to increase the CO2 content of the atmosphere, which means that man has an effect on climate. Things are much more complicated with carbon dioxide because it affects the life of citizens in every state and is a colossal source of revenue. This is why the protocols implemented today are very welcome, as has happened in France with the Grenelle environmental summit; this is a good thing. It is difficult for measures to be taken, but they must be upheld. We need to find the next step after the Kyoto protocol; this is vital. Even if times are difficult, austerity often gives rise to solutions, intelligence and resourcefulness. We need to make the most of this situation to make progress.

As I was saying, environmental issues are often minimised unless they are related to issues of public health. Today, human health is under threat, not due to any massive creation, even if we are right to be wary of the potential destructive power of nuclear weapons, but due to something which is infinitely small. I mentioned the Ebola virus; we are unable to combat viruses and new ones are emerging here and there. In addition, some things are invisible: microscopic pollution, remnant pollutants, pesticides, organochlorine compounds and heavy metals. In medicine, when we want to find out about a person's health, we do various standard biological tests (blood tests, urea, glycaemia, cholesterol and so on); if we were to start looking at the pesticides, heavy metals, oestrogen-likes and oestrogens, people would start worrying and paying attention. This microscopic pollution, which threatens us due to the phenomenon of bioaccumulation of remanent pollutants - that is, accumulation in the body - is all the more toxic because it is highly resistant. These remanent pollutants are liposoluble, which means that they enter lipid cells.

This toxic bioaccumulation can be seen in polar bears, despite the fact that they live so far from civilisation. Samples taken from the milk of mother bears showed that it is laced with organochlorines, pesticides and so on, because this animal is at the end of the chain. Phytoplankton eats these molecules and is in turn eaten by zooplankton and then by krill, which is eaten by fish, which is eaten by cod, which is eaten by seals, which are eaten by bears. In the end, the bears are stuffed with the cumulative effect of all this, which we call bioaccumulation. We are exposed to these changes - and I will not go into detail about other insidious, microscopic pollution. It is difficult to know what is going on because epidemiological surveys look at small doses which take place over time. This means that establishing correlation is sometimes complex. Patience is required in this respect; these aspects need to be watched closely and taken into account.

Teaching is mandatory. Generalisation and pedagogy are like the work of a producer. Knowledge has to be portrayed in such a way as to be attractive, so that it enters the mind and people appropriate it for themselves. It must be more than simply another piece of abstract information.

In addition, knowledge in a variety of areas is required. I often give lectures and people come up to me at the end and say things like: “I’ve just finished a Masters in plant or animal biology and I would like to work in something environment-related. What do you advise?” I tell them to gain an engineering diploma or study social science, economics or law. Our need today is to get organised and invent new machinery. When an engineer in a company does work on an engine which produces very little CO2, he is working for the environment. Knowledge of biology is essential because it enables a firm grasp of the subject, but it also needs to be supported by education in another field which relates to how the world works (legislation, social sciences, technology). At the Sorbonne, there is a combined course taught comprising science and social science, and all the students are keen to be working to improve our environment. Environment relates to absolutely everything around us, so it is important to have some kind of multi-disciplinary education.
Stakeholder mobilisation is also important, and it is important to thank Michel Ricard for having organised these meetings for some time now. Perhaps it's ungrateful to say so, but he will need to carry on because this work is absolutely vital.

So as not to be pessimistic, we need to see that we are more in a period of Renaissance in terms of both energy and in terms of how we create wealth. Precautionary principles are a good thing and will enable us to improve our living conditions. So I prefer to say that we are at the outset of a renaissance rather than at the end of the world.
Jean-Louis Etienne started by making an appeal to intelligence and concluded with the perspective of a renaissance, which is a good way of situating our debate with respect to what was said at the end of the morning in a workshop on the issue of desire and passion. Everything which has been said, even more so if it is placed in the context of education, falls within the triangle within which the relationship between education, intelligence and desire is located.

Intelligence without desire is an intelligence which is defective. First and foremost, curiosity, which is one of the principal drives in intelligence, is a desire and an emotion. Sustainable development cannot be envisaged or passed on if this is sustainable development is not also desirable. No renaissance such as Jean-Louis Etienne has just envisaged is possible if humanity does not have the desire to pursue our adventure. If we simply remain fearful, there is no other perspective than mere biological survival. For humanity, biological survival is far too paltry an objective to mobilise the kind of energy required for the challenges which we will face.

This question of the relationship between intelligence and desire is crucial, because when desire malfunctions, the effects of this malfunction have formidable consequences. This is familiar to historians, summed up in the phrase "science without conscience is the ruin of the soul", but if we look at the general characteristics of man's barbarity to man, they have also been the fruit of desire and its counterpart, anxiety. Desire is what made possible the final solution, Hiroshima, Rwanda and so on, not need. It is important to grasp this fundamental difference in anthropological and psychological terms. Need is something much simpler, because it is self-regulated by satisfaction. Once you have satisfied the need, a measure of satisfaction becomes established and you no longer need to go beyond a specific need. This means that need is self-regulating, whereas desire, which contains within itself an awareness of death, is shot through with the infinite. This means that the force driving desire is immeasurably greater than that relating to need. Desire, in both real and abstract terms, is what enables humanity to move mountains. Similarly, when desire runs amok, it gives rise to what the Greeks called "hubris" (excess). If we look at the systemic crisis into which we have entered, it is not an exaggeration to say that at the heart of this systemic crisis - which is not only financial in nature but equally environmental and social - there is the issue of malfunctioning desire. We only need to look at the way our relationship to nature, which is at the heart of the excess at the origin of the ecological crisis, be it in terms of climate disruption and human causes thereof or in terms of the threat to biodiversity, has gone awry.

Excess is clearly at the heart of the financial crisis. Did the former boss of the US Federal Reserve, Alan Greenspan, who has long been in a self-critical phase, not speak at the time of the irrational exuberance of financial markets? When the Wall Street Journal raised the issue of the very nature of the feelings at work in the financial markets, it used this enlightening phrase: "Wall Street can only feel one of two things: euphoria or panic", which definitely speaks of excess. One of the former directors of the Belgian Central Bank, Bernard Lietaer, recalls that of the 3200 billion that would be traded daily on financial markets prior to the tempest, only 2.7% corresponded to actual goods and services. That too speaks of excess.

Excess in relation to power rather than in relation to wealth was also what led to the implosion of the Soviet empire 20 years ago.

Wherever we find excess, we find malfunctioning desire and its consequences, in terms of collateral damage - and this will be extensive in nature. It is comparable to the phenomenon
of addiction, because behind excess lies suffering and mistreatment. If desire is directed in terms of possession, it inevitably creates artificial conditions of scarcity. If you were to take the richest person in the world, what more could they possibly want in terms of needs? If we were nothing more than rational mammals, beings of need with an added layer of rationality, the idea that the richest being in the world should want even more wealth, or that the most powerful being in the world should want even more power would be totally incomprehensible. However, if we consider the issue in terms of desire and if desire is simply another word for the struggle against death, it becomes easy to understand that in actual fact in their accumulation of wealth, the richest person in the world is actually attempting to fight against their fear of death. This will not solve the problem; not only will it not satisfy, on top of that it will cause quite significant collateral damage to others. When 225 people - the official figure published by the United Nations - have a personal physical fortune equal to the total revenue of 2.5 billion human beings, what could possibly be continuing to create this phenomenon if it is not a malfunction in the realm of desire which produces excess?

This phenomenon is similar to addiction in that when desire is focused on an object which does not correspond to development of being but rather to the realm of possession and having, you have exactly what Gandhi summed up in his celebrated phrase: "There are enough resources on this planet to fulfil the needs of all, but there are not enough to satisfy the desire of each to possess". What Gandhi said was illustrated perfectly in the United Nations report on development of 1998. The twin column established in this global report on human development showed that the sums that would be required for mobilisation on issues which were as crucial in terms of vital need as access to drinking water, basic medical care, the problem of hunger or the issue of housing represented scarcely the tenth, and more often the twentieth, of the sums mobilised through the sale of drugs, arms or advertising. When on the one hand you have such massive budgets and on the other, an inability to find the money needed to fulfil the millennium goals set by the United Nations, you are in precisely the situation in which malfunctioning desire produces excess on one side and, on the other, a situation in which the ability to meet fundamental and vital needs is no longer guaranteed.

If at the heart of our analysis lies the idea that in the current systemic crisis into which we have entered, the issue of excess is fundamental and that at the heart of this excess lies suffering and mistreatment, we will also have understood that at the heart of positive strategy, the Renaissance to which Jean-Louis Etienne was inviting us, these new appointments of humanity will involve both what Jean-Louis Etienne termed frugality and what Pierre Rahbi called sobriety, but sobriety related to a better life, which Pierre Rahbi calls joyful sobriety. If no work is done on what constitutes a better life, if we remain in fear which renders us powerless, if there is no possibility of a positive narrative of the future of humanity - if there is no desire for humanity, the limitation which is the necessary condition for ecologically humanly sustainable forms of development will not be accepted. We are in the position of a drug addict to whom a rehab programme is offered; but if there is no hope that at the end of this rehab lies a better life, the addict will prefer to remain an addict.

The relationship between how frugality or sobriety is managed and the issue of the politics and economics of a better life is absolutely central in these major gatherings around which much of what humanity will become will be played out. It is clear that the issue of education is also a central one because the key question in the realm of desire is the ability, once vital needs have been satisfied, to progress from desire relating to the order of having and possession to desire relating to the order of being.

Jean-Louis Etienne told us that nature is a wonderful mutual society; this is another way of saying that the economy of giving is primordial in any economy. If nature were to demand payment, none of our economies would be possible. When we are faced with the issue of the economy of giving, the determining issue which then emerges is that of quality. If, instead of starting out with the fundamental issue of fear of scarcity structured around the question of food, economists were to start out from an even more obvious vital and urgent need, that of
breathing, we would not end up with the classic triangle of scarcity, production and quantifying on which most economies are built, including critical economies such as Marxism; the issue would no longer be one of production and scarcity. Rather, the perspective would be one of a situation of abundance, or at least would be so long as we have not polluted the planet so much that air becomes a rare commodity. We would no longer be thinking in terms of production but in terms of receiving and co-creating. This comes back to the issue of breath; it is no accident if all the wise tell us that the hardest thing is to learn how to breathe. Finally, it would no longer be a question of quantity, because what is at stake as we breathe is the quality of our relationship to the world around us.

This gives us a fundamental clue as to the nature of education and desire focused on the realm of being and of what a Renaissance intelligence directed to education in joyful sobriety should look like. When your desire is focused in the realm of being, the three major modes of communication of human beings are their relationship to nature, their relationship to others and the relationship to oneself. One of the forms of desire in the realm of being inherent in communication with nature is beauty. In relationship to others, friendship, peace and love are expressed. In relationship to oneself, the form is serenity. Could anyone seriously argue that humanity could be threatened by unlimited desire in the realms of beauty, serenity and peace? There is clearly no danger in unlimited desire focused on the realm of being. On the contrary, when unlimited desire falls into having and possession, it produces artificial scarcity because even as we continue to satisfy desires for possession in terms of the power and wealth of a tiny minority of humanity, another part finds itself under attack, right down to the level of its fundamental needs. Furthermore, it produces dissatisfaction and the addictive behaviour which means that even the beneficiaries of this excess-related system remain unsatisfied.

This issue of education with respect to desire and collective wisdom, built on a desire on the part of humanity intent on pursuing the human adventure, lies at the heart of the issue of acting educationally for sustainable development. The systemic answer to the systemic crisis involves changing the modes of production and consumption as well as approaches to life themselves. The question of "being better", with an emphasis on the word "being" is central and lies at the heart both of our individual lives and of the required change in stance of humanity itself.

We are an extraordinarily young race, infants in terms of our psyche, in which it is as though all of us were prematurely born. The compromise which nature found in order to enable us to be born with such big heads has been for us to be born before term, even when we go the whole nine months. The conditions required for any human being to become autonomous take much longer to fulfil than for any other animal, and the fact that all of us are physically premature also means that we are mentally premature; beings with considerable emotional vulnerability. These physically and psychologically vulnerable beings are then clothed with an amazing gift from the universe to itself: consciousness; but this gift may sometimes turn out to be a poisoned chalice. If it were possible to wave a magic wand and give this a bottle of the gift of consciousness, it would immediately ask itself "Where am I from? Where am I going? Are there any other bottles around anywhere? Am I the prettiest?." The very mechanics of becoming distinct from the universe, others and myself means that consciousness is a difficult responsibility for the human race.

The great question of education with respect to desire which lies at the heart of sustainable human development therefore involves constructing what could be called a collective emotional intelligence - the great issue raised by Pascal of the reasons the heart only knows, and by Gandhi when he talks of the wisdom of the heart. It lies at the heart of changes in stance be they individual or collective, and will enable humanity, if it rises to the challenge, to understand that the colossal challenges which lie before it, with respect to which it is no exaggeration to say that they endanger its very progress, may also be an opportunity for considerable advancement; a qualitative leap in the history of humanity itself.
The major challenge with which we are faced is that humanity has started to see itself as the antihero of its own history ever since Hiroshima. By acquiring the ability to destroy itself, humanity has become the subject of its own history, but a negative subject. How can we become positive subjects of our own history? The great question of sustainable development, which lies at the crossroads of social, ecological and economic issues and the question of the ability of humanity to govern itself democratically, is permanently shot through with human desire - not simply rationality and fear.

"Going through life with a closed heart is like crossing the ocean without ever leaving the hold" is how Alexander Lowen summed this up so magnificently. We will be able to repeat this phrase to our children because like us, their desire is to see the human adventure continue. There is indeed a way of taking up the colossal challenges with which we are confronted and creating this opportunity for Renaissance about which Jean-Louis Etienne has spoken.
You have heard from the scientist-educator and the philosopher, now you will be hearing from the technocrat: the person who having heard all that asks themselves the question "So what do we do now?"

The fundamental question in this event has been to see what could be said in terms of an assessment of the Decade at midpoint with respect to education for sustainable development. I took myself back to a point in time some years previously and said to myself that we have done a good job. In terms of sustainable development, today the message has become generalised and we have progressed in terms of knowledge.

Firstly, then, the topic of sustainable development is now widely known. It has become central, unavoidable even, because regardless of which newspaper you read or which advert you’re watching, there is always something to do with sustainable development. I am not judging whether this is good or bad, but observing that this has changed with respect to how things were a few years ago, particularly at the time the idea of the Decade was launched.

The theme has spread out to the extent that it now forms part of political discourse. In 2007, no speech by any candidate for the French presidency was on the theme of the issues of the environment or sustainable development. Today, in the speeches of the candidates for the US presidency, many aspects related to climate change and the environment. This does not mean that politicians are completely up to speed on the subject, but that the subject exists and people have taken it on board in a big way.

In advertising, it has become a sales argument which means that it must mean something for consumers. At the Paris Motor Show it is now impossible to sell a car without talking about CO2 and energy consumption.

This is something new; something has happened and we need to be aware of it. Over and above the topic itself, it is also a matter of policy and initiatives. Today, the topics raised at the Grenelle environmental summit are high on the agenda, and many of our politicians have lined up with the diagnosis carried out on that occasion and more particularly the ensuing roadmap.

Between 60 and 70% of the French presidency of the European Union was devoted to topics related to the themes of sustainable development and protection of the environment. In the programme for the Mediterranean Union, a significant majority of topics also relate to these subjects. Even in international meetings such as the G8 summit, the topic of sustainable development, climate change and the environment is also moving up the agenda.

Even during the present period, the financial and economic crisis which we are entering into, issues relating to sustainable development remain significant or even strengthened. We are in the presence of a crisis which is largely due to the fact that long-term had been forgotten and that investments were made which bore no relationship to genuine mid or long-term profitability. There was no concern for future generations or even for the future of our generation. This runs precisely contrary to the thinking behind sustainable development, which is why I am persuaded that we will come out on top thanks to the policies underpinning the topic of sustainable development. Moreover, the surveys which are regularly carried out today show how much awareness of this topic has been raised and also how familiar our fellow citizens are with the issues.
We have progressed and changed, but I am not sure whether this is solely due to the efforts undertaken as part of the Decade or efforts by educators. The recent progress made on these topics is above all because facts have reminded us of the urgency of the action which must be taken.

The reason progress has been made in terms of debate and work on climate change is because of the 2003 heatwave and because every day, the consequences of climate change and its progress everywhere can be measured. It is this, and not only our efforts in terms of pedagogy and education, which has highlighted the importance of the issue.

In terms of biodiversity, it is as the disappearance of species is both shown and proven that the subject has grown in importance and that people have begun to examine what the consequences of this trend might be. In terms of health, various crises have also been an opportunity for measuring actual consequences on health, following which the teaching element comes into play.

An additional factor has also further strengthened our message and fuelled our debate with respect to sustainable development. It is what Jean-Louis Etienne referred to as the exhaustion of resources, or what I would call the imbalance between supply and demand. With 9 billion humans on the planet, it is clear that it is no longer possible to continue living as we do today and that an imbalance is underway - and destined to increase - between the resources that we use and the way we consume them, be it only to satisfy our needs or desires.

Today, we are moving further and further towards a greater and greater imbalance between the supply and demand of resources (energy, raw materials, food) which makes our policies, debates and understanding of what genuine behaviours and practices in terms of sustainable development might be, absolutely necessary.

The conclusion which I draw from these two types of debate is that it is necessary for us to continue our efforts and adjust to this new environment which is one of the beginnings of understanding with respect to a number of topics. We therefore have to progress our methods in terms of education for sustainable development. We must certainly not relax our efforts, anything but. The objective is probably to dial down awareness actions somewhat at the same time as we provide a little more explanation. It is absolutely vital that our work in terms of education for sustainable development has the aim of providing keys for understanding.

I have the feeling that our fellow-citizens have been alerted by what they are reading and seeing, by what is explained to them, by tangible changes in their immediate environment; they have become inquisitive, begun to ask many questions and are in search of answers. It is vital that our efforts are directed at addressing this broadening curiosity which is so necessary. People cannot be made responsible, and therefore no action can be taken, without informing consumers, voters and citizens as broadly as possible. If you are not aware how much energy you use or that by consuming energy you emit greenhouse gases, you will not be made responsible either as a stakeholder or as a consumer or as a voter. We therefore need to work on these mechanisms: informing to make people responsible and enabling citizens to act as a result. With this in mind, there are many possible forms of education for sustainable development.

Another important thing is that it is a mistake to try and dumb things down. Some errors have been made, including in the recent past, and more will be made if we attempt deliberately or otherwise to oversimplify a certain number of subjects or solutions.

One day, the solution is wind farms. The next, it's biofuels. The next day, it is solar power. The day after that, it is the capture and storage of CO2. The responses which various people attempt to provide are far too simple; when you stop to think about it, you realise that things are not as simple as that. Our fellow-citizens end up becoming lost in the maze of messages. The key is therefore responsibility rather than over-simplicity, eschewing a desire to
oversimplify in favour of an attempt to explain the complexity of the world in which we live and of the solutions which need to be found. I believe these are two areas of work which we need to carry out today because things have changed and we have made progress in some areas.

All of this provides even more support than before in favour of transverse work in every avenue of education, information and awareness with respect to sustainable development, in a kind of ecosystem which is emerging between various parties, between all stakeholders throughout society and in the various colleges of the Grenelle environmental summit. All of them shoulder part of this education which is required with respect to the environment and sustainable development.

I would like to come back briefly to the type of stakeholder I have in mind to show that we have an ecosystem which has to be absolutely consistent both in terms of explanation, in terms of solutions and in cross-pollination of the insights gained by the various players.

It is clear that education can enable us to go further in understanding these phenomena. To understand them more fully, it is necessary to acquire the kind of competency which Jean-Louis Etienne mentioned earlier. Being multi-disciplinary makes it easier for us to understand each other, but not everyone is capable of progressing in more than one discipline. In any case, it is necessary for education to lead us on this path, attract our interest and help us to understand what is at stake.

The French Department of Education is doing this increasingly today, and this is what we must generalise, even as we demonstrate how it is implemented within educational institutions. We need to come to the place where the very workings of educational establishments and the system itself are based on a sustainable development approach.

Next, in the field of professional education, it is necessary for everyone to step back from their mode of teaching and determine how they can operate on the basis of a sustainable development approach. Irrespective of a person's profession, they should be able to understand how to get involved in a sustainable development approach. Today, many things have been begun, but with this simple idea in mind, all of us should be able to make progress.

In addition, there are those who have not had the privilege of learning all this kind of thing at school. This is particularly difficult because climate change, for instance, is something which people aged 45 and over never heard talked about at school. Learning something when you never heard about it at school is really quite difficult. Some people have had the opportunity to read up and find out more, but many do no more than watch a report on television from time to time. Becoming educated about climate change in this manner is not a simple matter at all. This is why there is a huge task to be done by means of a number of other methods and avenues.

The media has a huge responsibility, particularly broadcast media which can exhibit best practices and exemplary behaviour. They are starting to do this, and it really is a way of drawing the attention of people who have not had the opportunity of looking at things in more detail or for longer to our concerns. We need to steer clear of black-and-white prime time news explanations which take a few seconds to tell us that such and such a solution is the right one, with another the next day telling us it's the wrong one. At the end of the day, people don't know what to think, do not have time to weigh up the arguments and find themselves all at sea. We need to bear this in mind and attempt to understand how, through various types of media, we can avoid placing people in this frustrating and inconsistent situation.

Another increasingly important avenue relates to local initiatives, in other words all the actions carried out by associations and local authorities in a given area with the aim of seeing how practical responses can be provided to be used immediately by individuals in their local environment and daily life at work, at leisure and at home. These local actions are
precisely those in which our fellow-citizens have the opportunity to talk with people like them who can explain certain issues, study best practices, and realise that they too are capable of doing something; this gives them an answer to all these global challenges with which they are bombarded and confronted - shoved under their noses without any real explanation that they too are capable of playing their part.

A whole multitude of things are being done in relation to this subject in terms of education for sustainable development. We need to encourage this widespread emergence, sow into it and continue to expand it.

Another type of initiative is the alert, as practised today by major national and international NGOs or public figures who command an audience, which open our minds and attract the attention of society in general to a number of important issues. This is also a mode of education for sustainable development which is to be encouraged. It comes naturally to some and so it should be promoted. The interest of such alerts is their pioneering role.

What strikes me today is the fact that issues which were unheard of a few months ago suddenly emerged to become the hot issues of debate discussed to a greater or lesser extent by a large number of people. We need the contributions of these associations and individuals who see a little further and attract our attention to new topics, tomorrow's burning issues, the ones which will pose us problems in future. The changes in our environment mean that new problems are emerging, so we need to attempt to act as quickly as possible. These alerts are very different in nature to local initiatives, but we need the variety of every kind of approach and educational technique available.

In all this, the role of government is above all to facilitate the development of all these avenues, from education right through to alerts via local initiatives, and work to ensure that everybody has as much information as possible. As far as the State is concerned, our responsibility is to provide information on subjects relating to development, which is what we will attempt to do in line with one of the commitments of the Grenelle environmental summit, by creating an environmental information portal which will enable everybody to find and use information. I am convinced that one of the responsibilities of government is to ensure that such exchanges of information are possible and simple.

In conclusion, I would like to assure you of the support of France, the Ministry I represent and the Central Office for Sustainable Development in all initiatives undertaken in terms of education for sustainable development and the environment as part of the particular context of the moment, i.e. the Grenelle summit. In this context we have set up two operational committees focusing on the theme of education for sustainable filament. This is the only topic for which we managed to create two committees and we are currently awaiting the results of the second. The work done by the two operational committees will form the basis for decisions and measures to implement these.

These themes of information, education and training deserve a priority role in the new national sustainable development strategy. We will be drafting a new strategy, because the previous one ended last June. It is still being applied, but a new one is required and during the course of work on this, particular attention is required as regards the aspect dealing with "education and training".

The last thing I would like to say relates to the UN Decade. We wish to continue working intensively on the topics with UNESCO, and this message will be reiterated by France, particularly at the Bonn Conference in March 2009, as well as at all the other major events which mark milestones in this international process. We are currently reorganising the French Commission of UNESCO so that it is more present and active in this work and communicates more about the major undertakings by UNESCO and conversely, so that there are better exchanges of information emanating from France vis-a-vis UNESCO and its major programmes in terms of education, science and culture. As part of this reorganisation, we will be further strengthening and reinforcing our work in the course of this Decade.
In conclusion, I would like to thank the Bordeaux City Council for welcoming us during these three days, and all those who have come to discuss their experiences. I am totally convinced that we will not make progress in all these areas except by exchanging genuine experiences and practical examples. Irrespective of whether they have been successes or failures, these experiences are useful; that is how we can all move on together. The work in which each of us will continue to be actively engaged will enable us to progress in generalising education for sustainable development and above all in implementing these solutions.
Session 1

Progress made and outlook for the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development in EU member countries

Sommaire

- Introduction
- The context
- the UN Decade and the Bordeaux conference
- the role of ENSI during the Bordeaux conference
- European and global efforts to assess progress during the UN ESD
- ENSI and Europe (by Willy SLEURS, president of ENSI)
- European efforts on the Decade of ESD (Elisabeth BITTNER, Directorate for Education and Culture, European Commission)
- The German efforts and the UNESCO World conference on ESD, Bonn, 2009 (Alexander LEICHT, German Commission for UNESCO)
- The Greek efforts on sustainable development (by Andreas KARAMANOS, chair UNECE Steering Committee on ESD)
- The UNECE Strategy for ESD: Indicators to measure the implementation (Roel Van RAAIJ, chair UNECE expert group on indicators for ESD)
- Monitoring and Evaluation during the UN Decade: The Global Process (Daniella TILBURY, chair of the UNESCO Global Monitoring and Evaluation Expert Group MEEG)
- Workshops
  - Workshop 1: The whole institutional approach to ESD and the role of school in society (facilitators: Michela Mayer and Eugenia Flogaitis)
  - Workshop 2: A systemic approach to curriculum change in educational institutions (facilitators: Maryse Clary and Guy Turchany)
  - Workshop 3: Professional educational competences in ESD (facilitators: Mercè Junyent and Regina Steiner)
  - Workshop 4: The role of social learning in the attainment of SD (facilitators: Roel van Raaij, Antoine Heideveld, Ingrid Mulà)
- Key discussions around the workshop
- Conclusions and recommendations

Facilitator: Christine Affolter (Environmental School Initiatives-ENSI)

Introduction

This session proposed to provide a platform for French and international stakeholders working on ESD to reflect on and review the first half of the DESD (2005-2008) and make recommendations for the second half of the Decade (2009-2014).

---

2 A complete version with appendixes of this session can be found on the web site of ENSI, of the French Committee of the Decade and of the Bonn conference.

3 The French committee of the Decade mandated ENSI (Environmental and School Initiatives) to organize a meeting with experts on ESD in order to provide information on progress and make proposals for second half of the Decade. This session was partly financed by ENSI and by the French committee of the Decade. ENSI is an international network founded in 1986 as a decentralised international network bringing together school initiatives, educators and other stakeholders in countries worldwide to promote and understand activities promoting sustainable development in schools and their communities.
The conference included 10 sessions (full sessions & thematic workshops) each focusing on different ESD aspects. The sessions were coordinated by working groups which provided information on progress and drew up proposals for the future at the plenary session.

This session brought together different experts and educators in ESD to review the DESD progress during 2005-2008 in the 27 countries of the EU.

The discussion and recommendations arising out of the different workshop streams are compiled in this document. It is hoped that the report will serve to address questions regarding progress in the first half of the DESD. It proposes recommendations to be discussed at the World ESD Congress to be held in Bonn in March-April 2009.

The context

• The UN Decade

On 20 December 2002, the United Nations General Assembly in its 57th session adopted resolution 57/254 to establish a Decade of Education for Sustainable Development. Spanning 2005-2014, the DESD is a global platform which offers the opportunity to promote ESD at all educational levels and spaces of learning: formal, non-formal and informal, with a lifelong learning perspective.

The DESD seeks to engage a wide range of stakeholders around the globe, and to strengthen the development of innovative policies, programs and initiatives of ESD at local, national and international levels. The DESD is facilitated and promoted by UNESCO as the official international leading agency.

In October 2005, the DESD strategic framework, the International Implementation Scheme4, was released after a stakeholder consultation process. The IIS is a set of principles and strategies to which stakeholders can adhere to promote the Decade. This document is consistent in outlining a vision for a world where everyone has the opportunity to benefit from education and learn the values, behavior and lifestyles required for a sustainable future and for positive societal transformation5.

The IIS defines the DESD goals, trusts and milestones, as well as the seven strategies to move forward. Monitoring and evaluation has been identified as one of these strategies for the Decade. UNESCO, as the leading agency, has the responsibility for establishing the mechanisms to monitor and evaluate the DESD, and for reporting progress to the UNGA and UNESCO.

To this end, UNESCO established the Monitoring and Evaluation Expert Group, which recommended that UNESCO published three Global Monitoring and Evaluation reports. To elaborate these reports, the MEEG designed a Global Monitoring and Evaluation Framework6.

A draft of the first report, based on the context and structure of work on ESD in countries, will be released at the UNESCO World Conference on Education for Sustainable Development - Moving into the Second Half of the UN Decade7 in Bonn. This Conference proposes to be a gathering of key government agencies, stakeholders and experts in the field with the purpose of reviewing the strategies and achievements of the first half of the Decade.

4 The IIS can be found on: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001486/148650E.pdf
6 The GMEF can be found on the following link: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/files/56743/12137065225GMEFoperationalfinal.pdf/GMEFoperationalfinal.pdf
7 For more information about the conference see: http://www.esd-world-conference-2009.org/
• The Bordeaux conference

The French National Committee of the UN DESD organised in Bordeaux, during the French presidency of the EU, an international conference entitled, ‘Working together on ESD’ (27-29 October, 2008). This meeting proposed to provide a platform for French and international stakeholders working on ESD to reflect on and review the first half of the DESD and make recommendations for Bonn, as well as inform the remaining years of the Decade.

The conference focused not only on reviewing the contribution of France to the DESD, but also ESD activities and actions of French-speaking and non French-speaking nations were also considered. Specific attention was given to countries in the Euro-Mediterranean area and ESD progress made in EU member states was also highlighted.

The conference included 10 sessions (full sessions & thematic workshops) each focusing on different ESD aspects. The sessions were coordinated by working groups which provided information on progress and drew up proposals for the future at the plenary session.

• The role of ENSI during the Bordeaux conference

ENSI - Environment and School Initiatives was commissioned by the French National Committee to prepare and facilitate session 1: ‘Progress and possibilities for the UN DESD in EU member states’ at the Bordeaux Conference considered its missions and objectives:

- To initiate, co-ordinate and support research and school development activities, as well as publish and disseminate these activities;
- To promote international exchange, understanding and co-operation, including co-operation with other international organisations and programmes;
- To make policy recommendations and/or statements as appropriate.

ENSI, in its session at the Bordeaux Conference, brought together different experts and educators in ESD to review the DESD progress during 2005-2008 in the 27 countries of the EU. The discussion and recommendations arising out of the different ENSI workshop streams are compiled in this document. It is hoped that the report will serve to address questions regarding progress in the first half of the DESD. It proposes recommendations to be discussed at the World ESD Congress to be held in Bonn in March-April 2009.

ENSI’s session firstly hosted different key note speakers who reviewed some of the current strategies in ESD in the EU, as well as mechanisms and frameworks to monitor and evaluate ESD. These strategies were explored in greater depth by four different workshops, attended by participants at the Conference who brought their expertise and experience in the field to inform and draw recommendations for the future.

**European and global efforts to assess progress during the UN ESD**

This section summarises the presentations from invited keynote speakers who were asked to introduce current global and EU efforts and to reflect on progress during the UN DESD. The different presentations commenced after a brief introduction of the session by Michel Ricard, President of the French National Committee of the UN DESD, and were moderated by the ENSI Vice President, Christine Affolter.

The keynote speakers were:

---

8 The site of the conference: http://www.decenniefrance.fr
9 For more information about ENSI see: http://www.ensi.org
10 The French efforts have been discussed during a one-day special session and the results are presented in the proceedings of the Bordeaux conference.
Willy SLEURS outlined ENSI’s rationale, activities as well as commitment to ESD. Although the word ‘environment’ features in the name ENSI, Willy Sleirs explained that, the term environment is understood very broadly and thought to encompass physical, social and economic aspects. This more holistic interpretation dates back to ENSI’s origins. It has also consistently sought to show good practice and provide evidence through research of the need engage with new pedagogic method. Over the years, ENSI has contributed to establishing and supporting learning and research networks and to the development of innovative research projects. Willy Sleirs summarised ENSI’s key initiatives as follows:

- **The SEED Project**

The Comenius SEED project\(^{11}\) (2002-2005) addressed ESD as a driving force for school development to foster the integration of ecological issues into daily life at school. This key focus recognised and reflected international and political thinking and is in line with the UN DESD agreed-upon international principles and objectives. The SEED-project included a comparative study across 13 countries on implicit and explicit criteria in regards to eco-school developments. One of the outcomes of this study has been the Quality Criteria for ESD schools, translated so far in 17 languages.

- **The CSCT Project**

The CSCT Project\(^ {12}\) was developed as a response to the call of the UNECE Ministers of the Environment in 2003 to include ESD in curricula. It was terminated in 2007 after an extensive work of fifteen partners who develop a framework for a competency based curriculum for ESD for initial teacher training and in-service training institutions.

- **The SUPPORT Project**

The Comenius network ‘Partnership and Participation for a Sustainable Tomorrow’, SUPPORT \(^ {13}\) was established in 2007 in order to address the need to enhance quality of educational practices and material in line with the overall objective is to promote ESD in European schools.

- **CaSaLen Project**

The CaSaLen Project\(^ {14}\) aims at establishing a support system in order to encourage the school based co-operations in the Carpathian region within the existing financial frameworks (EU – LLL program, Visegrad Found). It will be organised a regular summer school as in-service training for multiplication of the collected and structured materials, knowledge and know-how for ESD teachers.

\(^{11}\) For more information about the SEED Project, see: http://www.ensi.org/Projects/QCESD/

\(^{12}\) For more information about the CSCT Project see: http://www.ensi.org/Projects/Former_Projects/CSCT/

\(^{13}\) For more information about the SUPPORT Project see: http://support-edu.org

\(^{14}\) For more information about the CaSaLen Project see: http://www.ensi.org/Projects/CaSaLen/
• **ENSI ESD young researchers Project**

The overall goal of this project\(^{15}\) is to pool the expertise of research newcomers and to develop a small researcher’s network under the umbrella of ENSI.

• **European efforts on the Decade of ESD: Education and Training** *(by Elisabeth BITTNER, Directorate for Education and Culture, European Commission)*

The Union must become the most competitive and dynamic knowledge-based economy in the world capable of sustainable economic growth with more and better jobs and greater social cohesion\(^{16}\). However, as Elisabeth Bittner remarked: “the social dimensions need more particular attention”.

Ministers of Education adopted in 2001 a report on the future objectives of education and training systems agreeing for the first time on shared objectives to be achieved by 2010 (Education and Training 2010).

In this policy context, there is a need to make economic transformation efforts as well as radical educational changes.

The European Commission supports member states via the Open Method of Coordination: through the sharing of experiences, working towards common goals and learning from what works best elsewhere. In cooperation with Member States, the Commission develops guidelines for policy action and supports the modernisation of education and training systems in Europe.

The Lifelong Learning Programme 2007-2013\(^{17}\) serves as a wide umbrella for these objectives as well as for meeting the ones defined for the Decade of Education for Sustainable Development. Lifelong Learning Programme 2007-2013 is a holistic educational programme which also promotes ESD by funding specific ESD projects. It mainly addresses and promotes all forms of education and learning within different structures and programmes: Comenius, Erasmus, Leonardo da Vinci, Grundvig, Transversal Programme and the Jean Monet Programme.

The generic actions of Lifelong Learning Programme 2007-2013 include individual mobility, partnerships, projects and networks, operating grants or reference materials. As Elisabeth Bittner affirmed: “It is an excellent opportunity to bring bottom-up approaches”.

---

### Important work of the Lifelong Learning Programme 2007-2013 related to ESD

- EU recommendation of Key Competences for Lifelong Learning\(^{18}\): The major challenges that will have to be addressed are equity and quality gaps.
- Commission Inventory of innovative practices: Elisabeth Bittner affirms that these innovative projects in the EU countries show the shift of focus from exclusively environmental to considering the social aspects of sustainable development.

The first EU Progress Report on SD\(^{19}\) shows substantial progress in the area of ESD but there is still much more that needs to be done.

---

\(^{15}\) For more information about the ENSi young researchers project visit: [http://www.ensi.org/Projects/ESD/](http://www.ensi.org/Projects/ESD/)

\(^{16}\) European Council, Lisbon, March 2000

\(^{17}\) For more information see: [http://ec.europa.eu/education/lifelong-learning-programme/doc78_en.htm](http://ec.europa.eu/education/lifelong-learning-programme/doc78_en.htm)

\(^{18}\) For more information see: [http://ec.europa.eu/education/policies/2010/objectives_en.html#basic](http://ec.europa.eu/education/policies/2010/objectives_en.html#basic)

• The German efforts and the UNESCO World conference on ESD in Bonn, 2009
(by Alexander LEICHT, German Commission for UNESCO)

In his presentation, Alexander Leicht – Head of the UN DESD in Germany - summarised some of the German and European efforts in ESD. He highlighted the results from the German EU Presidency Conference in Berlin (24-25 May, 2007), which aimed at reviewing the implementation of ESD in the EU. The conference concluded by stating that much good work in ESD has been done in the EU, but ESD is still at the margins when it comes to the broader priorities in education.

At the EU level, a substantial effort was made in the development and implementation of the EU Sustainable Development Strategy, adopted in 2006. Although ESD is included as a cross-cutting issue in the EU Strategy, A. Leicht stressed that there is a danger that ESD could be neglected in the formulation of policies with regard to the concrete sustainable development challenges of the Strategy.

Finally, he reviewed the plans and efforts of UNESCO, the German Federal Education Ministry and the German Commission for UNESCO in preparation for the UNESCO World Conference on ESD in Bonn (31 March-2 April, 2009).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objectives of the Bonn Conference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Highlighting the essential contribution of ESD to all education and to achieving quality education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Promoting international exchange on ESD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Carrying out a stock-taking of the DESD implementation and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Developing strategies for the way ahead</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• The Greek efforts on sustainable development (by Andreas Karamanos, chair of the UNECE Steering Committee on ESD)

Andreas KARAMANOS briefly summarised the ESD efforts put in place in Greece. Recognising the importance of education in fostering SD, Greece has developed and implemented a great number of actions in the country. Some of these are as follows:

- In 2006, Greece nominated a coordination body for ESD, the National Committee on ESD, which meets regularly during the year to revise the National Plan on ESD.

- Greece is working on changing the roles and scopes of its environmental education (EE) centres and re-orient them to address ESD issues.

- In November 2005, recognizing the importance of ESD and to strengthen the links in ESD amongst the Mediterranean countries, the following events were organized in Athens:
  - the Official Launch of the UN DESD in the Mediterranean region
  - the first south-east Europe sub-regional workshop of for implementation of the UNECE Strategy for ESD

- In 2010, the Government of Greece expects ESD to be wholly implemented at a school level emphasising the importance of embedding sustainable development in the curricula.

---

20 For more information about the EU SD Strategy see: http://ec.europa.eu/sustainable/welcome/index_en.htm
21 For more information about the conference see: http://www.esd-world-conference-2009.org/

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
• The UNECE Strategy for ESD: Indicators to measure the effectiveness of the implementation (by Roel van Raaij, chair of the expert group on indicators for the UNECE Strategy for ESD)

Roel van RAAIJ introduced the monitoring and evaluation mechanism that has been designed and implemented to assess the progress of the UNECE Strategy for ESD. This Strategy, which is specifically policy driven, is the response to the UN Decade for ESD and aims at encouraging UNECE member States to develop and incorporate ESD in their education systems: formal, non-formal and informal.

Following the recommendations and proposals of the Vilnius Framework for implementation of the UNECE Strategy for ESD (2005), the UNECE High-Level meeting established a group of experts to develop indicators to measure the effectiveness of the Strategy implementation.

As Roel van RAAIJ explained, the first step taken by the Working Group was the establishment of a framework to measure the effectiveness of the Strategy. To do this, it was important to translate the Strategy objectives into specific indicators which could show the effectiveness of each of the objectives.

These indicators would answer the questions: What do we need? What do we want? what data is available? And what methodology is available? The challenge was to collect data, as little information in ESD is available to monitor and evaluate the Strategy, especially at national levels, as well as to find evaluation methodologies in ESD. Some work on SD indicators has already been done, but the design of ESD indicators and its evaluation is still a new area to be explored.

The expert group looked at an evaluation model which could cover the process and effectiveness of the implementation of the Strategy. A questionnaire with forty-six questions was developed considering the objectives of the Strategy. The UNECE and the UNESCO questionnaires share many similarities. However, they also differ in many other aspects.

The UNECE indicators were used to report progress on the Belgrade Conference in 2007: Learning from Each Other. Thirty-six countries sent their National Implementation Reports and a data base of ‘good practices’ was set up. These helped inform the effectiveness of the first phase of the Strategy at the Belgrade Conference.

Roel van Raaij concluded his presentation with recommendations on how to improve the monitoring and evaluation of ESD.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations to monitor and evaluate ESD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation between environmental and educational sectors (and others)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adoption of a multi-stakeholder approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-assessment should be considered a ‘learning process’ in itself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting countries in their reporting exercise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training for National Focal Points in monitoring and evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity building in monitoring and assessment at all levels</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

22 The UNECE Strategy for ESD can be found at: http://www.unece.org/env/esd/
23 More information about the UNECE expert group: http://www.unece.org/env/esd/SC.EGI.htm
Daniella Tilbury presented the DESD as a “worldwide movement which seeks to improve opportunities and quality of education”. Underpinning the UN DESD, she argued, is an assumption that education can change the world. A more peaceful, equitable and socially just world is required for the achievement of sustainable development.

Some forms of education are more aligned with this vision of the world. These involve critical reflective thinking, participatory learning, systemic thinking and values clarification. Daniella Tilbury illustrated the importance of these processes to the achievement of a more sustainable future and the realities underpinning social change for sustainable development.

She argued that it was important to acknowledge the ambitious nature of the DESD as well as the complexity underpinning ESD. These, she argued, provide a context for understanding the DESD monitoring and evaluation exercise.

Then she moved on to review the Global Monitoring and Evaluation process. She explained that UNESCO, as the DESD leading agency, is required to report progress on the implementation of the DESD to the UNGA in 2010 and to UNESCO Executive Board every two years. To assist with developing an evaluation and reporting process, UNESCO established the MEEG – Monitoring and Evaluation Expert Group. The MEEG, composed of ESD and evaluation experts from across the globe recommended that UNESCO published three Global Monitoring and Evaluation reports each with a different focus.

### The DESD Global Reports

- 2009: contexts and structure on ESD in countries
- 2011: Process and learning
- 2015: Impacts and outcomes

The MEEG also designed a Global Monitoring and Evaluation Framework (GMEF) based on the ESD major thrusts for the DESD and global milestones defined in the IIS.

### Aims of the GMEF

- To raise awareness amongst stakeholders about the DESD
- To provide opportunities for reflection and learning
- To monitor progress across a range of sectors (formal education, community, government, business, etc.)
- To assess changes in context and structures, processes and learning as well as outcome and impact
- To provide a regional as well a global map of progress
- To assess the contribution of UNESCO to the DESD and the lessons learnt in the process of implementation
The GMEF includes self-reporting, participatory monitoring and expert evaluation in order to validate the data and engage as many stakeholders as possible in the process. The GMEF will use questionnaires, stakeholder consultation, longitudinal assessments, self-reporting process and portfolio of evidence.

The indicators defined in the GMEF will help assess ESD progress during the DESD. Different types of indicators have been defined to establish whether the DESD is making a difference: status indicators, facilitative indicators, learning indicators, effect indicators and performance indicators.

A draft of the first Global DESD report will be released at the UNESCO World Conference on Education for Sustainable Development in Bonn, and will document and review progress specifically with regards to changes in ESD contexts and structures at the national and regional levels.

At the start of her presentation, D. Tilbury asked whether perhaps the DESD goals were too ambitious given the lack of resources to support its implementation and the complex nature of ESD. In her conclusion, she returned to this question arguing that the First Global Report will not provide evidence of how the world has changed as a result of education but will seek to establish whether education contexts and national systems have improved to promote change for a more sustainable future.

Workshops

This section provides a brief introduction to the key questions and findings from the four workshops stream which took place in the session. The workshops were:

- Workshop 1: The whole institutional approach to ESD and the role of school in society (Facilitators: Michela Mayer and Eugenia Flogaitis)
- Workshop 2: A systemic approach to curriculum change in educational institutions (Facilitators: Maryse Clary and Guy Turchany)
- Workshop 3: Professional educational competences in ESD (Facilitators: Mercè Junyent and Regina Steiner)
- Workshop 4: The role of social learning in the attainment of sustainable development (Facilitators: Roel van Raaij, Antoine Heideveld and Ingrid Mulà)

**Workshop 1:**

The whole institutional approach to ESD and the role of school in society

A whole institutional approach is a relatively new concept and raises questions about existing institutional routines and structures.

The UNECE describes the "whole institutional approach" as one in which all aspects of an institution (internal operations and external relationships) are reviewed and revised in the light of SD/ESD principles. Each institution should decide on its own actions addressing the three overlapping spheres of: campus, curriculum and community.

Within a whole institutional approach, ESD is recognised as a process which contributes to the institutions to become "learning institutions". Such organisations find opportunities to reflect on their aims, procedures and actions.

These institutions are also underpinned by internal and external collaborative opportunities; ‘learning how to learn’ strategies; and a focus on preparing for the future.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions proposed in workshop 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What evidence do we have that the whole institutional approach has been recognised as relevant in the European and non-European educational systems?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How much has this idea been diffused and how much institutional support has it received?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What organisational/institutional changes are needed in order to transform educational institutions into ‘learning organisations’ and ‘core social centres’ for the local communities?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What has been learned from the experiences and examples of good practice?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What advice can we offer to schools and HEIs that are already engaged in these processes?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What recommendations can we make to European, national and international educational authorities?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key points arising from the discussions in workshop 1:**

**Fundamental elements of the whole institution approach**

- The ability to work together: teachers need to find ways of working collaboratively together, but they must also seek opportunities to interact with civil society, policy makers, staff, parents, and other stakeholders.
- Networking and research.
- Bottom-up as well as top-down actions.

**Needs for a whole institution approach**

- Policy engagement and institutional support;
- Specific measures and materials to train educators;
- To avoid the risk of marginalisation of institutions which take this approach;
- An anthropocentric attitude in ESD: learners at the centre;
- Empowering learners through participation and ownership;
- Maintaining the ownership of this process at a very basic level, collaborating with the local community, looking for private/public partnerships, following the principle of subsidiarity in an atmosphere of open democracy;
- Understanding that ESD is different from EE: ESD does not forget nature or the limits of natural resources but civil/democratic society is at the centre; ESD deals also with lifestyles and sustainable consumption.
• **Workshop 2:**
  **A systemic approach to curriculum change in educational institutions**

The problems related to SD are characterized by complexity. ESD integrates many fields of knowledge that interact to create new understandings. ESD needs to understand this type of complexity to avoid its simplification. To understand these complex realities, there is a need to develop strategies with a systemic approach. This corresponds to a new way of thinking rather than the application of a new technique or method.

ESD implies the development of reflective and action oriented projects and working at local levels. It demands an active approach of learning through experiencing which can help to stimulate the emotional, ethical and behavioral attributes associated with ESD.

ESD cannot be exclusive to schools. Governmental and non-governmental organisations and the business sector also need to be involved. Active partnerships are needed to develop better guidance and training for citizens.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions proposed in workshop 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What evidence of a systemic approach to ESD in education and teacher education?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Do teacher education programmes and processes integrate ESD concepts and new methodologies of teaching and learning?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are the current levels of support for these types of educational project and for field work in schools?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What collaborations exist between schools, local businesses, NGOs, civil society, media?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key points arising from the discussions in workshop 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The concept of sustainable development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The systemic approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Active learning project work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Networking as a method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Local partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reaching beyond the school walls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Defining new roles of pupils, such as becoming active citizens and eco-managers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Values for sustainable development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• **Workshop 3:**
  **Professional educational competences in ESD**

Most countries have already taken significant steps towards implementing ESD. However, whereas there is considerable documentation on criteria and competences for SD, few studies are available regarding competences in ESD.

A comprehensive example of competences on Education for Sustainable Development is the CSCT-Project\(^2\), which is a framework for a competency-based curriculum for ESD for initial teacher training and in-service training.

\(^2\) For more information about the CSCT-Project see: [http://www.csct-project.org/](http://www.csct-project.org/)

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
The CSCT model proposes five essential competence domains:

- Knowledge
- Systems thinking
- Emotions
- Ethics and Values
- Action

These competences are geared towards the overall purposes for ESD:

- Teaching (and communicating)
- Reflecting and Visioning
- Networking

These competences are also designed to integrate professional dimensions of the teacher role:

- Teacher as an individual
- Teacher in the educational institution
- Teacher in society

ESD neither demands new specific subjects nor extra work. ESD asks for:

- A new vision of teaching and learning
- A systemic approach to real life problems
- New competences in education
### Questions proposed in workshop 3

- What progress has been made in the first half of the DESD in terms of professional competences for teachers?
- What is the status quo in our respective countries – what are the opportunities and the challenges?
- What do we need to focus on next and what do we need to improve?
- What advice can we offer about the nature of teacher education and training for ESD?
- What recommendations can we provide to the authorities responsible for teacher education?

### Key points arising from the discussions in workshop 3

#### Some good examples for promoting ESD in teacher education

- To carry out new research in pilot schools and mainstream these approaches.
- To use active learning approaches in teacher education for ESD, taking guided experiences in school and sharing these experiences for discussion within the teacher training group.
- To organise workshops that target all those involved in the life of the school: teachers, staff, and parents.
- An ESD programme that targeted teachers, pupils and parents to learn together. This example was supported and funded by companies.

#### Discussion points in workshop 3

- There is a lack of teacher trainers who are knowledgeable in ESD issues.
- Across countries there are different ESD approaches and varied concepts around ESD but there is no co-operation or information exchange.
- It seems that the potential for ESD is greater in early years education but in later phases of education, the curriculum is more subject-based and less amenable to ESD.
- There are differences among countries in the effectiveness of top-down and bottom-up approaches; the positive driving factor is that demand comes from within each society.
- Although ESD has implications for all parts of the educational sector, the main pressure is on teachers, who are considered to be at the core of ESD.
- Tensions involved in using good practice as an incentive: this can be an inspiration but can also suppress the initiative and creativity of individual teachers.
- A high importance is placed on the teacher’s responsibility for ESD. Therefore teachers need encouragement and support to work on ESD so that they are not made to feel guilty and demotivated.
- Teacher training should involve teachers learning together with business sector professionals.
- It is important for teachers to be able to benefit from feedback from pupils.
- ESD is socially relevant and can address contemporary concerns, including the search for sense and meaning.
- There is a lack of quality assessment for ESD processes and practice.
Workshop 4: The role of social learning in the attainment of sustainable development

The UNECE Strategy and the UNESCO IIS for the Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (DESD) consistently emphasise that ESD includes formal, non-formal and informal learning.

ESD has a broad lifelong learning perspective, not just formal education systems. However, most resource allocation has been in formal education to date and little investment has been made available in other sectors.

In the Programme Learning for Sustainable Development in the Netherlands, three levels of learning activity have been defined:

1. Individual learning
2. Learning organisations
3. Learning society

The idea of the ‘learning society’ includes the concept of ‘social learning’.

Social learning is the process by which stakeholders learn together around a mutual interest or topic, exchanging ideas, views, problems and possible solutions.

Social learning is not a spontaneous process, it has to be structured and managed and is most effective if it is also evaluated as part of the process.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of social learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Uncertainty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reflection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Respect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Empathy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Emancipatory learning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions proposed in workshop 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What evidence is there in Europe of new alliances and new strategies in social learning for sustainable development?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What good educational practices have been developed and have become part of our understanding of social learning for ESD?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What recommendations can we give to promote social learning during the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key points arising from the discussions in workshop 4:

### Discussion points on social learning

- The term ‘social learning’ is not recognised by most of the participants. Mediation and participatory approaches are terms often used instead.
- In most countries, examples of social learning are becoming more common. Some of them were highlighted in the workshop by the participants.

Sustainable Development problems need to be tackled in ways that have not yet been fully explored. Social learning processes seem to have potential meaning and value for all stakeholders. However, social learning is not yet part of the mainstream in educational practice.

- The most common approach to date has been driven by top-down decision making in government authorities. Ministries of Education alone cannot stimulate social learning.
- Other organisations must be encouraged to explore and promote social learning, especially those with lifelong learning remits.

### Conclusions and recommendations

This section presents the recommendations for the future implementation of the DESD and for consideration at the Bonn conference "Moving into the Second Half of the UN Decade (31 March - 2 April, 2009)".

### Strategic sector level approaches to stimulate further ESD innovation

- Communities and local authorities should support changes to school premises in order to enable more coherent ‘whole institution’ ESD strategies to be put in place.
- Communications, partnerships and networking between academics, schools and businesses should be improved and extended.
- Teaching and learning methodologies should be improved, starting from teacher education, to support the systemic approaches envisaged for the curriculum.
- Public awareness should be raised to ensure that there is civic support for whole institutional change for ESD.
- Networks should be developed in order to exchange experiences, to promote partnerships across civil society and to compare practice at national and international levels.
- Strategic attention to the professional competencies that will be required for teachers seeking to promote ESD with formal education.
- Contextualization in terms of national priorities is an essential component of comprehensive and effective ESD.
- Promotion, support and policy development on social learning.
### The whole institutional approach to ESD and the role of school in society

National strategies need to take account of the "whole institutional" approach to ESD:

- Institutional autonomy with the time and freedom to create strategies that will enable real changes to be introduced into curricula;
- Educational approaches that create critical, reflective capabilities in learners, rather than attempting to change particular behaviours;
- Strategies and guidelines for educators and headmasters where aims and processes and evaluation tools are included;
- Enlarged learning environments open to nature, to real life and to social debate;
- Participatory approaches to decision-making within schools so that all parties take a role in developing strategies for ESD.

### A systemic approach to curriculum change in educational institutions

To fully integrate ESD into curricula and teaching practice on a wider scale, further attention is needed to the following aspects of teaching and learning:

- Ways to create more clarity about the values of ESD and its systemic approach, for example the processes required to integrate ESD epistemologies into teacher training.
- Project learning based on SD issues that includes integrated planning for interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary working (e.g. teacher meetings, classroom time and reflection time).
- New learning roles for pupils to become active learners responsible for their own decisions and to encourage co-learning and dialogue-based approaches between teachers and pupils.

### Professional educational competences in ESD

- More emphasis is needed in initial and continuing professional development to encourage learning among colleagues in practical and creative ways, not only on a theoretical basis.
- Teacher training can draw on existing concepts and initiatives (e.g. eco-school/global schools) and develop them further in support of the ‘whole institution’ approach.
- Teacher training must take account of systemic approaches to teaching and learning, including methodologies and assessment strategies, as well as content and SD topics.
- Further discussion is needed about the degree to which professional ESD competences for teachers should be articulated at policy level and how they can be part of professional development processes.
- Strategic consideration is needed regarding the relationship between competences for ESD and for related issues such as lifelong learning.
Social learning in the attainment of sustainable development

- The DESD is an essential platform for promoting social learning and ensuring that resources are directed towards it as a policy priority. Social learning can be supported by stimulating cross-sectoral learning and by further exploration of the connections to lifelong learning agendas and the most suitable organisations to involve.

- The DESD is an opportunity to gather information about social learning initiatives taking place in different countries and to use this information to inform policy-making and provide examples of existing practice to national governments.

- It is important to generate greater understanding about the benefits of social learning and the types of learning process involved. Social learning processes take more time and resources; therefore it is necessary to clearly articulate their additional value and benefits.

************
Session 2

How are teachers integrated into the educational continuum along with other stakeholders committed to a socially-oriented sustainable development project?

Summary

• Introduction (Pascal BOYRIES, IA-IPR, Academy of Grenoble, France)
• Presentation of ESD initiatives carried out in France in Regions
  - Initiatives in Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur (Annick DELHAYE, Vice-Chair of the Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur PACA region with responsibility for sustainable development)
  - Initiatives in Franche-Comté (Christophe BERGEROT, sustainable development officer, Franche-Comté Region, responsible for Agenda 21 programmes in senior schools)
• Open-floor debate

Moderator: Renée-Paule BLOCHET (ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy)

Introduction

by Pascal BOYRIES
IA-IPR, Grenoble administrative Academy

I am an Academy Inspector, and Regional Teaching Inspector (IA-IPR) for history/geography in the Grenoble administrative Academy. I'm also responsible with respect to ESD for State education within this Academy, and I formerly had the same responsibility in the Toulouse Academy from 2005 to 2007. I have been working on this with Pierre JOZIN, IPR for life and earth sciences.

Firstly, I would like to remind you of the values promoted by the Decade for Sustainable Development, particularly the socially-oriented project by the United Nations for the Decade 2005-2014. This involves lifelong education to train citizens to be more committed, more participative and capable of working towards intelligent use of the planet's natural resources, capable of improving their environment and capable of improving economic and social relations. I believe that one of the key terms in this introduction is the word "citizen".

For the French Department of Education, ESD is an educational priority which has been reaffirmed by all circulars issued over the last few years. The first dates back to January 2004, deals with environmental education for sustainable development and launched generalisation by suggesting a number of different avenues. The second dates from March 2007, talks in terms of education for sustainable development and unveils three major strategies: presence in syllabuses, E3Ds (education for sustainable development approaches) and the training of staff.

Furthermore, ESD is also present in the common core of knowledge and competencies, which is related mostly to lower secondary schools. It is not present in upper secondary
schools, although there is an impact on what happens there as a result of initiatives carried out in lower secondary schools.

The objective of ESD within state education is to provide training in citizenship to alter behaviours. This can also be seen in a number of elements present in the 2007 circular in particular, notably the following: understanding the unity and complexity of the world about us, training in a scientific and prospective approach, teaching the notion of doubt and training in critical analysis and teaching how to make responsible choices.

In terms of strategy, it has arrived in various disciplines through their syllabuses, in order to provide students with a sound scientific culture in a variety of disciplines.

Furthermore, establishments engaged in a sustainable development approach allow synergies to be created between everything going on in the establishment both in terms of implementation, gestures and actions and in terms of educational thought within the various disciplines and projects, together with all stakeholders.

There is also a need for co-operation between disciplines to avoid potentially very harmful partitioning and/or comprehension via a single discipline which would necessarily be incomplete.

This arrival has taken place via classes and transverse measures and courses which are to be found in lower secondary education. A whole series of measures, most of them incorporated into student and teacher timetables, also enable teachers to engage in co-operation between disciplines and implement sustainable development elsewhere besides the class in their discipline.

Projects may operate at a number of levels. For instance, a particular teacher's project, generally carried out with a partner, a team plus partners, or the establishment. In this instance the logic is that of an establishment with a sustainable development approach or in the less extensive mentality of an environmentally responsible establishment or one in which Agenda 21 has been deployed.

In order for this to work, it is necessary for teachers and all staff in the establishment to be trained. In all academies, training courses in sustainable development and education for sustainable development are offered on the basis of individual disciplines or on a cross-disciplinary basis.

Having said that, within the Department of Education there are two interpretations in terms of teaching relating to primary and secondary-level education. While primary school teachers have a degree level and specialise in a particular discipline, secondary-level teachers have more specialised training than those in primary education. Furthermore, this specialisation is further reinforced by their work in their discipline on a daily basis as they teach.

On the other hand, primary school teachers are continually engaged in cross-disciplinary education with their pupils. They are fully responsible for the pupil from the moment the latter enters their classroom until they leave, irrespective of the discipline in question. In secondary education, it is more difficult to implement this cross-disciplinary approach because pupils move from one class to another, and there may be a complete hiatus between various classes if teachers do not communicate amongst themselves. It may even be that the message is different or contradictory depending on the discipline in question.

There may also be differences in terms of the population. There are very significant differences in terms of educational development between pupils in primary education and those in secondary education, and it is clear that the same level of scientific information and culture cannot be provided at every level. Work may be done on the same subject but it will be done differently at different points in a pupil's education.

In addition, there are differences in the level of critical analysis. In lower secondary school, civic education classes include training in critical analysis, but this is done on the basis of preselected elements. In upper secondary school, students are required to supply their own
opinions and work on these alongside the opinions they may encounter elsewhere. This training in critical analysis is indispensable, particularly as regards the issue of sustainable development.

As regards this difference in culture between primary and secondary education, attitudes with respect to partners will also differ. In primary education, the logic is one of delegation of service, whereas in secondary education, the thinking is more in terms of provision of service. This means that in primary education teachers may often delegate action to a partner who takes over, while in secondary education, this is more likely to form part of a teaching project. Nevertheless, a variety of practices exist depending on the teachers, the academies and the départements.

The world of education therefore supports the socially-oriented project of the 2005-2014 Decade and has equipped itself with the resources to implement it.

As a minimum, the awareness of all pupils has been raised with respect to sustainable development, although the term "awareness" is problematic because some pupils still need to be made aware when they enter education, others become aware in primary education, in secondary education, in lower or upper secondary school, which may lead to the phenomenon of saturation if all we do is raise awareness, which can lead to some pupils exhibiting a form of rejection.

Is school the central arena for education for sustainable development? One can have the impression that school is something of a Gordian knot through which everything must enter and exit.

School offers formal education and sustainable development, but there are other educational arenas including the home, cultural spaces, leisure areas and the workplace; school is also one of these spaces for the teachers and staff who work there. Between these various spaces, there was also what I term interstices - for instance, the street - in which a torrent of information and educational elements are also offered to students.

Furthermore, there are a number of stakeholders: families, local authorities, government agencies, NGOs, the media and businesses, each with their own specific area of intervention.

Families are active particularly in the home, businesses in the workplace, media at home but also very much in these interstices, and local authorities are active in all of them. Having said that, much of what they do is carried out via schools, since the latter are a fundamental element for most local authorities.

Schools work extensively with Regional Councils, Département Councils and some city councils. The same applies for government agencies who are active in all these spaces and who are privileged partners of schools or act within schools themselves to disseminate ideas, notions and concepts relating to sustainable development.

Elsewhere, NGOs are highly active in cultural and leisure spaces, as well as in the interstices, and in addition to being active within schools.

Interests are therefore concentrated on schools, which leads to the notion of a kind of dissemination to the home, interstices, leisure spaces and, later, the workplace.

As a result, schools are under immense pressure from all social stakeholders. This may be due to the fact that school populations are malleable. Pupils are in their formative years, and what they experience may have repercussions throughout their life. It may also be due to the fact that during school hours, the population is captive, so it is easier to intervene, more actively and with a greater degree of control.

The various people involved may also have the impression of a vacuum, perhaps thinking schools are not doing enough in the realm of sustainable development. There is also a desire on the part of some stakeholders to impose their interpretation of sustainable development
and what should be done in this respect. This means that tensions arise between schools and those who wish to be active within these same schools.

Thus, schools are offered resources and teaching packs, and in my capacity as a representative of the State, my alarm bells always start ringing when a partner offers a teaching pack. This is because not everyone understands the same thing by "teaching". Schools may be offered diagnoses, advice or lectures which are grounded in values to which the school cannot possibly subscribe. The three major errors which can be encountered are doomsaying, dogmatism and syncretism.

Sustainable development becomes something of a religion with rites which need to be perpetuated and gestures of which the meaning is neither explained nor discussed. My view is that school is there to combat this risk of error.

In the face of such pressures and errors, the educational system or particular schools may sometimes reject potential partners. As a result, schools throw up barriers. This means NGOs register with local or regional education authorities in order to have permission to work in schools. Blacklists and blue lists are drawn up, mostly on an informal basis. In addition, schools have done a lot in terms of training teachers to raise their awareness of these pressures and remind them of the importance of educational values, but also of the importance of working with partners. Schools cannot function in isolation, but they need to avoid certain errors.

Sometimes we encounter teachers who are not sufficiently informed or else highly militant. Consequently, they may blindly subscribe to the view put forward by a given partner. If this occurs, formative education is no longer taking place. It is true that it is difficult for a teacher who is highly committed to an NGO not to be militant in the classroom. However, in the classroom, they need to take the stance of an educator, which is not always an easy shift for them to make.

We are no longer in a pioneering phase, but for many years teachers involved in sustainable development were pioneers and therefore militants. What is more, some teachers feel that they are insufficiently trained or informed and hand everything over to the external partner, who may have their own shortfalls.

There is evidence of rejection of sustainable development by one section of the world of education. In such instances, when you talk with these people, you realise that the educational issue has not been properly apprehended. They see sustainable development as being about teaching pupils to perform a certain number of actions and not as providing them with a particular education. Sometimes, some stakeholders have a vision which is less than exemplary and which is based on a dogmatic interpretation; they do not realise that as educators, they need to train students to understand the keys in order for them to be able to respond to these different interpretations and form their own opinions.

Schools frequently call on NGOs. In some instances, only one association is involved, which I find slightly problematic. In other instances, several associations are involved and I think this is much more positive. It allows the possibility of several interpretations of a particular issue relating to sustainable development.

Local authorities are enormously involved if only by providing funding since local councils are responsible for primary schools, département councils for lower secondary schools and regional councils for upper secondary schools [in France]. As regards intervention by local authorities, there is sometimes a degree of suspicion. However, the need is there and local authorities fund a large number of projects and are therefore vital. However it may happen that they arrive with their interpretation of sustainable development and that this may be somewhat different from that promoted by the Department of Education.

Government agencies are also involved and generally inspire more confidence because they depend on the state. However, they are less called upon than local authorities. They also provide funding, but have a less hands-on approach.
As to businesses, there are two tendencies. On the one hand, some teachers reject the corporate world and do not invite them. On the other hand, as a result of their original training or other measures such as fourth-year secondary professional induction, some teachers launched projects relating to sustainable development and explore the world of business. Rejection is actually often based on insufficient knowledge of the world of business.

Once this exploration has begun, businesses become involved in the educational environment and bring with them their interpretation of sustainable development.

For my part I do not see many teachers working in-company during the course of their lessons. This is despite the fact that most companies, particularly multinationals, are doing some very interesting things in the field of sustainable development.

Universities have the full confidence of schools but are not often invited to do things outside a limited number of one-off initiatives. Universities tend to be more involved in training trainers rather than in schools. There are issues of availability, but teachers do not often think of calling on universities.

Parents play a fundamental role in the education of pupils, who are their children. Some tend to be too present in school, militating and attempting to impose their interpretation, which generates a degree of suspicion. Others have a more hands-off approach and delegate everything to do with learning and the learning process to the school.

The importance, which is attached to school and to educational values instilled in school by various stakeholders in society with respect to sustainable development, is therefore clear. Schools are seen as a central arena for implementing education for sustainable development. Is this the case for all stakeholders? We have seen that parents are somewhat on the fringes of this view. Are schools really such a central arena? Is it simply because stakeholders view schools as being a central arena that they have become one?

Whatever the truth of the matter, there is interaction between the various partners. What can be done in order for there to be consistency in the education given and in the educational continuum between the in-school and out-of-school environments?

Some points of difference between interpretations of sustainable development often relate to a different understanding of terminology.

So for instance, not everybody understands the same thing by "education" even within the educational system itself. For some teachers, education means teaching pupils, but does not at all involve teaching them critical analysis in order for them to turn into active citizens taking responsible decisions having analysed all the various elements at their disposal. For some partners, education simply means telling pupils what to do.

The idea of the validity of information comes up repeatedly. What does valid information consist of? Is it always valid? Information which is valid for some stakeholders is not valid for others. The fact is that when most stakeholders carry out a project in a school, they present their information as having been put together on the basis of valid information.

This leads to discrepancies and results in differences and conflicts between the various approaches. In some cases, people create anxiety, scaring pupils to force a reaction, which is something to which I am firmly opposed. If partners arrive with this sort of approach, there is inevitably a problem. Proposals that represent only one voice can also create problems; I prefer it when a number of views are put forward which are then discussed. Moreover, partners may be more or less disciplined in the way they work, with respect to the data which forms the basis of their work and in how they define their terms. For some partners, the objective is what counts above all else, attitudes must change at all costs, and so scant regard is paid to the means used.

For my part, as an educator with responsibility for education, means are very important indeed. Finally, if there is disagreement as to values, there is no way forward at all. If there is
no continuity between the values of the partner and those of the Department of Education, the objectives and fundamentals are not compatible and the situation is unworkable.

We therefore need to manage to make all stakeholders working within schools aware of all this. This requires a certain amount of organisation; I am going to explain how we do things in Grenoble, but many other academies function on a similar basis. The person in charge of orders is the rector. Next, in order to oversee training and ensure a uniform message, there are two IA-IPRs (life and earth sciences and history/geography).

There is also a project officer, a group of trainers, and establishment contacts, in other words a teacher in each establishment who is responsible for disseminating information and feeding back, and the teachers who do the work on the ground. In Grenoble, there are also département contacts who intervene to a greater or lesser extent depending on how things work with primary-level education.

The Academy Inspector and Director of The Department of Education Département Services (IA-DDEN) plays a key role because they will enable sustainable development to be deployed in primary-level education.

To connect these various players together, there is an academy mailing list, academy websites and everything relating to training.

Staff training is very much geared to educational issues in the broadest sense of the term. The aim is to make sure teachers understand that what is taking place is education and that the way in is through syllabuses. For education to be possible, as well as discussion, debate and decision-making, a sound scientific culture, spaces for discussion and debate and project-based implementation are all required.

Schools are made up of a whole group of people, and one of the difficulties the Department of Education faces is that many of them are on their way through. On average, pupils stay four years in lower secondary school and three in upper secondary school. Some teachers remain in their establishment for many years, but there is quite some mobility even among those with permanent positions. Others do not have permanent positions and therefore change schools every year, which changes the game within each establishment.

In addition, there are what are termed non-teaching staff, even if they do play an educational role in terms of example. This term covers all those who are not teachers (administrative and maintenance staff) who come into contact with pupils. Their attitude to pupils and vice versa may not be consistent with the training given. The classic case is inciting pupils to sort waste paper, but not administrative staff. Some projects make it necessary to consider the school community as a whole, including staff who are employed not by the Department of Education but by local authorities. How can these people be trained and involved?

What sort of example does the school as a whole set? To inform and educate requires an example to be set.

For this to be consistent, work needs to be done to ensure messages are consistent across the board. At the level of administrative academies, contracts exist in order to agree joint action procedures. This ensures that projects are not sprinkled randomly across different stakeholders. The water agency will deal with things relating to water, the Region will deal with projects relating to the region. This enables work to be shared out, achieves economies of scale and makes things more effective.

It also provides an opportunity to get to know others better and overcome personal prejudices, a fundamental requirement for working together. One thing which we are very good at within the Department of Education and which we work very hard at is how people view the world of business, non-profit organisations and local authorities. Learning to get to know other people is the first positive aspect of these forums for working together. It is necessary to have a clear definition of the role and objectives of each and for a complementary way of working to emerge.
It is important to avoid school being a sanctuary which becomes a haven for syncretism with respect to sustainable development. It is therefore fundamental to compare and contrast the viewpoints of the various partners of the educational system and the world of education and achieve consensus on shared values.

To do this, opportunities to meet together must be encouraged; establishments and regional education authorities set up a number of different forums for this. Of course, there are all the meetings with the various stakeholders, but steering committees for establishments which are engaged in a sustainable development approach are also significant meeting places. This is because steering committees often include other stakeholders besides the Department of Education.

One partner with a particular role is the parents. On the one hand there are militant parents who are committed and have plenty of initiative but to seek to impose their view. On the other, there are parents who disagree and think that sustainable development is not the most important issue. Then again, there are neutral parents, absent or trusting blindly: at the end of the day, they constitute a secondary target. By educating their children, we are also aiming to alter behaviour within the family circle.

How can we involve parents? This is a problem faced by most establishments engaged in a sustainable development approach. Parents have other worries and there are issues of time. One avenue is invitations to one-off events and generally speaking, there is a good turnout of parents on such occasions.

Renée-Paule BLOCHET, André BOLLARD and I have drawn up a number of questions. We believe that one of these in particular is central: what form of governance should exist between stakeholders in education such that this educational continuum can exist?

Is school really at the centre of this educational continuum with respect to sustainable development? If so, what can be done to ensure that everyone works together? If not, how can an educational continuum be achieved?

Do the various stakeholders agree on the values relating to sustainable development promoted by schools?

What role should parents have? How can they be incorporated in this approach and be reminded of their value as educators with respect to these issues?

What measures can be put in place so that children, who will one day become adults, perhaps even decision-makers, can be in an educationally consistent environment in which they are not subject only to a single view but not exposed to too many contradictory elements either?

Renée-Paule BLOCHET, ESD Trainer, Grenoble Academy

This introduction has established two things: the elements and the stakeholders in the debate concerning the "educational continuum" focused on the child, now a pupil, now "the child of", now "subscriber to".

How can we be educationally consistent with respect to this child in a global, environmental, social and economic context whose urgency adds a degree of pressure? The urgent nature of the issues is not sufficient cause for us to lose our heads.

The presentation you have just heard has provided you with a view of where things stand with respect to this continuum. I would therefore like to invite you to add to it, counter it or support it with reference to your own approach, whether you are a teacher in state education, a member of a non-profit organisation, work for local government or are in business.

Following this, we will be able to identify key questions to form the basis for work on proposals to be selected by this group and put forward when the final proposals are submitted.
In the PACA Region we have held onto the term "environmental education for sustainable development" (EESD). I hope that ultimately we will be able to talk in terms of "education for sustainable development" (ESD) but we felt it was important that the environment was not forgotten.

We encourage local stakeholders to come up with projects which we hope are innovative. Universities, particularly Provence university research laboratories, work with us on action-based research with local stakeholders. This is a tripartite project involving the ADEME, the PACA Region and universities relating to the area covered by the Region.

In addition, we are structuring the regional format of environmental education by supporting the emergence of topical non-profit association networks. For instance, there is the MER network and structuring networks such as the regional consultation platform for environmental education. This platform brings together all local stakeholders within our area to enable them to have a common culture in this field. The various stakeholders are: the two regional education authorities (Nice and Aix-Marseille), decentralised government bodies (the DIREN, the DRAF, the DRJS, the ADEME, the Water Agency, the six département Councils, local education networks and regional natural parks.

We support teaching programmes relating to the collective integrated management of natural areas, as well as fifteen associations under contract.

During 2007, we carried out awareness-raising for over 120,000 pupils and over 150,000 people out of school. We carried out some 6,000 local initiatives.

We have established our regional policy orientations regarding environmental education for sustainable development and for sustainable development together, in order to make regional involvement clear.

We have defined priorities and rationalised our involvement, structuring this with institutional and non-profit partners, and we are currently assessing our regional policy in EESD. To provide this regional clarity, in March 2007 we established a framework decision for EESD regional policy promoting appropriation of sustainable development issues. We have taken to heart the objective of promoting changes in behaviour and the Region has a shared culture with the Department of Education in this respect. Finally, we are also promoting the emergence of individual and collective behaviours which are relevant to specific regional concerns. Our region is somewhat particular; with the Mediterranean, we do not face the same issues as in the Nord-Pas-de-Calais region, for instance.

We have several avenues of involvement. Via local stakeholders, we promote the construction of quality EESD projects which do not unfairly favour one part of the region. More particularly, we promote pilot projects at the regional level and work at implementing an assessment process so that all this can form part of an approach in which progress is being made.

In conclusion, Pascal Boyries' introduction has shown that local authorities are called upon to a great extent. The Department of Education does not have the resources to pursue its ESD or EESD policies. For my part, I have a budget of €2m to help local stakeholders. He also described how things function within the state education system very clearly, and too how things work with local stakeholders including local authorities and non-profit associations.

Renée-Paule BLOCHET, ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

I observe a shared objective: education; and a necessity: consultation. There are a large number of stakeholders and we are at a historic moment at which all these stakeholders
who, formerly, could only act separately in their specific field, are now together with a common purpose and a single domain, with an obligation of working together in a limited time frame corresponding to the school day.

Françoise BOISSOU, Former IA-IPR SCT, Poitiers and Paris administrative Academies

When I was IA-IPR, Poitiers was a pilot Academy, as was the Region and the Poitiers Primary Teacher Training College (IUFM). The Poitou-Charentes Region carries out sustainable development initiatives aimed at upper secondary schools, with the creation of a number of High Environmental Quality schools. In addition, the region has a genuine High Environmental Quality (HEQ) policy: in addition to leaving 10% of upper secondary school budgets to be managed by pupils and teachers, it is also developing the “timber” aspect.

Personally, I would have liked the previous speakers to have emphasised that education is not the same thing as instruction. Environmental education for sustainable development involves educating in values to be shared which form part of common culture.

I think that one term which often crops up in this education in values is that of "secularism" ("laïcité"). I think that sustainable development is another field of secularism which eschews sectarianism, militancy and the gurus of every stripe which can be encountered here and there.

Explaining any sustainable development project, including those relating to north-south relations, education with respect to values, carrying out a specific project: all these help our young people develop a sense of responsibility and environmental responsibility and make them global citizens. They are indeed values, those of France and the schools of the Republic, and too those of the North-South, perhaps.

Initiatives in Franche-Comté

by Christophe BERGEROT

(Sustainable Development officer, Franche-Comté Region, with responsibility for Agenda 21 initiatives in upper secondary schools)

I would like to point out that half of the upper secondary schools in the Franche-Comté Region are involved in Agenda 21 through the work of the Region.

Mr Boyries was saying that most pupils or children are now aware of sustainable development but on the basis of my work in upper secondary schools and my discussions with many teachers and headmasters, I think there is something of a hiatus between primary school children who seem to be very aware and lower secondary school pupils. When we bring this approach into upper secondary schools, with perhaps more freedom in terms of programmes and projects, sustainable development once again enters the picture.

I myself have intervened on the subject of Environmental Quality for buildings, and indeed it came as a complete surprise to pupils to have a talk about sustainable development and energy with respect to buildings. There was a certain lack of understanding and I think this needs to be borne in mind. Pupils have been made aware but they have lost something of this awareness.

As to the link between local authorities and upper secondary schools, a level of trust has grown up over more than 20 years between Regions and headmasters and bursars. We now need to see this sort of trust established between Regions, département Councils and teachers. The latter are still apprehensive about local politics getting a foothold in teaching methods and education. When we work in upper secondary schools, we make it clear that our role is not one of teaching but we are there to assist teachers. The link with teachers must be through pedagogy, but it is not up to the Region to impose theirs.

Sustainable development cannot be imposed. Our approach is to make a request for submissions and those schools which wish to respond, do. This participative, opt-in approach
is important. If things were to be done on the basis of a mandatory circular issued by the Education Ministry, I think the core concept of sustainable development would be lost. For my part, I no longer talk in terms of environmental education for sustainable development because sustainable development includes the environment, the economy, society: it covers them all.

In conclusion, it should not be forgotten that there is a whole group of children who do not go to upper secondary school: apprentices. We are currently examining how apprenticeship training centres (CFA) which are not under the remit of The Department of Education can be educated with respect to sustainable development, since there are also pupils there who need to learn about this responsible citizenship; the same applies to private [Roman Catholic] secondary schools. While the notion of secularism may be important in sustainable development, there are also pupils in private upper secondary schools and they should not be excluded with respect to sustainable development.

Frédéric ELEUCHE, Histoire/Geography teacher - SNALC CSEN

I am from the PACA region and I am here representing the national union of lower and upper secondary schools. Some time ago I was in a meeting which was not to do with union concerns and which brought together several dozen history/geography teachers. A university professor spoke to us about Al Gore’s film and told us that an English primary school teacher had refused to show this film to his pupils and took his case to court. This English court recognised, scientifically speaking, that over half what Al Gore stated was false.

My union, SNALC, is fully agreed that education for sustainable development needs to be integrated into syllabuses, but I was surprised that it took this speech by a university professor to provoke some very strong reactions from a number of the colleagues who were present. Some kind of saturation level and/or rejection has occurred with respect to what some term the politically correct. They don't dare to say what they really think about education for sustainable development; it was because a university professor created the opportunity that several colleagues came out with it I believe this phenomenon of rejection should not be underestimated.

In conclusion, I would like to know why, amid all the initiatives carried out by The Department of Education, Mr Boyries did not mention the work done by the Committee for Education for Health and Citizenship (CESC), the election of which is mandatory in School Boards under the terms of the amended Decree dated August 30, 1985.

Renée-Paule BLOCHET, ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

The CESC is an internal body within each school which brings together all partners who have something to contribute to pupils’ health and citizenship education. The CESC was long restricted to health education with a whole aspect given over to training to prevent hazardous and addictive behaviours. Increasingly, this partnership forum within schools has been opening up to other types of action which in some cases includes a section devoted to education for sustainable development.

Pascal BOYRIES, IA-IPR, Grenoble administrative Academy

It can be observed that the involvement of the CESC varies widely from one school to another. On the whole, it is called upon very little, not even by steering committees of schools in the Agenda 21 programme, eco-responsible schools or those in a sustainable development approach. Similarly, the School Life Committee (CVL) is not called upon enough whereas it should also be on the front line in this respect. Things are being implemented, but it is true that there are still gaps and much remains to be done.

Renée-Paule BLOCHET, ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

One problem which has been raised is use by the world of education of information and resources which have been scientifically validated. Like other resources, Al Gore’s film may be disputed. This relates to global warming, about which not everybody agrees as to the
causes. How can a primary or secondary school teacher choose a resource which they deem to be educational inasmuch as it leads to discussion, debate, examination of the issues and a search for alternative solutions? How can they choose a resource which may have both supporters and detractors?

Didier MULNET, University of Auvergne

The problem with Al Gore's film is not one of use as you are using that term. Al Gore's film is not a documentary but a film which was made to persuade a political audience in the US. Using it in an educational context simply requires knowing how to use it. This is what might be termed a socially live issue. What is dangerous is not using Al Gore's film but using it badly.

Regarding the scientific debate, the Website gives the account of the court action brought against Al Gore. Nine charges were made for the film as a whole, two of them have been overturned and debate is ongoing on the other seven.

When the subject is not yet fully resolved scientifically, an appropriate attitude of caution must be adopted. The problem which has been raised here relates to the training of teachers in how to use films of this type.

Annick DELHAYE, Vice-Chair, Sustainable Development, PACA Region

I would prefer not to talk in terms of "pupils" but in terms of "young people" or "children". The subject of this session is the educational continuum and as has been said, pupils are also the "children of...", they go to out-of-school centres on Wednesdays, a sports club or cultural association - so all local stakeholders are ESD stakeholders.

Pascal BOYRIES, IA-IPR, Grenoble administrative Academy

Education for sustainable development is not there to tell pupils what is right or wrong but to give them the keys to interpret and decide for themselves whether or not they subscribe to any given argument.

For my part, my expectation is that teachers give pupils texts and documents relating to stakeholders promoting negative growth, because these entities exist.

The idea of negative growth is part of the environmental influence of Mathis Wackernagel who, with respect to development, has shown that if the ecological footprint is correlated with the HDI (human development index) it can be seen that Northern countries have a large HDI and a large ecological footprint, some states, particularly in sub-Saharan Africa, have a small HDI and a small ecological footprint, and states such as some Latin American countries lie somewhere in between. He says that the use of space is 2 hectares per individual and that a decent HDI is 0.8.

This gives an environment which would be the ideal development zone, but no country corresponds to this. This raises an issue for development because African nations need to increase their HDI without increasing their ecological footprint.

On the other hand, Western European and North American nations need to reduce their ecological footprint considerably whilst maintaining their HDI.

This is one interpretation of what sustainable development means and it raises the question of what development means. In this view, development for some nations involves reducing their ecological footprint and therefore entering negative growth in some sense.

Our vocation in the Department of Education is not to state whether or not this is a good thing but to show every caucus of opinion. Of course, this type of issue cannot be discussed with children in the initial stages of primary education. In lower secondary schools this could be a problem, but in upper secondary schools the question can be addressed via social science and history/geography classes.
Renée-Paule BLOCHET, ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

Moreover, it is not unheard-of, particularly at upper secondary level, for the proposition to be questioned. The aim of this type of education is to stimulate critical analysis so that young people can form their own opinions and take a stance with respect to choices which will need to be made in the near future. Regardless of what anyone may say, young people are soon involved in society and the life of their local district.

Mohammed GAMIZI, professor at the university of Marrakech

As university partners, we find ourselves both inside looking out and on the outside looking in. We have students in our universities and work with them in terms of education for sustainable development. At the same time, we are partners with other secondary and primary institutions.

I can confirm that we are not called upon very much at all, doubtless due to a high level of knowledge. There is a lack of connections between universities and other educational institutions which prevents a degree of vulgarisation. Research professors cannot put together teaching sheets for a given topic if they do not have the help of an educator. This connection therefore needs to be developed.

I am also Head Curator of the Marrakech Natural History Museum and in this capacity I am involved as regards "cultural spaces". This partnership is important for both schools and universities.

The notion of education for sustainable development is perfectly in line with the aims and actions of natural history museums. We work with a whole set of topics, collections and scientific documentation, and it is very interesting to be able to use this with learners by means of exhibitions and practical workshops. For our part, we have done school work including school gardens and practical workshops on groundwater and pollution.

I would like to emphasise the importance of training in a scientific approach. Our contribution as university staff is to support and reinforce the capabilities of teaching colleagues with respect to this scientific approach. Regardless of the resource being used, learners can learn how to form their own view if scientific rigour is provided.

In Morocco, the connection with universities involves setting aside 30% of course programmes for regional topics. This window has enabled us as university staff to develop topics relating to the region in textbooks. It may be good to teach lower secondary pupils about Siberia, for instance, but it is also good for them to learn about lakes, resaves and parks nearer to hand.

Participant from the Oise département council

Local stakeholders are therefore consistent with each other. However, in lower secondary schools, teachers who are committed to this type of programme suffer from a lack of recognition. They spend a lot of time on them but are not paid for this. How can time spent in consultation and preparation which is necessary to get an establishment into a sustainable development approach be paid for? This recognition could be in terms of finance, media recognition or recognition by superiors.

I would also like to say that while pupils’ critical analysis must be developed, teachers seem to be somewhat fearful of this critical analysis. What sort of support is provided during teacher training to help them when they are faced with the emergence of pupils’ critical analysis? How is this training assessed with respect to what actually happens in the classroom?

Pascal BOYRIES, IA-IPR, Grenoble administrative Academy

The time which is an issue is that devoted to projects. To what extent are teachers involved and how are they funded with respect to time spent on such projects? This relates to the choices made by teaching teams. As things stand, the orientation is to develop the autonomy
of each establishment, particularly via goal-based contracts which establishments are now required to implement. This makes it the responsibility of establishments to set priorities and synergise projects relating to sustainable development. Some establishments choose to include sustainable development issues in their goal-based contract.

Some administrative Academies provide resources to establishments on the basis of their goal-based contract. Others do not, because their view is that the establishment should make decisions about its direction and priorities on the basis of its existing budget. This means that there will be different responses depending on the Academy in question.

There are many measures devised to help projects operate. Funding by partners, specifically Regional and Département Councils, also brings in resources.

**Laurence AMICI**, Contact teacher, Lycée Jean Rostand, Strasbourg

I would like to add that I have no resources from the education ministry and that everything is on a volunteer basis. You said that care had to be taken to ensure teachers were not militant, but if they were not militant, why should they commit time and work overtime for no pay?

We are called upon to act but resources are not available consistently everywhere. It really depends on what is in place in any given establishment and local and regional education authorities.

**Pascal BOYRIES**, IA-IPR, Grenoble administrative Academy

In the Grenoble Academy, we recently met with our contact teachers and this was one of the first questions we dealt with, because here too we are calling on their militant tendencies.

Some heads of establishment are highly committed and pay contact teachers overtime, but elsewhere it is true that we are dependent on militant engagement. This is more a question of teachers who are militant within their establishment, which takes me back to 'popular education' of the 60s and 70s when teachers would go on drama and music courses during the holidays. They would then use these resources with their pupils during the school year. We are returning to this sort of militancy and this is a good thing in some respects.

At the same time, in my capacity representing the Department of Education, I am rather uneasy at the idea that this is becoming a modus operandi.

As to the fearfulness of teachers in the face of young people's critical analysis, the answer is simple: a huge amount of training needs to be done in this respect.

**Renée-Paule BLOCHET**, ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

At the same time, this relates to one of the fundamentals of the stance to be taken by a teacher. We all know how hard it is for teachers to feel at ease, and they are reassured if they have a proper grasp of the information or message to be passed on.

Educating for sustainable development will involve putting oneself in a difficult position in at least two ways.

Firstly, it is education which will encourage critical analysis.

Secondly, this education is by its very nature concerned with uncertainty. This is a difficult stance to adopt on the part of the person communicating the message and who would be reassured by well-understood information or a clear message - which they do not always have. So there may be a degree of unease or even anxiety, which is why when we train teachers and trainers we are keen to work on an approach involving education for responsible decision-making in an environment of uncertainty or even doubt.

This completely changes the image one may have had of a teacher as master of knowledge - and of their expertise and attitude.
Anne CALVET, History/Geography teacher, IUFM ESD trainer, Toulouse administrative Academy

One of the questions is to know if school lies at the heart of this continuum; I am one of those who are convinced of this, if only because we are working with future generations. I believe that there is a real agreement on the values relating to ESD among the various stakeholders in ESD.

ESD is a notion which brings people together and therein lies all its appeal. Having worked with a number of partners, I think that there is now genuine recognition of the Education for sustainable development debate and of the concept, which is emerging as an educational and scientific endorsement.

Issues of saturation, dispute and fear on the part of teachers have been mentioned. It is true that things are difficult for teachers because there is no absolute objective scientific truth. My view is that during training and even during personal reflection, two questions need to be asked: that of our own representation of sustainable development and of ESD and that of the stance to be taken with respect to pupils.

I saw something interesting done by geography teachers at the Marseille Primary Teacher Training College who had examined a number of issues. What is our personal view of this concept? How do we position ourselves with respect to it? There are three aspects of ESD: which do we feel closest to? In terms of stance, are we certification experts who are going to impose an official standard? Are we analysts who are going to examine how people see sustainable development? Are we citizens seeking to promote debate and political decisions?

We need to look at all of these kinds of thing during training; any teacher who wants to engage with these kinds of concepts has to think this sort of thing through.

As to the forthcoming geography syllabus for second-year lower secondary pupils, when we saw the pre-publication syllabus overview last June, ESD was mentioned. In the published syllabus the words "notion" and "concept" are both used. This means that we are not talking simply in terms of a scientifically established concept but really in terms of something which is open to debate.

As to connections between ESD stakeholders in general and those in schools, what can be done to create opportunities and forums to connect?

Regional Councils, for instance, are involved in ESD in three different ways: education with respect to upper secondary schools, school buildings and the environment and/or sustainable development. They already have difficulty getting together to discuss the issue of ESD. For our part, we manage by attempting to meet all three at the same time to ask them how we can work together.

Could not one answer be to consider largely inter-category training programmes, particularly with the National Training Centre for Local Government (CNFPT), which is now the main way local government staff are trained?

As to the way E3D works in establishments, how can E3D be done out of school hours when teachers are still working on the basis of a 15 or 18-hour timetable? One answer is that you cannot force structures beyond what they are capable of. We need to use what exists already, such as the CESC which is under-used, the CVL and everything relating to the School Board. I find it hard to see how people can commit to E3D programmes without a head of establishment, an administrator, several teachers and parents who are ready to go down this road.

Lastly, the issue of parent involvement seems very difficult to me as regards secondary education. They are either consumerist or react strongly or even aggressively, which raises a major issue over and above that of ESD.
Renée-Paule BLOCHET, ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

Although the issue is much larger it is nonetheless at the heart of the debate. If we want to avoid young people experiencing a dichotomy and unease at the gap between the world of their home, culture, family and roots and the learning environment, an educational continuum is indeed required. How can we build bridges between the world of the individual, society, and the world of education so as to give structure to young people?

Gaëlle LE BLOA, Multi-partner consultation forum officer, PACA Region

This forum brings together state departments and establishments, local authorities and non-profit associations, and we expect to be incorporating the world of business very shortly.

I have a lot of questions following the first part of Pascal Boyries’ presentation. It puts forward an ideal world, a framework, a clear objective and strategy, but I don’t feel things are like that on the ground. For instance, we put together action sheets with teachers, representatives from culture, farming education, local authorities and non-profit associations. One of these relates to the development of Agenda 21 eco-responsible approaches, with the preliminary requirement of a common culture. We felt it really was important to work on this notion of common culture.

The first stage involved creating a framework because everyone was agreed that on the ground the political indicators for the development of ESD were not yet really established.

I am not very familiar with texts issued by the Department of Education, but in new school syllabuses, has environmental education really been incorporated?

In terms of strategy, is there sufficient support for project environments?

In terms of E3D approaches, are there resources, even in terms of time, such that these methods which are consequential and really change the way establishments work are attainable by each establishment on the ground?

In addition, one of the questions raised by the presentation was that of whether school was the central forum of education for sustainable development. In the PACA region, for the definition of the word "education" we use that given for UNESCO by the United Nations: awareness, information, training and environmental education. But if we take "education" in its broader sense, I would say school is perhaps not the centre of education for sustainable development. Particularly in France, where the presence of the Department of Education in this education for sustainable development approach can be felt very strongly, this question needs to be examined.

If we want our workings to change and society to change with us, we need to involve children but also adults in the world of business and leisure, and I ask myself whether all these aspects fall under the remit of the Department of Education.

One answer we have found in the PACA region is the regional consultation platform. This is still at an experimental stage and has its faults even if it does work fairly well. Perhaps multi-partner action plans are required at a national level.

Annick DELHAYE, Vice-Chair, Sustainable Development, PACA Region

In the PACA Region, transversality exists as a result of sustainable development because of its three pillars (economic, social and environmental). We work together with my colleagues who are involved in upper secondary schools, education and services, and we have implemented an Environmental Quality reference handbook which has now been incorporated at the level of upper secondary schools.

We have also implemented Agenda 21 for upper secondary schools. On an opt-in basis, nine such schools volunteered last year following a request for proposals. They were supported with project management assistance in the first year to establish a diagnosis, in partnership
with the Academies of Nice and Marseille and the DRAF. This year, we launched another request for proposals and we have nine upper secondary schools and a CFA.

For semi-skilled staff and technicians in schools which now fall within the remit of the Region, we have implemented training either internally or with the CNFPT.

It is true that the whole educational community is not yet involved in sustainable development, and I think it is a pity almost only life/earth sciences and history/geography teachers are involved. Sustainable development is cross-disciplinary, and teachers from every discipline should be involved.

For upper secondary schools with boarders, we have implemented waste sorting and offered composting for organic waste.

However, it is not enough to have upper secondary schools involved, the educational continuum involves stakeholders throughout life. For us at the Regional Council, it is vital for all stakeholders to be involved and this is why we will be incorporating business in our consultation platform.

Pascal BOYRIES, IA-IPR, Grenoble administrative Academy

I would like to clarify that the aim of the first part of my presentation was to show that at a national level, the position is clear, which was not the case some years ago. This means we can now have a consistent position within the Department of Education with respect to teachers who have sometimes been trained in a somewhat different culture.

In addition, as to the role of school in this education, as school is often used as a means to reach adults via children, the idea is somewhat related to this dual use. Children are trained and adults through them, which is why I place the school at the centre.

André BOLLARD (IUFM, Grenoble administrative Academy)

I would like to make a transition rather than draw a conclusion. In the discussion following Pascal Boyries' presentation, I noted three types of question: questions relating to preliminaries, resources, and aims.

To summarise regarding preliminary questions. Is there a continuum? From what I have heard, I think there is more of a constellation of times and places and not a linear concept. Is the view of ESD or EESD held by various partners always educational as the Department of Education understands the term?

There are also questions relating to the scope of the concept and the notion of sustainable development, and it is true that we ourselves have to educate in the concept of doubt and practice this. It should not be forgotten that our own language and imagination are shaped by history and words.

In terms of resources, we have seen that this issue was highly influenced by a number of types of conflict: the fear of political involvement, saturation, rejection, discouragement and suspicion. This seems to be to be more of a discontinuity than a continuum because the whole is a series of tears to which what I might call multi-point injections need to be administered: injections of assessment, time, and particularly time spent by militants. There should be contributions from universities and the world of culture and an approach to this continuum should be designed in terms of educational multi-centrism rather than seeing school as the centre of the approach.

Finally, I would like to conclude with a question which was not discussed much, that of objectives. I could sum up what was said about the PACA region rather summarily as a large number of initiatives and plenty of resources. Figures to make the Department of Education blanch were given - but what are all these resources for? Do we have the same objectives? This question has not yet been discussed.
Annick DELHAYE, Vice-Chair, Sustainable Development, PACA Region

For our part, we have established objectives with various partners including the Department of Education. For this to work, we cannot act alone, we need to put things together with local stakeholders. We have a document detailing shared objectives which we put together over three years with all local stakeholders. It is then up to each local stakeholder to appropriate this in their field.

Jacques DESBORDES, Primary school teacher

I am more familiar with primary education so I shall limit my comments accordingly. I think that education for sustainable development is a real opportunity for schools as it represents a brilliant resource to open up to the world around us and not be afraid of this outside world which was long denied and banished to beyond the school gate.

In my opinion, teachers are not trained to talk to other adults. Up till now, teachers were trained to talk to children. And in Pascal Boyries' presentation, we clearly saw the significance of other participants (local authorities, non-profit associations, businesses). I have had some experience of this difficulty in my daily work because I have the privilege of being responsible for a centre for education for sustainable development and citizenship. It is clear that teachers are not at all unfavourable in this respect but that they do not know how to cope with outside participants.

In addition in the document given to us by the Aquitaine Regional Council, I read that a contract signed by the Bordeaux Metropolitan District, the Gironde Département Council and the Regional Council will enable a continuous Agenda 21 approach from primary school right through to upper secondary school. I believe that there is one major factor missing from this agreement: the Department of Education.

This is slightly worrying.

Eric ALBEROLA, Teacher, higher-level technicians, Narbonne catholic education

I thank the person who said that in Agenda 21 initiatives, Catholic education - under contract with the State and which represents 20% of the nation's pupils - should not be forgotten.

With respect to passing on information, there has been talk of children training parents. I believe this to be an inversion of what passing on is all about.

Have the psycho-educational consequences of this assumption been thought through, particularly for working-class or underprivileged families who are already struggling to bring up their children? Is this not a sign of fear or failure on the part of the Department of Education to build co-education as expressed by the FCPE [parents’ association] and other parties?

As to the educational continuum, it has to be said that a lot revolves around the Department of Education. I often put together projects with pupils and the easy option is to deal with so-called captive audiences or those under duress.

In our great nation of France there is a huge lack in terms of "youth" policy. Associations and structures which formerly provided some structure for our young people (scouts, benefactor organisations, communist youth etc) have virtually disappeared. This creates a genuine problem today. There are whole swathes of free time and leisure time between family life and school life where little is available.

Every year, I do surveys to see to what extent young people are involved in associations and I can tell you that the results are not very encouraging. This means there is definitely work to be done both within and outside school to raise their awareness of sustainable development and many other aspects of life in society.

To conclude, I would like to be a little provocative.
Someone mentioned part of the teaching profession being reticent or fed up with this new "hot potato" of sustainable development. Irresponsible parents, fundamentalist Arabs, Africans unreconciled to history, urban youth and irresponsible consumers have all in their turn been made scapegoats and the finger has been pointed at individuals and groups all too quickly in my view. While this is going on, there is little analysis of why we have arrived at this state of affairs.

Much is said about irresponsible consumers, particularly about their "irresponsibility", but you never hear the question of whether the purpose of humanity is solely to be a consumer.

Renée-Paule BLOCHET, ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

This contribution is an invitation to seek alternative forums as a solution. It can indeed be noted that the "school" environment, whether geographical, temporal or organisational, is over-called-upon because there is a captive audience.

To inform, interest and perhaps convince, we need an audience in a place in which the conditions facilitate discussion or at least attentiveness. This means that school is called upon too much in terms of a child’s day. This raises a number of problems, in particular that of teachers having to organise all this since they also have other things to pass on.

This also identifies the gaps that Pascal Boyries termed "interstices" which were formerly well-occupied. These interstices were filled by associations and other bodies, each with their domain, field, procedures and specific timetables.

Today, as regards education for sustainable development, everybody wants to be involved with respect to the same subject for the same audience at the same time. This is perhaps what raises a problem. The previous contribution perhaps provides some answers to this.

Conclusion
by Renée-Paule BLOCHET
ESD Trainer, Grenoble administrative Academy

This session was designed and conceived to be complementary to the session assessing ESD in France and EU countries inasmuch as it looked at the role of school in society and thus the role of teachers. We have looked more at the role of school and thus of teachers within the educational continuum in such a way as to make a sustainable socially-oriented project meaningful.

This group has supplied a number of observations which have formed a basis for discussion. Firstly, that the perception of a continuum is structured around two approaches. Firstly, the various spaces which offer education for a given audience. In other words, a young audience may be faced with a number of educational areas (home, school, associations, sports clubs, media, and the implicit interstices). Secondly, the notion of continuum can also be seen in a more linear fashion, as an educational continuum throughout an individual's life. We have therefore examined the notion of educational continuum from both a temporal and a spatial perspective.

The group has raised a number of positive items which all suggest a genuine educational continuum which can sustain a long-term socially-oriented project.

Firstly, there is a clear and significant commitment on the part of all stakeholders in this socially-oriented project: implementation of sustainable development through education. State education stakeholders are in the front line, along with local authorities, decentralised government departments, and sponsors and stakeholders from the world of non-profit associations.

At the same time, this educational continuum is being implemented at a time in the history of the world at which a major cultural shift is taking place. It has been emphasised that education for sustainable development (ESD) is definitely no stranger to this cultural change.
and may even have contributed to a cultural change both within the Department of Education and within various structures, associations and authorities that work in partnerships with schools.

Another positive aspect is the feeling that all stakeholders, regardless of the area in which they are working, are getting back to a more militant approach, particularly stakeholders involved in continuous education.

A further positive observation resides in the desire of universities and researchers to be involved, although the difficulty of engaging with younger populations has been noted, particularly the difficulty for university academics to simplify what their research is about, despite which this could provide relevant insights into the scientific approach to education for sustainable development.

We have also seen the positive aspect of significant help in terms of structuring the environment for partners. Various ways of providing structure for partners have been discussed during this symposium.

In this workshop, we have noted regional consultation platforms such as that in the Provence-Alpes-Côte-d'Azur region, regional consultation forums in the Rhône-Alpes Region and regional committees in the Midi-Pyrénées Region. These platforms, committees and forums enable synergies to be created and discussion to take place between various stakeholders. Progress has been made, but we have emphasised how changing practices is a difficult and slow process.

On the minus side, one factor preventing the implementation of an educational continuum and of a long-term socially-oriented project is the role played by various respective prejudices and the rejection these may engender.

Another problem is the difficulty of getting young people's parents involved.

One regret in this group is the absence of the world of business, whose approach would have been required for proper analysis of the educational continuum, in which they are also stakeholders.

We have envisaged a number of proposals on the basis of these observations. The continuum exists but requires further work, firstly within state education. We have emphasised the importance of training teachers, particularly training in project-oriented teaching methods which includes examining the issue of seeking alternative solutions in partnership with others.

We have also noted the need to extend education for sustainable development to all school populations. This includes those who are not often targeted including the disabled, SEGPA (special needs classes) and specialist education sectors.

Another proposal relates to the need to create forums and/or occasions for consultation between various partners, as takes place with the platforms. In addition to being forums for discussion, these spaces should also help the educational continuum lead to more formal agreements, so that people can get to know each other better and build a common culture, so that partners can agree on the issues of this universally aspired-to society and also on working objectives, which require sharing out of the tasks to be performed.

This requires agreement on who does what, who the stakeholders and participants are, and more particularly, who the recognised participants are.

We have also discussed the validation and trust required to put together joint actions and multi-partner training on the basis of training reference documents and competencies to be acquired by adults involved in these projects; these reference documents need to be put together in a consultative manner.

Finally, a continuum has yet to be fully established regarding two points.
Firstly, there is a need for stronger links with universities, which can provide data and good training and add to the scientific approaches adopted in pedagogical projects in primary and secondary schools.

Secondly, forums for action relating to sustainable development must be developed outwith state education and other educational environments for young people in order to reach all populations including senior citizens.

The group has stated that a pupil is also "the child of" and the "grandchild of...". This means they have a private personal life in which they need to find their role.

************************
Session 3

Education for Sustainable Development in the Francophone World

Summary

• Southern stakeholders’ view of ESD in Europe (Michael ATCHIA, UNEP/IUBS/AFICS-M)
• ESD based on education in the fundamental rights of the child: profile of the situation experienced by children in the far North of Quebec and the Sahel region (Pauline CÔTÉ, Professor, LÉADRE, University of Quebec in Rimouski)
• Assessment of strategic ESD avenues and actions in the "Central Africa" sub-region with the implementation of the Environmental Education for Sustainable Development Network in Central Africa - REESDAC (Hega MARTIN, Project Manager, Crystal Mountains national park, WCS Gabon)
• International solidarity is the poor relation of sustainable development (Paul VERMANDE, Francophone University Agency, AUF)
• Presentation of a project in Brazil (Julie LE PHUEZ, Ministry of Education, Brazil)
• Environmental conflicts relating to the disposal of wastewater in natural environments: review and status report from Algeria (Hassini TSAKI, University of Oran, Algeria)
• Conclusion (Michel MOMBRUN, Francophone networks)

Moderator:
Hega MARTIN (Project Manager, Crystal Mountains national park, WCS Gabon) and Michel MOMBRUN (Francophone networks) and Boufeldja BENABDALLAH (OIF/IEPF).

INTRODUCTION

Hega MARTIN, Project manager, WCS, Gabon

I am in charge of a programme for education with respect to the environment and conservation in the Gabon forests, particularly the network of 13 national parks. We are presently implementing an ESD Programme which will be presented during this session.

Michel MOMBRUN, Francophone networks

I have recently been working more with UNITAR since I am coming to the end of my career. This has not put a stop to me continuing to work in all francophone networks at least as much as beforehand. In particular, I am involved in an ESD initiative in the Ile-de-France Region in the département of the Essonne. As part of this, we are in liaison with a number of French-speaking nations in Africa, South America and Central Europe. I am very happy to be involved in these discussions, in which I have now had some fifteen years' worth of experience.
Boufeldja BENABDALLAH, OIF/EPF

I am part of the Francophone Institute for Energy and the Environment (IEPF) based in Quebec, and have been there for some twelve years. I am responsible for the "national strategy and sustainable development" programme. Along with many other colleagues, I am involved in issues relating to increased capabilities. Increasing capabilities involves education and training.

It is with this in mind that we are delighted to be present at this conference to obtain others' opinions and find out how the Francophone world can establish a major initiative for 2009-2010. We already have a core discussion group, but we also want to leave here with ideas to pursue the work done by you, by those with knowledge and who are professionals in the field. Thank you.

Hega MARTIN, Project manager, WCS, Gabon

Our session relates mostly to ESD in the Francophone world, so it will be a case of assessing what has been done on the ground in Francophone countries, what resources have been developed and what partnerships have been formed to strengthen education for sustainable development.

We hope that the presentations will be useful contributions for you and add to the debate, so that concrete proposals can be made for the next five years, so that the French-speaking world can really position itself as a key partner in this field in order for education for sustainable development to move forward.

Southern stakeholder perspectives on ESD in Europe

by Michael ATCHIA
(UNEP/IUBS/AFICS-M)

My presentation will be an attempt to look at how the Southern nations see things compared with what is happening in Europe in terms of sustainability, and on relations between the two, with an emphasis on Mauritius: two weeks ago it launched a project at UNESCO entitled "Mauritius - the sustainable island", a huge project which aims to transform the whole country into a sustainable island. This involves ESD and much more besides. It is with this perspective somewhat in mind that I will be making my comments.

The South has many ideas as to the objectives of education for development (I prefer to talk of sustainable or sustained development). In 1993, when I was programme manager for the United Nations in Nairobi I came up with the idea of replacing "Environment Education" by "Sustainable Development Education". I suggested this to UNESCO, but they thought that SDE could not be translated into French. They turned this into ESD, "Education for Sustainable Development", which stuck, and then ESD really took off in 1997.

I saw the objectives of sustainable development when I defined it - some years ago now - as a broad vision of human wellbeing integrating socio-cultural lifestyles with the economy and industry. This was also incorporated with governance, scientific research and finally education. Governance: our nations (i.e. French- and English-speaking Africa) suffer from a huge problem of governance. This is hardly news to you. In my country we have identified national governance as the number one problem. In other words, we can pass every resolution imaginable under the sun, if there is not good governance, none of them will work.

Secondly, I am glad to note the implementation in Europe of education which is directly relevant to day-to-day life. What the mayor of Bordeaux said this morning is quite apposite: sustainable development is something which affects everybody's life. For instance, with respect to "Mauritius, the sustainable island", every aspect of life needs to be affected. I would also like to raise the issue of fairness worldwide, the issue of living at peace and of equity between continents, nations, individuals and generations. There can be no sustainable
development without equity. This is another whole topic in its own right and I will not go into it further here.

Equity between continents is not simply a vain hope as regards Africa. I have a few things to say about that. I have already had this discussion in international forums, but I would like to say to Europe that Africa is the poorest inhabited continent in the world. The root causes of this poverty may be war and corruption, but what causes are there which are related to Europe? We had an awful example this morning when somebody mentioned flowers being exported amidst a crisis situation.

The key word for me is that of consistency between policy in Europe and in our nations. Does the European Union in general and France in particular have the objectives which I set out earlier? This presentation looks at the percentage of energy which is derived from sources other than fossil fuels. France does pretty well: 70% nuclear - whether you are for or against nuclear power, it's a fact of life - 12% hydroelectric. This puts it in a very good position. Some years ago we had the inter-island conference in Barbados and then in Mauritius ten years after that. Some of our islands have no oil and are totally dependent on imports. What are we doing today in Mauritius? We use wind power and so on, as well as ethanol from sugar cane: the price of sugar has dropped and it makes more sense for us to turn it into ethanol than to import petrol.

In Brazil, all government vehicles are required to use ethanol and ethanol is not taxed and thus cheaper than petrol, which encourages people to use it. We are going to try and use this sort of measure in Mauritius to promote ethanol and become energy-independent. You are very familiar with such calculations and you know how much this applies to African nations. So biofuels, wind power, solar power, geothermal power, tidal, hydro and nuclear power are all on the table. Then there are new energies. We will not be discussing hydrogen today since this is not the place to be discussing technical issues. In any case I submit that fossil fuels, oil, gas and coal should only be used transitionally from 2010 onwards. Economies which are based wholly on fossil fuels such as the US are dependent first and foremost on the Middle East, Venezuela and so on. In our nations we can manage if we are ready to take on board the parameter of a diversity of energy resources. A researcher at the CNRS has said that by 2020, solar-based energy production in France will account for only 3% of total energy production. In Mauritius, it is easier to progress more quickly. We have conservation versus innovation in industry, defence, the economy, law. For instance, a few years ago an industrial company in Lagos imported an industrial plant from the North-east of England where it had been declared unusable because it polluted too much. This is a counter-example: we cannot continue to import technologies which have been consigned to the scrap-heap by others.

What is the real basis of the market economy? We won't get back into talking about the subprime crisis here, but seen from the South, Europe is viewed as being almost as artificial as the US in terms of virtual spending. I suggested to you that the key word was "consistency". One way of addressing this lack of consistency is education, training and sustainable development established on this happy alliance in France - and for us too - of a huge cultural, scientific and technological heritage and the needs of tomorrow's world. A few years ago in Japan, I suggested a new index called the "national sustainable development priority" index.

What should the priorities of a nation be with respect to sustainable development? One should be that of energy independence. This helps countries to be able to define governance and return to governance. Perhaps this is my principal conclusion. For those of you taking notes on the conclusions of this seminar, I would like to submit this as a recommendation - because it applies to France, our nations, Mauritius - we need to define three or four national priorities with respect to sustainable development.

For instance, in Japan, their priorities are very different to those of other countries. One of their priorities is access to marine resources, on which the Japanese are largely dependent.
for their food supply. This is not exactly the case in other nations. In addition, there will be an incomparable economic advantage for those countries which place a priority on developing renewable energy production capacity for a global population of 6.4 billion. Might this include developed countries such as the US, Russia, China or others? Perhaps it might include Brazil, South Africa, or perhaps one of the Francophone nations, or a consortium of nations, which is perhaps more likely.

So to conclude I would like to remind you that sustainable, supportable, stable development cannot coexist with an unregulated virtual market economy led by reckless traders who establish national climates and the subsequent actions of decision-makers.

The integration at the heart of school and university curricula of education and training for sustainable development and research into technologies and lifestyles developed in human-sized proportions must be reinforced. Self-sufficiency must become the prime objective of civilisation.

**ESD based on education in the fundamental rights of the child: profile of the situation experienced by children in the far North of Quebec and the Sahel region of Africa**

*by Pauline CÔTÉ,*

*(Professor and Researcher at LÉADRE, University of Quebec in Rimouski)*

I should have been presenting this with my colleague, Abdou Harouna, who is in charge of the Niger team, but unfortunately he could not be with us here in Bordeaux. This north/south research is into education in fundamental rights according to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. This relates to similarities and differences in what is experienced by children in the far north of Quebec and those in the Sahel region of Africa. Abdou is the CEO of a major NGO in Niger in the Sahel region, as we will see on the map in a minute, for education for sustainable development with the Touareg peoples. We work in the far north of Quebec. I am a professor at the University of Québec in Rimouski, which is the easternmost university in Québec. One of my colleagues is Sonia Fournier who will be making a presentation tomorrow evening. The topic of Sonia's work is "Understanding and preventing mass violence in the perspective of education for sustainable development: image, memory and a culture of peace". We have been working together for over two years as part of a request for an institutional chair of UNESCO at our university, which is related to several other UNESCO chairs in ESD including that of Charles Hopkins who holds this chair at York university. We are also working with Mrs LY-TALL who is an African of Moroccan nationality, and who is also working with a UNESCO chair in sustainable development relating to gender and human rights.

In our research, we start from the principle that there is no sustainable department possible without peace and no peace possible without sustainable development. We are working with the children from the far north of Quebec, the Inuit. In a moment I will be showing you a map of Saharan and Sahelian Africa with education, the environment, education for sustainable development, peace and development, the rights of the child, the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. Being born and growing up in the far north of Quebec, in the Bay of Ungwa, north of the 50th parallel, is a huge environmental, educational, humanitarian and social challenge for children and their parents, who are mostly Inuit. There is a long list of disturbing statistics which have emerged from the commission for individual rights and the Department for the Protection of Youth in Quebec. Our research presents the difficult situation with respect to education of children from the North of Quebec and compares it to the equally complex situation of sub-Saharan children in Niger. Our comparative analysis is related to the 54 articles of the Convention on the Rights of the Child adopted on November 20, 1989 by the United Nations General Assembly.

Our research in the far north of Quebec outlines the geography, demographics, education, health as well as family life and the activities of non-profit agencies. In the far North of
Quebec in the Bay of Ungava we have a research team consisting of several of my interns studying education. We really are working in all of these villages in the far north. Our university is not very far from the furthest tip of the Gaspé Peninsula. This is 1000 kilometres east of Montréal, before you get to the Maritime provinces. I'm going to talk briefly about 14 villages in the far north of Quebec. We will see some photos shortly. These villages are located within an area of over 7000 square kilometres. So basically we are studying the far south and the far north. The population has increased 350% in 40 years; in 2007 there were between 10,000 and 11,000 inhabitants, 90% of whom are Inuit.

The territory is home to 14 villages located along the shores of the Hudson Bay and the Bay of Ungava. Inuktitut is the native tongue and the language of education from nursery school to the second year inclusive. From the third year onwards, parents can choose for their children to be educated in English or in French. To give you some idea of the landscape, there are 24 hours of daylight, so the teaching environment is rather unique. In 2001, 62% of over-15s did not have a secondary education diploma. The pass rate for exams set by the Quebec Ministry of Education, Leisure and Sport is only around 20%. In 2001, 1/3 of 15-25-year-olds were in full-time education. The suicide rate is increasing significantly. It is of the order of 156 deaths for every 100,000 inhabitants. This is the worst rate in Canada. Quebec is the worst-ranking province with a rate of 19. The Nunavik have the lowest life expectancies in Canada: 66.7 years for men and women alike. This places the region between the Dominican Republic (67) and Egypt (66.5). Those nations rank 111th and 112 out of 191. The infant mortality rate is four times higher than Quebec as a whole, with 20 deaths for every 1000 births. The mortality rate for young children is six times higher, with some 10 deaths for every 1000 babies. I think that over 10.5% of teenage girls are pregnant, which is five times the rate for Quebec as a whole.

I don't recall whether I have described all the statistics relating to crime, abuse and mistreatment later on. These are illustrative of upbringing and have enormous influence on the way we teach, as do issues of drugs, alcohol culture and identity. I'll come back to those criteria and show you the comparative analysis methodology that we are using based on the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child.

I'm now going to talk about Saharan and more particularly Sahelian Africa, its geography, demographics, population, education and the types of situations in which children and young people find themselves in rural and urban environments. We are really working in the south of the Sahara. The surrounding countries are Algeria, Mali, Libya and Burkina Faso. We sponsor a school in the region of the Ahir. This is school for Touaregs who come to study there and also board. We have built the school and have teachers from Niger working there along with interns who also go to this school. In official terms, the Republic of Niger is a landlocked country in western Africa which lies 700 km from the ocean. Niger is 2.3 times as large as France and its capital is Niamey. It is a real link between North Africa and Sub-Saharan Africa.

Here you see some of the landscapes. There are 11.1 million inhabitants and several ethnic groups. The population is made up of Sunni Muslims. My colleague should have been presenting this section. The main ethnic group are the Hausas. There are a score of national languages. We use the work done by UNICEF "the Third World: characteristics of the youth education system; problem situations; types of children". I'm really just going over the key features of the research, which runs to several reports: "Children and workers", "children and young people separated from their families", "child and youth beggars", "street children", "children in Koranic schools", "children and young people left to themselves in neighbourhoods". These children are outside the school system.

I would just like to present you the methods used, because the results are underway. Our basis is the United Nations Convention, with six modules which each represent a different article of the Convention. We then make a comparison between children from the far north and children from the far south as to these articles in the Convention. The Right of the Child...
to an identity and to a family. This comes into the category of the module on "The rights of
the child to a name, citizenship and family". I will not go into details of the methodology. This
concerns rights relating to development: articles 17, 28 and 29. The United Nations
Convention has 52 articles and we are based completely on these articles. "The right of
the child to leisure, rest and play", "the right of the child to survival".

Then there are the "rights of the child to protection". This module brings together all rights
relating to the protection of children against "economic and/or sexual exploitation, abuse,
mistreatment, negligence, delinquency, armed conflict involving children and kidnapping".
We have broken this down into various articles: protection of children against kidnapping and
arbitrary separation from their parents. This article is very important in the far north of
Quebec, since children have been removed from the far north to attend special schools
where they have really been very badly treated. "Protection of children who are in special
circumstances: children who are refugees, disabled, immigrants" and native children of
course.

The final module is "the right of the child to fundamental freedoms". This module includes the
rights of the child to integrity, life, freedom of expression, freedom of conscience, freedom of
religion and freedom of association.

I will not discuss the results because they are still underway. We will present the results in
Montréal in May 2009 at the WEEC symposium.

Hega MARTIN, Project manager, WCS, Gabon

There will of course be the fifth WEEC which will take place in Quebec in May 2009. I think
that will be the opportunity to have much more information about this highly interesting
research. Comparative analysis makes it possible to look at the situation of children in both
contexts. Highly interesting lessons can be drawn from this.

Assessment of strategic ESD actions in the "Central Africa" sub-region
with the implementation of the Environmental Education for Sustainable
Development Network in Central Africa - (REESDAC) 2005-2008
by Hega MARTIN,
(Project Manager, WCS Gabon)

I am going to discuss ESD using social marketing relating to the preservation of wildlife in the
Crystal Mountains National Park. This theme was chosen because we are realising that
conservation and sustainable development form one of the fields in which little
communication is done despite us being aware that advertising has an impact on our habits
and behaviours. The question for us was therefore to try and see how we could use the
techniques of marketing communication to make people aware of a number of issues and
enable them to change their behaviour, particularly in terms of knowledge, attitudes and
practices.

This idea had its origins in the fact that on August 30, 2002, the head of state of Gabon
created a network of 13 national parks, entailing a challenge for us in terms of conservation.
Despite work done in schools, we needed to find strategies to really communicate about this
network, particularly with respect to precise problems. The aim is to enrich people's
knowledge and develop new attitudes to change behaviours by using social marketing
techniques in favour of sustainable development. So this was basically the goal which we set
ourselves in this approach and research.

The particular problem that we addressed was that of eating wild game. The reason for this
is that things have got to a point where some people thought that hunting should be
completely prohibited. It is true that by prohibiting hunting, we would have gained in terms of
preserving biodiversity, but this could also have created a social imbalance culturally and
sometimes economically. Others thought that people should be left to hunt as they wished, in
other words commercial hunting. It is true that this would provide plenty of economic added value for traders, but the result would be social imbalance and a loss of biodiversity. The reason for this is that wild game meat is exported to cities, so there would be a risk of famine. People who used to hunt wild game very close to their village now have to travel tens of kilometres to hunt. This means that there is less game. In addition, these people often have no other resource because there are no shops or stores. There is absolutely nothing else. Sometimes the only food resource is a wild game, sometimes a few vegetables too.

The location of the study is the Crystal Mountains National Park in this area you see here between the two large areas of the park. We have tried to reach some 7000 people; there are 11 schools for a total of some 2000 pupils in 28 villages, and our awareness-raising campaign lasted one year. It really was a campaign in the advertising sense of the word. The method was as follows: we began by using all kinds of literature. In order to have a consistent message, you need to know who you are talking to, properly identify the target, be familiar with their cultural and social habits and their story in order to understand the relationship of this population with nature. The issue is not one of importing practices from other provinces or cities and imposing them but of understanding the context and the environment. In order to do this, systematic research was carried out in the region both geographically, demographically and anthropologically in order to better understand the relationship of the population with nature. Once this data had been obtained, since our method was designed to be participative, we organised meetings, what we term stakeholder meetings.

All local stakeholders: businesses, local chiefs, hunters, administrators, the forces of law and order - everybody was there to identify what the real threats to the national park were. This led to a conceptual model being designed. In red here, you can see the principal threats to the preservation of this biodiversity and the national park, as identified by the stakeholders themselves. The threats which were the most clearly identified by all stakeholders were poaching, illegal forestry, mining and farming. We therefore managed to have meetings with the various groups of people involved in these activities (hunters, farmers,...) to attempt to understand what they were doing, why they persisted in doing it and what alternatives might be available to them with respect to these activities which are threatening biodiversity.

Following this, on the basis of the results of these meetings, we had to put together a questionnaire and carry out a survey in order to build up a picture of the population. In order to do this we put together a questionnaire with some 66 questions and used some 14 survey staff for a period of just over two weeks. These people therefore needed training in the techniques to be used in this survey to understand the relationship being studied. The results enabled us to establish specific objectives which in turn enabled us to have a precise aim, in other words a clear goal which could be measured; this therefore had to be specific and realistic. The issue was to know whether we could reduce the consumption of wild game and for how long. We needed to ask ourselves what people were capable of assimilating in terms of knowledge and attitude and whether it was possible for us to change their ways of thinking and their behaviours with respect to the environment in which they live. To do this, on the basis of the preliminary study that was carried out, we identified activities which would enable us to sustain our campaign for a whole year. These activities needed to take account of the context. We therefore organised traditional games, meeting games and football matches. We made posters. All these activities were tied into the results and analysis from the surveys that were carried out so as to ensure that people would identify it with the awareness campaign. It was the people themselves who chose the mascot i.e. the emblem of this awareness campaign. I personally would have chosen the gorilla at the outset. But following the survey, we realised that people had opted for the giant pangolin. They saw it as an animal which did not destroy plants or damage crops or do anything like that. This came as something of a surprise to us, but we had to bear it in mind because if we chose an animal other than the one which the population had chosen there would have been an impasse in terms of communication because people would not identify with our chosen mascot.
Here you can see some of the communication resources we used: leaflets and tablecloths which were highly successful because after work people sit down around a table to drink a beer. They have a message. On every table cloth in the region, at a football match, etc. There was even a religious message because we observed that 70% of the population in this region were christians. That meant it was inevitable that we should use this means of communication to get our message across.

Here are some of the results. For instance, to take the issue of protected species, prior to the campaign, 29% of people could name five protected species; after the campaign, this rose to 47%. For us in terms of assessment, this was very encouraging, because we do a lot of awareness campaigns, we do education and information but we cannot manage to assess the impact of our awareness initiatives. This means this is an important method, because outside the national park, some 600 km away, there were what we termed control villages in which no campaign took place. This enabled us to compare and showed us that our awareness campaign had indeed had this level of impact. There was also an impact in terms of attitude. Here, for example, we can see that initially, 52% believed that the principal threat to the giant pangolin was over-hunting. This has gone from 52% to 67%. This means that as the campaign progressed, people acquired some knowledge and had begun to change their attitude. Not many of them had been aware that the giant pangolin was becoming extinct. But by the end of the campaign they had understood this, and as the answers came in, we saw a degree of change. However, we had major problems with respect to practices and behaviours. There were questions like "would you be capable of no longer buying wild game at the market?". There was no change in figures at this level because people had difficulty in changing this behaviour and it was important for us to understand why. Our observation is as follows: in terms of knowledge and attitude, major changes were observed, but in terms of behaviour practices, people find it difficult to make a move. Why is this? Our aim is conservation and to achieve this, we need to reduce the threats. How is it that people cannot manage to stop eating wild game? There are institutional and cultural barriers - many of them.

We therefore came to the understanding that over and above awareness, providing people with knowledge and bringing them fresh information, there are other barriers which are often independent of these individuals. We therefore need to attempt to address these barriers. One of the principal barriers is poverty. 76% of people living in the region are unemployed. This was very important in terms of us understanding their relationship to nature. If there were jobs, would they be capable of changing their behaviour? This means that the efforts we may engage in for education for sustainable development need to include a degree of synergy and be appropriate to the context. It is not an isolated activity but a whole in which each partner needs to play their part.

Another barrier is legislation. In terms of resources, some species are protected by law, but others are not and may therefore be hunted. There is a hunting season and a season in which hunting is prohibited. During the hunting season, some areas are protected and others are not. So you can see how complex this problem is. Rather than prohibiting or allowing people to do what they want, we need to arrive at sustainable resource management by making the local population feel proud of their forests. Generally speaking, commercial hunting has its origins in large cities which, from a participative perspective, have impoverished villages. So this would lead to more balance and biodiversity, a gain in conservation and social equilibrium because there would be less conflict and more well-being. Economic equilibrium too, because people would be able to have acceptable purchasing power; in actual fact the major traders come from the city. The local population is rarely involved.

In this context, we have endeavoured to implement a national network of stakeholders and educators for sustainable development in each central African nation. Within the sub-region, in Libreville, we have implemented a sub-regional network of educators for the environment since 2006, the REDDAC. Today, there are almost 60 members working in both rural and
urban areas, in schools and with the general public. We hope to be able to hold a forum in each country in the sub-region every two years. We think that we will be holding a symposium in Brazzaville on this basis, the objective of which would be to define a sub-regional strategy to combat poaching.

I would like to thank all our partners because we have involved a lot of people, both economic operators, government agencies and local populations. Thank you.

**International solidarity is the poor side of sustainable development**

*by Paul VERMANDE*

*Francophone University Agency (AUF)*

International solidarity is a value which is very favourably received by the population and public opinion, particularly in Europe, but it features very little in symposiums.

I would define international solidarity as follows: taking account of the presence in the world of all populations, their cultures, property and activities and acting as partners, not simply by assisting them or in a predatory fashion by taking their sources of wealth (mineral ore, timber, etc).

One revealing fact is that a few months ago I was involved in a major symposium not very far from here and none of the seven dignitaries who spoke at the opening session mentioned the international aspects of sustainable development. All of them discussed problems of energy savings, water and global warming. Why did these seven dignitaries (a prefect, the head of a Region, a mayor and a headmaster) not mention this? Is it an issue of cronyism with respect to their fellow-elected officials, a question of addressing the immediate preoccupations of their constituencies, short-term policy or a lack of consideration for southern nations?

What is happening in Southern nations? There are some one billion people who do not have enough food and who simply wish to live, have their own home, have access to medical care, education for children and adults through literacy programs and access to drinking water. Underdevelopment still exists and this is the fault of more than one party: the West and Western countries must take a fair share of the blame. I worked for six years in Haiti and I can tell you that between the pillage carried out by France in the 18th and 19th centuries and that carried out by the Americans during the 20th century, the country has been extensively devastated.

How can our development be sustainable when in the South, it has barely begun? To quote Lévi-Strauss, "well-ordered Humanism does not start with oneself but places respect for others above selfishness". In the train, I was reading the magazine *Futuribles*, the October 2008 issue, which included a review of the book by Edgar Morin, *Vers l'abyme*? He writes: "we are at the heart of a planetary crisis; the Earth's ecosystem is no longer capable of regulating its vital problems be they physical, socio-economic or human [...] The idea of development, even sustainable development, leads to disaster". We place far too much emphasis on quantitative indicators when there are many qualitative aspects of life, too.

Where did the idea of international solidarity come from? I am drawing from a presentation made some 10 days ago by a lady who has many responsibilities in this field and who was telling us that this began at the end of the 19th century with the fight against colonisation, both on the part of colonised peoples who had been trained and alerted their peoples to the need to react and on the part of some Western nations in which in spite of everything there was a degree of reservation about the concept of colonisation. Then there was the Baku conference, after the Russian Revolution, then liberation movements at the end of the First World War, and, in 1955, the Bandung conference which brought together non-aligned Third World countries and Third World activists. In France, the Algerian war was highly important and in May 1968, we also witnessed the development of many international solidarity movements. More recently, the consequences of decolonisation have led to other solidarity...
movements such as NGOs etc emerging. Such international solidarity movements have almost always occurred after wars, struggles or conflicts which have given rise to the idea of implementing international organisations to serve as consultative and regulatory bodies for international issues.

I would like to give you a definition which can be found on the site www.Vedura.fr, which works in sustainable development: "Social equality is the core issue in sustainable development. Social equality is based on the fundamental principles of human rights and individual freedoms.

One of its principles is solidarity between developed nations and so-called developing nations and between all generations; it aims to fight against poverty and exclusion by promoting healthcare, education, employment, disabled rights, food and access to housing."

Which stakeholders could take charge of the various aspects of international solidarity? My response will not be an exhaustive one but one based on my experience: I taught for seven years in Algeria in the 1970s, then I was responsible for a graduate school in Cameroon for six years in the 1980s before finishing my career just prior to 2000 by spending six years in Haiti. This has meant that I have had quite a lot of contact with various international organisations.

- UNESCO does a number of interesting things and I have had many contacts with young people from Third World countries who are present in UNESCO clubs. I think it is one way of enabling them to form positive contacts with young people from Western nations.

- I have also frequented many other bodies (UNICEF, UNEP, WFP, etc) who are trying to work on the basis of development and solidarity, but for one thing young people from Western nations are ill-informed and more especially, the credibility of the experts from all these bodies in Third World and Southern nations is not what it could be because their salaries and lifestyles cut them off from brotherly relations with local populations, particularly young people, in these countries.

- The IMF and the World Bank. Here are two figures for you: in 2006, the budget of the United Nations Programme for the Environment (UNEP), the highest instance within the United Nations for dealing with environmental issues, was $60 million. If you compare this figure to the kind we have been hearing over the last few weeks you will see that there is not very much they can do. Meanwhile, the World Bank raised $14 billion worth of funds during the same year, 2006.

- The European Union does some interesting work with respect to environmental issues and is now doing more and more in the field of solidarity, but it has been preoccupied particularly with the situation of Central and Eastern European countries. However, its attention now also extends to Southern nations. I'm currently taking part in a programme put together by the European Union which involves connecting African researchers, particularly from sub-Saharan Africa, to research programmes dealing with the environment and climate change in response to the 7th FP, a 6-year programme. There are billions of euros involved and I really did get the impression that European Commissioners genuinely want to incorporate Africa and African researchers in this approach.

- The Francophone world: there are four priority programmes, including the one called "co-operation serving sustainable development and solidarity". The Méditerre website, which provides a lot of information, is very interesting because it enables discussion between young people from the north and the south. I work for the Francophone University Agency (AUF) to lead and coordinate one of the networks in the "Environment, solidarity and sustainable development" programme. Every two years, we launch a request for research projects, for instance into fishing along the coast of West Africa, land-based carbon capture and so on. When a research project is submitted, it is not examined unless the staff for the project under consideration includes one or two
stakeholders (research centres and universities) from Southern nations. There is still insufficient funding for the Francophone world.

- Stakeholders in international solidarity in France: as regards the government, we represent only 0.4% of state development aid. Immigration laws tend to discredit people from Southern nations, although there has been some progress, for example the Grenelle environmental summit and the Environment Charter. I am talking mostly in terms of the environment because we don't really see much yet in terms of international solidarity. As to local government, there is an international Council for local environmental initiatives and "Cités unies", a large organisation which brings together municipalities who want to carry out joint North-South projects and so on. Large companies also have socially responsible investments: international projects do not play a large part in these, but some initiatives have been begun.

- As to NGOs, associations and unions, solidarity forms part of their constitutions and/or actions and I think that they are the most active in this respect: they carry out education, direct projects, link up people from Northern and Southern nations, often on a shoestring and relying on volunteer work more often than not.

My first recommendation is in favour of supporting the close partnership with NGOs, associations and trade unions.

My second recommendation is to ask "what can be done?". You have no doubt been following the approach taken by the IPCC and Al Gore on climate change. In my opinion, the problem of international solidarity is just as serious as climate change and global warming. If this aspect of solidarity does not come into being, we will see population movements leading to conflicts which will be difficult to control. I would therefore like to propose that analysis and research is carried out with partners in a large number of nations to examine actions which could be implemented for more efficient international solidarity.

My third recommendation would be that children are made aware and trained as early as possible so that they act for the long term over and above acts of charity, which do not constitute solidarity. Should we be sending Third World schools books or money?

In the associations with which I am working, we have decided the issue: we will only send money, which enables local printing presses to work and allows local people to choose what they want. We can use the Internet to train children.

I have had several experiences with 'Mosaïques du monde': we set up the Internet in primary schools and twin primary schools in northern and southern nations. The children can discuss together and see each other using the webcam and there is no need to organise an expensive trip. This is a highly significant resource for training and discussion, as has already been mentioned this morning.

My fourth recommendation is that the necessary funding be obtained for an approach to which most citizens are willing to commit themselves. This relates to the issue of governance in each nation. Despite the criticisms of certain types of expertise, I think these need to be strengthened in order to achieve a shared policy for all humanity. I would simply request that these experts adopt a humbler attitude and perhaps a lower income.

One week ago, I was chairing the National conference of solidarity stakeholders for Haiti and we were examining what kind of solidarity could be implemented between France and Haiti, today in 2008, in order to strengthen existing networks within Franco-Haitian associations, help further debate on partnerships to be established on the ground, discuss Haiti's key problems (healthcare, education, fairtrade, etc). Out of 250 associations working with Haiti in France, 100 have joined our collective.

I would like to conclude with a quotation from Gandhi "We must be the change that we wish to see in the world" and say to you "merci empile" which, in Haitian Creole means "if you have to stack things up, that must mean that there are a lot of them".

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
Open-floor discussion

**Boufeldja BENABDALLAH, OIF/IEPF**

I have a question for the last two speakers: what effect have your experiences and research into education for sustainable development had? What sort of approach do you currently have in mind or are you working on in this respect?

I would like to ask Mr Martin if he had considered making a brochure about how to duplicate his awareness approach so that we could disseminate it in the southern nations?

I took due note of Paul Vermande's recommendations, but I would like to ask you as a globetrotter what kind of really tangible project could be launched as of now to carry out work in the field of solidarity?

**Ao BOKARNI, environmentalist and sociologist**

My name is Ao BOKARNI, and I am an environmentalist and sociologist. I am a member of the network 'researchers and practitioners for peace' and I did my doctoral thesis on the impacts on women of the damming of the Senegal River. This river crosses the Sahel from its source in Guinea and flows through Mali, Senegal and Mauritania.

Firstly, I have a question for Hega Martin relating to your experience on protecting the environment and more particularly wildlife.

You said that by asking for specific species to be preserved, a degree of social imbalance would be created. However, it is well-known that experience in some countries such as South Africa or even in Europe is that the preservation of species and bans on hunting have led to ecological imbalances due to the proliferation of some animals which then become pests. I believe that there have been experiences of this nature with respect to wolves in France and also in Africa and India with monkeys. Would not be true to say that nature establishes a balance and that if we stray too far from this we create other problems? You have clearly demonstrated that any survey or social research helps to raise awareness but I sometimes wonder whether we are not in too much of a hurry to see the results of our work. I really don't think it's possible for dietary habits which date back thousands of years to be changed in a matter of months. You appear to point the finger of blame at people buying food in the cities, but isn't the real issue one of poverty?

When you go to Africa, people often say "leave the trees to protect the environment", when the African peasant who cuts down the tree can use the wood for heating or make charcoal to sell and feed his family for a few days, a week or a month: he and his family think only in the very short term. Is the principal source of environmental damage not poverty in Third World countries including Africa?

Paul Vermande has spoken to us about international solidarity. How is it possible to talk in terms of international solidarity when for conferences on the level of this one or others which take place in Canada and the US, researchers and civil servants who want to come and make a contribution are systematically refused visas because it is claimed that they will want to stay in the host nation? How is it possible to talk in terms of international solidarity with such a state of affairs? Why is adequate research not carried out to halt malaria, which kills some one million children worldwide, when 15 Canadian dollars would be enough to bring an end to these illnesses? Would not international solidarity simply require ceasing to take people's food from their mouths? From Niger to native American Indians, populations have suffered in the same way: occupation, pillage of resources from their environment and the shutting up of their population.

I wonder when we will stop saying that Africa is the poorest continent in the world. If Africa was poor then westerners would never have gone there and the Chinese would not be there today. It is because they lacked all sorts of things that westerners left Europe to go to Africa and America. I often say that the failure of Africa in terms of development is presently the...
failure in the development of Western nations who, at the Berlin conference, carved up Africa piece by piece.

Today in Nigeria, which has been completely despoiled of its oil, we are witnessing scenes of youth terrorism as these people rebel and take up arms, and the same thing is happening in Somalia. Does not international solidarity begin simply by Western nations leaving Third World countries, particularly Africa, alone and ceasing to steal the food from the mouths of their children?

Pauline CÔTÉ, University of Québec, Rimouski, Canada

I would like to be as passionate, but it will be difficult! However I would like to go on in this vein and to drive the point home. I would like to reply to a very direct question asked by Boufledja BENABDALLAH who asked what the effects of research were and how we were working to increase the visibility of our actions in favour of sustainable development.

I began my career in Rwanda with a Rwandan teacher. I knew very well that it would be very difficult to organise a symposium on Rwanda because I'm interested in looking at potential conflicts which may end up in genocide. In Quebec, I have worked a lot on the rights of the child because children are completely overlooked in the United Nations Convention. There is no UNESCO chair in the subject.

And so it was that in 2006 we organised a major international cross-disciplinary symposium on the 1994 genocide in Rwanda. This involved inviting leaders from all countries where there was a threat of conflict and/or genocide, particularly in Africa. We requested a subsidy of $250,000 and were able to bring together 70 Africans including Héga Martin. My involvement in the Forum Planétaire 3 conference in Burkina Faso last year was a major discovery for me, and we are still feeling the effects of the latter, in which a great many people took part. Our twinning project connecting schools in Quebec with schools in Burkina Faso with respect to environmental education is one of the outworkings of this and will require major investment. This is why it will be good for a large number of people to help us by taking part in Thursday's meeting.

As to the results of the symposium on Rwanda which brought together some 150 people, most of them from various African nations, the aim was to be able to discuss together the reasons leading to extreme conflicts such as the genocide in Rwanda. We discussed violence from the starting point of experiences in Quebec schools This cross-disciplinary symposium discussed the psychological, educational and historical aspects, the media and semiology and led to an international network of 144 researchers, most of them African, which I coordinate, the International Network for a Culture of Peace, Comprehension and the prevention of Genocide and Conflicts. Several projects in Africa have seen the light of day as result of this network, all of them with the same thing in mind: finding money and holding symposiums in Africa; as Westerners we go to Africa because we have the means to do so. Next year we are organising a symposium in Morocco in a relationship with the UNESCO chairs. We have a great many links with Burkina Faso and privileged links with Rwanda. UNESCO clubs are very active in Burundi and Rwanda and we work with teams which escaped the genocide. In the Democratic Republic of Congo, the entire east of the country is at war with daily scenes of extreme violence and thousands of women being raped. We are working with a team researching the discriminations of which pygmies in the Congo and countries around Rwanda are the victims. In Quebec, I recently gave a report in a symposium stating that in one major event pygmies were invited to give lectures and were housed in the zoological Gardens in tents. This is very disturbing and illustrates various types of violence, some more obvious and some more subtle. In Côte d'Ivoire, my work relates more to my University responsibilities, as I supervise doctoral theses.

Hega MARTIN, Project manager, WCS, Gabon

As to duplication of methodology, this is precisely one of the recommendations with respect to the training. I have been working in education and raising environmental awareness in
central Africa for over 10 years and we have had problems with assessment throughout this time. Our partners and sources of funding are continually asking us about the impact of our initiatives on children. This particular method originated from Kent University in the UK: it is a participatory approach which we have worked on for two years now. We did some training in England and then went in-field, carried out research and returned the results. Today, although it does not form part of the normal training programme, Arizona, Mexico, and China have requested this programme. The interesting aspect is assessment: how can it be established whether there is an impact in terms of knowledge and practices? Two weeks ago, I was in Mulhouse for a symposium on primate conservation, and people realised that they were doing a lot in terms of education in schools and zoos but had difficulty in assessing what was done with respect to the expected aims. So let me reassure you: this network will be duplicated in central Africa, both with respect to parks and protected areas - these are isolated so there are less influences with respect to our approach - and later with respect to cities as required by the specific issues there. In terms of recommendations, therefore, I would like training, particularly as regards the Francophone world, to emphasise this point. As stakeholders from southern nations, we may have ideas but at the scientific level there is an approach which we could use to have genuinely effective results.

The lady raised the question of the origins of the social imbalance. What we know today is that villages are becoming storehouses: traders come from the cities, take animals and sell them in the city. Village populations then find it difficult to find food because they need to travel further to find wild game. In cities, a choice is available: you can eat chicken, meat or fish. But I can assure you that in some villages there are no shops and the sole source of animal protein is wild game. If nothing is done, there will be a major food problem within 10 years in the villages, because for city dwellers, wild game is virtually a luxury. If commercial hunting carries on in this manner, there will be a nutritional imbalance for rural populations who have only this resource.

I carried out this project over the course of 2 years, but people will not change in two years. There needs to be follow-up, and the major problem we have with respect to sustainable development and conservation is a lack of resources. None of our strategies are long-term. When we carried out a survey on conservation issues in central Africa, in most of the organisations for which I work, education did not even account for 10% of their financial budget, staff availability and energy expenditure. This is because the issue of conservation is not really seen as incorporating an educational dimension. The fact is that you can conserve as much as you like, so long as populations which are living in harmony with this environment do not understand you or disagree with you, you are doomed to failure. It is vital to involve these populations in conservation approaches.

The last aspect relates to poverty in villages: you cannot require foresters to become stock breeders. A long-term approach involves teaching people management: loggers are asked to adopt a sustainable approach but local populations are asked to stop hunting. Rather than this, what is required is proper development, with local areas and committees in villages to prevent traders coming from the cities and exhausting their natural resources.

We were talking about discussions just now: they play a very important role not only in terms of teaching resources, but also in terms of what adjustments can be made for southern countries. Discussions on this level can improve the understanding of young people. For instance, I am in touch with a lower secondary school in Ariège (France) as part of a school twinning programme. Unfortunately, the Internet cannot be used, but we are trying to encourage discussion via diplomatic bag so that pupils can find out what is happening in the north or the south. The pupils really enjoy finding out how things are elsewhere.

Another recommendation: networks. I can confirm that they are extremely important in terms of motivation, discussion and innovation. Without networks, our knowledge will be very limited and we will have many preconceptions and prejudices which will be difficult to overcome. Facilitating participation in symposiums, the granting of visas and travel are also
highly important aspects, as is the involvement of politicians. I assure you that it is very important for politicians to be involved, particularly in our countries.

A participant

In consideration of international solidarity, I shall try to be brief. I took out an overdraft with my bank to buy my plane ticket and come here. The suggestion of having symposiums in Africa is a good one. The network to which I belong, WEEC, held a major international symposium in Durban in 2007 and then in India in Ahmedabad in 2008. We have also been active in African nations and the South. I would like to make the following comment: defeating apartheid was perhaps the most striking example of international solidarity. Today, perhaps there are not crises of sufficient magnitude for us all to rally to the cause. It may be that sustainable development is one such topic. I experienced the struggle against apartheid: young people worldwide took up the cause and we won. It was extraordinary!

Another comment with respect to corn and ethanol: I am in full agreement with those who are against using corn for food in order to make ethanol. As to pesticides, I am sure you know better than me. However, as regards sugar cane, not many pesticides are needed because it is a plant which grows easily without them being used. Fields can be weeded by hand, so using sugar cane to produce ethanol appears to be very reasonable to me. In any case, our countries need energy. This brings us back to the "wind power, solar power + ethanol" solution. I think you will agree with me that there is this need to find energy in order to become independent.

I also agree that Africa is poor in terms of GDP irrespective of how the situation has come about today. In terms of travel and investments, we lack financial resources.

Paul VERMANDE Francophone University Agency (AUF)

In Western countries, we are paying increasing attention to problems relating to the environment and global warming. We have sources of data which enable us to measure their consequences. However, there really is a lack of data with respect to international solidarity. The world is currently in a state of imbalance and we find it difficult to act in favour of solidarity except when there is a tsunami or other natural disaster, when the population acts quite spontaneously to help respond to these emergency situations. As I was preparing this symposium and when I visited the exhibitions, I saw that a number of people were concerned by this: for instance, on one stand I picked up a document published by the Franche-Comté regional teaching resource centre entitled "The case for education with respect to development and international solidarity". It was very well put together: a teaching guide for junior schools and lower and upper secondary schools and extra-curricular activities. Similarly, the ADEME has published a brochure on sustainable development which includes two pages explaining how important it is to be attentive to the world around us.

I was asked another very direct question: what should be done now? In western countries, I have suggested that raising the awareness of young people with respect to issues of international solidarity should be further developed: discussion via the Internet... other solutions need to be devised which could form part of teaching programmes, school projects and class projects. This still needs to be worked on.

As to southern nations, I don't think there is truly a tangible project which should be implemented today to progress sustainable development: it's really up to each country to determine what they feel is important in the very short term. I gave you an example from Haiti: two years ago, each of the 250 associations had a school, a small health centre and a farmers' cooperative. The only thing they wanted to talk about was their own little project: they paid their subsidies and put on events so as to be able to send off money. We decided that was charity and dispensed with this way of working in order to engage in partnership. We no longer do anything unless our partners in Haiti tell us that is what they want and explain their degree of need. This sometimes leads to discussion, but there is genuine dialogue and that is what is important.
If you want to fund projects in Haiti I am open to a large number of possibilities but it is up to Haitians to recommend them in their sectors (healthcare, education, fairtrade, etc). At the present time, there are stakeholders who do not have the resources to implement projects because the UN mission to stabilise Haiti consists of soldiers who get $700 million a year to maintain stability and who find this to be a difficult task.

It is up to individual countries and partners to define their national priorities.

**Presentation of a project in Brazil**

by Julie LE PHUEZ BRANCANTE MACHADO

(Department of Education, Brazil)

The project I'm going to be speaking to about is a project by the Brazil Department of Education which has existed since 2003. It is a system of lectures in schools, i.e. of participatory democracy, which has been set up in Brazil. I am here to tell you about it and share this project with you because we are currently in an invitation phase during which we are inviting countries worldwide to join with us in this project and share this experience in their schools.

This involves lectures which we offer to all kinds of school communities and also communities for street children, Amerindian communities and communities for the children of former slaves. We direct this to all children in an attempt to reach all children aged between 11 and 14 so they can all get together around a teaching resource which we prepare and send to schools and communities. Teachers, parents and others are invited to come and talk to children about a general theme in all the schools, for instance, global warming. We ask the children to think about the topic and then suggest something they can do within the community and elect a delegate to represent the project in their school. These delegates then meet together for discussion.

In Brazil, 700 children meet to represent community and school projects. The delegates meet at state level and then at the national level to discuss the project together and take decisions at both local and global levels, so this is a highly interesting concept.

We have a technical cooperation project with Portuguese-speaking countries and, in Latin America, with mostly Spanish-speaking countries. We are also very interested by the Francophone world and would like to invite Francophone nations to take part in this product with us and enable the children to take decisions together, take on responsibilities and give them a voice through the use of the teaching resources which we have established.

Of course, each country is subsequently free to create its own material; the material we have in Brazil works well but each country will need to adjust it to its own requirements and context; so this is what it's all about. The objectives are to promote the exchange of international experiences, which makes it possible to engage with social and environmental - i.e. global - issues and of course to do this via academic education and the involvement of society at large. Another aim is to make it possible for as many young people, teachers and communities as possible to have local ownership of monetary commitments and take on responsibilities for sustainable societies and to disseminate and further investigate fundamental issues with respect to the recognition of diversity - a topic we often use - as well as the culture of peace, of course, and the survival of the planet. And of course as part of the Decade, we want to strengthen the impact of this decade of education for sustainable development worldwide by getting as many children as possible involved with these subjects relating to sustainable development.

At this present time, the economic crisis may be an opportunity to consider everybody's individual and collective responsibility. I believe that the theme of our project is fully in line with current affairs and that making children stakeholders in this could be extremely interesting. In Brazil, we discuss a lot with today's stakeholders as well as tomorrow's; children need to start thinking about this sort of thing right away, start taking responsibility...
and become aware of what's happening as of now because it is today that attempts must be made to change things, not tomorrow.

Somebody mentioned debate over the Internet just now. We also have an online learning community which enables children in Brazil - and we hope to extend this internationally later - to exchange the experiences and projects they have in their communities over the Internet within Brazil: this works very well and two conferences have is taken place as a result. The next national conference in Brazil takes place in April 2009 and we hope to welcome a large number of international observers to see how we do things as well as influence a large number of nations such that in their own way and in their own fashion, they will reproduce this type of conference in their own schools.

This procedure has helped to connect schools somewhat to other social entities and already start involving children in taking responsibilities and having a voice in their nation. To achieve this, we provide them with significant communication resources.

We use newspapers to explain to children how to get themselves heard and ensure that they are listened to just as much as adults are. We explain to them how newspapers and radio work and get them involved in all that. We set up workshops to explain all this to them and it is always very interesting and surprising to see the extent to which children are always capable of taking adult decisions when we have it in our heads that it is always up to us as adults to make decisions for them. They are completely capable of understanding what is going on and making up their own minds, taking on responsibility themselves and in fact this is quite moving.

In Brazil, when they meet in Brasilia for the National five-day conference, we ask them to set up a charter of responsibilities similar to what exists in France with the Charles Léopold Mayer foundation, from which we receive a lot of support. This charter, drafted by children, has been given to President Lula for the international conference which will be taking place in 2010 in Brasilia. We will certainly have an international charter of children's responsibilities at the conclusion of this conference and we hope that this charter may be given to UN bodies and that subsequently, this type of experience could be taken on by international organisations.

We hope that Francophone nations will be interested in this project. We are very keen to work with African nations, southern countries and we are also very much hoping that France will become involved. I hope that we will be successful in setting up networks for we need contacts and support and we would be delighted to discuss our project more and pursue it.

Environmental conflicts relating to the disposal of wastewater in natural environments. Review and status report from Algeria

by Hassini TSAKI,
Professor, University of Oran, Algeria

I would firstly like to note that it is in the southern nations that the greatest ecological catastrophes, environmental accidents and incidents with an impact on the health of the most exposed populations of the planet are currently played out on a daily basis and that they are liable to continue to take place there.

The long journey of the French aircraft carrier Clémenceau and its 105 tonnes of asbestos to be disposed of on the shores of a southern nation is still fresh in our memories, as is the memory of the highly toxic products disposed of in the immediate vicinity of one of the principal ports in Cote d'Ivoire, causing the deaths of scores of people. These are harbingers of a future in which we will find ourselves taking stock of incidents and doubtless international conflicts based on damage to the quality of the environment in nations which are poorly prepared and which have been left behind by the rest of humanity.

It is widely recognized today that environmental management in southern nations suffers first and foremost from a significant communications deficit. This sphere appears to be the
preserve of some public figures, NGOs and institutions from northern countries where there is somewhat excessive media coverage of environmental issues. I believe that the opportunity should also be given for the duty and opportunity which southern nations have to share their view of things with respect to their reality.

Our specific contribution to this meeting relates to a State on the southern coast of the Mediterranean and relates to preservation of the Mediterranean as well as inland territories. The title given is "environmental conflicts relating to the disposal of wastewater in natural environments" and I'm proposing to give you a review and a status report.

The methods used in an attempt to approach this particular matter as follows: firstly there will be a presentation of the place and role of water in human civilisations, the environmental management of water as a key factor in sustainable development and, as regards the report related to Algeria, water and modernity, with an overview of the rapid and incomplete urbanisation of contemporary Algeria and especially the difficulties of government to control migratory flows and their consequences on the environment.

With respect to human civilisations and the role of water in the civilisations, I will firstly discuss the pioneering role of natural heritage and the water resources of the Tigris and Euphrates in the viability of Mesopotamian civilisation.

This primitive human civilisation which, 5000 years ago, firmly established writing within human society as a means of communication and development from that point onwards, could not have existed without water. At that time, for humanity this represented much more than Neil Armstrong’s small technological step onto the moon; it was the start of the march of mankind towards development and more especially the development of human intelligence.

This period represented the first steps in the development of human society in which mankind was already beginning to exercise a degree of control over its destiny. This new state of affairs, encouraged as it was by the physical landscape and a favourable climate, led to a fundamental change in humans of that time, turning them from hunters into farmers and making them key players in their own future.

Here you see a map of ancient Mesopotamia with the monthly flow rates of the rivers Tigris and Euphrates, with sources and power of virtually unbelievable levels. You can see this involved billions of cubic metres of water every month and this resource, which is not a fossil resource since it is renewable, formed part of the hydrology of an ecosystem or a region and represented a source of inexhaustible wealth.

Opposite, you can see a number of Sumerian tablets with evidence of the first traces of human writing and which date back to several centuries before Christ.

Right next door, Egyptian civilisation, which could more accurately be called Afro-Egyptian civilisation, left its mark on all the Mediterranean nations and cities due to its enriching and innovative influence and its role as a mediator of remoter African civilisations and Asian civilisations. This civilisation endured for practically 3500 years. That is not a short time on the scale of human history and none of it is or was possible except by means of this wonderful resource: water, and the amazing river Nile, one of the greatest rivers in the world which rises in central Africa and continues on its way for 6000 km.

Finally, not very far from France, there are still remains, some of which are contemporary, of cities dating from the European Middle Ages, such as towns in Andalusia in which water was celebrated with great pomp and ceremony. A number of relics and testimonies show that at this time, not only did man control this resource but also drew a certain degree of enjoyment and pleasure from it, because taking hold of a resource and turning it into a means of development and creation of wealth was evidence of a successful society.

It is now universally recognized that both the European Renaissance and the Greek and Roman civilisations drew a large degree of inspiration from the Egyptian and Mesopotamian civilisations which were also the mediators of Far Eastern civilisations. With respect to this, a
European philosopher has already stated, in a work dating from 1977, that what is generally called the West is nothing other than something which was born in Mesopotamia or Egypt. He goes on to give the etymological definition of Europe. Etymologically speaking, Europe designates something in the West. All this goes to show that human civilisation forms a single whole. There is no north, south, east or west. All understanding, knowledge and expertise is passed on from one to the other and forms a whole.

In a preliminary discussions which followed the first part of these presentations, a certain number of observations were made. People spoke about the North, the South, colonisation and neo-colonisation, but I believe that at present it is important, if our consciences are ready for it, to rise above all that and attempt to build a human heritage. The most recent global events concern issues such as global warming, a water crisis which is definitely to be expected in the years to come, and environmental or climatic nomadism in the future. With this in mind, I would like to discuss the question of water in more detail, I believe it is one of the resources with respect to which humanity should adopt a certain number of recommendations and attempt to follow them because it is a fundamental issue for the future and above all for the environment.

Algeria has experienced three major periods of migration; many of you will be familiar with the most recent of these which was related to security issues in the country. The country was in the throes of civil war and many populations in the country were instructed or required to move closer to major cities. At that time, a certain number of built-up areas and new towns sprang up very quickly around a number of cities in the north of the country. This led to a certain number of management issues, particularly with respect to water management. There is water management with respect to the supplier of drinking water, to which the government was able to act very quickly with a number of water supply initiatives, but the major problem was that of the treatment and monitoring of wastewater. The country was not at all ready for this and this created a certain number of problems.

30 years ago, this population was assessed as totalling some 14 million people, today there are 33 million people. 30 years ago, this population lived mostly in the country and is now 90% city-dwelling. These people live mostly round cities because there is a whole network of homes and built-up areas which have grown up around particular centres; this has led to problems of overpopulation and particularly problems in terms of water resources.

With respect to water resources, this country, which is reasonably rich financially in the form of oil and gas wells, was able to deal with the problem by purchasing and deploying a certain number of desalination plants. If we look at the case of the city of Oran, which has a population of some 2 million, a few years ago it used 90,000 cubic metres of water a day. The city now consumes 180,000 cubic metres a day. Unfortunately, while drinking water capacity was very quickly doubled using desalination procedures, wastewater treatment is not carried out or insufficiently so. For a country of this size, between 300 and 400 wastewater treatment plants would be required. There are about 100 in Tunisia but only 50 or so in Algeria. The population densities are not at all the same.

This wastewater is the source of a significant problem for the environment. The city of Oran uses almost 180,000 cubic metres of water a day and must of course dispose of it too. This wastewater is rejected into the natural environment: 85% of it goes into the Mediterranean, where there are also homes, holidaymakers and beaches. We have a certain number of sanitary issues with respect to some beaches in this regard. The rest of the wastewater - almost 15% - drains into the natural environment, generally to salt marshes which are therefore not used for farming or any kind of farming or timber use. Unfortunately, these sites are also transit sites for a number of migratory birds which cross the Mediterranean and sometimes stop over for a few days or weeks in these wetlands. The disposal of this wastewater in these marshes leads to changes in the natural environment and the destruction of a certain number of factors which make these environments sustainable. This means that these areas are losing their biodiversity or having it eroded.
As to scientific cooperation and international solidarity and cooperation, I believe the problem is one of communication. There is no solidarity, but I believe this is because there is no dialogue. We do not have dialogue; the North sees itself as the north, the south as the South and neither can understand the other. There are some obvious things which could be done but these have never happened.

In July, there was the declaration of the Union for the Mediterranean, which provided a number of hopeful signs of sincere, constructive and mutual dialogue. Ten years on, if an assessment were to be made of the last Barcelona protocol, what sort of conclusions could we draw? Has there been a genuine attempt at cooperation between countries to the north of the Mediterranean and those to the south? Personally, I do not believe this to be the case. There has only been the aspect dealing with controlling illegal immigration on which some progress has perhaps been made, although not fully because there are still young people, children, mothers and men from Africa dying daily as a result of this. How should we refer to them? They are the shipwrecked souls of globalisation, those who have fallen overboard from the north-south non-dialogue. There are children: and the awful thing is that everybody has got used to this state of affairs, it has become routine and no longer even makes the news. Thousands of people die off the Canary Islands, the Strait of Gibraltar and the Libyan coast.

The Barcelona treaty was supposed to establish responsibility for and set up genuine cooperation between the northern and southern countries round the Mediterranean. Ten years on, the issue of poverty remains. We cannot deal with the problem of the environment without dealing with the problem of solidarity with respect to the issue of poverty. It is to be hoped that the Union for the Mediterranean will provide solutions with respect to management of the environment in the region, particularly the Mediterranean.

One has the impression that the Mediterranean is enormous, but in fact it is not very large at all. It is a small sea which is continuing to bear the brunt of a number of onslaughts. We know that a number of marine species have already become extinct or are no longer sighted by a number of biologists. The Mediterranean monk seal, of which there were still sightings ten or so years ago on the southern shores of the Mediterranean, has ceased to be sighted by the teams led by Professor Zitouni BOUTIBA from the University of Oran who is here with us today and who studies monk seals and marine pollution in the region of the southern coast of the Mediterranean. We know that a number of species are already endangered and we are working with Professor Boutiba and his team on these aspects of marine pollution. We have data which shows that a number of resources, including fish and shellfish, are already affected to greater or lesser degrees. The Mediterranean should not be seen as a dump, even for wastewater.

The subject of my recommendation is that there should be genuine, sincere scientific collaboration and that to address problems relating to the Mediterranean, the north and the south should act to create genuine synergy founded on the potential represented by these nations in an attempt to solve these problems.

Annie DE WIEST (Director for SD, French-speaking community, Wallonia)

I am Director for Sustainable Development for the French-speaking community of Wallonie Bruxelles, the Francophone part of Belgium. We have competency in the fields of education and culture. We are very glad to be here and I would like to answer some of the questions which Boufledja BENABDALLAH addressed to us.

Education for sustainable development now extends well beyond the field of education. We are involved in fields which are much broader than simply the environment, extending to citizenship, North-South relations and peace. With this in mind, it is important at mid term to have concrete proposals for action, particularly within Francophone areas. The interest of the "www.mediaterre.org" portal has been emphasised and I would like to invite all partners here to get involved in adding information to it. It would also be interesting to add databases listing successful experiments as well as theoretical advances, and for it to be possible to inform
each other about the obstacles we encounter when we attempt to implement dynamics relating to education for sustainable development.

In terms of concrete proposals, I would like to talk about the necessity and relevance of exchanging training modules. Training of trainers and young people is very important, as is the networking which allows mobilisation and discussion to take place.

In conclusion, education for sustainable development involves discussing youth, but in addition there is the female half of the population. It is very important to be able to mobilise women because they are often the first victims of environmental disasters. What is more, women are also consumers and are often the people making purchases, so it is important to mobilise women more - and they are easy to mobilise - as well as getting them around the discussion table, particularly as regards decisions at the local level.

Lamine KADI, University of Mostaganem, Algeria

This workshop is entitled "ESD in the Francophone world". Has a comparison already been made between what happens in the Francophone world in terms of ESD and solidarity compared to the experience of other international stakeholders? Is the Francophone world behind, in advance, more committed or less so? Can anybody provide us with some perspective on this question?

Another point: Paul Vermande launched an appeal with respect to international solidarity. We could discuss the issue for hours, but from the point of view of southern nations, we believe that the best solidarity involves giving resources to the populations in question in order for them to be able to change their own living conditions. This requires two highly important conditions.

Firstly, democracy, which we refer to somewhat shyly as 'governance'. One very useful solidarity initiative would be for Northern countries to implement the conditions for genuine democracy to be set up in southern nations. How can we combat the cynicism of Western governments today, as they maintain regimes which are universally recognized as being undemocratic, solely for clear reasons of economic interest?

Why is democracy necessary? Simply because it is the preliminary for the implementation of effective systems in every field, be it the economy, research, education or training. It would reverse the brain drain in favour of the southern countries in question and be a useful achievement in these nations. It would also enable practically identified development factors to be set up: access to energy, water and education.

In addition, investing in knowledge means redirecting aid from international development agencies and international organisations towards funding delocalisations of Northern universities to southern countries. There has been some movement in this respect, taking place currently because there is a market in some emergent countries, but with more funding, this could also take place in less developed countries and thus enable an initial core of knowledge and skills centres to be set up, which would in turn leverage a knowledge-based society and pump-prime development. These are the two principal conditions I wished to mention.

Concerning practical projects, there is an initiative which we have been preparing in Algeria as part of NEPAD, the New Partnership for Africa’s Development. This relates to the creation of an African university for sustainable development and the pooling of the resources of certain universities in Africa and northern countries. In addition, an initiative is currently being developed in cooperation with the IEPF and the AUF involving the creation of centres of excellence focusing on topics devoted to sustainable development.

That is what I would like to contribute to this debate. Having said that, providing democracy really cannot be done as is being attempted at present. Bringing democracy to Iraq or Darfur because there are raw materials is not what I am talking about, rather enabling the populations in question to achieve their democratic aspirations.
With the perspective of economic recession, is it not likely that sustainable development will become the poor relation in international questions?

Florent BAARSCH, REFEDD and Médiaterre

I am Chairman of the French Student Network for Sustainable Development (REFEDD), but I would like to speak here in my capacity as a member of the "Médiaterre" youth committee.

Firstly, I would like to thank the person who just now said that young people should be at the centre of the decision-making process because the discussion is about education and at the end of the day the first people to be concerned by the kind of education which we are creating today are young people: people like myself who are students or those who are in primary or secondary education.

To come back to concrete proposals, last week the Francophone World Summit was held. On the fringes of this summit, a meeting was held for thirty young French-speakers who were asked to share their thoughts on four topics covered by the Francophone Summit, including the environment. I was part of this forum and with thirty or so other young French-speakers, we discussed what we could propose for the next two years; a kind of action programme involving concrete proposals. The fact is that we want to be practical because we are too young to be speechifying.

Education for sustainable development appears to us to be fundamental with respect to such proposals, as does participating in the creation of a major education for sustainable development programme with the IEPF and the AUF to see how things are done in other Francophone nations, bringing together what is done and attempting to put together a major programme destined particularly for African nations. I know that young environmental volunteers in Togo and Côte d’Ivoire are very active in this field, but they are lacking in intellectual resources and expertise as well as funding. The idea would be to assist with their training, training trainers so that there are more of them and so that they can then visit different schools to carry out this education for sustainable development.

Secondly, there is the training of young people who are highly influential in associations with respect to environmental issues. This summer, with the Francophone world, we received training in questions relating to sustainable development, but we would like to broaden access to the kind of training we received because it is really vital. It would be really important for as many young people as possible in southern countries to be trained in questions relating to the environment, protection of the environment and sustainable development. This is what we are presently working on in the youth committee because we believe it to be vital.

Training is important and education is even better because, particularly in some countries, young people do not necessarily have access to information as we do, particularly through Internet and the media.

I believe it is fundamental to be able to refocus the debate on concrete proposals because the subject is important, particularly education for sustainable development destined for African nations, because it should be borne in mind that they are the first victims of global warming and climate change. They are already suffering from these and it would be good if we could examine these issues immediately.

Corinne VIALLE, Teacher, Francophone World Union Committee for Education and Training

We were particularly drawn to this workshop because ESD is a central issue for the Union Committee. The price to be paid for the improvements which can be noted in the field of ESD can be measured in terms of the efforts which we all need to make so that together, taking into account what everybody can contribute in this field, we can collaborate, co-operate, co-train and establish partnerships which will enable us to make progress.

It has been emphasised that the role of NGOs and trade unions in this field is quite advanced because they are a means of getting very close to the problems which require dealing with. It
is true that major organisations deal with these issues and examine them, but grass-roots work can be implemented by organisations which take responsibility for such issues, including in terms of human rights and democracy.

As was stated at the summit in Quebec, we believe that the French language is an important tool for mutual understanding and working better together in order for these values of peace and democracy to be addressed collectively. I believe that the various experiments under way have brought to light questions on which we need to make progress, firstly a template for drafting projects, because there are many of them but they are not always put together properly. This would involve resources to be pooled. Secondly, we need guidance in how to put such projects together and enable others to benefit from shared experiences, successes and the various problems that arise. Thirdly, we need a standard way of validating these projects.

Furthermore, I think that a key factor is missing: assessment of such projects. If we are to talk in terms of projects and/or education we also need to measure our efforts and the progress made. This is perhaps one particular avenue on which we could work.

The issue of creating synergies around resources has also been mentioned. We also believe this is necessary: Mediterre could be a portal for this, but we need to remember the digital divide, which means this cannot be the sole resource.

Lastly, I would like to emphasise that the most important issue is that of funding these actions. In this regard, it is regrettable that funds allocated for the Francophone world are dropping. We would like to emphasise our regret in this respect and state that we would like there to be further possibilities for working all together for ESD in shared solidarity.

Isabelle d’ORGEVAL, CNEA - National Council for Private Agricultural Education

In agricultural colleges, we have long-standing experience of international cooperative initiatives. In private agricultural colleges, along with thirty or so other secondary schools we have tried, rather tentatively and with varying degrees of success, to operate a partnership network with agricultural colleges in Madagascar.

We have really done our best to get beyond charity and throwing food at the problem, which is often the issue in Catholic education, in order to develop genuine partnerships relating to programmes and methods. We have really managed to achieve a level of discussion: some young Malagasies have just sent us a clip in which, through a mix of traditional dance, hip-hop, rap and so on, they have described what farming is like in their country to young French people. It is now our turn for the young people in France to send them something back.

These actions may appear to be low-key in terms of education for development, but at the same time, we also act as a funding relay because we sent this video clip to the European Union and have managed to obtain some funding as a result. Days like today are also an opportunity to find ideas, euros and friendly discussion, which is all very positive.

Hega MARTIN, Project manager, WCS, Gabon

You should not refer to it as low-key: Sister Emmanuelle said that even a drop of water is not lost in the ocean. Any initiative to this end, great or small, has a part to play. We really need to have faith in this kind of initiative.

Julie LE PHUEZ, Department of State Education, Brazil

To answer the question about the cross-disciplinary nature of learning, we work a great deal on this basis with adults. We believe that generations can learn together, so it is not simply a question of something being passed on from adults to children, but also from children to adults.

We make children responsible in order for them to perform their actions within their families and communities. We supply them with the resources in order for them to develop their own thinking, but they then carry out these actions in their own community. This means that it is up to them to chivvy their parents, adults and teachers into action. This is an aspect which
we very much enjoy encouraging and which is highly important. It is not rare to see grandparents coming along to take part in the schools with their grandchildren and share their expertise and knowledge. The children, meanwhile, teach them how the internet works and how to communicate using different media. So this is something which we teach the children, not only by showing them how to do something but by getting them to do it; by getting them to participate in the initiative.

Comments

by Michel MOMBRUN

I will attempt to provide some answers to some of the questions which have been asked and which are important ones, starting by the crisis with respect to the bursting of this speculative financial bubble.

The real economy represents only 3% of all financial transactions which take place today. By real economy I mean the economy in which goods and services provided by some are exchanged and paid for by others. The rest is a speculative bubble of trading and share purchases of all kinds. It is not the global economy which has blown up, but the speculative bubble which represents 97% of all global transactions today. Unfortunately, when this takes on these sorts of proportions and trust between the people who make money solely by buying and selling shares evaporates, it ends up having a direct consequence on the real economy. It is true that we are all likely to feel the effects for a number of years to come.

Will this be negative with respect to sustainable development?

On the contrary, it should accelerate it because having an environmental crisis and emergency, an unprecedented social crisis, hunger riots, crises with respect to water and drought and the explosion of the financial bubble mean all the prerequisites are there. All the ingredients, over the last 15, 20 or 30 years, have been pointing the same way and if I were to put the Brundtland report in layman's terms, if we carry on in the same way we are going to hit a wall and this wall is now mere inches from us. We need to change course and come up with a different way of functioning, managing, acting and thinking. We need to devise a new form of development which is sustainable for the planet; bearable for our little planet, liveable-with and viable with respect to all human activity.

The bursting of the financial bubble and this crash should be an element which accelerates change and moves to invent this new form of development which must necessarily involve more solidarity, necessarily be fairer and necessarily be more viable for this small planet which is the only available resource known to life, particularly human life, on which to develop.

There is cause for concern because I am not convinced that all those at the controls in terms of political and economic decisions are persuaded of the need to change our modes of development, production and consumption. They are experiencing these events not as a call to a fundamental paradigm shift and a declaration of the need to change every aspect of our mode of operation in every country in the world, but simply as a crisis. It is as if I have a fever and think that it is enough to take some aspirin and rest a little for everything to go back to normal. Quite a number of people think that everything will go back to how it was before.

We know that is not the case, the climate will not change back, we are on our way and past the point of no return. The same applies to the loss of biodiversity, we cannot turn back the clock. All this is in constant change, doubtless with a whole series of major catastrophes in social and human terms which will have a huge financial cost, and there will be more to come. Unfortunately, all this has already started. We can prevent this from getting any worse than it is and reverse the trends, but that is a little more difficult.

This brings us right to the centre of our subject, education for sustainable development, because the issue is one of change and the primary objective of education is change.
50 years ago, I entered teacher training college and in my day we were taught many things so as to become teachers; educators. One of the things we were taught was that: “education takes place every time an individual has been able to structure themselves”. Amazingly enough, the same applies to sustainable development: it cannot be achieved by decree, it must be structured, built up with everybody, women, men, all the stakeholders involved in building a new form of life together, a new collective lifestyle. At the end of the day, it comes down to the same thing.

We are in a process to devise and build a form of development which is exactly the same, in terms of the thinking which lies behind it, as the way an individual personality is structured.

What does structuring an individual involve? There are two vital aspects. The potential for structure in an individual provides them with the ability to find fulfilment which will enable them to gain autonomy, freedom and relationships with other human beings in order to create a living environment with them: an ecosystem for life including all the other living species and in which we ourselves are stakeholders. This is an extremely important factor which must not be forgotten.

Education is not served up on a plate or learned by rote but an approach which should provide everybody, individually and collectively, with structure, both as separate, distinct individuals and collectively as members of the human community, where they live, in a particular region, in a habitat, a place to live and exchange with others. This is what makes education such a rich field, but also raises huge difficulties which have come up time and again in what you have been saying. I would like to come back to one of the difficulties raised in one of the questions asked.

How can the results of education be assessed?

Education is an investment, one characteristic of which is that the time to return on investment is particularly long. Bankers will tell you that it is difficult to have a return on your investment in the mid-term but possible in the long term. It is not easy to measure the results of education 20 or even 50 years later. Moreover, the main achievement of education is the avoidance of costs: environmental costs, social costs, human costs and financial costs. Costs which have been avoided are very difficult to identify, simply because they have been avoided. This means that in our templates for analysing, interpreting and assessment, we need to work on our ability to assess avoided costs since this is the main output from education: non-existent costs.

How can we persuade somebody putting funding into education how important this is when the returns will be in 10, 20 or 50 years time and that to make matters worse, they will be difficult to see. Education is very much the issue here and we need to make sure we do not lose sight of that. What is needed is to be able to identify what might have happened had education not taken place. But this cannot be affirmed because the education in question will have prevented that from happening.

This makes things really difficult, but nevertheless we really must work on this issue. Education enables autonomy to be established: the ability to take responsibility for oneself and exchange and discuss with others. On this point I would like to share something with you which was implicit in a number of contributions but for which I would like to share some concrete experience. In the province of Kerala in India, Amartya Sen worked for 35 years with a population which was in a highly deprived situation and suffering from extreme poverty. He worked to improve two things: education (the ability to acquire autonomy and be a productive human being) and health (being physically capable of living and exchanging with others).

Amartya Sen lived this out for 35 years and won the Nobel Prize for economics for his life’s work. He managed to make it possible for a given population to become endogenous, in other words to live without the benefit of money or technology from elsewhere, and acquire the means of its own development, having chosen how its own development would take
place. This provides part of the answer to some of the questions various people have raised. It is not up to us to impose what we believe to be the best education and mode of development. As we have seen, we are running into a brick wall ourselves!

Amartya Sen developed another measurement indicator for development, which he called the synthetic human development index, which provided much of the inspiration for the UNDP when they devised the human development index. What does this human development index portray? It does not take the total volume of financial activity within a country in order to measure its gross domestic product (GDP) which is a purely economic, financial and quantitative measure, but looks at the capability of a country by assessing all its wealth: human capital, social capital, health capital and capital in terms of natural resources in order to assess the capacity of populations within a given area to achieve their own endogenous development.

This is something which we must not lose sight of in education. The capacity of an individual to structure themselves alongside others in the human community is the key issue, and concerns a population of human beings made of flesh and blood, emotions, relationships, spirituality and the heritage of a culture which can sometimes be very old indeed.

Are not all of us, or at least most of us, the heirs of Mediterranean cultures who invented forms of democracy, citizenship and education and who first studied these matters? We have inherited all this and we cannot build a culture or education for sustainable development without taking into account all these roots of which we are the heirs. Are we not also the heirs of the evolution of all living things which, for 4.5 billion years, have gradually structured themselves - evolution of which we are one of the most complex and therefore the most fragile end products?

Education therefore lies at the heart of all our concerns; but when education for sustainable development is discussed nowadays, there is a tendency to forget the definition which brought us together in this, even if it is not necessarily intellectually appealing to us. You are of course familiar with it: "Meeting the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs"; but what comes next is extremely important too.

The concept of needs itself contains two other notions: meeting the needs of the most deprived, who should be given top priority: and I submit that education for sustainable development and sustainable development tend mostly to remember this part of the definition of sustainable development established in the Brundtland report which was officially enshrined in Rio 1992. Meeting the needs of the most deprived, who should be given top priority, is valid in every nation on the globe. In some cases, the most deprived make up 80 or 90% of the population. For others, in the privileged, rich nations like our own, they make up 20 to 30% of the population.

I would like to refer to something very recent and highly practical which led us to devise an education for sustainable development initiative of a form which was somewhat different - totally different, in fact.

In France, in 2007, according to statistics supplied by the national electricity and gas companies (EDF and GDF), the principal suppliers of power to French homes, an average of 25% of families were unable to pay their electricity and heating bills and had to resort to staggering payments over more than one year or to preferential rates benefiting from social aid paid for by local authorities or to having the bill paid in full by département solidarity funds, municipal social action centre funds or other charitable organisations. In some départements and cities this percentage is as high as 45 to 50%.

What sort of response can education for sustainable development with respect to energy provide if it does not involve dealing with this sort of issue first and foremost? This forms part of the definition of sustainable development which we have all subscribed to: "meeting present needs, particularly those of the most deprived populations". What should we all be
doing in France, a rich nation, the fifth-most powerful country in the world, a privileged nation in terms of sustainable development? We should be providing answers for these families. What sort of answer has been given today? An exclusively financial and economic one. Attempts have been made to pay some families' bills for them. At the same time, 60% of the heat is lost out of doors, greenhouse gases continue to be emitted and we are still using fuel oil in our boilers. This is simply tinkering with the problem and solves nothing at all.

The response to energy insecurity in France involves social, environmental and economic education: this is vital. These are in fact the three pillars of sustainable development. There is no other possible response to such issues of energy insecurity; the same applies to water, which is becoming increasingly expensive and for which the same families find themselves unable to pay, to job insecurity created by long-term unemployment, to housing insecurity because they cannot gain access to decent housing. All these issues apply, and we are talking about 25% of the French population!

Responding to the needs of the most deprived is a priority if we want to achieve anything at all in terms of education and building a new form of development. This means that all the actions and services performed today are all extremely important, because most of them are indeed targeted at the most deprived populations, not necessarily here in France but in every country in the world. We are all very well aware of this and I would like to say this deliberately in these terms: a response through solidarity.

We know that we are all totally interdependent on each other. In our environment today, our good and bad actions in terms of energy, biodiversity or protection of the environment, whether it is in Bordeaux or on the other side of the globe in Malaysia, China, South America or Africa, will have consequences for all of us. We are interdependent within the environment, and in the future we will all experience the results of whatever we do for good or for ill today. What is dramatic at present is that those who are responsible for the worst environmental disasters today are not those who suffer the consequences of them. This is a rather terrible injustice.

This interdependency appears highly negative and is a rather harsh reality. There is only one word with which to respond, and that word is solidarity. Even if we are ungenerous, and even if we are unwilling to allow so and so to have access to the beginnings of development and a healthy environment, it is nevertheless in the interest of those who today have the resources to express solidarity to do so, because we are all in the same boat. If half or two thirds of humanity are in a situation of non-development or non-access to essential services, it is clear that the rich countries will not be able to find a way out on their own. Whether we want it or not, if rich nations have a modicum of intelligence, they will be obliged to make solidarity work.

For those of us who want to do more than look in their wallets and see how many euros or dollars they have, the essential, human option is to stake all on such solidarity, all the more so because most of the answers which will enable us to solve our own problems in rich, developed nations will not be forthcoming from our rich, developed nations but from developing countries. This is because the fact that they are confronted with these difficult situations means they have far fewer preconceived ideas than we do in our rich countries when it comes to inventing answers which will also be invaluable in helping us get out of our mess too. In this respect, solidarity is indeed completely reciprocating. We have just as much to hope for from developing countries and their populations as they have to hope for from us.

I can speak quite unreservedly and with complete freedom because I am longer accountable to any particular organisation, so I am making the most of this freedom to express myself.

Overall, sustainable development approaches consist in changing all of modes of production, consumption, thinking and living together. Sustainable development is attempting to achieve this renewal by means of its modest contribution of proposals and initiatives which are likely to be progressively reproduced. However, if, at least simultaneously, if not beforehand, we
do not eradicate all the causes of the current dead-end situation, the sustainable development and education for sustainable development we are undertaking are doomed to failure.

In my presentations I often use the image of a barrel, a big barrel with iron bands which is leaking all round the bottom. Others are taking to the barrel with axes and collecting water, water is pouring out in all directions and the barrel is almost empty. Above the barrel, there is a tiny shower from a watering can pouring in sustainable development. The only way for the tiny watering can to have any chance of filling the barrel one day is to plug all the leaks and put an end to all the unauthorised pilfering of water going on.

No education for sustainable development initiative can exist; no sustainable development can exist or be implemented if, at least simultaneously, we do not eradicate all the causes of our current situation. We need to face up to these causes and collectively take responsibility for them, even if we as individuals would not have done such things. This represents a major work to be done both in our respective nations and in solidarity together, with all the peoples of the Earth but also individually, because at the end of the day, as the United Nations texts say, we do have clearly different responsibilities in this respect.

As a summary, but not an end or a conclusion, all our educational processes must both remind us that we are in a perspective of change and that change is without doubt the hardest of things for humans to cope with. It means calling into question all our habits and practices and is a long and difficult process. This means that it is vital that we exercise our wills in this respect and have an extremely high degree of willingness to act regardless of the difficulties with which we will be faced. As we work to bring responses, we should never forget that responding to the needs of the most deprived populations has to be an absolute priority.

I am currently in the Essonne in France, and we have an initiative for the whole département. Some people say to me "why aren't you doing anything for people who would like to install solar-powered water heating in their houses?". I would be very happy to see homeowners installing solar power and solar-powered water heating! The fact is that they have the right culture to do this and the financial resources to pay for it. It is really not up to us as militants or professional teams working in the field to spend our time with those who already have the resources to do what is necessary.

Our first priority is social and family ecology and addressing energy insecurity. Our first priority is monographs on the living world for schools. At the beginning of the last century, schools across France spontaneously began to write monographs dealing with local history and heritage, with the help of their teacher who was often the mayor's secretary. The thousands of monographs from every village in France make up an extraordinarily significant heritage through which each individual was able to incorporate their history and their past into their contemporary life. These monographs supplied such a wealth of details that they formed the basis for laws which are envied worldwide governing the protection of our architectural heritage.

Today, the issue does not relate solely to this heritage and history but is one of whether or not the human race is capable of carrying on living on this planet. The issue today is one of rewriting monographs, not on the subjects of heritage and history, but to reinvent school with an enormous educational ambition bringing together all stakeholders: children, teachers, parents, local authorities and non-profit associations, to write monographs of the living world and reintegrating us, the human race, in this living world, with great humility, because we are there alongside everything else, with the high ambition of managing to protect this biodiversity which is necessary to our own survival.

Educational aspirations of this nature must be addressed with all our strength. I would like to conclude by quoting something Seneca said 2000 years ago: "It is not because things are difficult that we dare not, it is because we dare not that things are difficult".
Conclusion

by Hega MARTIN
(Project manager, WCS, Gabon)

The aim of this session was to assess initiatives carried out throughout the Francophone world, which is enormous, particularly in terms of its cultural diversity. This is an essential dimension because it serves as an example for other initiatives and an encouragement in terms of the positive results which have already been achieved.

Some 40 or 50 people have taken part and we have been able to present 12 of the 18 presentations planned. These concerned local initiatives which required a lot of courage because they have often faced major difficulties.

We have been able to note some results in terms of projects which can be proposed within the Francophone world. We are working on the basis that the primary mission of education for sustainable development concerns the fight against poverty and exclusion. This key point has been emphasised by all participants in the discussions and the responses to these, such that it is clear that this is not an isolated approach but one which forms part of a whole and a specific context.

The first proposal is to call on States, via the CONFEMEN, the Conference of Education Ministers, to support ESD and perhaps further strengthen this aspect by scheduling a meeting or work session in 2009. The Francophone world is vast and includes developing countries and under-developed countries. Strengthening modes of governance and pedagogical practices is therefore very important given that rates of progress and the ways in which different populations apprehend and/or take on board this notion are highly diverse and often take place to varying degrees. Three years after the launch of this Decade, how many nations have followed, ratified or even held a national debate on the topic? Very few.

There is also a need to make an inventory of available resources and pool these. There are a number of initiatives but they are generally disparate. Consequently, it is important that an inventory of what has been acquired so far is drawn up so that by pooling this we can move forward on a sound footing so that those taking initiatives do not repeat mistakes previously made by others.

It is necessary for projects to be established to give a voice to the most deprived, particularly for developing and under-developed countries. There are many deprived people, and a good number of turnkey projects are being provided by international organisations and some institutions. Assessment shows that one reason for the failure of projects is when time has not been taken to give the people concerned their say in the matter first and foremost.

Local knowledge needs to be identified and capitalised: the invaluable heritage of popular expertise. When an old person has the opportunity to go into a school to teach young people how things used to be in the old days, there is a lot to be learned. The Francophone world can enrich this kind of thing to constitute a basis which not only restores the status of older people, but also shows young people that the world was not always as it is today.

Simple criteria need to be established to assess initiatives: this is often a major problem for partners in our programmes. We educate, raise awareness and inform - but what is the impact? How can we know whether the message given has been heard? How can we know whether the person who has been informed has taken the message on board? How can we know whether someone who has taken the message on board has done something in practice?

There is a need to involve grassroots committees, particularly women. We know the influence of women in society, particularly in Africa, and these women are often marginalised. In some projects this aspect is taken into account and this kind of approach is a requirement, a criteria to obtain funding. In our proposals, we shall be strongly recommending that this is maintained.
It is necessary for a list to be drawn up of research projects dealing with ESD. In addition to available resources, there is also local knowledge: but how can these resources and local knowledge be introduced into scientific research? These resources need to be quantified and this local knowledge, which is often empirical, needs to be made use of scientifically. This therefore involves work relating to scientific research at university level.

A database covering projects and best practices should also be set up. For instance, we have seen with the "Médiaterre" website, set up by the Francophone world, that it is possible to use the Internet or other sources to build up capital which young people, adults and older people can use to find out information and discover existing resources to make it easier to pool these.

A project to strengthen solidarity needs to be developed, with the support of academics and recognized experts in the Francophone University Agency (AUF) and the Francophone Institute for Energy and the Environment (IEPF).

The approach adopted by Francophone parliamentarians, particularly those in the south, i.e. the involvement of local elected officials, should be supported. This is very important, particularly in these nations.

More training projects should also be established to support grassroots committees - whether it be formal or informal training.

The initiative to set up the Francophone network must also be supported. Networking is essential for this kind of approach.

We need to use images and other means of expression to promote ESD, particularly communications, television, art, etc. Every form of communication should be envisaged because the audiences are highly diverse and have different cultures.

Local partnerships should also be strengthened. Developing countries need to develop and companies have a huge influence in terms of jobs. They should not be excluded, on the contrary they should be included in this process, particularly by means of environmental impact studies for each project.

Issues of the rights of man and of the child also need to be taken into account and the value of belonging to a culture and a particular area needs to be promoted. As part of the teaching process, it is necessary for populations to be instilled with a pride in their area, their forests and their cultural environment in order for them to become conscious of this and recover their dignity. This represents a source of motivation which will enable these people to become integrated in this process.

The setting up of national committees should be accelerated. How many Francophone nations have set up a national committee since 2005? Out of the eight countries in Central Africa, I am only aware of one committee which has been set up by the government and which is ready to operate. This is quite a slow pace, so this is a strong recommendation for this to take place in the years to come.

**************************
Session 4

The role of the media in education and information for sustainable development

Summary

• Introduction (Patrice CAVELIER, Secrétaire général, Radio France)
• The development of the media, particularly with respect to the economy (Véronique SMEE, editor-in-chief, Novethic, Caisse des Dépôts et des Consignations)
• The place of the environment in the media (Carine MAYO, Journalist, President of the Association of Writers and Journalists for Nature and the Environment - JNE)
• Ethics and codes of practice for journalists (Jean-Luc MARTIN-LAGARDETTE, journalist and editor in chief of Ouvertures.net magazine)
• Training journalists with respect to sustainable development (Christophe DELOIRE, Director, Journalist Training Centre - CFJ)
• Training in sustainable development for France Télévisions journalists and sustainable development on air: the case of RFO (Didier DESORMEAUX, journalist in charge of the "multimedia information and editing" at France Télévisions University)
• Education, training, information and awareness-raising with respect to sustainable development in Youth press (Françoise RECAMIER, sustainable development partnership officer, Groupe Bayard Jeunesse)
• Conclusion (Jean-Louis CAFFIER, LCI journalist, president of the Climate, Energy, Humanity, Media Association).

Moderator:
Jacqueline DENIS-LEMPEREUR: Scientific journalist, French Committee for the Decade

Introduction

by Jacqueline DENIS-LEMPEREUR
(Scientific journalist, French Committee for the Decade)

How can education in the broad sense of the term, i.e. including training, information and awareness-raising, help all citizens at every stage of their life, to be capable and responsible enough to manage the present and be prepared to face an uncertain future in a society which is both complex and in a state of perpetual change? This is the challenge we are being asked to take up in this workshop.

We have a roadmap: at mid point in the Decade, the issue is to identify changes which can be observed since 2005, more specifically since the "Progress and proposals with regard to education for sustainable development" symposium organised by the French Committee for the Decade which took place in June 2006 at UNESCO headquarters. At the same time, on the basis of these observations we are called upon to look to the future and make proposals for the second half of the Decade.
Introduction
by Patrice CAVELIER
(Secrétaire général, Radio France)

First of all I would like to refer to the title of this conference, "Acting together to educate for sustainable development". Ever since I have been involved in meetings of the French Committee for the Decade, I have often asked myself about this verb, "educate". Is it up to journalists to "educate" our fellow-citizens? I would like to remind you that the mission of public service radio is based on three components: information, education and entertainment.

526 votes for, 4 against. The adoption on Tuesday, October 21 of the Grenelle environmental summit bill was a moment of virtual unanimity in France such as the National Assembly has rarely witnessed. Without a doubt, this shows that the time has come for France to begin a kind of green revolution. Although there is starting to be a consensus as to the objectives, schedules and resources are likely to provide further scope for lively debate.

In terms of education, training and information, the role of the media is of course fundamental. In the field of sustainable development in particular, Radio France is conscious of the importance of uniting its efforts with those of government, companies, non-profit associations, etc in order to go some way to improving national and international policy and in so doing, above all provide insights to enable citizens to become aware of this difficult issue.

The issue is difficult first and foremost because of terminology. In this respect, the results of a survey by Ipsos/Dexia published in the French daily newspaper "Le Monde" showed that less than one French person in two had a "very precise" or "highly precise" idea of what sustainable development meant. The very concept of "sustainable development" also involves a large number of issues and in my opinion, it also lacks clearly defined references and standards: my impression is that the man in the street finds it difficult to make it tangible.

The issue is also difficult because it challenges many of our instincts, habits and thought patterns and seeks to reform them. This involves making a break with the philosophy of the post-war boom years, the embodiment of growth "at all costs" and the epitome of the outrage that consists in the fact that in one century, we have used 100,000 years worth of fossil fuels.

Finally, the issue is difficult because people are ill-informed about it. While fair trade, responsible tourism, organic products and biofuels have all increased exponentially in recent years, and public opinion is stirred and extensively mobilised when industrial and natural disasters occur, bringing environmental issues to the fore for a brief moment, the "sustainable" aspect in individuals' thinking and commitment is far from being attained. There is regular evidence of the degree to which the population is ill-informed.

A significant amount of explanation still needs to be provided for the French as to what "sustainable development" includes, even if significant progress has already been made over the last two years. I am thinking particularly of the debate surrounding the Grenelle environmental summit, which was a real springboard for raising the issue and the awareness of many of our fellow-citizens.

In this education for "sustainable development", a kind of citizenship class on an international scale, the media need to help individuals become aware of the perils threatening our planet: this is how we can all become citizens of the world, even if I personally do not favour this terminology; but at least it has the merit of summing up our shared destiny and future.

However, as Francis Balle said26: "in our democracies, journalists may sometimes not accomplish their mission because they aspire to play a role other than their own: they may

26Professor of political science at Panthéon-Assas University in Paris and a former member of the Supreme Broadcasting Authority (CSA) in France in his Lenten conference at Notre Dame de Paris on Sunday, March 11, 2007
aspire to be the Delphic Python, responsible for passing on oracles from the gods, rather than acting as sentinels, a seemingly less glorious role which consists in keeping watch..."

While it would appear to be natural and fundamental for all journalists to take into account the complexity and interdependency of all processes relating to sustainable development in the course of their work, this nevertheless assumes a prior development of knowledge and awareness on the part of media professionals in this field.

This awareness must of necessity involve broader dissemination of specific educational and training approaches designed for them.

In the first place, I would like to address the role of the media in general and with respect to education for sustainable development in particular.

Too often, public and private stakeholders working on issues relating to sustainable development tell us that journalists should serve as relays to communicate the urgency of the measures to be implemented to save the planet, change consumer habits and so on.

I believe that it is important in this respect to recall, and emphasise, that the primary mission of a journalist (and I am deliberately not including the producers of programmes but talking about journalists), irrespective of the media in which they work and particularly if they work in public broadcasting, is to inform and not to educate. In the strict sense of the term, a "medium" is an agent of transmission: a medium of transmission - or communication - is by nature a neutral agent. In this context, the role of a journalist consists in gathering facts and information, organising these and offering an analysis. They provided the world with food for thought. Journalists are supposed to present objective facts so that free citizens may freely form their own opinion.

An analysis of the current state of the media, particularly in this era of globalisation, brings into relief the new challenges journalists face with respect to their role and function in a society of shared knowledge. New media are becoming databases, forums of dialogue and information-sharing from which anyone is free to draw what they wish when they wish, as they choose. The impact of these new media on a society based on knowledge and learning is therefore linked to the possibility of greater appropriation by the users. What is more, technological innovations are favouring the development of collective communications projects. They enable people who are physically distant from one another to work in partnership.

In terms of sustainable development, once again the role of the media is to inform: inform as to the issues relating to sustainable development, inform as to the debates underway: locally, nationally and at European and international levels, in organisations specialising on these issues; inform as to the policies being implemented by different States and also, above all, to inform - by simple, clear, scientifically verified messages - with respect to responsible acts which all citizens can perform to promote "sustainable development".

With a daily listening audience of 13 million people, Radio France, the state radio corporation, naturally has an essential role to play in this collective debate, and all of Radio France's stations have taken the measure of this challenge.

Over and above their role of providing information, which means they will pass on news of disasters such as Seveso, Three Mile Island, the Amoco Cadiz, Chernobyl, AZF or, more recently, the oil spill from the Fedra at Gibraltar, and so on, our nations have become aware of their role with respect to education and training; they have become aware that more fundamental work is also necessary so that not only can current affairs be dealt with on a day-to-day basis, but also, over the long term, issues can be identified and our editorial content can also fulfil a pedagogical function.

Features such as "CO₂ mon amour" on France Inter and reports such as "Planète citoyenne", "Planète environnement" and "Planète mer" on France Info, along with, for many years, Hubert Reeves' reports on France Culture, have become indispensable in terms of
understanding issues relating to water, energy, forests and the impact of various health and economic issues on the environment. Today, ratings figures show that these "responsible" programs have an increasing following amongst listeners: for instance, Denis CHEISSOUX’ programme "CO₂ mon amour", which is broadcast on Saturdays at 2pm on France Inter, saw a significant rise in audience figures in the first half of 2008, with close to 260,000 additional listeners.

Far from this becoming a "specialist interest" subject or it being restricted to a few daily or weekly timeslots, our stations are seeking to become forums for debate which we consider to be unrivalled in the world of French broadcasting and media.

The stations explain and highlight the fact that anybody can and must be involved in sustainable development: companies, local authorities and private individuals, each at their own level, in their professional and personal lives, and that it is possible for everybody to act practically as they are able to protect the environment.

In this respect, our local network, France Bleu, which has 41 local stations, is increasingly passing on and encouraging local and non-profit initiatives throughout Metropolitan France.

I would like to emphasise that we do not believe what we do is exemplary. Humility is still the order of the day because even if genuine progress has been made, much still remains to be done. And once again, as we go down this road, only work which brings together all political, economic, non-profit association and individual stakeholders will enable us to see expectations turned into realities. We are running a marathon and not a 100-metre race.

As was said earlier, providing proper information requires journalists' work to include a minimum of knowledge and learning about a given topic. How can somebody talk about economics, nuclear power or foreign policy if they do not have a good background in these areas? Clearly, the same goes for issues relating to the environment and sustainable development.

It is obvious that training journalists with respect to sustainable development issues is a necessary condition for these journalists to acquire the "keys" enabling them in their turn to provide better information to readers, listeners and viewers. Such training must form part of the common-core teaching given in schools of journalism alongside the traditional major disciplines.

Any media company should also enable its broadcasting staff to receive training and develop further expertise in such issues throughout their professional lives in the course of continuous training.

As we observe on a daily basis, the issue of sustainable development is not the preserve of specialists. It affects all of us, at home, at work and when we travel be it for business or pleasure.

Today, some timid steps are being taken in the curricula of the principal schools of journalism to make reference to these issues, particularly with respect to the economy. However, I believe we need to go much further than that. Sustainable development also includes many other aspects of society.

Lastly, leaving it up to specialist journalists to deal with issues relating to SD in the media is not a panacea because there are so many topics relating to these issues.

These are complex matters which of necessity change over time as new scientific discoveries are made and individual listeners, readers and viewers get up to speed. This means that journalists must constantly update their knowledge in all of these fields, including that of sustainable development.

Unfortunately, the question of continuous training has not yet been taken fully enough into consideration, whether by companies or, I believe, by those for whom it is intended: employees, which of course includes journalists. Over and above the development and/or
maintenance of employability on the labour market, professional training applied to sustainable development is absolutely vital given the extent and changeable nature of the fields and subjects to which these issues are related.

In this respect, managers and the heads of media companies need to be on the front foot to offer training to their teams enabling staff working on the editorial side (journalists and producers) to be fully up to speed with the changes of the world around us.

As I have said, there is still a long way to go and I’m sure that these three days, including this session this afternoon, will enable us to take a few more steps along this road.

By way of conclusion to this introduction, I would like to share with you this well-known quotation from Antoine de Saint-Exupéry which I recently rediscovered in an article in the daily newspaper Le Figaro devoted to sustainable development and which, doubtless somewhat idealistically, sums up our situation and our shared responsibility in this respect: "We have not inherited the Earth from our ancestors. We are borrowing it from our children."

The development of the media, particularly with respect to the economy
by Véronique SMEE
(Editor-in-chief, Novethic)

Information about sustainable development is information like no other. As a result, it is even more subject to the limitations of the media: audience, short-termism and a drift towards showbiz. Sustainable development involves complex issues which are significant for the future of the planet: this renders the work of the media difficult. Providing objective information whilst avoiding doomsday scenarios or inducing guilt at the same time as getting individuals involved represents a considerable challenge.

Novethic is a website which was set up in 2001 by the Caisse des Dépôts et Consignations [a French State banking organisation]. It is a resource centre which generates information on sustainable development and ethical investment funds, and attempts to act as a meeting place between society at large and political and economic stakeholders.

In seven years, we have observed extremely rapid development of the media in all directions with respect to these issues. Mainstream media began providing coverage of sustainable development with the Johannesburg Summit in 2002, following which environmental issues rose up the agenda until the media coverage of the work of the IPCC and climate-related issues. NGOs have benefited from greater visibility and their alerts have gained in credibility.

There are some extremely positive aspects; the downside remains the over-emotional way in which these subjects are dealt with, particularly when it comes to natural disasters and/or the loss of resources, which confer a sense of powerlessness. The media do not devote enough space to the role of consumer-stakeholders and eco-citizens and do not really manage to involve people.

Another point with respect to which progress is required is that the media do not pay much attention to social and societal impacts of economic activity, despite the fact that such impacts are vital, particularly in emerging nations. The social aspect is often relegated to the margins and generally deals with aspects relating to the environment (climate refugees, child labour, etc) or is covered from the angle of fair trade.

Lastly, while media specialising in sustainable development manage to supply a good level of information with respect to these issues, their audience is generally limited to the "converted" and sustainable development professionals. There is a genuine danger of the sustainable development community having no other audience besides itself!

Regarding the economic aspect, publication of the first sustainable development reports by companies has marked a change, with the notion of social responsibility and the taking into account of stakeholders (the public, employees and consumers). Lastly, the groundbreaking
Grenelle process received major coverage in the media and contributed to greater environmental awareness.

Nevertheless, however remarkable these changes may be, they also include a number of negative aspects which need improving.

The media need to root these subjects within a broader vision and explain the social implications of sustainable development rather than make do with passing on a whole series of "routine gestures" or adopting a more moralising stance. To take the example of organic products, the media definitely needs to be more educational; it does not help consumers to draw a distinction between marketing and genuine substance. The result of this is that there is a loss of public confidence and potential consumer-stakeholders become disoriented.

Some programmes are still too spectacular in nature, the risk being that the audience feel overwhelmed and do not understand what they can do. Information tends to focus on one-off events rather than keeping up with issues over the long term, explaining causes of climatic phenomena, water stress, the exhaustion of natural resources and so on. The media call far too much on emotion and sensationalism, particularly in their coverage of natural disasters and species extinction for example.

On the Internet, there are increasing numbers of sites and content aggregators which disseminate information pell-mell, mixing up articles, press releases and advertising. All these practices result in a skewed vision of the subject, even more so because sustainable development has also become a component of corporate communications. Specialist journalists are drowned out amidst communiques and conferences of every hue, and their role as those who filter information is becoming increasingly difficult. Information supplied by companies is not always verifiable, particularly as regards their local impact in emergent countries, the realities of their subcontracting chains, child labour and so on.

Journalists and NGOs both have an interest in calling companies to account with respect to these non-financial types of information. I find it unfortunate that businesses are still rather a taboo subject with respect to sustainable development given that they constitute a key element in terms of reducing societal and environmental impacts.

The place of the environment in the media

by Carine MAYO

(Journalist, President of the Association of Writers and Journalists for Nature and the Environment - JNE)

The idea that journalists have an important role to play in making people aware of environmental issues is not a new one. In fact, this observation formed the basis for the creation of our Association of Writers and Journalists for Nature and the Environment (JNE) which was set up almost 40 years ago. The first association of journalists devoted to this topic in the world, it was set up by Pierre Pellerin who at that time was writing for La Vie des Bêtes, Jean Carlier from RTL and others, as time at which the protection of wildlife and the environment did not have a very high profile in the press. JNE has been one of the groups to raise the alarm and explain the damage being done to the planet and the idea that the resources we derive from it are not infinite.

It was therefore natural for this association to publish an initial survey into the role of the environment in the media some 10 years ago, overseen by Claude-Marie Vadrot, who was at that time President of the association and a journalist with the Journal du Dimanche.

The objective was to analyse the gap between public expectations and how environmental issues are dealt with in the media. This survey also gave plenty of space to testimonies by journalists who were members of our association. Several new editions of this survey have been published since then. In the most recent edition which is currently being finalised, we have chosen to invite contributions from 260 members and to focus the debate on a single question: "Has the Grenelle environmental summit changed anything in your practice of journalism?"
The reason for this choice was that this has been the most striking piece of news in the past in our field, even if, as several association journalists have pointed out, other significant events have also taken place recently: the IPCC report, Al Gore’s film and their shared Nobel Prize and the possible candidature of Nicolas Hulot for the French presidential election, about which much was written.

Is it a question of the urgency of the crisis? Is a combination of all these phenomena? Apparently our society has become more attentive to the environmental message, even if it is difficult to know the reasons for this and even if some people, including some of our members, find that this is not happening quickly enough.

Before giving a voice to our journalist members, we also took a look at the press. This is what we found.

With respect to television, observation of the eight o’clock news on TF1 and France 2 and the Soir 3 evening news between the end of March and the end of April during the Sustainable Development Week produced a number of interesting findings. It would appear that television channels found it difficult to find a subject which would illustrate this concept because they gave it very little airtime. It may be that the short format of news items (mostly 1 minute 30 seconds, particularly for TF1) made it difficult to provide a proper perspective of the three pillars of sustainable development - economic, social and environmental - or perhaps it is simply not a subject which inspires editors in chief. During this period in spring, there were major differences between the different channels.

As in 2005, TF1 was by far the channel which gave most space to the environment, often with more than one item per day, particularly as regards local wildlife, even if this meant producing two almost identical reports within mere days of each other on pairs of falcons nesting in cathedral spires. Over on France 2, the preference is for environmental issues affecting daily life, while on the Soir 3 news, few items dealt with the environment, although the ones that did lasted longer. This was particularly the case with respect to GM crops last spring, because this was the time at which the bill relating to GM crops was being voted on in parliament.

Analysis of the television news for the last few weeks of October 2008 has confirmed the trend in favour of general-interest subjects which are closer to home, although the introduction of special reports during the TF1 evening news is noteworthy, particularly a piece lasting 3 1/2 minutes on nuclear hazards in France. It can also be noted that the adoption of the Grenelle bill in recent weeks has received very little TV coverage and that the environmental effects of the economic crisis has also received very little coverage in television news.

However, this does not mean that television has no interest at all in the environment. We can welcome the appearance of "Report-Terre" on France 5, a series of programmes in which young people are sent off to film the best European initiatives in terms of ecology in Europe, the debate programme "Ce soir ou jamais" on France 3, which often includes environmental issues and the magazine programme "Ô, ma planète" produced by Dominique Martin-Ferrari, a member of our association, to be broadcast on RFO starting in November.

There is also WebTV, with channels such as Gaïa Network, Terre TV, Alternative Channel, Ze media vert and so on, as well as the web radio station Fréquence Terre, which is launching a series of programmes devoted to the environment in the United States, starting in October 2008.

Also with respect to radio, it should be noted that France Culture had a special Grenelle environmental summit week in October and that RTL has launched "expédition RTL" in which reporters have been sent all over the world to analyse the consequences of the environmental crisis and climate change on our future.

In addition, Virginie Garin, the journalist at this station whose brief includes environmental issues, wrote to us to say this: "The Grenelle environmental summit has undeniably
increased the regularity with which environmental subjects get airtime, with plenty of practical angles (eco-loans, HGV taxes, housing standards, pesticides, etc). In my daily report (at 6.50am) I regularly cover topics relating to the Grenelle summit."

As to the written press, there is plenty there too, with the creation of the Planète section in Le Monde and special issues in weeklies such as Nouvel Observateur, Capital, and VSD, and more surprisingly, magazines such as Femme Actuelle. What is new here is definitely that environmental concerns are now affecting sections of the press which previously devoted little importance to this topic: the business press (although the trend has been present there for some time now), women's magazines, parenting magazines for young mums, health magazines and so on.

Another new consequence of the environment being taken into account in the written press is that printed media companies are beginning to pay more attention to their environmental footprint. It should be noted that Géo magazine is now printed on FSC (Forest Stewardship Council)-approved paper, that Prisma Presse has appointed a "Sustainable Development Officer" that there has been the announcement of the setting up of effective paper recycling and the carrying out of a carbon balance, firstly for VSD magazine and then the rest of the Prisma group. And these are just some examples among many.

Following this description of the media environment in which journalists work, I would like to return to the essential question which we asked our members in our survey. "Has the Grenelle environmental summit changed anything in your practice of journalism?"

For those of us who work in specialist magazines such as our colleagues at La Maison écologique and Terre Sauvage, and press which covers gardening, animals, organic issues, and for Denis Cheissoux who produces the programme "CO2 mon amour" on France Inter, the Grenelle environmental subject has not changed their practice. They are continuing to play a pioneering role providing expert analysis of the issues under discussion.

Another constituency of colleagues refuses to attach any importance whatsoever to the Grenelle environmental summit, which they deem to be a political charade.

Other colleagues report a discernible change at their papers. Olivier Nouaillas from La Vie, for instance, writes the following: "Environmental subjects are now becoming major headlines. Furthermore, when La Vie launched its new format (January 2008), a new regular section on "practical" ecology (at least 1 and sometimes two or even three pages) was created in the magazine section of the weekly in addition to the current-affairs articles in the first section."

Similarly, Marie Verdier, a journalist with La Croix, notes the following: "It is true that the "Grenelle" has served to amplify an existing trend attributable to climate change, which took on a new dimension from early 2007 onwards when the IPCC report was published, followed by the international negotiations post-Kyoto. Current affairs in Europe, with the energy-climate package and the reduction in vehicle CO2 emissions and so on has continued to fuel the topic of the environment alongside political and economic issues. In fact journalists as a whole, like the rest of the population, feel more concerned personally by questions of environment, pollution, eco-friendly products and so on. These subjects were already favourably received previously. What is new is that they weigh more heavily in the balance than they used to compared to other current-affairs topics."

The Catholic press is not alone in giving over more space to the environment. Here is an interesting testimony from Nadia Loddo, a journalist with the free newspaper Metro: "The Grenelle environmental summit was the reason my position was created! I've been working for Metro for two years and two months."

At first, I worked on the current-affairs pages (international news, France, politics) and the weekly section devoted to the environment: "Ma planète". This section was launched in autumn 2006 by the former assistant editor-in-chief, François Bourboulon. I quickly became interested in this and took on responsibility for it. One year later, faced with the increasing
number of topics relating to the environment and the inescapable news value of the Grenelle environmental summit, my editor-in-chief decided to create the position of environmental correspondent. Her aim in doing this was for there to be more environment-related subjects across the board in the hardcopy paper and on "metrofrance.com": I now cover everything relating to environment and sustainable development in everything from politics to the media. I am the first bi-media and "thematic" journalist at Metro."

What is also new is that most journalists emphasise the increased degree of credibility which they have gained as a result of the media getting hold of the topic of the Grenelle environmental summit. Here are some of their testimonies: "Editors-in-chief are beginning to understand environmental issues, so it is becoming easier to "sell" these without having to beg for hours on end."

"I have the definite impression that the environment is taken more seriously by the various sources I have had to interview" "I would say that even four or five years ago, people saw me as a militant with something of a hobby horse, almost a pain in the backside or a killjoy and in the newsroom, some people seemed to have "had it up to here" as regards the environment. I can understand them: life would be much nicer if we didn't have too talk about pollution and all the other harm which is done to the environment! I had the impression that people were tempted to bypass these "inconvenient" questions in the hope that they would become marginalised."

"The "Grenelle" legitimated our suggested features or angles related to this with regard to our managing editor. He helped us to get stories published or get more space for them. Up to a point... we would like even more to be done! He also helps us on a daily basis with respect to some of our less-aware friends, transforming us from "sweet but backward tree-huggers" into "foresighted citizens"."

These testimonies show a marked contrast with those in our first survey in 1998, in which 45% of JNE members interviewed thought that they would not be replaced as specialist journalists if they were to leave their position!

Several journalists emphasise or even criticise the predominance of articles relating to climate disruption as opposed to articles on the erosion of biodiversity, wildlife, or the seas and oceans. However, there seems to be the beginnings of a change with journalists specialising in Health. One of our colleagues writes the following: "they are starting to take an interest in issues relating to pesticides, endocrine disruption, pollution in the home and so on. When I used to talk to them about these issues they would never pay me any attention, but now they listen and want to know more." This is further evidence that several journalists who cover health and wellness have joined our association during the past year, which is also a new phenomenon.

Yet another new phenomenon is that there is a close relationship between politics and ecology. Patrick Piro from Politis notes that the Grenelle environmental summit has at last led to the politicisation of the field of the environment inasmuch as it has established the tension between, and therefore contrasted, politically-motivated environmentalism which aims to change society and its foundations (which obviously remains non-institutional) and a form of "de-ideologised", complementary environmentalism corresponding simply to the rise of "green growth".

Similarly, another journalist writes the following: "we are working together more often with political journalists, even if the latter still think that theirs is a higher form of journalism than that dealing with environmental issues."

It remains to assess the quality of what is done: is it a question of simply putting a green slant on the news or taking into account the environment in a more fundamental manner? One of the association's journalists notes the following: "some media which were previously "sealed off" from environmental subjects are now more sensitive to questions of practical environmentalism and have started to spread a little greenness around everywhere.
However, it is not always possible to deal with the subjects in-depth. We have to make do with short formats and practical approaches for readers, very much in the "daily living" style."

In the same register, another of our members writes the following: "being able to talk about a topic more is not the be-all and end-all; the question is whether we are free to give the public keys to explore the issue over and above anecdotal evidence. People only really start thinking during the terminal phase of a crisis, no sooner, and apparently with respect to the environment, things are not yet serious enough for us to be dealing with the big issues."

Conversely, some journalists have observed a better level of information of the public, who seem to be more "educated" in environmental issues. "Requests by editors-in-chief are becoming more specific", notes one journalist. Meanwhile, Dominique Martin-Ferrari has remarked "higher demand for what were previously considered to be weighty topics (major Conventions, global warming, biodiversity, etc), a better understanding of local/global relations, and a shift from sustainable development towards eco-citizenship and issues of governance, ethics and so on."

However, this enthusiasm in the media with respect to the environment may have a downside. Recent history is full of sudden moments of awareness (in the 1970s and then again at the time of the Rio Summit in 1992), followed by a slump. Even if, from our perspective, the environmental, financial and food crises are interlinked, it is difficult to tell what sort of lessons our society will be drawing from all this in the months to come.

For one thing, it would be wrong to think that our work as journalists will be easier as a result. Several members of the association have remarked on the increasing number of information requiring verification and "the massive increase in "greenwashing" press releases which invariably begin with the words "on the occasion of the Grenelle environmental summit...". This involves more work checking information which would generally be of interest to no-one but which is hitting the mark today because it contains the word "Grenelle". Thus Virginie Garin from RTL relates the following unfortunate experience: "The parliamentary implementation of environmental measures has fanned the flames of competition between rival media and a desire to be the first to announce future bonuses, penalties or a forthcoming tax. I had to spend a lot of time verifying all this information being put out by other media and which was regularly denied."

There is no doubt that our society is at a crossroads in its history, and it is our responsibility as journalists to follow this change by giving individuals the keys to understand the changes taking place in our world and on our planet, as Olivier Nouaillas, from La Vie, sums up so well: "Since the Grenelle environmental summit, it is on the whole easier to discuss and publish topics relating to the environment. It is also true that some media have a tendency to favour only non-divisive articles (practical ecology based on hints and tips).

It is certainly worth responding to this demand on the part of individuals to know how to act in an environmentally responsible manner. However, the "local" should not obscure the "global".

There remain a large number of more divisive subjects which present more cause for concern in terms of the future of the planet (global warming, GM crops and water pollution in particular). These continue to bring powerful lobbies and conflicting interests into play. This is why it is so important for JNE to continue defending the cause of demanding information which presents both sides of an issue and which requires enquiry, reporting and investigative journalism." This is what we are going to attempt to do in our media and on our association's website and by continuing to monitor the way in which newspapers are presenting environmental and sustainable development subjects.

Jean-Louis CAFFIER, LCI

The question of how journalists perceive change is a particularly interesting one. Are we simply in the presence of a "greening" of information or is there a genuinely greater awareness? I tend

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
to think the former is true. A lot of additional green spin is being placed on information and news, but I do not believe that every aspect of the subject has really been taken into account in depth yet. Nevertheless, one gets the impression that all the surveys reveal increasing concern in this respect, extending beyond the usual environmental sector to include the business and financial sectors.

France has been the first country in the world to set up a Ministry with such a broad remit. I would like to point out that the French Ministry (MEEDAT) covers not only the ecology and sustainable development but also energy, transport and planning. The Pact drawn up by Nicolas Hulot and signed, or almost signed, by all the candidates in the 2007 French presidential election campaign proposed the position of Vice-Prime Minister with responsibility for dealing with all these issues inter-ministerially. Presenting environmental ans

As specialist journalists working in the media, one question we could ask ourselves is whether a similar approach has been carried out for the written press, radio or television? Has this type of approach being adopted? Not in the slightest. Environment journalists are still working on environmental topics; at least these topics exist. However, in terms of the general treatment of news, sustainable development is not taken into account.

It is urgent to do so because people have not understood what is going on.

Ethics and codes of practice for journalists

by Jean-Luc MARTIN-LAGARDETTE

(journalist and editor in chief of Ouvertures.net magazine)

Sustainable development is a more profound and complex notion than the straightforward notion of the environment. Issues of poverty, social justice, wars, housing, health and the rights of local stakeholders are just some of those which go hand in hand with the emergence of sustainable development, and all these are interlinked. Sustainable development is also a major political issue and is a concept which deserves to progress.

The number of topics relating to sustainable development has increased considerably in all types of media over the last few years. If I suggested topics like these in an editorial conference 15 years ago, I would have to fight tooth and nail for them. At present, not a day goes by without there being a report on global warming or ways to save energy.

Unfortunately, there is a long way to go before sustainable development can be said to be receiving adequate coverage. Indeed, for the most part, my colleagues mostly address environmental and/or energy-related issues. Issues relating to governance, democratic debate, independent expertise, healthcare, social questions and poverty are less well-known and dealt with less often. We are just beginning to discuss fairtrade and micro-loans, but this is still far from systematic.

In particular, the news is not analysed from the triple perspective offered by sustainable development. The heavyweight newspapers, which are still the most widely-read by decision-makers and which are still the most effective opinion-shapers, still take far too little account of information which is politically sensitive, marginal, minority-related or which challenges or overturns received wisdom (except with respect to the environment). They work very closely with institutions and the powers that be and therefore run the risk of obscuring new ideas and avenues for progress (which, initially, always present problems for those holding the reins to a greater or lesser degree).

There are a number of hindrances to better coverage of sustainable development in the press:

- a lack of training of journalists in journalistic codes of practice and epistemology and in sustainable development;
- the lack of independence of journalists with respect to their employers who are also economic stakeholders, making it impossible for the former to investigate or criticise them.

- the almost total absence of a regulation of journalistic codes of practice. Some degree of awareness has been emerging with associations of journalists, the instigation of mediators and ethics committees. However, these structures are still internal to press organisations and have relatively few powers.

This vacuum encourages laziness, approximativeness, rumours - and the existing institutional and economic powers. I have observed that a lack of objectivity (or excess bias) and arbitrariness on the part of journalists always has knock-on effects in terms of injustice and suffering. Many people are not aware of this.

In order to improve things, it is desirable that journalists be trained in journalistic codes of ethics and in the three components of sustainable development. Similarly, the setting up of a regulatory body consisting of newspaper publishers, journalists and representatives of society at large would be most welcome (plans for a Press Council are currently underway in France).

This body, which would operate at a national level, could be petitioned or act on its own initiative to deal with bad journalistic practice. This bears no relation to a Professional Order or a Supreme Broadcasting Authority. It would be more of a watchdog and mediator which would enable better handling of the issue of journalistic standards and independence, which is vital in a democracy.

Lastly, another positive development would be for there to be forums for public debate on social issues chaired by professional conflict managers and conducted according to precise and stringent rules of debate (e.g. public debates; action carried out by the Vivagora association, etc) with pedagogical follow-up and use of the summaries.

I would like to remind you that the Rio Declaration, which launched the concept of sustainable development on a global basis, requests that States and peoples are concerned not only with ecology, but also with eliminating poverty, granting special priority to developing countries, reducing and eliminating non-viable modes of production and consumption, promoting an international economic system which is open and capable of encouraging sustainable economic growth and development in all countries, recognizing local knowledge and the traditional practices of native populations and so on.

In early September, a conference organised by UNESCO regretted the inability of the international Trinity to abide by the millennium development goals (MDGs) in terms of wastewater treatment. Despite promises by the States which signed up to this decades ago, 2.6 billion people still do not have access to proper drainage. The lack of drainage and treatment of wastewater is responsible for illness in 7 million people worldwide and kills 1.7 million of them (90% of whom are children).

Open-floor discussion

Céline CONRARDY, French Student Network for Sustainable Development (REFEDD)

The idea of having a common-core subject on this topic in schools of journalism has been mentioned twice. I would like to point out that we interviewed 15,000 French students within higher education and that this survey included a proposal for a common "sustainable development" core in every teaching syllabus.

Jacqueline DENIS-LEMPEREUR, French Committee for the Decade

This document can be found on our website (www.decennie-france.fr). Indeed, as part of the preparation for this Bordeaux Conference, we submitted an initial questionnaire to students.
to find out what their aspirations were in this respect. This led to them pursuing the matter further and coming up with this highly interesting report.

Céline CONRARDY, REFEDD

I would like to come back to Véronique SMEE’s proposal relating to the common interest of journalists and NGOs to call businesses to account with respect to their reports on sustainable development. This could also be of interest to us as future professionals, so I would like to invite you to get in touch with us to develop this initiative.

Véronique SMEE, NOVETHIC

I raised this issue because it is something we do given that it is at the very heart of the questions we are dealing with. Very often, journalists and NGOs have a common interest in examining this information. Few journalists do so, but this information can really serve as a way of calling businesses to account.

Even if this is PR, it is nevertheless interesting to see how companies carry out their communications. These reports are always an opportunity for them to be saying something and it is on this basis that we can call them to account on very specific issues.

Sébastien DARCY, journalist

To come back to the way that journalists should be incorporating the environment in the way they report on the news, sustainable development has been much talked-about but the word “ecology” has not had so much as a mention.

I have in my mind a book written by Hervé KEMPF, a specialist in the environment who works for the newspaper Le Monde, entitled "How the rich are destroying the planet". He explains that sustainable development is a semantic weapon to ensure that nothing changes and the productivist system continues. Personally, I use the term "sustainable development" as little as possible in my articles.

This is despite the fact that I get a lot of press releases dealing with sustainable development: Veolia with its incinerators, Renault with 4WD vehicles, etc.

In order to have journalists with inspiration and who know what they are talking about, is there not a need for emancipation, releasing our imagination from the grips of all these myths which have taken hold of us? If I take a brief look back in history, ecologically-friendly thinking has been around since the 1960s or 1970s. This is when it was first stated that infinite growth on a planet with finite resources is impossible. Then there was this incredible belief in progress. Finally, there was the race to produce, the clash of the superpowers and so on.

Today, we are up against the wall and the reason we are all here today is because it is now urgent that everything is changed immediately. To some extent, this was also what gave rise to the Grenelle summit.

How can we get across to people with a fair degree of knowledge who have been working in journalism for years the fact that their worldview needs to change? For my part, I have worked for two different newspapers. In both of the regions concerned, there were plans for a new motorway. The "old-school" journalists would say: "Who are these tree-huggers who are trying to stop this motorway being built? We are not going to interview them!"

Today, in the wake of the Grenelle summit, perhaps these same ecologists would get more of a hearing.

Perhaps this idea of liberating our imagination, including that of journalists, involves being more open-minded and a clearer view of all these non-profit networks, little-known scientists and raisers of alarms.
I have a question for Jean-Luc MARTIN-LAGARDETTE: how does become more open-minded and get a clearer view of all these non-profit networks, little-known scientists and raisers of alarms.

Jean-Luc MARTIN-LAGARDETTE, journalist

Too often nowadays, "sustainable development" sounds too moralistic and moralising. We must take care of the planet, we must dispose of our waste responsibly, we must think of future generations, and so on. How can this notion be sexed up?

I think we need to go beyond morals to philosophy and art and the human dimension. Imagine development infused with the joy of learning and understanding. We are lacking the joy which comes from understanding that nature is something complex and wonderful. Some people, like Nicolas HULOT, manage this very well.

The problem has to do with waste and pollution. We don't want to see our waste, look at it or deal with it. Nobody likes that, particularly those who put their rubbish on someone else's patch and couldn't care less because everything is clean on theirs.

In other words, there is a political problem, a problem of conscience and of responsibility.

Taking responsibility for the consequences of what we produce involves looking at an entire natural life cycle (production, ingestion, digestion and excretion) and realising that nature has many solutions to this. People become interested if acts of greenness and eco-gestures are suggested to them. If we talk about waste treatment using plants, there are some great reports to be done which people find fascinating. If we were to emphasise this aspect of understanding things better, there would be a sense of amazement. Someone who is amazed automatically has respect for the source of their amazement and does not need telling that it is their duty to think of future generations. What is more, as they understand nature they will consider themselves with respect to it.

This brings us back to the human factor: ourselves as part of the environment. This leads to an understanding about sustainable development and respect for the environment involves finding out who we are both individually and as we relate to others.

Activity which is sustainable is one spurred on by this exploration of beauty which leads us to consider our place in the world, which will necessarily lead to more harmonious behaviour and therefore to development which is sustainable indefinitely. We need to educate people in curiosity and wonder rather than confronting them and inducing guilt, and this will be better for all concerned.

Jean-Louis CAFFIER, LCI

In response to that question, I would say that it is vital to come back to some fundamentals.

We need to be engaged in sustainable development today because we have a problem which we have not yet fully mastered. We have a problem related to our development and the Earth. What is the extent of this problem? What kind of answers are there?

Before rushing in with solutions, the nature of the problem needs to be properly understood. In my opinion, the issues of climate and energy are not at all understood by the general public, politicians and journalists or producers. You just have to look at climate change and greenhouse gas emissions over the last hundred years or so and the outlook in terms of energy to understand that if we do not change track very quickly, we will very soon have passed the tipping point on the edge of which we now find ourselves at breakneck speed.

Work to educate, inform and disseminate data must be done to enable everybody to gauge the extent of the problem, if it is admitted that we have one, and then to adopt appropriate responses.

Where did the goal of 20% less CO2 by 2020 come from? It's all very well, but where did it come from? I would like to remind you that the IPCC report talked in terms of 30% as a
minimum and that 40% would be better. If the basic notions have not been grasped, there is no way that the new behaviours which may be discussed in the media will be accepted.

Pascal BOURGOIS, Maison de la Nature et de l'Environnement, Bordeaux Aquitaine

We do indeed have a problem with terminology and vocabulary (environment, ecology, sustainable development).

For instance, we were saying recently that “Maison de la Nature et de l’Environnement”, (Nature and Environment Centre) sounded out of date and that we would need to come up with something relating to sustainable development. We also have plans for an “open university of the environment”. We have been wondering what term to use in the name some time now: environment or sustainable development.

At the end of the day, with respect to non-profit associations, we are beginning to reach saturation level with respect to the term "sustainable development“. The term has been so misused that it actually ends up having the opposite effect to that intended today. Scarcely has it penetrated the minds of voters, listeners and so on than it is worn out and fit only for the scrapheap. We need something else, but we haven't found out what yet.

Véronique SMEE, NOVETHIC

That is true, but we have not yet come up with a better term to define it.

In addition, as a journalist I can confirm that I get 300 e-mails a day of which 80% are press releases from companies claiming to have adopted a sustainable development approach on the pretext that they carry out waste management or use wind power. A company may use wind power but may also mistreat its staff, be lacking in ethics or have governance which is dubious to say the least. "Sustainable development" companies are not necessarily green companies.

There is a huge amount of drift at the moment with respect to these topics.

This means that the term "sustainable development" has indeed become hackneyed, but we don't have anything else to work with. The English term "sustainable" could perhaps be translated back into French differently.

Carine MAYO, JNE

In our association, we are not very keen on the term "sustainable development" ("développement durable") and are very attached to our "E" which stands for "ecology". We would have preferred "sustainable development" ("développement soutenable") but this leaves no room for the human aspect.

Within journalism, the difficulty resides in the fact that our papers are highly partitioned. As journalists specialising in the environment, we are attempting to break down these partitions, but this is difficult because the papers we work for are often very partitioned themselves.

Jean-Luc MARTIN-LAGARDET, journalist

The subtitle of Ouvertures, the media resource that I have launched and which attempts to be representative of this change, is "Letter from a 21st-century gentleman". The idea here is of someone who attempts to understand what it is important to know to live life as they should.

Albert DE PETIGNY, Editions Pour Penser à l’Endroit

I would like to take this opportunity to talk about a project with some 30 signatories calling for an investigation into the possibility of a digital audio type media resource for children on the subjects of the environment and sustainable development.

If you are parents of children aged between three and ten and you switch on the radio or look for a web radio broadcasting music plus some content dealing with these issues, there is not very much to be found.
El Kebir ALAOUI, United Nations Development Programme, Morocco

I would like to come back to the media’s core skills and some points which we have looked at very little: the media and advertising and the communication potential of the media excluding journalism.

With respect to the issue of such complicated semantics as those in the term "sustainable development", many businesses attempt to hide behind this phrase to carry out advertising, very often forced advertising. For instance, there have been many adverts for four-wheel-drive vehicles closely related to nature. What might be the role of the media to address this problem from an ethical point of view? What avenues could there be to approach advertisers, designers, PR agencies and the public and media? How could the media take steps to minimise this type of advertising that runs counter to a concern for the environment?

We see many instances of how multinationals communicate in a completely different manner in more aware countries.

For instance, in advertising for washing powder, as soon as you go to southern nations, they talk about "lather" despite the fact that this has a strong impact on the environment. These are the kind of things which we need to be discussing, involving countries to the south of the Mediterranean.

Jacqueline DENIS-LEMPEREUR, French Committee for the Decade

As part of the Grenelle Environmental Summit, operational committee 34, which was set up in September and which deals with information and communication, is chaired by Hervé BROSSARD, Chairman of the Association of PR Consultancies and Agencies.

Jean-Louis CAFFIER, LCI

There are several avenues open to us in this respect.

Firstly, there is legislation governing advertising relating to cars and four-wheel drive vehicles. Between 96 and 98% of advertising for cars does not comply with the law, specifically as regards information concerning CO2 emissions.

Secondly, work with regards to advertising needs to be done in parallel with the work on product labelling, particularly as concerns a product's carbon balance. This is a complex matter, because carrying out a carbon balance for products requires a lot of money and studies in order to have the correct data.

Patrice CAVELIER, Radio France

As regards public media, I can talk only about national radio. For us at Radio France, things are simpler because commercial advertising is prohibited and we can only carry what is known as general-interest advertising. I would like to add that the maximum advertising time for stations carrying advertising is less than 12 minutes per day.

A participant, journalist

Advertising expenditure is increasing rampantly (+50% in 10 years) and now comes to €39 billion in France. This makes things very complicated for journalists. Personally, I am currently doing an article on the nuclear power station at Blaye and I can assure you that AREVA’s advertising will have far more impact than my little piece. Journalists attempt to make a number of statements about the environment, but advertisers use the "carpet-bombing strategy".

If we want the media to have more freedom with respect to advertising, individuals need to become more aware of their role as media consumers. As long as people are passive with respect to information and do not understand that quality information costs money, we will be facing a major challenge. I’m very pessimistic in this respect because there are now free papers which are funded solely through advertising.
Chantal DEMONGIN, Aquitaine Region Environment Office

We are in a workshop of which the subject is the role of the media in education and information for sustainable development. We have said a lot about sustainable development but very little about education. I don't believe this is an accident.

For some years, I had the position of communications officer and I always found it very difficult to communicate on the topic of environmental education for sustainable development.

How can journalists be made more aware of this topic? It is not a question of giving people advice or of making them feel guilty. The difficulty is managing to get specific messages across.

Journalists understand that education is not just for young people and does not take place solely in school. When journalists cover an event, what they look for is basically description (of a class, initiative, exhibition, etc); but the underlying message does not come across at all in the article in the newspaper. What has to be done in order for people to be able to read articles about education in favour of the environment in regional and local press?

Carine MAYO, JNE

Journalists are working to tighter and tighter deadlines these days. When they go out to cover an event they are asked to be as quick as possible. If they do not have the necessary keys to understand what the background to this event is, they are liable not to see every aspect of it. This is not an excuse but a statement of fact.

Training of journalists with respect to sustainable development

by Christophe DELOIRE

(Director, Journalist Training Centre - CFJ)

The first difficulty with respect to sustainable development is to deal with things in terms of a 20 or 30-year period. Journalists are by nature not used to dealing with the future. This means there is a kind of resistance to such subjects which is understandable in terms of journalistic logic.

Secondly, journalists like news: things which are visible, fast-moving, animated and stirring. French journalists, who are increasingly inspired by their British and American counterparts, are moving further away from a certain tradition of analysis. This means they have a problem when it comes to knowing how to interpret events which require more intelligence in the primary sense of that term.

In addition, there is a fundamental question regarding political journalism in France. Politics are to be found everywhere except in political departments which deal only with election campaigning. The key issues are never discussed there or if they are, it can be observed that the level of discussion is more appropriate to the local bar than to an editorial conference.

I believe that there need to be a number of revolutions. Firstly, we need to be able to develop scientific journalism. This is a real issue for schools of journalism because we come from a tradition which is more literary and political. Some of the general-knowledge questions in the competitive entrance exams are set by older colleagues. These either resemble literary set texts or are highly political, so it should come as no surprise that political science graduates are overrepresented among successful candidates.

Rather than a form of journalism which sets out to lay bare details and which is closely related to journalists' mindsets and, sometimes, to the business considerations governing journalism today, as a training institute we should be developing cross-disciplinary academic ability.

Our problem in schools of journalism is that we are a postgraduate institution devoted to professional specialisation. This means that at the CFJ the exam is open to people with two
years of higher education but that the average entrance level corresponds to five years of higher education. This means that we assume that entrants have satisfactory academic knowledge and that they come to learn how to write articles and pieces for television and radio.

Little by little, we are implementing courses with more specific slants, but it is difficult to find journalists with a wide range of skills. Sustainable development is a subject which calls for skills in law, science, economics and politics, and today it is unfortunately very difficult to find people with such a broad skill set.

When it comes to sustainable development, journalists tend to behave as though they are solely journalists without a country or citizenship. The current crisis is giving them pause for thought and is an opportunity for them to consider that they are also citizens.

Schools of journalism have been accused of producing clones. This criticism falls wide of the mark today. Far from it: we now call on each journalist to consider how they work, but one of the problems of journalists is that they do not have time to reflect on their practice and too often, the standard of truth is reduced to whatever the person next door happens to think. In other words, what the paper down the road or the competing television station says becomes gospel truth, which leads to a huge copycat effect in the French press and sometimes in broadcasting.

Our school of journalism is one which works well, and we are increasingly opening up. This is why we have signed contracts with other graduate schools working in different fields. In this way, we are attempting to make progress on topics like these, with the awareness that as for any new topic, it is difficult to progress because of the need to find people who are competent and have teaching ability. There are very few of these and they are very booked up because the subject is flourishing.

With respect to sustainable development, we offer one-week seminars on business journalism for content other than business and seminars on medicine, health care and sustainable development. It may be that we should make this training mandatory. This is a one-week course, but throughout the year, we also appeal to our trainees' intelligence and encourage them not to set too much store by what other papers are writing, think for themselves and attempt to weigh up what is essential and what is secondary.

Jean-Louis CAFFIER made reference to the fact that there have been changes to State institutions, but very few in the newspapers. From an outside perspective, one could imagine that the most interesting features should emerge. In this respect, the issue of how papers are structured is fundamental.

Should "sustainable development" departments be set up? Or should there be a "sustainable development" correspondent attached to each existing department? This is worth thinking about in depth because it is a fundamental question in terms of the journalistic result.

What is more, papers need to be sold, television stations need to be watched and radio stations need audiences in order to survive. This means that resources must be found to discuss sustainable development; and journalists need to find resources which will give it some appeal.

This will not be achieved by standing on a soapbox or spouting moralising discourses. Journalists will need to demonstrate creativity and inventiveness. Perhaps the first phase would involve interesting the journalists themselves, telling them that there is some unexplored territory awaiting them which it would be a mistake to pass by.

Débora MASCHWITZ, Journalist in Argentina

A journalist is not interested solely in topics but also in presentations. Who should they be interviewing and why? Journalists do not always find the right stakeholders to discuss the environment and end up looking at unexceptional experiences. It may be that they do not find the right people to discuss the environment in the fields of business and politics.
Christophe DELOIRE, CFJ

This is true for every subject. It is sometimes easier to talk with celebrities than to answer your child when they ask you why rain happens. Journalists need to direct themselves to questions which may appear simple but which are really the fundamental ones which are more difficult to answer. I believe that this requires an intellectual revolution.

Jean-Louis CAFFIER, LCI

The issues of interest to us are by their nature controversial, nevertheless scientific debate has some structure to it. For my part, I attempt to go along with how this debate is structured, especially as this takes place in scientific publications, where a review committee consisting of specialists from a number of disciplines decides whether an article is deserving of publication or not.

Céline AUGIER, Department of Education for the Environment, Argenteuil Town Council

In 2008, we have been celebrating the 10th anniversary of our Department of Education for the Environment, in which seven people are employed by the town council in the education of the public with respect to the environment. I often encounter journalists who tell me that if I do not create an event, it will be impossible for them to communicate about what I’m doing. However, our work is for the long haul and relates particularly to children; I am not necessarily very keen on putting three pupils from a single class in the spotlight, which is the kind of thing journalists often suggest.

My contribution to the debate on how to communicate with respect to education regarding the environment and sustainable development is to ask how content, rather than the sensationalism of an event, can be discussed?

Christophe DELOIRE, CFJ

Much has happened in terms of communication over the last 10 years. The role of journalists is to act as a relay, and they are often looking for a good story and key characters. One way of an association raising awareness of specific issues is by means of the Internet. There are a number of things which, if they are set up today, are easier to talk about than 10 years ago.

Tarek MRABET, Tunisian Ministry of the Environment

We are discussing the role of the media in education and information with respect to sustainable development. The media do not sufficiently take sustainable development into account either as a concept or as a value. Is this due to a desire on the part of decision-makers to exclude the media from this kind of awareness? Is there a lack of interest on the part of the media?

With regard to the present challenge, there is an immense problem which concerns not only the media's missions to inform and educate, but which should also be dealt with at the level of editorial policies.

In addition, with respect to training, should this be training directed to journalists or first and foremost at editors-in-chief?

In principle, what would be required is a charter committing the media with respect to sustainable development.

Jean-Louis CAFFIER, LCI

It is true that education and awareness-raising is not solely a question of information. For instance, why not have questions relating to the climate, energy and biodiversity in TV game shows? In future, we could imagine series devoted to subjects other than crime, for instance an NGO working in some field of development in a foreign country.

I also think that training should relate to everybody, but I will say more about that in more detail in my conclusion.
Training in sustainable development for France Télévisions journalists and sustainable development on air: the case of RFO

by Didier DESORMEAUX

Journalist in charge of the "multimedia information and editing"
at France Télévisions University

France Télévision is currently in the middle of being restructured, and at the beginning of the year we set up France Télévisions University which is directed at all the Group's employees. I am responsible for the "multimedia information and editing" department which concerns over 2500 journalists.

France Télévisions is a State Group, which means that we are a signatory of the sustainable development charter for public bodies. This means that we are fully committed with respect to future generations and their involvement in sustainable development. We have to give an account of our production relating to information and knowledge concerning sustainable development.

We have also set up a France Télévision Foundation. We received 500 projects and have selected 32 for a total of €0.5 million worth of subsidies; some of these relate to sustainable development.

In terms of TV programming, we broadcast the programme "Rendez-vous en terre inconnue" also enabled a number of messages to be got across. The programme "Envoyé spécial" regularly features reports on these questions, and there are also programmes like "Des Racines et des Ailes", "Thalassa" and "C'est pas sorcier". On France 4, the programme "Taratata" regularly has guests who discuss these issues.

In terms of news, there have been a number of initiatives at France 3 in regional news bulletins. I will not give you an exhaustive list, but there are programmes at the level of local news. Paradoxically, it is more difficult in built-up areas than in most urban regions.

France 5 has a wide number of programmes, including children's programmes such as "Bob the Builder" and "Mission Nature". France 5 has also got together with French-speaking Swiss television (TSR) to make over 100 videos available via the Internet for schoolchildren to have access to a number of resources relating to the environment and sustainable development.

RFO is also making significant efforts in this field. This channel covers territories in which there is much richer biodiversity than in metropolitan France. There are programmes broadcast very regularly: "Archipel", "Temps de parole", "Civilités", "Passeport pour l'eau", and so on. As to continuous training, we have adopted a position which is highly innovative with respect to other media groups. We have implemented very strict training plans and endeavoured to ensure that sustainable development forms part of training courses. We have linked career development to continuous training and promoted the notion of responsibility.

In addition, we have decided to make an effort in terms of how current affairs are dealt with. This means that in order for somebody to have the title of specialist journalist, they must follow a six-week course. Firstly, trainees learn about how to look for information. Secondly, they spend a week on learning how to present this for a general audience. We have implemented a system of mandatory credits. We make use of resources made available to us by the CPJ, the Lille school and other recognized schools. In terms of sustainable development, in 2004 we had four courses (GM crops, regions and environments, natural disasters). Three years later, we had seven. Today, we now have eleven. All this involves having the right contacts, good information and good experts from universities and elsewhere. We have concluded partnership agreements, for instance with environmental agencies such as the DRIRE and, for water issues, the University of Brest. This makes it possible to have a general journalistic culture.
In addition, managers also have to go on a number of mandatory courses.

At present, this mostly concerns France 3, for a total of 1500 journalists. We are currently ramping this up with RFO, which will be followed by France 2's editorial departments. There has definitely been a realisation that what we learnt when we were in schools of journalism is no longer adequate and that it is absolutely vital to take-up challenge of continuous training. There are certain signs that during the discussions in various editorial departments, there is now a degree of wisdom in terms of not responding after an event but of taking the time to examine it upstream.

Jean-Luc MARTIN-LAGARDETTE, Journalist

In my opinion, we have not sufficiently emphasised the question of having a public debate on issues relating to the environment, sustainable development, society and health. Nowadays, education does not simply mean delivering knowledge from the top downwards, but also knowing how to listen to those we are addressing and taking into account their sensitivities and concerns. In future, the news media need to be more aware that they are capable of doing this. There have already been significant times of public debate with respect to key issues; we see less of this today and it is often very regimented, with not enough diversity of opinion and not enough supporting figures and validated information. The general public will learn better if they are also able to say what they wish.

El Kebir ALAOUI, UNDP, Morocco

While we are on the topic of academia and training, I would like to say something about being attentive to and more familiar with audiences and media, particularly with respect to research on knowledge, attitude and perceptions by audiences according to various classifications to be set up which could be closely linked to the whole training aspect.

When journalists are encouraged to become more familiar with the audience which they are addressing, they may pay more attention to the kind of message they put together. This could form an immediate recommendation inasmuch as very little research and methods are presently available to scientists, particularly media specialists in the field of sustainable development.

Education, training, information and awareness-raising with respect to sustainable development in Youth press

by Françoise RECAMIER,
Sustainable Development Partnership Officer, Groupe Bayard Jeunesse

When you are addressing a younger audience, you have to get down from the pedestal on which you are as an adult in order to communicate with children. At Bayard Jeunesse, we have magazines aimed at children aged from 18 months to upper secondary school. We deal with things differently depending on the age group in question. Even the most romantic of stories can be an opportunity to communicate many things, particularly through the illustrations. This means that we are continuously obliged to call on our creativity and a variety of forms through which various topics can be dealt with.

The release of Al Gore's film and the IPCC report on climate change were key societal triggers which enabled things to be speeded up internally, particularly through partnerships with the ADEME.

New sections have also been created in various magazines. In the magazine "Enfant Magazine" aimed at young parents, there is one section in which parents who are stakeholders play a key role. Creativity and access to information constitute essential elements in our view. It is important to find attractive ways of dealing with these subjects, know how to find interesting approaches, not be too wordy and know how to get to the point.
We have carried out surveys of our subscribers and when we dealt with the issue of
development, their response was that we already provided good coverage of these topics in
terms of editorial content. Our desire is to do even more; we are committed to an approach
which will provide us with the carbon balance of our economic and industrial activity.
Although this will doubtless not involve us changing everything overnight, we are
nevertheless making progress in this respect.

In my opinion, what creates a sense of panic in people with respect to sustainable
development is the impression that the die has been cast whereas in fact we are at the start
of a process. We need to move on together, particularly through partnership agreements and
progress so that we begin to function differently.

It is important not to be negative when dealing with young people. Everything must be dealt
with, but this must be done from a positive perspective.

So, for instance, we published a special issue of our magazine "Image Doc" called "The
Earth, our treasure". If we want to protect our planet we have to tell ourselves that it is a
treasure.

Before beginning to discuss problems relating to climate and waste, we opted to prepare the
children by portraying our planet with its various environments, the people who live there,
and how they have managed to do so. You then need all the right pictures to explain that, but
children are quite capable of understanding subjects like this.

We have just brought out a teaching kit devoted to ESD which offers primary school teachers
12 posters relating to issues such as climate change, waste and so on. It also suggests
demonstrations to help children understand scientifically what is going on. It is then possible
to go further on an experimental level and go into more depth on some topics. We worked
with teachers to identify key teaching aspects which would give teachers some idea of the
right point in their syllabus for introducing this topic.

In addition, we have suggested related challenges to action, with one challenge for each
topic (climate, biodiversity, etc) with things that 8-12-year-old children are capable of doing.
Information is necessary, but unless it is understood and integrated I am not sure that it
persists.

More generally, things are changing at Bayard. For instance, last year, Bayard was involved
in a communication initiative through various magazines during the second "waste week"
organised by the ADEME. We included teaching resources from the ADEME which were
offered free to all younger children’s parents who subscribe to "Enfant Magazine" or "Youpi".
As a result, the ADEME awarded Bayard its "Winning planet for the company" trophy.

This triggered a number of progress factors internally. For instance, at the start of the school
year, there was what became known as Bayard University. Between noon and 2pm, staff,
both journalists and others, were invited to attend lectures. One cycle of lectures was called
"Environment: the clear thinking kit" and was given by engineers from the ADEME. These
lectures dealt with subjects such as global warming, standards labels, reducing waste and
renewable energy.

Lastly, we have also committed ourselves to carrying out a carbon balance for our Bayard
Jeunesses activities. This will lead us to examine in what way we can leverage things
throughout the supply chain in order to improve our performance. This will raise the
awareness of many people internally, from HR right through to manufacturing and others.

In addition to journalistic information, this will also raise awareness more broadly by making
people aware of practical issues.

Yves RAMBAUD, Director of Institutional Relations, RFO

In fact we actually combine two jobs. Firstly, we rebroadcast programmes produced for
public-service broadcasting (France 2, France 3, France 4, France 5). This means that there
is a high density of programmes relating to sustainable development. Secondly, since we are in highly sensitive ecosystems and contemporary lifestyles have reached our regions, we are much more exposed. The effects are stronger, faster and more visible; we therefore need to react very quickly.

Radio is an interesting medium because it is rapid and highly interactive. For our programmes, we make use of the ADEME and other specialists, and listeners can get involved spontaneously and take part in the debate - they raise good questions.

It is true that we feel the effects of global warming much more frequently and more strikingly, because we regularly have tropical storms which are becoming increasingly violent. This means that we are perhaps learning lessons faster than is possible elsewhere. Of course, these are natural phenomena not related solely to an increase in global temperatures, but we do feel this change and we feel it more strongly than is the case elsewhere.

To make a contribution, if we want to win the hearts of our audience, I think that interactivity and dialogue with listeners are the most promising avenues for this, enabling us to get to the heart of the matter. We need specialists; the role of journalists is more to serve as facilitators than to be specialists on environmental issues.

A participant

Faced with a lack of sustainable development, we fear there may be many more natural disasters in the decades to come. Unfortunately, within the media, problems and a general state of panic can be noted in terms of managing crises arising from natural disasters.

More attention should be paid to the training of journalists so that in the event of natural disasters, teams can be present to support local inhabitants.

Conclusion

by Jean-Louis CAFFIER
(LCI journalist, president of the Climate, Energy, Humanity, Media Association)

I will reiterate the proposals, although they have already been expressed in the form of the Grenelle steering Committee. I am speaking here in my capacity as co-founder and president of the Climate, Energy, Humanity, Media Association. I set up this association four years ago, with Jean-Marc JANCOVICI, Hervé LE TREUT (a climatologist) and key specialists in energy in France - Jean-Louis BAL for renewable energies, Bertrand BARRET for nuclear power and Yves MATTHIEU for fossil fuels.

The question we asked ourselves was why these issues were not dealt with across the board in the media. The answer was that editors-in-chief were totally ignorant of these issues, so our target was department heads, managing editors, leading journalists and well-known presenters.

We therefore developed this association in which we are all volunteers. Over the last three years, we have invited David PUJADAS, Audrey PULVAR and Carole GAESSLER. This year, we are due to have Gilles LECLERC, Laurent BIGNOLAS and others. We try to bring together people from radio, television etc.

As result of this work, I was invited to take part in the “Grenelle de l’Environnement” to serve on the steering committee with responsibility for information and training. We are persuaded, and will make highly practical proposals in this respect, of the need to extend training to the whole of the profession and to review the fundamentals in a certain number of areas.

The issue of links with the Mediterranean was being discussed just now. We are perhaps going to be creating a subsidiary of our association in Morocco, in relationship with the "Mohamed VI foundation for the protection of the environment ". We have invited the General Secretary, Mrs ALAOUI, who will definitely be coming this year, to see if she can achieve the same thing in her country.
We have also suggested a similar approach at a European level. We have already produced some offspring because a journalist from the *Est Républicain* newspaper in Nancy has developed a similar type of initiative relating to biodiversity.

Lastly, we are going to try and develop something along the same lines for the oceans. The training which we offer is free of charge. It is financed 100% by benefactors (ADEME, SNCF, the Banque Populaire Group).

For the Grenelle steering Committee, we are going to suggest to media bosses that we do the same thing as we have been doing every year with our association. We’re going to offer a greater level of initial training on questions relating to climate, energy, resources, water, nutrition and biodiversity. We are then going to implement an emergency training plan for all journalists working in all French media. We will be seeking funding because there are 30,000 journalists in France.

As to decision-makers in the media, we also want to broaden this training to include politicians and organise a major get-together in Paris with people talking to these elected officials who will be voting on the Grenelle II Law. We believe that they are not sufficiently well-informed about the reality of the issues at stake.

It is necessary for the issues, scales and deadlines to be stated in accurate terms. Indeed, although I am convinced that progress has been made in terms of awareness, we are still a long way from people apprehending the reality of the situation.

It is important to realise that the IPCC worst-case scenario of an increase of 6% by 2100 was based on an increase in greenhouse gas emissions of 2.6%. In 2007 - something which was not mentioned at all during the financial crisis - the level was 3.5%.

These figures have been forgotten - despite which, during the financial crisis, the climate crisis has not only continued but worsened. The current crisis should not be grounds for forgetting the other crises, because the latter are certainly more serious.

---

**Summary of discussions**

*by Jacqueline DENIS-LEMPEREUR*

*Scientific journalist*

This workshop, devoted to the media, has been particularly enriching and benefited from many contributions from the floor. We are all agreed as to the fundamental role of the media whose duty is to help raise citizens' awareness of this difficult topic of sustainable development, which is difficult both in terms of terminology and because it calls into question our instincts, habits and ways of thinking.

Participants have emphasised the population’s lack of information, which entails significant work in terms of explanation, even if significant progress has been achieved over the last two years. Indeed, since the start of the Decade, there has been a noticeable increase in the extent to which sustainable development has been taken into account by the media, boosted by the publication of the IPCC reports, the release of Al Gore’s film and, more recently, the Grenelle environmental summit and all the information which has become available as a result.

At present, pieces dealing with sustainable development are to be found well beyond the mainstream media. They are now to be found in women's magazines, health magazines, parenting magazines and business papers. Nevertheless, much remains to be done. If the media wish to be credible, they must be exemplary and they too must commit to sustainable development policies.

The messages they disseminate must be simple, clear and scientifically verified. Public service broadcasting, both radio and television, has a particular responsibility with respect to education and training - more so than the rest of the media.
It should be noted that programmes dealing with sustainable development are increasingly successful with listeners and viewers, with significant increases in their ratings figures. So, for instance, the programme "Vu du ciel" with Yann Arthus Bertrand was watched by 4 million viewers. Patrice Cavelier, Chief Administrative Officer at Radio France, took part in our debate and emphasised the considerable way we still have to go, requiring commitment from all stakeholders, be they political, economic, non-profit organisations or simply citizens at an individual level.

Sustainable development must be applied across the board in the media and not be restricted solely to incremental issues but also engage with social and societal topics.

To win over the general public, which is the lowest common denominator of society, pieces need to be attractive, a source of enjoyment and not be moralising or guilt-inducing. This information about sustainable development must be positive, appeal to the intellect, the emotions and practical experience, and above all be capable of being put into practice.

Several participants have emphasised the need for the media to engage in dialogue with their audience, something which is easier for radio to do. More generally, there has been a call for a change to more participant-based information. One suggestion made by a participant was the creation of an environmentally-aware radio station with positive messages aimed at children and young people - something which does not exist at present.

The role of new media in the form of new databases and forums for sharing and discussing ideas has been highlighted, with an emphasis on the fact that such environments often lack any form of classification, meaning that it is not always possible to distinguish press releases, advertising and articles.

However, what appears to be even more fundamental in this group is the issue of training journalists and other media professionals with respect to the issues of sustainable development. This absolutely must form part of the common-core teaching given in journalism schools alongside the major traditional disciplines; but initial training is not the end of the story.

Any media company should be enabling its staff to receive training and further instruction on this topic throughout their careers so that they can keep up with the changes in our society. Curricula in the principal schools of journalism are beginning to refer to this sort of issue.

At the symposium organised by the French Committee for the Decade in June 2006 at UNESCO in Paris, Didier Désormeaux from France Télévisions explained that sustainable development had been incorporated into training for journalists at France 3, a total of 1500 journalists. Since then, the Department which he heads up has been expanded to include all journalists working for France Télévisions, a total of 2500 people. In 2004, four 5-day training courses were devoted to sustainable development. There were seven in 2007 and eleven in 2008.

The training of journalists in codes of practice and the three components of sustainable development have also been discussed, as has the planned Press Council, a type of regulatory body similar to what exists in other places (Quebec, Switzerland and the United Kingdom).

Another essential point is the lack of scientific training of journalists to equip them to deal with issues of sustainable development, since journalists tend to have more of a literary rather than a scientific background. This is why an emergency plan has been recommended to train media professionals, more specifically with respect to issues relating to climate, energy, resources and biodiversity.

Lastly, there is no point in training journalists if their bosses are not aware of the issues and reject their proposals for articles. It would therefore be worth while designing very short training sessions, lasting a half a day, for editors-in-chief and media bosses, who have particularly hectic schedules.
I would like to add that as I reread the proceedings of the 2006 symposium, I noted that at the end of the workshop devoted to the media we recommended the creation of a Ministry of State for Sustainable Development and an end to advertising on public service broadcasting. It is clear that we have been heard in this respect and I hope that our proposals today will enjoy a similar future.

************************
Session 5

Teaching tools for Education for Sustainable Development: review of current resources and new schemes

Summary

• Introduction (Cécile LLANTIA from the National Centre for Teaching Resources SCÉRÉN/ CNDP)
• Actions undertaken by the Europe-Education-Training France E3F Agency (Sonia DUBOURG-LAVROFF, Director of the E3F Agency)
• Some tools for ESD (Elodie TEXIER, National Union of Permanent Centres of Initiatives for the Environment – UNCPIE)
• Presentation of Strass Productions Terra Project (Anne MARLEIX, CEO Strass Productions) & Presentation of some teaching tools (Vincent LEVEQUE, Publisher, Strass Productions)
• State education resources and teaching materials (Jean-Michel VALANTIN, Senior civil servant with responsibility for sustainable development, Department of Education)
• Presentation of SCÉRÉN productions (Cécile LLANTIA, Project officer for social sciences for the Publishing department at the CNDP)
• The Comenius European sector programme (Didier FERASSE, Head of school teaching department for the E3F Agency)
• The network of agricultural colleges working with a sustainable development approach (Christian Peltier, Agricultural college teacher)
• Agricultural colleges and ESD: the example of the Saint-Herblain College (Léna LEDUCQ, Regional developer for SD in the Pays de Loire region)
• Partnership scheme between the Avesnois regional natural park and an education inspection board in the Nord-Pas de Calais (Delphine DUTRÉMÉE, Avesnois regional park, and Marie-Françoise GAUDON, education board inspector, SD officer, Nord département)
• The mediatory role of researchers and their responsibility (Maurice FAY, Institute of research for development)
• Conclusion (Patrick LE PROVOST, SCÉRÉN/CNDP)

Moderator: Patrick LE PROVOST (SCÉRÉN/CNDP)

Introduction

by Cécile LLANTIA
National Centre for Teaching Resources SCÉRÉN/ CNDP

Our debates will certainly illustrate the rich diversity of teaching tools and various resources devoted to ESD, but also that of the people for whom these resources are intended. As teachers we know that even with schoolchildren, we are dealing with people who come from different backgrounds.
When talking about resources we are focusing on schools, but the same issues are at stake in lifelong education and more generally with the general public where we also find several levels of resources and targets.

In addition, people live in different places and so the way of doing this is bound to be different.

I hope that this workshop will highlight this diversity of resources.

**The actions undertaken by the Europe-Education-Training France Agency**

*by Sonia DUBOURG-LAVROFF*

*Director of the Europe-Education-Training France Agency - E3F*

I head up an agency that manages, for France, the major education and life-long training programmes, including four sectorial programmes: Erasmus, Comenius, Grundtvig and Leonardo. The agency manages other schemes such as Europa and in particular grants a European label for languages.

The mission of this active arm of the European Union is to implement these programmes by means of funding - this year we will be distributing some 90 million euros - and also with a consultative role since our team is made up of 80 people who are trained to help put in place European projects in education and training.

The theme of sustainable development is at the heart of our project, but not exclusively since our aim is education with a large number of very diverse education- and training-relating topics as we are in contact with all kinds of learners and educators.

Before going into detail, I would just like to refer you to our website ([www.europe-education-formation.fr](http://www.europe-education-formation.fr)) where you will find general information about the programmes, and also resources.

Sustainable development is a high priority issue in lifelong education programmes. Practically speaking, when projects applying for funding have a link with sustainable development, the experts consider them to be higher priority. They are not selected automatically as selection is carried out based on other criteria, but this is a priority since sustainable development can come in various forms, depending on the target of the training.

As you relate this subject to regions, I would like to insist on the usefulness of training local councillors in sustainable development.

In this respect, in October 2008, MEP Jean-Marie Beaupy presented a report entitled "Governance and partnership at national and regional levels and bases for projects in the field of regional policies". In this report, he recommends the creation of an Erasmus project for local councillors. The idea is that local councillors from all around Europe should be able to meet each other and take part in exchanges, meetings and seminars and travel to see the experiences of other local councillors. This seems to be to be very interesting from the point of view of sustainable development as it gives the opportunity to see first hand the achievements of other local authorities.

The mobility of local councillors can be arranged through us with Grundtvig and European regional policy can fund mobility for local councillors.

In the Leonardo programme, we have training for councillors called "Elus d'Europe" ("European Councillors"). We manage this programme which is coordinated by the "Idées Nouvelles Europe" association which is aimed very specifically at the mobility of local councillors. In actual fact, this mobility is organised for thirty or so French councillors who are going to meet other local authorities in Europe, in particular in Rome.

Also with Leonardo, we have selected a project launched by Amiens agricultural college. Its objective is the mobility of a dozen French teachers to travel to Romania and Hungary for the
topic of sustainable development. Note too that sustainable development is of high priority for the Ministry of Agriculture. For these teachers, immersion into education systems which are different from ours, but which focus on the same issue, is very enriching, enabling them to encounter teaching methods used by different people.

We also have a programme dedicated to adult education which has been widely used by associations (back to work associations, groups working with minorities and against various types of discrimination, etc.). This programme has attracted the participation of local learners and representatives of society with a sustainable development approach. It lasts 36 months and is based on the mutual experiences of these European learners on issues of sustainable development.

In this respect, a certain number of projects have been implemented with various teaching materials being produced leading to mutual enrichment, with exchanges of knowledge, best practices and development of new know-how. This should lead to the results being promoted and circulated, the idea being to measure the impact of this project in the area of sustainable development.

With respect to ERASMUS, flows of student, teacher and administrative staff mobility are undertaken depending on the degrees of motivation from one institution to another. Mobility applications should be at the very heart of the institution's European and international policy. So this gives you a quick idea of the way in which Europe contributes to your subject.

As we implement European mobility, we are in the particular position of being borderless and totally multilingual and versatile, because the agency works with many different partners.

We work with local and regional authorities and of course we recognise their essential role in funding European mobility.

Our challenge today is to find coherence between the regional policies for supporting mobility and those of Europe which come under the authority of the States as we are in the domain of European subsidiarity in terms of education and training.

Marie SARAZIN, Catholic education

At E3F we are working on a European project for sustainable development and we will have our first days on October 24 and 25 in Paris. We are right at the beginning and we hope that we will be able to bring together seven European countries around this subject. For the time being, we have Romania, Italy, Estonia and France.

Some tools for ESD

by Elodie TEXIER
National Union of Permanent Centres of Initiatives for the Environment – UNCPIE

I am in charge of the mission for environmental teaching with the UNCPIE which brings together environmental teaching association networks working in popular education, protection of nature and teachers' unions.

The first tool that comes to mind when talking about ESD is a scheme put together by an environmental education network called “School network”. This tool is sold with training for three people and it is interesting because it was put together with educators and Eco Emballages, a company working with waste.

Another partnership tool, Paleo, relates to climate change and is aimed at the older primary school and secondary school children. At this age, it is not easy to grasp what is at stake, nor the role they can play in this area. This tool has been created by CPGs in Picardy with the support of the ADEME and EDF. This is therefore a public-private partnership and the importance of this partnership can be seen on both the technical and financial levels. EDF, for example, provides data that it would have been difficult to get hold of (production of electricity, energy consumption, etc.).
When we talk about teaching tools, we think that this concerns children, but also the adults. And so an interesting tool called CRITIC was highlighted during the waste reduction week. It is a bike to be set up in a supermarket offering three types of experience. It enables consumers to have a critical view by being concerned about what they've got in their trolley and to be careful about how they consume waste when making their purchases. This tool is also a mediation tool with retailers, as it was developed with supermarkets.

There is also a database on development education tools, and a platform that is somewhat the equivalent of the CFEEDD but which concerns international solidarity and development.

Finally, it is important to pool our resources and not be redundant. Thus, the Teaching League has been working on the ecological footprint and created a game intended for 10-12 year-old children to help them take on board this concept and act with respect to their own footprint.

In terms of partnership, and more particularly with the Department of Education whose actions were encouraged in the 2004 and 2007 circulars, there are teaching packs. The CPI in the Cotentin has put together a pack of documents for the region on sustainable development which is made available to teachers so that they can work on this subject in their region.

There are other types of packs that associations lend to teachers.

Then there is also a partnership for the creation of resources, but this is less standardised and varies a lot from region to region and education authority to education authority. In the regional education authorities, teachers are in charge of ESD and so we can invite them to take part in building resources. Likewise, we can ask the education authorities to validate the quality of a resource, but this takes time.

In addition, the Department of Education has set up a recognition process for complementary associations for public education, which helps teachers in their choice of resource and partnership relationships with associations.

On a national level, things are more difficult. Firstly, there is a reduction in subsidies at the moment, but we know that the situation is not simple. We can also feel greater reticence in what is being said. So, in the last speech by Mr. DARCOS on environmental education, there was no reference to partnerships. We are sorry to say that we don't feel any real desire on a national level to work in partnership with associations.

It is important for schools to be open to the region because sustainable development is first and foremost about issues relating to the region, to the land. If we want to solve these issues, pupils need to know what exists in their region; they need to know the economic, social and association-based players and they can do so through partnerships.

To conclude, a large number of teaching tools are available. One of the problems is knowing how to identify them - is a database necessary? How could the quality of a resource in this database be validated? In fact, this already exists, in particular with highly relevant search engines. I have in mind, for example the "Réseau-IDée asbl" in French-speaking Belgium (http://www.reseau-idee.be).

There is also the problem of signage and communication to make these portals known. And finally there is the question of assessing the resources. For the time being, the teacher is the key - they decide. That is all very well, but we should be able to help them.

Paola BRUZZONE, administrator of GRAINE in Greater Paris

Partnership and teaching tools remind me of some work we did with the virtual ESD university, the UVED, to list the teaching resources in the different universities and graduate schools in this network. We wondered how to present all of this. Of course these are not teaching resources intended for children, but degree-level or Masters students and we are also asking ourselves this type of question. This may be a subject to be examined further.
Elodie TEXIER, UN CPIE

In fact, we would like to make this search engine for the CPIE network resources. Internally, it is interesting for our educators, but there are limits to it and that's why I am wondering about these search engines and validating the resources within it.

I am sorry, but I forgot to talk about local authorities for funding these resources, most of which exist thanks to their support.

Philippe SANCHEZ, Regional Youth and Sports department, Aquitaine

We have spoken a lot about education in terms of the Department of Education. As far as we are concerned, a fairly major part of our contact is with all the sports associations which are also in contact with young people and they are in a position to promote a form of education, based on sports of course, but also relating to the environment. What do you think about the relevance of all these resources in a setting other than the classroom and pupils?

Elodie TEXIER, UN CPIE

Most of these tools are usable in another setting, be that in leisure centres or sports events. It is totally possible to talk about waste by organising a canoeing day for example. It takes a leader who has the desire and ability to do so, and these tools are quite easy to get hold of. Otherwise, there are training sessions for the use of these resources.

Céline BROSSARD, Director of the Marine World centre in Nice

We work with schools, but we also offer activities to young people during the holidays. In this respect, we have a speciality which consists of offering an environmental educational activity using a sports resource as a means of discovery during the holidays. We use these resources in both cases, and each educator gets hold of them and uses them in different forms.

Jean-Paul ROBIN, SNES FSU union

I see there are a great many teaching documents for primary and secondary education. In addition, in universities and graduate schools, a certain number of resources and classes are coming into being. What seems to be missing in a major way is resources for upper secondary students. Why are the associations less interested in this level? What do you intend to do in terms of partnership in this area? How can we move forward in this area which has been deserted to a large extent?

Elodie TEXIER, UN CPIE

Upper and lower secondary school pupils have a timetable which is cut up into hour periods. It is very complicated to work in this area in just one hour. You need at least two hours or even a half day. Since lower and upper secondary schools are organised in this way and it is not easy for associations to come in for one of these periods, they have not chosen to focus their efforts to develop environmental educational activities. It would be necessary for periods to be reserved for cross-disciplinary themes, which is the case in agricultural teaching. Without going as far as having a half-day a week, there is a need for longer periods of time.

Patrick LE PROVOST, SCÉREN/CNDP

You have drawn a distinction between two types of partnership - use partnership and creative partnership. With respect to the latter, with the UN CPIE and CNDP, we have tried to put together a partnership to produce a specialist magazine on ESD. This is completely in line with the National Education texts, but we come back to the issue of funding. Certain ambitious projects are expensive and it isn't easy to balance the budget. Even though a public publisher such as the CNDP is not always obliged to break even on its products, they mustn't lose too much money all the same. There is the solution of sponsors, but this is a delicate subject as we cannot choose any sponsor we like because it isn't always a neutral matter.
In what way are ICTs [Information and Communication Technologies in Education] of particular interest to facilitate the development of the educational dimensions that form the basis of ESD?

This is our core business as in the Terra Project structure, we are publishers who have been specialising in teaching resources and awareness resources for sustainable development for around ten years, in two major areas, firstly schools and also the general public.

Firstly, ESD is a vast subject and all the scientific, social and economic considerations are all fully interconnecting. To describe the complex links between these different areas and human activities and their interaction with natural environments requires lots of other media in addition to writing. This is why we use pictures, moving pictures, interconnected databases, videos, simulations, geographical information systems and other multimedia features.

We can note that without computers, the very idea of sustainable development would not have come into being with such impact. Computers as a resource and field of action and thinking are relatively recent, with these areas supporting and stimulating each other. There would maybe not have been such great awareness of the necessity of sustainable development without computers.

Today we find ourselves confronted with a huge amount of information available to teachers. How can they sort through this information? How can the educational dimension be recovered? It is not simply a question of constantly coming back to the web for information which has not been validated. There is therefore a significant phase of validation and transformation of this information to make resources which are educationally valid.

Today, teachers are less and less at a loss faced with this quantity of information as tools and resources have been put into place. There is also a large number of specialist sites and resources where validated information can be found. We are therefore in a second phase of connecting users and raw worldwide data in the area of sustainable development.

What are the particular characteristics of ESD to which ICT resources can provide more relevant answers? In what way are ICTs distinctive?

ICTs facilitate access to and interconnection of information. They also encourage bringing together the many different components which make ESD a complex subject and enable a systemic approach. They are a valuable resource to facilitate the connection between global and local, between particular and general matters. These resources also help with contextualisation. In this respect ICTs are particularly interesting as they enable things to be put into perspective to examine issues on different scales, from the point of view of topics but also from that of time and space.

ICTs facilitate cross-disciplinary projects, meeting the requirements for true transversality. They make it possible to go from one discipline to another, so there is permanent transdisciplinarity right at the heart of ICTs.

As they provide specific functions such as level management, management of personal progress, self-assessment modules, interactive exercises, customisation of the elements used, simulation and modelling, ICTs make it easier to apprehend the complexity of the issues and the solutions envisaged.

Also with ICTs, a critical approach can be developed and the importance of choices and each person’s responsibility for their choices can be emphasised. With an interactive resource, each person is confronted with choices to be made. Responsibility for one’s choices is one of the possible definitions of interactivity. This is also an interesting
component of ESD as ICTs constantly place pupils in the position of having to make choices. The future citizen realises that they have a part to play in sustainable development. So in a simulation where there are choices to be made, the pupil becomes responsible for what they do, and sees directly the results of their actions through the choices they have made.

In this context of use, the pupil also has to use and take in all the media, enabling them to have a better knowledge of them, thus developing a critical approach to information. They are they bound to be more aware of the problems affecting the planet as a whole.

Finally, by promoting exchanges, ICTs enable shared projects to be put together with other schools in the same region or in several regions, in France or abroad. These practices encourage the pupil to become aware of the necessity of developing worldwide solidarity. What could be better than the Internet to enable this kind of contact and action?

Through the way in which ICTs make it possible to develop international projects, they also encourage actual participation of each person involved in this solidarity. This is one of the criteria that leads us to say that ICTs truly are a prime resource for the development of ESD.

By drawing together isolated users, for example people living in remote areas, pupils with difficulties and disabled people, these new technologies help to close the gap between young people and teachers all over the world.

I would just like to illustrate what I have been saying with a few examples of resources we have developed.

These resources have been developed within broad-based partnerships as we have involved public partners such as government ministries, international organisations such as UNESCO, UNEP, FAO and scientific partners such as the Institute for Research on Development (Editions Belin), non-publisher private partners acting as sponsors and content suppliers such as Eco Emballages and public partners such as the ADEME which also guarantee the content that we are developing and provide us with sponsorship support.

I'll now hand over to Vincent LEVEQUE, a publisher in the organisation, so that he can present a few of these resources.

Presentation of some teaching tools

by Vincent LEVEQUE
Publisher, Strass Productions

The first example is a series of 6 CD-ROMs focusing on SD topics (biodiversity, mobility, health, risks facing society, resources and sustainable development, sustainable cities). These strictly pedagogical CD-ROMs have the support of the Department of Education's new technologies department, have been coordinated by the General Inspectors and Regional Inspectors with the exercises written by teachers and Regional Inspectors.

All this has been done with a cross-disciplinary approach in an attempt to connect these issues with a combination of history, geography and Life and Earth sciences - biology and geology. This was complicated because this project brought together 35 people from three different disciplines, each of them answering to their respective school board.

Another example of a tool which will soon be available is a website providing a large part of the resources produced by Strass Productions and Terra Project, free of charge to teachers. This is a site where teachers will be able to create groups, put the documents they have chosen into the different groups, put together their teaching sequences and send them out to their pupils with all this fully under their control.

Strass Productions is also a studio for the development of video games on several systems (PC, Mac, Nintendo DS, Nintendo Wii, PlayStation 2, Xbox). In this respect, we have made several games, in particular the Siberian Odyssee with Nicolas VANIER and Ushuaia co-produced with MyScape.
To conclude, with respect to video games, we hear a lot about fun learning and 'serious games', and at Strass Productions, we are wondering whether it wouldn't be possible for us to apply certain validated teaching content on sustainable development for these new media. There are some major games publishers that are now bringing out certain resources. Ubisoft is bringing out a collection of three games called "Planète Nature" on Nintendo DS and Nintendo Wii, focusing on the fun learning aspect.

Anne MARLEIX, Strass productions

I would like to add that we began with general public products, with a series of 5 CD-ROMs co-produced with UNESCO. Both at school and out of school, there are now so many different media that can be used in an interesting way. Young people use these media extensively, and so it is interesting to use them to develop ESD.

Chekib TIJANI, Environmental communication advisor, German voluntary service in Tunisia

The Tunisian Environment ministry has adopted and translated one of Strass Productions' products into Arabic and sent it to Strass Productions for it to be published for Arabic-speaking users.

François BESANCENOT, Lecturer at Paris IV Sorbonne University

How do you choose the content of your tools and teaching resources? You said that there was consultation with several stakeholders and that it was difficult to get everyone to agree. How do you bring together all the ideas you receive? How do you design your products from the point of view of content?

Anne MARLEIX, Strass productions

There is always an editorial decision behind a project. We decide to put into place a topic or issue from an analysis of priorities or needs. When we have decided on the outline for this editorial project, we look to see which partners can help us and contact them. We do the same thing from a scientific point of view to find partners we will be able to rely on to supply us with validated content which we then transform into multimedia content. Sometimes projects are put on hold because we haven't found partners or not enough partners. Also when we meet the partners we are working with, other topics are suggested.

I would add that we are also going to make a lot of room for local authorities on the ESD site due to go online in November. A large part of the content is dealt with through case studies and there are several hundred case studies proposed nationally and internationally. We would like to develop case studies in France based on local issues, so with local partners, and implement international partnerships, such as the one we have with Tunisia, for the development of these tools in different languages and different countries.

We are trailing behind in terms of communication with the general public and this is due to the size of our organisation. Ours is not a very large company (with fewer than 20 people) and, given the diversity of technologies we use, this is not very many. We communicate through events such as today's event, and through everything that relates to sustainable development. We are clearly identified as stakeholders in the area. In terms of circulation, we go through specialist distributors either for the general public or schools.

State education resources and teaching materials

by Jean-Michel VALANTIN
Department of Education, French ministry of Education (MEN/DGESCO)

In the Department of Education, SD issues are found in the content of teaching curricula, teacher training and support staff training and in school life. The aim of the current generalisation policy is to include sustainable development issues in three major areas. This is the only means we have available, but it is of some significance, to train our 12 million pupils in sustainable development issues.
We need resources that can be used with pupils. These resources must also be able to be used for preparing lessons and classes. Finally, there is everything that enables teachers or educators to train themselves, to engage in self-study. So when we talk about teaching tools and resources, we are talking about at least three different issues.

With respect to all the tools and resources I am sent, having had the chance to study them a little, as I read them I can note things that are of a high standard. I also see things that give me grey hair before my time. This leads us to the major question which has been mentioned several times, that of the scientific validity of teaching tools and resources.

ESD in the Department of Education is a very recent matter. Officially, as a public policy, it began in 2004. It is experiencing exponential growth making it a completely atypical phenomenon in The French Department of Education. We are currently in a very interesting phase where we are faced with an ever-increasing demand for ESD, issues that appear by themselves and the necessity to perfect resources and tools to take into account the subject-based and cross-disciplinary dimension as ESD is literally based on getting hold of and understanding the complexity of the today's world, right across the board.

Producing teaching resources to tackle these cross-disciplinary issues with valid scientific and teaching content is not an easy matter; however, a certain number of players have begun to address the task. As one of the senior civil servants with responsibility for sustainable development in the Department of Education, I can only applaud the work accomplished by the CNDP and CRDP network, and also by other players such as a certain number of associations and public institutions such as the ADEME and others.

One thing is sure, there are an immense number of good resources as yet unknown to the teaching world, which brings us to the third major issue. Having defined who we are aiming ourselves at, having established that we need valid scientific and teaching content, we also need resources that can reach teachers and that teachers can connect with, which is not necessary the easiest achievement. On this point, certain things such as partnerships and the use of information technologies and communication are areas to explore and these are completely effective methods. To enable this effectiveness to go on being strengthened, we see public institutions, associations and other ministries approaching us - the Department of Education - to tell us that they are ready to produce teaching resources, but that we need to agree on what works and what does not work.

This brings me back to the question of the current proliferation of resources. In fact this is a two-fold issue as it exists nationally and locally.

Nationally, it is possible to come to an agreement with partners who agree on a certain number of criteria. Locally, it is important to know these criteria, but it is also important to bear in mind the fact that there are huge numbers of tools in the regions and regional education authorities. It is therefore important to list them and offer them to teachers.

We are currently moving into a new phase for the production of teaching resources, enabling us to have resources which take pupils and educators into the complexity of the issue, including scientific content meeting the need for a cross-disciplinary approach, which will also enable self-study for these new issues.

ESD is far from being simple because it is a new way of looking at things - not only the world and its inter-connectedness -, but also a new way of looking at the job of teaching. It is also a new way for the administrations that validate a certain amount of scientific content to look at their missions and how they work themselves. At the ministry, when we get certain partnership offers for producing teaching tools or resources, this makes us realise that the world is changing and that we need to change with it.

**Chantal CALLIER-BENEST, Regional Direction for Environment (DIREN) Franche-Comté**

When you speak about teaching tools at a regional level, you should know that in the regions an increasing amount of structuring is being done in terms of environmental education. In...
France, most players relate to the GRAINEs. In these GRAINEs, an inventory of resources has been drawn up and all you need to do is visit the website of each GRAINE or that of another body to find these inventories. In Franche-Comté, we work very well with the CRDP which has done some outstanding work over the past few years.

I will finish on a pessimistic note as we are going through difficult times. In terms of partnerships, although we always had a good partnership over the last twenty-five years, the last ESD steering committee meeting I attended at the regional education authority following your national seminar, sent shivers down my spine. I discovered that associations were maybe going to be excluded, that they would no longer be invited. I was told that I would be the privileged interlocutor for the DIREN, for the Besançon education board, because I would be the only one remaining. What a privilege and how open-minded for schools!

At the same time, the Director of the Franche-Comté CRDP felt some backlash. We had a wonderful educational programme on energy funded by European money and we were busy getting on with it when we found out that things were maybe going to be stopped because there was deep-seated conflict and that the ADEME may withdraw from the funding.

I hope that things are going to move forward positively but I must admit that last week I was somewhat at a loss. We left that meeting devastated. I would like you to reassure me.

Myriam BOUVERAT (French-speaking Swiss development education foundation)

In my opinion you cannot really produce ESD documents if you don't take all these criteria into account. Yes, we have material from associations, mainly from France as we do not have a sufficiently large pool to be able to produce documents ourselves.

We need to be very strict with respect to the production of teaching documents in order to truly succeed in establishing ESD. Currently we have either partial, or incomplete, documents and I think we should have shared criteria for producing and validating teaching resources, not just for France but also throughout Europe. We ought, if possible, to be in agreement on these basic criteria.

Sébastien CHAILLEUX (French scout movement, National Youth council)

In a large number of agricultural colleges, in addition to the regular class representatives, there are also sustainable development representatives in each class, enabling students to identify with SD issues and act decisively at the level of their college. I would like to know whether the Education ministry has already thought about implementing a similar procedure.

Jean-Michel VALANTIN, MEN/DGESCO

I would like to applaud the work undertaken over the past few years in agricultural education. Great progress has been made on a number of ESD issues and questions, and we are currently trying to put into place a system for exchanging best practices. Encouragingly, there are increasing numbers of ecological representatives in colleges. This issue of SD is now rapidly becoming a part of the fabric in general, technical and professional educational establishments. We are moving forward at a fundamental level and these ecological representatives will be taking on a more and more important role.

Presentation of SCÉRÉN productions

Cécile LLANTIA

Project officer for social sciences for the Publishing department at the CNDP

Our work involves both editorial impetus, as it is a question of proposing resources for ESD, and also a role of coordination and organisation of what the network produces.

The SCÉRÉN is the National Education Resources and Culture Publication Department. We have both a teaching and cultural vocation. Our network has a natural structure called the CNDP (National Centre for Teaching Resources) that coordinates a network of independent
establishments. There are 31 regional centres and several of you have been involved with these centres, particular during the course of partnerships. When a partnership is put into place with a centre, usually Patrick LE PROVOST and myself are contacted, so that a third person is involved in the partnership.

The Department of Education is increasingly interested in ESD issues. Likewise, the CNDP and CRDPs have become interested over a certain number of years in ESD issues and have become involved according to changes, which may also explain why a certain number of products you will find at the bottom of our bookshelves – as one of the tasks of the SCEREN network is to propose documentation and not simply sell teaching resources – appear rather dated as we follow changes in ESD moving on from EESD to ESD. One of our great challenges is to keep up with these rapid changes in State education in this area.

To come back to our essential vocation, it may appear to be stating the obvious, but it's always a good thing to charge in through open doors, it is a question of meeting needs arising from the application of school curricula. I stress this because there is sometimes misunderstanding with partners who do not understand why a resource coming from the outside is refused. We are not closed, but we need to adapt to the requirements of the curricula. A resource may be very good, but simply not suitable for curriculum requirements.

As far as ESD is concerned, the curricula emphasise a notion which is often a source of problems for publishers, that is an inter- or cross-disciplinary approach. Teachers are of course very attached to their subject and when they are told they are going to be sold a product that does French, Maths, History, Geography, Life and Earth Sciences, and Technology all at the same time, they find it difficult to know where they are. One of the first major challenges is to make ESD something that isn't just for History and Geography and Life and Earth Science teachers, but which successfully flows through all of state education. So our resources take this problem into account, bearing in mind the fact that there are also subject-based approaches as the curricula have included ESD within them.

Secondly one of the challenges of ESD is its complexity. Working in History and Geography, it was often said in my studies that teaching geography was teaching complexity. It isn't easy to teach complexity. When you are faced with pupils who have a certain number of preconceived, set ideas, it isn't easy to show that you are not always obliged to have an opinion on everything.

Our idea really is to set out the terms of the debate, to put things into perspective, make analysis and critical analysis tools as part of education in citizenship and training today's and tomorrow's citizens. In particular, upper secondary school pupils are strongly encouraged to be involved democratically and it is part of our work to train them for this democracy which they are already experiencing within the school.

There truly is a challenge that is also linked to the fact that outside of school, governance issues are moving towards greater consultation with citizens who can increasingly have their say and are more and more demanding when they are not listened to. It is not a question of turning France into an enormous coffee shop discussion, but to have people who are capable of constructing critical, analytical and open-minded thinking. We must not forget that tolerance and knowing others are also important in all of this. So when we are faced with a resource and we ask ourselves all these questions, it isn't easy to get it right.

As far as I am concerned, I'm not at all against acts of greenness, but the aim of school is to get people to take on board practices that will become a part of who they are, of their experience, that will be analysed and chosen and not imposed. We really are involved in building something, building something on the level of teaching which means giving pupils information, giving them access to a certain amount of analysed information.

The SCÉRÉN network bears all this in mind when it is attempting to make a resource.

In terms of ESD, particularly in History and Geography and sciences, there have rarely been so many changes to curricula at the same time. The curricula are being extensively
overhauled and so there are problems. This major overhaul is also destabilising in schools because everyone does not have the same approach to these issues. For the first time, the geography curriculum in year 8 has been totally taken over by ESD.

One of the hallmarks of the SCÉRÉN is that it is under the responsibility of the Department of Education. And so we offer resources that are validated by the education ministry which is why teachers trust us. How do we manage to get our content validated? At the moment we are piloting a lot of work with the general inspectorate. We are meeting experts, who are often regional inspectors, therefore closely tied to curricula and national education, and we have an authors’ policy.

Secondly, I would like to come back to the nature of these resources. Remember that we are a public body with the particular characteristic that we should not be in competition with private publishers. So we do not produce school text books, we do not have the right to make pupils' resources, but we make resources for teachers.

Do we manage to make sustainable resources? I would say not because we are obliged to do a lot of updating to our resources, especially in this area which is changing very rapidly. We are currently developing our offer in two major areas. First of all in self-study resources for teachers. This is very important, because when teachers finish teacher training they have several possibilities for ongoing training, but ongoing training cannot provide them with up-to-date information on everything they will need to know throughout the forty years of their working life. So we have a fundamental role in terms of self-study both for circulating experiences of teaching sequences, both written and filmed, and self-study resources to bring university culture to teachers. We have some small collections which meet this need very well, in particular a collection by the Montpellier CRDP called "Open questions" which is going to bring out an issue on SD in partnership with AGROPOLIS. We also have the "Training Resources" collection, and also the TDC and "Idées" magazines that regularly offer teachers access to up-to-date university and scientific information in the form of articles.

Then we have a second type of major resource which is the resources that teachers use in the classroom with their pupils. Here we have videos, written resources and statistics and collections of films.

This is something of our hallmark, particular at the CNDP as we have more resources that the CRDP in terms of audiovisual aids with a large audiovisual production department which has produced a lot of work with France 5. This forms part of our possibilities and our major know-how. In addition, we can adapt these films at the request of teachers. We can produce very short modules, we can make very precise sequences, so that teachers can situate themselves without any problems.

We also have the national skills centre in Amiens, with a website with content that offers resources listed by theme and that have been validated. This national skills centre has been designed in agreement with the steering committee, including members of the inspectorate general, academics and Jean-Michel VALANTIN.

To finish, as to the question of partnerships, the existence of CRDPs is very promising for us. It is always easier to talk about what is happening locally rather than nationally.

Michel CHAUMET, Director of the Aquitaine CRDP

The Aquitaine CRDP has just published what we call "The big green book", to understand sustainable development. I would like to explain what led us to produce this resource which we hope will be very useful to teachers.

As a public body which answers to the Department of Education, we are obliged to meet the needs of teachers as defined in the curricula. We based ourselves essentially on the curricula with respect to ESD and from this point of view, a lot is missing with respect to the standards which need to be developed in our opinion. Here we wanted to have a summary of what sustainable development is. Everybody is talking about sustainable development, but I
challenge you to find someone who is capable of explaining what sustainable development is in a nutshell.

This question was the starting point for writing this book which was complicated to put together as it involved a lot of authors. It is always complicated to talk about sustainable development because it’s a complex notion, in particular because we are in a cross-disciplinary approach. Of course we need French, the Arts, and Philosophy, but we simply modestly tried to meet the needs of History and Geography and Life and Earth science teachers who officially have to answer these questions. It is mainly these teachers who are in charge of this issue and I hope that as I say this, it will be provocative enough to make you react.

We are also at a time of generalisation and so we need tools that are aimed not just at specialists but at all colleagues who have to deal with these questions but do not really have the materials to do so.

For the summary on "What is sustainable development?" we enlisted the help of Yvette VEYRET. Choices have to be made and we were of the opinion that even if this was not the best solution at least it was the least bad solution. She is recognised with references in the national and international scientific community. As Director of the CRDP, I am proud to have enlisted her help and I stand by this choice. Furthermore, this choice was approved by the competent regional inspector for the Bordeaux education authority, which is the highest institutional validation possible from the education authority.

Responsibility for four topical studies (water, health, towns and cities and the coast) has been accepted by History and Geography and life and earth science teachers. For plastic arts, some of Monet's paintings have been used to address the subject of sustainable development. Personally, there was one question I was very interested in: Was ancient Rome a sustainable city? The answer is in the book.

Bensaïd LOTFI, Director, Tunisian Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development

In the field of sustainable development, we are faced with highly complex situations which require cross-disciplinary skills. We talk about different issues relating to the protection of the environment and sustainable development such as controlling energy, biodiversity and other major topics.

Everything that has been said about the different criteria which are necessary for teaching materials and products is important, but one very important thing needs working on, which is the progression in these materials. There are targets at different levels and this progression must be borne in mind to make sure the message is passed on correctly. You also need to take into account the local and regional situation because if we’re talking to young people along the coast, it’s not the same as talking to young people who live inland.

Gil Avery MOUNGUENGUI, Environmental NGO, Gabon

We are very implicated in the issue of ESD in Gabon as we have kept 11% of our national land for the creation of national parks. I am going to speak not only on behalf of my country, but also for the Congo basin sub-region The Congo basin is a very important area in terms of biodiversity not only for ourselves but for the entire planet.

We are confronted with these issues of sustainable development inasmuch as these protected areas have found local populations present and presence in these protected areas is going to involve restrictions for these populations. To settle the problem, we thought that not just restrictions but also opportunities were needed for these populations. This involves a lot of education, communication and finding alternatives for these areas.

I’ve heard a lot about the proliferation of tools and generalisation in the French education system. I’m going to try to bring some international colour to the discussion as unfortunately we aren’t all at the same place.
In our country, we have been working in informal education going to rural areas to try and get the people to adopt responsible behaviours. These areas have remained undamaged, because the people already had healthy habits. So they needed educating on the need for them not to give in to the need for money, and behaviours arriving from the towns.

Then we saw that the young people in urban areas did not have much information on SD. And so we thought about putting into place curricula in terms of environmental education because, as has already been said, the difficulty being with the tools suitable for the curricula. So we tried to draw up curricula and I note on this matter that there is very little exchange between North and South and even between South and South. We started off from scratch and we held small training events for trainers locally. We began to see which issues should have priority and drew up a document. We didn't begin with something which had been designed elsewhere although we could have used work already done in the North.

We are now in the phase of formalising this curriculum and extending it on a national level. This generalisation implies implementation by national bodies which means upheaval of policies and in schools.

With have tried to form synergies with all the national NGOs and now we need tools. We have a curriculum, but teachers must be able to pass on this knowledge to the classes. We need to make the task easier for them as they are already very busy. I'm amazed to hear you say that there are a proliferation of tools because we are looking for resources and we haven't got any. We don't have any textbooks; we only have informal resources. So if we could establish this exchange, this could enable us to adapt the tools already used in France or elsewhere to the local context of the needs in our regions. Although the ecosystems are different, environmental problems are international problems.

I would like to be able to exchange information between what has already been done and the areas where we have an urgent need. We are looking for these partnerships, particularly for sharing resources, experiences and ongoing communication. We are looking for people to whom we can submit what we are doing to get some direction. Here I am not talking about financial partnership because that would become more complicated.

There are representatives of the French Department of Education here and it would be good if we could have relationships, through the French volunteer service, to be able to influence our national policies so that ESD is included in our curricula.

We have the natural resource, nature itself, and the potential but we maybe have other priorities or maybe we are looking elsewhere. We are a major oil-producing nation and so thinking is focused on this matter. There is iron and manganese ore and very few people are concerned with these issues. It is in our interest, with the support of the international community, to remind our leaders, that beyond the question of money, we need to include ESD in people's mentalities.

I am speaking in my own name and on behalf of the sub-region to say that North-South and South-South exchanges are necessary on what has already been done and on what needs doing so that your experience can be useful to us and we can move on together.

Patrick LE PROVOST, SCÉRÉN/CNDP

Thank you for taking us out of our national boundaries and any friction there may be. I hope that your call for help will be heard. It is easier to foster exchanges on uses and practices than on teaching materials because the distribution of materials is often more complicated than producing them. We are often disappointed when we want to distribute a tool, especially if it is free elsewhere.

Jean-Paul ROBIN, SNES-FSU

I would like to thank Cécile LLANTIA for what she said. When you go around all these symposiums on ESD, you hear a lot about what has been produced by such a partner association or such a company, but we don't hear much about the many publications made
by the Department of Education for state education. She painted a rich picture of all these productions and I wanted to draw attention to this because I think that we forget all the work that is being done and which is very much in line with teachers’ expectations.

Also I sometimes feel that we only hear about history and geography teachers. They are no doubt outstanding, but life and earth science teachers are too, and I think that we will truly have made progress in this area of ESD when the last maths teacher has been included in a cross-disciplinary team for sustainable development.

You mentioned the arts and I believe that you cannot continue with ESD without a particularly pronounced sensitive approach. On this point, arts teachers have an essential role to play and must be included in these teams.

Likewise, cross-disciplinary workgroups need to be formed so that this collective co-disciplinary dynamic is permanently being developed, in partnership of course with a whole series of different players.

The Comenius European sector programme
by Didier FERASSE
Head of school teaching department for the Europe-Education-Training France Agency

Following the talk given by Sonia Dubourg-Lavroff, Director of the Europe-Education-Training France Agency (E3F), I am carrying on to present one of the four sector programmes which relate to the education and lifelong training programme: the Comenius sector programme.

I am deputy officer in the school education department covering both the Comenius sector programme and study visits. Fourteen people are working on nine different actions for the Comenius programme.

The Comenius programme has two main objectives - ensuring and encouraging involvement and the European dimension in projects and raising the awareness of all the players involved in the actions and projects of the cultural and linguistic diversity in this European area comprising 31 nations: the 27 member states in the European Union, the 3 EFTA nations, Lichtenstein, Norway and Iceland and a candidate nation, Turkey.

This entire space is open to all people working in school education, from nursery schools, to lower and upper secondary schools and primary schools. All the actions in the Comenius programme stop at the end of secondary education.

The work done is aimed at improving and increasing the mobility of the players concerned, i.e. all those working in school education, first of all pupils with massive involvement of pupils for the 2007-2013 programme as the objective for Europe is to involve over 3 million pupils, teachers, non-teaching staff, headteachers, inspectors, teaching advisors and all those working in any capacity with schools.

It is also a question of increasing the number of partnerships between schools, encouraging the teaching of foreign languages, supporting the use of new information and communication technologies and bringing a European dimension to teacher training with a diversity of approaches to teaching and the management of schools in the different countries.

I am going to present you with four major areas that Comenius’ work falls into: personal mobility, partnerships, projects and networks.

In terms of personal mobility, there are a large number of possibilities for pupils as part of partnership projects, and for teachers and non-teaching staff as part of ongoing training. At the present time, a European database provides access to ongoing training sessions and events in a lot of areas and covering highly varied topics.

The topic of "Education for Sustainable Development" is one of these, but it is not the topic with the most sessions or events on offer. One idea to be promoted and encouraged would
be to encourage bodies that organise or may be in a position to organise training sessions to have themselves included in the European ongoing training session catalogue to offer ongoing training on this topic. It is always possible to do this and these ongoing training sessions on offer are validated and proposed to all the people involved in the European countries mentioned previously, after the procedure, content and objectives have been established, enabling them to meet for a period of a few days or up to a maximum of six weeks to work on a particular aspect of a shared subject to move towards working together.

Activities involving personal mobility include assistants, sending assistants abroad and welcoming assistants into schools. About 300 people are concerned each year, which enables not only the culture and language of the people concerned and the country they come from to become part of the schools, but they can also deal with a certain number of subjects with the pupils in addition to the subjects which are usually taught. This enables work to be done with young people and pupils on matters such as those relating to sustainable development.

All specialist subjects are open and students can opt for a period of three to ten months as an assistant. In this way, a young person finishing their studies in biology can apply to be an assistant in a French school and take part in the teaching sequences in their specialist subject or in their language, or even both.

With respect to partnerships, it is a question of establishing at least bi-lateral partnerships but this now only concerns 5% of funds allocated to us by Comenius. For France, €14 million is available through Comenius. Multilateral partnerships are given precedence involving at least three schools from three different countries.

In terms of education for sustainable development, we have noted that over the past several years this topic has been taken up by schools who are committing to or getting involved in partnerships. Of the 500 to 600 applications we receive each year, we can say that, for the past three or four years now, the number of topics and subjects for projects which are chosen has been increasing with respect to sustainable development. The schools under the Ministry of Agriculture were the first to take hold of this subject and offer it within partnerships. Since a certain number of programmes and curricula have included sustainable development in their teaching, the number of programmes devoted to it has increased.

The recurrent topics for partnerships include first and foremost training and eco-citizenship, developing and protecting the environment, the use and preservation of resources, renewable energies, recycling and reuse, tourism (in particular rurally), food and health, production (agricultural and forestry), the adaptation of standards for Europe, relations between producers and consumers and marketing and services.

To move on further with discussions and projects aimed at implementing innovative teaching practices throughout Europe, there are two specific Comenius actions.

Firstly, multilateral projects aimed at developing, promoting and disseminating new teaching programmes, teacher training content, teaching materials and methods. These projects may lead to a specific line of thinking between European partners, for at least three for three years, moving on to building and developing resources which can then be validated.

Then, multilateral networks can be formed for a given theme. Here it is a case of at least ten schools in ten different countries working on the same theme. This means a network is formed for schools to work together to move forward with a certain amount of discussion Europe-wide.

The work included in programmes, curricula and avenues suggested are resources to enable things to move forward. Personal mobility can contribute to this, and ongoing training actions and the different sessions on offer each year can also help. It is a case of placing three components to be established by European partners at the disposal of an idea such as sustainable development: being together, experiencing certain things together and working together to make progress on a topic.
The agencies themselves also contribute to the sustainability of certain aspects of their work. I will mention only one tool, called "Quality and Sustainability", which covers the notion of durability of projects and partnerships. It is a question of understanding how to continue on the same course having received financial support for an action, how to make progress and move on to other actions or coming up with a certain number of possibilities following a partnership or personal mobility. This site, which can be accessed by simply typing in QAS, is hosted in Sweden is the result of work involving British, Czech, Swedish and French agencies.

The network of agricultural colleges working with a sustainable development approach
by Christian Peltier
Agricultural college teacher

I have been a teacher in an agricultural school for over twenty years, and now I am in charge of leading a developing network, that of agricultural colleges working with a sustainable development approach. I am not going to go over the entire history of agricultural colleges for you, but I would like to remind you why agricultural education is a little specific and what the major issues that we are trying to work on today are.

Since the 1960s, the major particular characteristic of agricultural teaching has been to have five missions. One of its missions is to provide training, as in state education, but there are four other missions which play a major role nowadays when dealing with ESD issues.

Since the 1990s, agricultural education has begun to implement projects aimed at farms and since 2003, colleges with 25 pilot sites each time and these typical missions have gradually been examined through the lens of sustainable development.

It is firstly a question of international cooperation, getting young people to be open to other situations particularly in southern countries. This change of perspective is a source of education, enrichment and also revelations for the accompanying teachers and particularly for the young people.

Then there are development missions on farms, and more generally relating to the dynamics of the region. Agricultural teaching is very open to regional differences and is very present on the ground, in the broadest sense of the term. Young people have traditional lessons but are also confronted with complex realities which require resources to be developed. They are not always developed as they should be, but at least this is a significant way in.

Finally in terms of professional insertion, our target audience is young people in initial training and also in apprenticeships. Professional insertion is one of the strengths of agricultural teaching. We work on professional insertion and more broadly on insertion as citizens in the world they will be living in, in the future.

Since the 1960s, agricultural teaching has also had a particular characteristic which is social and cultural education. Culture has provided a way into sustainable development for these teachers who are used to regional practices.

Since the middle of the 1990s, concern for sustainable development has spread to all sectors of agricultural teaching, affecting all the young people involved, although not all the teachers. I would like to draw your attention to the dangers of activism which sometimes exists and get everything back into perspective. Bringing together these five missions with the national emphases on sustainable development, it can be seen that ESD has forged a place for itself and is inherent in the history of agricultural teaching.

One of our strengths is to bring together and combine in a pluridisciplinary approach social sciences and engineering sciences or "hard sciences". As a history and geography teacher, I was thrilled to be able to work with both agronomists and economics and biology teachers. The greatest pleasure is when we don't agree, when we don't see things the same way and we try to build the subject we are going to work on together with the young people.
In terms of teaching in socially sensitive issues, I think that the 19th century Republican model has its strengths, but it no doubt needs a makeover. When you are working on sensitive issues, it isn’t a question of knowledge that is set in stone, but of knowledge that is being debated. Yes, we need scientific references, but we are not completely cast in this mould.

This is not the case throughout agricultural teaching, but these are subjects of concern in the teaching and topical networks providing backup.

In addition, in agricultural colleges, we have a lot of boarders. These are small societies that live together five days out of seven during term time. There is therefore scope for education outside the classroom, on Wednesday afternoons and in the evening. Our model is closer to real life or real society and we can use this as a basis for “educating” in various issues.

This of course affects the way we see ESD. We are trying to work on making environmental education move on to sustainable development and something broader, i.e. the overall project of the school for sustainable development.

To finish, I would like to remind you that in our mission, we have an "activity" aspect and a "training, research and development" aspect.

Different schools have made varying degrees of progress, but they have not yet succeeded in intentionally building the school's sustainable development project. We have to reinterpret our traditional development project through the lens of sustainable development. What we mustn't have is an Agenda 21 on the one hand, and the school's project on the other hand. It is not easy to move on from here, and we will not be able to do so without research and action, without teaching specialists as this is at the heart of this co-building procedure, and without people working on the sociology of organisation and changes in behaviour.

Within the framework of the Ministry of Agriculture, there are organisations and support bodies that can provide us with this. We also find this support externally.

Agricultural colleges and ESD: the example of Saint-Herblain Agricultural College

Léna LEDUCQ
Regional support worker for SD in the Pays de Loire region

I am going to continue by presenting the example of the Saint-Herblain Lycée to you because it is pretty representative of the situation of agricultural colleges. These colleges are small societies but with areas and land that needs looking after and an environment that you have to live with. Most of our agricultural colleges have a farming vocation but are located in periurban areas which can be a source of conflict.

At the Saint-Herblain College, we have been in an overall SD procedure since 2000 and began an Agenda 21 in 2005.

It's quite complicated, particularly because we had a lot of teachers who were very keen but who also had high expectations for the procedure. The aim was to move on from an approach with one-off environmental projects to an approach covering three centres - the college, the CFA and the CFPPA, as well as work on professional insertion and the 35 hectares of land, all in collaboration with all of the partners and learners.

The aim was to find coherence between everything that was being done internally, so that it was credible internally with respect to what we were saying officially about sustainable development. Talking about social aspects, plural economics and cohesion, whilst the behaviour of the team or people was not necessary coherent with what was being said could have a pretty serious boomerang effect.

We need to work on things being understandable internally and externally, and making all this work known also helped our training courses to survive.
We are also working on this guarantee of quality with respect to values in order to make what we are doing sustainable. We began with a project-based approach with a diagnosis of the three major fields of work.

For teaching, it was a case of forming an educational community capable of training responsible and competent eco-citizens, taking into account the fact that even the restaurant staff were part of the educational community and by working with the learners' parents too.

Then we had to work on the organisation and running of the school, which meant choosing overall responsibility in everyday practices.

Then we worked on setting all this in our environment. We are not floating above the ground or in an unassailable bubble, but we are working in an area which is our catchment area but not just our catchment area.

We have been working with a lot of partners (the DIREN, the Water Agency, Nantes Métropole, the urban district authority), on the pillars of sustainable development (the environment, economics and social aspects). We have also been working cooperatively as we have had exchanges. For instance, France Europea, a network of ten countries, is going to be held on the themes of sustainable development.

After this diagnosis, we worked on co-building and reviewing the work done so far. We put into place structures to organise all this, to get feedback from this sharing and these debates.

Asking questions and co-building is motivating for learners, all those working in the educational community and the partners involved with our school.

**Partnership scheme between the Avesnois regional natural park and an education board inspectorate in the Nord-Pas de Calais**

*Delphine DUTRÉMÉE*

*Avesnois regional park*

The Avesnois regional natural park is located in the south of the Nord - Pas de Calais region, which is a very rural region with lots of biodiversity and quite specific know-how.

I am going to present the background to our experiment and explain why a regional park is working with state education.

In short, a park is an organised area with a specific land project. It is awarded a label for this. Our missions are meeting, educating and informing the public and also conducting experiments. For this reason, since the regional natural parks began in the 1970s, we have been working with local people working in environmental education and the regions, etc.

This meant that in 2001, the Department of Education and the Chairman of the Parks Federation formalised this work with a charter. This was put into action locally in 2007 through the signature of an agreement between the Chairman of the regional natural park and the head of département services for the Department of Education.

We are working in partnership for ESD. Our aim through this partnership is to provide added value to the project. For the park, it provides the opportunity to test things on the ground, in schools. For the Department of Education, it gives the opportunity to have a coordinator, a facilitator on the ground who is already working with a vast network of partners.

Together, we asked ourselves some questions. How can we give meaning to this concept of sustainable development? How can we create the right conditions for pupils and teachers to identify with this concept? How can we train eco-citizens for the future? From there we had the idea of basing ourselves on Agenda 21, a procedure ratified at the Rio Earth Summit in 1992. The idea was to make the school and its environment into a sustainable development laboratory. In other words we wanted to make the school into a learning tool for sustainable development.
And so I am going to present you with our programme called "Les Écologiques".

In and of itself, a partnership between state education and the Park is a long way from covering all the issues and the entire scope of an Agenda 21. We began by forming a cross-disciplinary steering committee made up of representatives from the Department of Education and institutional and association partners.

These are Inspectors from the different areas in the region, teaching advisors, representatives of the local municipalities, partners such as the ADEME, the DIREN, Energy Information Spaces, the DRDJS, Atmo Nord-Pas-de-Calais, CPIEs, the CAUE, the Regional Council, the Département Council, the Water Agency, the SCÉRÉN/CRDP, the Hauts Pays Natural park, the IUFM teacher training college, local environmental education and sustainable development associations, the GRAINE, Committee 21, the School and Nature network, the COREN (a counterpart in Belgium), etc.

We wanted to apply the principles of sustainable development from the bottom up, which means we put into place governance for the creation of resources. So when we co-develop a tool, we have five schools involved in the experiment and the tool is put to the test in the schools and the teachers report on their experience to the steering committee.

This steering committee also wants to set the example. We try to do car sharing, have an organic buffet, put together teaching kits with recycled material, etc.

We have a practical guide for teachers to go with the programme. In addition the park is identified as a consultant and coordinator for the procedure and assists the steering committee in each school. In each school, the scheme is led by a steering committee made up of the wider educational community and representatives of the pupils' parents, municipalities, pupils, the Inspectorate and the Park.

An Agenda 21 scheme involves well-defined steps (reviews, eco-diagnoses, etc.). The Park doesn't come to conduct the review at the school, but the teachers do this through the teaching sequences with the children. To do this, we needed to provide them with tools and so we put together an eco-diagnosis kit. Afterwards when the actions are implemented, the schools have to work with priority topics and at this point, the teaching kits are no longer necessary as we do not which to reinvent existing materials but use and optimise this.

In terms of reviewing the method used to develop the tool, we are very involved with all our partners. The tool is very well accepted but this takes time.

In the schools, the teachers really want to work in this way with a truly global approach. In addition, the municipalities are involved in the steering committees in each school. It is sometimes difficult to get the parents involved.

On the level of assessment, the steering committee decided that assessing the pupils should continue to be done by the teachers as it is part of their skill set. However we would like to assess the scheme. The scheme is a part of school life for three years and it will be necessary to analyse whether or not these actions have been relevant and effective. That being said, we haven't got there yet as the schools involved in the experiments are currently drawing up their programmes.

In terms of development in the region, we are offering eight new schools the possibility of joining the scheme before the Christmas holidays and we are wondering whether to take the tool to a regional level, which would involve identifying and training partners to accompany it.

The mediatory role of researchers and their responsibility

Maurice FAY
Institute of research for development (IRD)

I am going to talk about education for development, although I am conscious that this is tautological and maybe not really necessary. I could in fact have spoken just about...
education. What kind of education could there be that was not working in favour of development?

Before talking about youth clubs I will tell you a little about my experience. I used to work at the Institute of Research for Development (IRD), in particular on scientific culture projects. Before that I worked in the evolution gallery at the Natural History Museum where I helped to put into place a certain number of audiovisual documents. I worked for about ten years at the CNDP as project manager on developing resources for what was called scientific education. I would like to emphasise the fact that I was very careful to make sure that these products being developed with teachers were developed in contact with researchers and scientists and also with educational researchers and people training trainers and teachers.

Before the CNDP, I worked in Africa for about ten years, in Niger and Côte d’Ivoire, on two teaching experiments that consisted of using audiovisual aids to remedy the lack of training for teachers so that the young people could have a modern education focusing on developing their country and region.

The youth clubs are workshops under the state education system. They are scientific workshops working with at least one reference researcher, from the IRD or another institute, on a particular issue.

The main thing is to work on an issue, drawing up a bibliography and trying to see what has already been written, without trying to do what has already been done, and with a hands-on approach. Then they have to communicate their work to others.

This is a very important stage because by communicating their work to others, other people around can benefit from it and this obliges us to return to our beloved studies, because in general what seemed clear to us at one time needs to be reworked when it is a question of explaining it to others.

Around one hundred youth clubs have been running since 1999, some of them in France, others in overseas départements and territories, as well as in Africa and Latin America.

The IRD works in partnership with the countries in the tropics, again with a pluridisciplinary, trans-disciplinary or cross-disciplinary approach, which means that we always bring things together under topics relating to development - the climate, fishing, oceanography, soil study, ethnology, anthropology, etc., and people from social sciences and life and earth sciences. This is important as it is practically one of the obligations with respect to thinking on development and modern education.

The IRD has taken part in teacher training through education authority action plans, in the administrative Academies of Créteil, Amiens, Montpellier and others. More particularly we have put into place an agreement with the CRDP and the Amiens education authority with respect to youth clubs and informing teachers.

I will mention in particular the seminar for northern and southern towns as this involved a lot of researchers from the IRD, and it seems to me that the north-south aspect is one that needs emphasising.

What do we mean when we talk about environmental education? In my opinion there ought to be an "s" on the end of "environment". Because we have lots of different environments. They are ecological in the scientific sense of the word ecology. We talk about this a lot, in fact we talk about nothing else. They also exist in the field of social sciences and human relations.

That is all that is talked about too, but it is never fully discussed. Personally I am moving for there to be four pillars to sustainable development, the fourth of course being cultural aspects and therefore educational aspects.

I've been asked several times to talk about sustainable development in schools, from primary school right through to the year 11 or even upper secondary, more or less in global terms. It
was a question of defining the link between what can be done locally in a school or with one's family and the general link which is a problem. What pupils can do for sustainable development is very simple - learning and education is the very basis. It is easy for me to say that when I come from outside the school, but it is very important nonetheless.

With respect to nature that we refer to so often, is there anything more cultural than nature? What is nature other than a cultural representation of a certain number of things?

I have a reference which seems immutable to me – the millennium objectives. I have worked in a research institute that works internationally and I am not going to insist on this, passing over poverty, hunger, education and sex equality.

What are the links with research? Of course I am not going to develop the fact that researchers ask questions to try and get a better understanding of the world. They teach us that we need to act at different levels. We have talked about regions, about local and global aspects, but we must not forget that between the local and the global, there are thousands of scales of areas, depending on whether we are looking at things from and ecological or human point of view or whether we are thinking about water.

These things fit into one another, cover some of the same area, collide with one another, contradict one another and can sometimes be the source of conflict. Young people are very sensitive to all this and are quite capable of using this approach because they understand it. This is what they see around them, what they hear around them all day long, in the media or on the television.

The French research institutes have an incredible desire to communicate, to talk about what they are learning, to talk about their questions. I often hear two different things. On the one hand, in the French research centres, information and communication managers hold monthly meetings. I can tell you that they want to work with state education so that what is going in the research centres can have more impact on society than they can achieve with their means of production.

On the other hand I hear people from the state education system say that it would be good to work more with research institutes. That is fully possible. Methods and schemes need to be put into place so that this collaboration is done on a regular basis, even if sometimes there will be a certain amount of conflict. We are not necessarily in the same positions, but we shouldn't be afraid to take this risk.

I also note the necessity, though I won't spend any longer on it, of a very specific dialogue with southern countries, because ESD cannot be a matter solely for northern countries.

If we take a look at all that, a certain number of concepts are obvious. I can sort these out into what can be considered scientifically to be concepts and what are ideas or projects.

We have said a lot about the systemic approach and complexity. To be sure, complexity is difficult to teach, but why not get used to doing so? All it takes is to find situations in which young people are active and are confronted with this complexity. The youth clubs were an example.

And so we are going to work on a question and notice that it has ramifications in all directions, that the geography we are working on is not sufficient, that we need to ask for the help of an economist, a historian, a geophysicist or a geologist. Complexity is something we are confronted with and it is very difficult to teach.

It is said that sustainable development is complicated but there are amazing experiences in the field of education. The same is true for topics such as health, food, biodiversity, ecosystems, soil, risks, energy. There is a whole education movement within state education and with its associations. This means that these terms which constitute long-lasting development issues exist and we need support to move on and put together projects with young people and not simply have a teaching attitude.
Time needs to be made, but I think this is possible. We could give a dogmatic speech to 100 people with a microphone and a PowerPoint presentation. This saves time because by making a regimented presentation to so many people we then have time to do workshops that are of interest to young people. Here again it would be a good thing to ask questions about this scheme to a class and a teacher, or a class and several teachers taking over from one another.

I cannot finish without saying that it is important to communicate in all directions. It is important, for young people in particular, but also for teachers, to tell others what they are doing.

You can always tell yourself that what you are doing is no good, that you could do better, that it isn't general, that you've looked at only a tiny issue, but it doesn't matter. You've done it, you really have done it and you will be able to take on more complex issues later on.

I always say that we only talk about teaching and educating but we never talk about learning. Today, I have been proved wrong, because since this morning I have heard several times that learning is important. In my opinion it is at the heart of the issue we are interested in - that of education for sustainable development.

Seeing the world today from the perspective of sustainable development is a significant change. If we were to see the world of education through the lens of "learning" rather than "teaching", this would change things in the same way. Learning is the heart of the matter.

Consultations and partnerships oblige us to change and we have several testimonials illustrating this.

To finish, it seems to me that now we need to think a lot about how things come together, links, conflicts between different sectors which are compartmentalised and which have formed their own environment, their own world. I am thinking about the sectors of production, research, education, training, information and consumption. There are continuums, but there are also divides and it is absolutely necessary to ask questions about how it is possible to get these different worlds to communicate.

To give a few examples, last year an entire class at the Jules Guesde High School in Montpellier worked on global warming with five teachers (maths, history and geography, life and earth sciences, English and physics and chemistry).

They worked with four researchers (a glaciologist, two soil experts and an agronomist).

The pupils developed ten topics around the central issue of global warming, with two areas being studied, one in the Alps on melting glaciers and the change in the rhythm of avalanches, the other in the Camargue on the issue of salty soil, an important question in particular with respect to rising sea levels which will mean that a certain number of coastal areas will have higher salt levels, and this is land that provides a large part of some countries' food.

They presented their posters in English at the World Water Congress in Montpellier, and on the stand there were posters of a youth club in Quito that had worked on melting glaciers but who unfortunately had not been able to communicate much due to the time difference. I hope that they will be able to do so this year.

In addition pupils from Amiens and Vaujours came to present their work at the World Biodiversity Congress which was held at the UNESCO in 2005. They spent a day in a workshop at the IRD and in videoconference with Senegal, Madagascar and Cameroon. They came to give their conclusions at the plenary session at the UNESCO where they were invited onto the platform.

I can assure you that when young people who have conducted studies, made posters and exchanged with others find themselves confronted with adults, it is an amazing source of motivation.
Conclusion and summary
Patrick LE PROVOST
SCÉRÉN/CNDP

During this session, I have tried to find common themes running through our thinking beginning with a few key words: people, partnerships, exchanges, approach.

In terms of people, we have seen that the tools and resources need adapting to suit the people they are aimed at. There are three different types of target audience and we have had several examples.

We raise awareness in the general public, we educate pupils in the educational system, we train managers, whether these be head teachers in the state education system or local councillors. We also train teachers who look after pupils. For all of this, we need tools to suit the different targets because sometimes there are tools that overlap between different types of people and it isn't very clear who they were intended for to begin with. So this needs to be thought about beforehand.

Then, with respect to partnership, we have understood that it can be a delicate subject, but we have also had examples of very successful partnerships, public-private partnerships, public-association partnerships, private-association partnerships or all three together.

The complementarity of the different types of partners needs to be improved, complementarity which we have been working on for a long time, to forge functional links between the different worlds that are not always aimed at the same target. When they want to aim at a same target audience, this must come into a certain framework and the state education system is working on building this framework.

Then it was a question of exchanging resources and best practices, particularly within Europe. With respect to exchanges, I remember access to resources in general. Our colleague from Gabon says he has a real problem in having access to resources, but this is also the case in France. Tools are not sufficiently well known and it is necessary to make the right tools known. First of all we need to define what a good tool is and ensure that everyone knows about this.

With respect to approaches, the main point is that an ESD resource must be part of an overall approach. This was said in several cases, in particular agricultural education where it was particularly clear in the presentation, but this idea can be transposed to all settings. We talked about the E3D school approach as we say in state education, an approach which includes the theme of governance, where the pupils or citizens are playing an active role.

This requires a systemic approach, a complex approach which fits into the surroundings, which means that the original tools cannot necessarily be taken elsewhere in the same form.

This will therefore require the tools to be apprehended and people to play an active part. They will have to develop their own tool taking inspiration from another one, which is why exchanges are important.

To conclude, a good ESD tool cannot be off-the-peg, but it is an aid to deal with complexity and open up the debate.

To summarise we could mention the fact that the title of the session may have been ambiguous to a certain extent, but we clarified this straightaway. Tools are also methods. Then we were not talking only about state education because it is also possible, and even preferable, to have teaching methods aimed at the general public. So we had to talk about tools and methods for a whole range of different targets.

A lot was said nonetheless about state education during the session, as it is very present, and about schools in general. 80 people took part in the workshop, which shows that the topic of tools always attracts a large number of people in ESD from different backgrounds.
This is why the session was organised around about ten presentations to give as wide a range as possible of tools produced by different people for ESD.

On the level of Europe, the role of the Europe-Education-Training France Agency (E3F) was presented.

France was represented by the Department of Education, representatives of the Ministry of Agriculture and regional authorities with an example of a partnership between the North Avesnois park and the Department of Education. Associations were present with the CFFEESD, and private publishers with "Terra Project", state publishers, the CNDP (National Centre for Teaching Resources) and its SCEREN (National Education Resources and Culture Publication Department) network and the world of research with a representative of the Institute of Research for Development (IRD).

Between the presentations there were plenty of comments from the floor, with rich, fertile and sometimes lively exchanges. This showed that there were already a large number of different existing resources, that are maybe too disparate. It was immediately clear that there was a problem with the suitability of the tools for the target audiences. The requests emerging from the discussions and presentations included four which we have particularly noted as they seemed important to us. The first is being able to have access to tools based on proven scientific information, especially for topics that are the subject of debate. This is particularly true for state education, but also for all targets.

The second request is to remedy the relative lack of resources for lower and upper secondary schools compared to the profusion of resources for primary schools. This profusion may be apparent only because sometimes there is a problem with them being relevant, but it is true that there are more resources on offer for primary schools in France than for secondary schools.

These resources need to be adapted for state education to the criteria of the institution. We are not limited to learning acts of greenness, we know that ESD requires resources that deal with complexity and enable the issues to be taken on board by pupils who play an active role.

The third request is to harmonise the criteria for assessing and validating resources in Europe, inasmuch as a lot of projects tend to be developed internationally. To decide on the relevance of a project, the validation criteria are sometimes different in different countries or between Europe as a whole and the criteria found in a given institution in a given country.

The fourth request is to promote exchanges of best practices and access to resources locally and internationally. We listened to the testimonial of a colleague who is a trainer in Gabon. He has discovered that there are a lot of resources in France but he finds it difficult to have access to them.

However, in the same country, a lot of people often do not know that there is a resource that would be totally suitable for them which has been produced at the other end of France.

From all of this we identified four key words: people, partnerships, exchanges, approach.

The key word "people" covers the first recommendation which is to adjust the tools to suit the people they are aimed at. From the outset, a tool must be designed for the people it is intended for. That seems obvious but when we see some tools on offer for ESD, there is often a problem with respect to their target. The same tool cannot be used for the general public and for educational purposes, unless the tool itself includes different sections enabling this.

The second key word "partnerships" refers to the need to improve potential synergies between different partners. To do so, the expectations and specific needs of each sector need to be taken into account, with respect of course to the target audiences.

The third key word "exchanges" aims at facilitating access to tools and best practices both globally and locally. One recommendation would be to bear in mind that the Internet is very
practical in this respect, but there are still places without internet access. To begin with, this access to tools and best practices should be generalised so that everyone can profit from what has been carried out successfully in neighbouring countries.

Finally, the key word "approaches" covers tools with an overall approach, which includes understanding what is at stake and encouraging genuine appropriation of knowledge and practices. It is not a question of crossing your fingers for a method or tools for a particular target audience. Sustainable development is complex and so we need to have the courage to face up to this complexity so that the target audience is included in the approach.

To conclude, a tool for education for sustainable development cannot on any account be seen as off-the-peg, but must be an aid for facing up to complexity. I would just like to say that the four recommendations detailed were not ranked by increasing or decreasing order of preference, but if one needed to be chosen for first position, the inclusion of teaching tools in an overall approach seems to me to be the most important.
Session 6

Education for Sustainable Development in France:
2005-2008 stakeholder review
and proposals for the second part of the Decade, 2009-2014.

Summary

• Introduction (Jean-Michel VALANTIN, French Ministry of Education)
• Assessment of the contribution of local authorities to education for sustainable development
  - Antoine CHARLOT, Committee 21
  - Bernard GERARD, Manager, Centre for the Sea and Sustainable Development, Le Havre City Council
  - Annick DELHAYE, Vice-Chair, Sustainable Development, PACA Region
  - Julie CHABAUD, Agenda 21 Officer, Gironde Département Council
• Assessment of "Company" aspect
  - Olivier CLASSIOT, "Des Enjeux et des Hommes"
  - Daniel CATZARAS, La Poste
  - Jean-Pierre MONGENDRE, La Lyonnaise des Eaux
  - Pierre-Erik ANDRIANARISOA, Caisse d’Epargne
• Assessment with respect to society at large
  - Roland GÉRARD, Co-Chairman of CFEESD
• Assessment with respect to the State
  - Jacques BRÉGEON, Chairman of CHEESD
• Open-floor debate
• Conclusion (Olivier CLASSIOT, "Des Enjeux et des Hommes")

Moderator:
Olivier CLASSIOT ("Des Enjeux et des Hommes")

Introduction
by Jean-Michel VALANTIN
French Department of Education/DGESCO

Education for sustainable development raises two issues for the Department of Education, that of education and that of sustainable development within the education system.

Sustainable development has emerged as a complex cross-disciplinary notion. Since 2004, the issue for the Department of Education has been to know how to express this complexity and cross-disciplinary nature within its workings. The reason I mention 2004 is because for over 30 years, the Department of Education did nothing in this respect: this type of educational work was carried out by means of partnerships, particularly with associations promoting environmental education for sustainable development.

Since 2004, the Department of Education has decided to get involved in such issues directly and is doing so through its own competencies, i.e. teaching programmes, training for teachers and support staff and in the day-to-day running of establishments.

Education for sustainable development represents a considerable challenge for the training of teachers and support staff. 2004 is still relatively recent, and so the measures required for
such training are still being fine-tuned. What is more, training is traditionally carried out by
discipline, because teachers, who lie at the heart of the whole business, teach a particular
subject. The challenge is therefore to help teachers receive training in sustainable
development both with respect to their own subject and transversely i.e. in a cross-
disciplinary matter. Since the issue of sustainable development is also an issue of
sustainable development within the educational system itself, an increasing number of
administrative Academies can be seen to be offering training which is multi-disciplinary and
multi-category, enabling the creation of a shared culture of sustainable development across
all categories of employees working within state education.

Lastly, since 2007, the Department of Education has entered a phase during which education
for sustainable development has become more widely disseminated: in this phase, these
issues are being proactively incorporated into the various sectors and levels of the system.
A start has therefore been made and things are progressing very quickly. It will not be over
in one or two years because state education represents 1.5 million civil servants of whom
850,000 are teachers, as well as 12 million pupils, 60,000 schools and 15,000 secondary
education establishments. We are therefore talking in terms of a network which extends right
across the nation and every level of society which requires much more than announcing
something to actually get it done. Similarly, the introduction of issues relating to sustainable
development into teaching programmes has begun, is underway and is being pursued.
I would also like to clear up a number of misconceptions. Education for sustainable
development has had the benefit of partnerships with local authorities, decentralised
government departments, companies and approved non-profit associations and public
bodies. Clearly, all this is not going to come to a halt: within a system which is changing very
rapidly, the issue is to clarify how each of these partnerships is implemented.

The generalisation of ESD aims to train the 21st century citizens who are presently pupils in
order for them to be able to apprehend and understand the complexity of the contemporary
world and make appropriate decisions regarding this complexity. This is why cross-
disciplinary approaches within establishments are particularly encouraged. If we take the
question of water, it can be discussed quite appropriately in geography, physics, chemistry,
life and earth sciences and the humanities. The outstanding issue is really that of
incorporating sustainable development issues within the various processes which are
specific to the educational system itself.
Pupils, teachers and many other people spend most of their day within schools and
establishments. It is therefore important that these establishments become places in which
sustainable development initiatives can be experienced and experimented with, so that this
living space can also become a space for learning about sustainable development, cross-
disciplinary approaches and complexity. Living out what has been learned and creating
consistency between what is learned, practical life and routine gestures is what makes this
policy of generalising education for sustainable development meaningful.

So what does a pupil, i.e. a citizen-to-be, who is learning about sustainable development look
like? From an academic point of view, the key principles of sustainable development involve
articulating the scientific approach, developing critical analysis, ethics and citizenship. In this
sense, education for sustainable development is fully in line with the principles of the
Republic and the profoundly Republican vocation of education, even as it enables education
to adjust to changes in the contemporary world.

Over and above this, education for sustainable development also opens up new horizons; it
is a philosophy geared to action. At present, it is clear from many analyses that we have
to enter uncertain times. It is not children aged 5, 6, 10, 12 or 15 who will be solving the
climate crisis; it is us. Children aged 5, 10 or 15 will learn about and understand the key
issues relating to the climate crisis, the water crisis and the interactions between social
conditions, climate conditions and water conditions. They will learn that it is possible to think
in social, economic, cultural and civic terms in such a way as to address these issues.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
This means that education for sustainable development opens up horizons well beyond doomsday scenarios, looking towards a 21st century, which must be a century of sustainable development.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

I believe this introduction has raised a number of highly interesting points. Things are moving, but are they moving everywhere? This is the question we will need to address during this assessment. The issue of generalisation - being capable of sowing sustainable development at every level - has been raised. How do things stand in this respect in the various spheres which we will be looking at during this summary? Partnership has also been mentioned. How can we do better together by observing what exists already?

You mentioned the 21st century citizen, but I would like to find out what we are doing with today’s citizens, with people working in companies, local councillors, teachers and volunteer workers, those who can raise the awareness of other people.

The assessment has been drawn up by four teams and I would like to thank Committee 21 represented by Antoine CHARLOT and the other people in the team who have helped him prepare this work, particularly Christine DELHAYE and Anne LEMAIRE. I would also like to thank Jacques BREGEON who will be speaking on behalf of the inter-ministry working party on ESD and Roland GÉRARD who represents the French collective for environmental education for sustainable development.

The contribution of local authorities to ESD
by Antoine CHARLOT,
Committee 21

Committee 21 has been working on the topic of ESD for five years, with the particularity that it brings together all stakeholders in education for sustainable development with the idea of mobilising all the stakeholders in a given area, obviously with the local authority heading up the group, but also including companies, non-profit associations, public bodies and schools. This thinking is mirrored in our programme of education for sustainable development, since this involves seeing how, within a given area, all stakeholders can contribute to lifelong education for sustainable development, seeking to address all stakeholders whether they are in the process of becoming citizens or are already citizens today.

To carry out this assessment, it is important to note that in 2007, we carried out a survey on the contribution of local authorities to ESD. This means that this session is an opportunity to carry out an assessment one year on to see what progress has been made in terms of education for sustainable development and how local authorities at every level have incorporated this dimension of education and pedagogy for sustainable development within their own programmes.

To carry out this assessment, we called on the 150 local authorities who are members of Committee 21 and local authority networks, in order to be in touch with as many of them as possible. In particular, we called on the Association of French Mayors, the Association of Mayors of major French cities, French Départements and Regions, as well as French overseas municipalities which have their own particularities and which are often less advanced with respect to these subjects.

At a national level, a number of campaigns provide evidence that sustainable development has been present in public-sector communications for two years. At the local authority level, it can be seen that sustainable development has been increasingly present in communication over the last two or three years. This clearly has a political dimension; local authorities are now carrying out marketing of their local area. This is becoming a major political issue, as we have seen at the most recent municipal elections, but what emerges first and foremost from interviews with local authorities is the importance of not acting alone. What would be the point of an "Agenda 21" initiative or a local sustainable development policy if companies,
non-profit associations and individuals within the area in question continue to consume, dispose and generally act as before, in short do not contribute to the objectives of the local policy?

This is the thinking behind local authorities including pedagogy and education in their strategies today: the aim is to persuade people and win them over. How can businesses and individuals be won over so that they can contribute to local policy and apply it to their own day-to-day practices?

The first stage involves persuading internally: local government employees and councillors who are sometimes a little recalcitrant when it comes to sustainable development. They need to be brought to the place where they understand the issues in terms of climate change, factor 4, the IPCC and work on biodiversity, international solidarity and social cohesion. These involve complex data which need to be taken into account gradually and applied with respect to the competencies of local authorities. It is also important to understand working methods as regards sustainable development because these require more prospective study, cross-disciplinary work, consultation and assessment. These are new methods which are sometimes problematic for local authorities. Some may find it scary to talk about assessment, so much pedagogy and dialogue is required in order for internal stakeholders to be brought to the place where they take on board sustainable development.

This is something new: the first "Agenda 21" initiatives of a decade or so ago completely missed out this phase of learning, training and appropriation with respect to sustainable development. They consisted in an action programme which was not always really applicable or really owned by each of the internal stakeholders and teams within the local authority. Over the last two or three years, local authorities have taken the time for such training and learning, which really constitute a guarantee of effectiveness of public policy.

This mobilisation is expressed in a number of ways and there are now many awareness and training sessions in evidence. Agenda 21 and Committee 21 do these, but there are also explanations of how sustainable development applies to each kind of job. Today, the National Training Centre for Local Government Employees (CNFPT) has at last taken up this issue and incorporated sustainable development in its training, particularly in Aquitaine where the CNFPT now offers courses which take place in the Aquitaine Region enabling people to get to grips with sustainable development and apprehend what that could involve for them. Training and awareness-raising is no longer sufficient: study trips also need to be organised. Local authorities do organise study trips, but these are often for councillors and Heads of Department. This means there is a whole category of people within internal teams who are excluded from hands-on experience and who could benefit from these study trips to see what sustainable development could represent.

Debates also need to be organised: some local authorities believe that a single person or expert in sustainable development is not enough for awareness to be raised. Councillors and employees need to raise their own awareness, discuss, talk together and explain their vision of sustainable development. For instance, the town council in Rezé near Nantes has organised debates called "local authority employees discuss together". They are establishing their vision of sustainable development together; it is very important for people to establish their own vision of sustainable development. We could come back to the principles supplied by Brundtland at the Earth Summit in Rio, but these really need to find practical application with respect to people's own working practices, aims and objectives.

Ambassadors, i.e. models in terms of sustainable development are necessary, and local authorities are fully aware of this. Within each Department, contact individuals must be appointed so that sustainable development can be applied within each of these Departments.

Councillors have also grasped the importance of belonging to networks. Councillors now participate in sustainable development commissions which form part of local authority networks and networks specialising in sustainable development: this creates a buzz in terms
of sustainable development and also enables people to appropriate it a little better and find out what is being done elsewhere.

However, we are sorry to see that this awareness-raising and training have not yet been implemented long-term. Today, there is an important turnover of councillors and employees within local authorities, so this type of training, awareness-raising and mass mobilisation needs to become a long-term commitment; this has not yet really been done properly at local authority level.

What is more, training and awareness does not always involve an obligation to act. At present, local authorities have grasped the importance of raising awareness. However, they do not always manage to implement sustainable development operationally at an individual level internally. This is despite the fact that there are very straightforward resources such as the Public Contract Code which now make it possible to introduce social and environmental criteria and launch very simple little initiatives such as the use of organic food in catering, fair trade and the use of pesticide-free products in the maintenance of parks and gardens. All this offers ways of performing actions which could gradually change practices and get everybody involved in determining the future of their particular line of work.

Local authorities can also benefit from requests for projects and competitions to suggest practical initiatives. If one of their projects is selected, they can implement it and receive funding for it. The Le Havre City Council organises a competition entitled "Innovation and sustainable development", and Bernard GÉRARD is going to talk to us about that.

**Innovation for Sustainable Development in Le Havre, France**

*by Bernard GÉRARD, Le Havre City Council*

Since 2006, we have organised a competition aimed at council employees on the subject of innovation for sustainable development. The idea is to mobilise all staff internally, irrespective of their category and their role so that they can serve as relays with respect to the general public. One of our aims was to help council workers to receive information, education and training with respect to the various aspects of sustainable development so that they could then relay these to the general public. This involves 3000 council employees, each of whom will have the opportunity of discussing these issues at home.

The idea was to favour projects suggested by employees from different departments and to put together teams which were highly varied in terms of their makeup and background. So, for instance, we mixed up category A, B, and C employees from different sections and Departments.

The contest relates to "sustainable development" with no other specific guidance. Employees are asked to be innovative and to work on aspects and issues which can help the council to get more involved in the field of sustainable development.

The panel of judges is external: we have invited industrial players and other local institutions to serve. Talking in terms of the local area is important because we very quickly realised that this was to do with more than the council itself. The various projects submitted by each of the contestants showed that the council itself represented rather a limited field and that we needed to extend our scope to include the area around the estuary.

Some thirty or so projects are submitted each year and between three and five are chosen. Project sponsors are responsible for carrying out the project if it relates directly to their section or Department, or they may be called upon to check how a project progresses or is implemented if they belong to different sections or Departments.

It is not simply a question of launching projects but also of ensuring that they are followed up. Although they are overseen by individuals, we have also set up monitoring indicators for these projects.
Antoine CHARLOT, Committee 21

Today, there is a lack of assessment which is not related solely to education. People are intimidated by the idea and this puts local authorities off implementing indicators to measure how effective their initiatives are. It is necessary to be able to measure changes in behaviours and practices wherever education and training initiatives take place.

In addition to internal teams, local authorities are increasingly inviting citizens to take their share of responsibility for sustainable development locally. There are an increasing number of resources in this respect with more and more information campaigns, exhibitions and so on. In most cases, the council newsletter includes a section on sustainable development, guides are published and council websites usually have a "sustainable development" section. Local authorities screen films such as Al Gore's. However, it can be seen that mobilisation as a result of these campaigns is sluggish and that it is difficult to invite citizens to act practically in terms of sustainable development.

Moreover, if the surveys investigating the extent to which sustainable development is appropriated by citizens are considered, everybody says they know about sustainable development but if they are asked who has the greatest responsibility to act in terms of sustainable development, they do not identify themselves. They generally say it is the council or the State, and do not consider their own practices on a day-to-day basis.

We need to move from awareness to action. There are some interesting initiatives, particularly with respect to young people; it can be noted that school-based "Agenda 21" initiatives and establishments which have adopted a sustainable development approach constitute one way of moving from simply being aware to what could be termed training-action in which pupils become stakeholders in sustainable development within their own establishment. Particularly in the case of school-based "Agenda 21" initiatives, pupils will be involved in carrying out a diagnosis of their establishment, organising a consultation to define an action plan, implementing this action plan and assessing it.

These school-based "Agenda 21" initiatives therefore represent a way of providing young people with an initial approach enabling them to implement sustainable development practically.

Two initiatives of this type are represented here, firstly the Provence-Alpes-Côte-d'Azur region which is presently supporting and encouraging upper secondary schools to implement "Agenda 21" initiatives. I would like to hand over to Annick DELHAYE, Vice-Chair of the Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur (PACA) region with responsibility for sustainable development.

ESD in the Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur (PACA) region, France
by Annick DELHAYE, Vice-chair, PACA Region

I am responsible for sustainable development in the Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur (PACA) region, but the upper-secondary-school "Agenda 21" initiatives are under the responsibility of more than one department, that of sustainable development and that of a colleague who is Vice-Chair with responsibility for upper secondary schools. We are therefore jointly responsible for these school-based "Agenda 21" initiatives.

The Region launched a request for projects from its 183 upper secondary schools and last year chose nine of these for an experimental implementation of the "Agenda 21" initiative within upper secondary schools. The aim really is for the entire educational community to become involved in sustainable development within its own establishment. So for instance, the diagnosis of the establishment in terms of sustainable development is carried out jointly by pupils and the teaching staff. This diagnosis, which must be jointly adopted, then leads to an action plan which must be implemented. For instance, this action plan could involve organic catering. Within our region, 56 upper secondary schools now serve organic catering once a month - no more than that simply because organic producers cannot supply any more than that.
The action plan might also concern the issue of energy, which is often the number one field cited in the suggested action plans. Transport and the way that pupils come to school are other major concerns which come up. The schools choose their action plan and we help them to implement this.

In schools as in other institutions we have increasing time constraints. As a result, to help the schools implement this diagnosis and put together an action plan, we provide them with project management assistance.

Our desire was to establish a method with these various experimental school sites in order to extend this subsequently to all upper secondary schools.

This year, we have 10 new upper secondary schools and an Apprenticeship Training Centre (CFA) since regions also have responsibility for apprentices: this gives us a total of 19 upper secondary schools and a CFA to take this experimentation further and ensure that the methods developed for the first nine schools can indeed be extended to all other upper secondary schools.

A school's action programme is put together step-by-step with the project management assistance and the two regional education authorities, Nice and Aix-Marseille.

➤ Agenda 21 in Gironde Département, France

*by Julie CHABAUD, Agenda 21 Officer, Gironde Département Council*

In the "Agenda 21" initiative launched by the Gironde Département Council, the need to involve new stakeholders as part of this initiative quickly became clear. We therefore launched a request for projects for other local authorities. Initially, we supported 25 local authorities. At present, 36 local authorities in the Gironde at every level (municipalities, district councils, local area authorities, départements, the Region and the Bordeaux Metropolitan District) have their own "Agenda 21" initiatives.

The issue of education quickly came to the fore, particularly with regard to schools. The Bordeaux Metropolitan District got involved in school-based "Agenda 21" initiatives. The Region started to look at "Agenda 21" initiatives in upper secondary schools and the Département Council issued a request for projects for lower secondary school "Agenda 21" initiatives. Together, we drew up a common framework document for school-based "Agenda 21" initiatives in partnership with the Department of Education and the ADEME with the idea of an educational continuum, in other words the idea that pupils moving from a primary school to a lower secondary school which both had "Agenda 21" initiatives would be up to speed on the subject. The same applies to upper secondary schools and now even to universities.

As part of the coordination between local authorities, we have also set up what we call a network "Agenda 21" for things with which we are all concerned but which are not to be particular preserve of one level of local government. This applies, for instance, to eco-construction and public contracts.

As part of this network "Agenda 21", we have developed an aspect relating to education for sustainable development which has involved six initiatives being validated for 2008:

In drawing up a list of education for sustainable development stakeholders, we decided not to target any specific constituencies so we sent out a questionnaire with the following questions: Do you feel concerned by the issue of education for sustainable development? In what way do you feel concerned? What sort of needs would you have?

Following this, we set up a three-way co-operative agreement between the Bordeaux Metropolitan District, the Département Council and the Region in order to establish this educational continuum which includes things which are also in the network "Agenda 21" such as the deployment of a Département Committee for "Agenda 21" schools, the
implementation of training cycles for non-profit associations working with "Agenda 21" schools and the launch of a request for projects for "Agenda 21" initiatives for social centres and out-of-school activity centres. Education for sustainable development is not simply confined to academic contexts: we are also involved with respect to extracurricular and out-of-school activities as well as family-based "Agenda 21" initiatives. Another aspect is the development of a practical guide for "Agenda 21" initiatives for social and other activity structures. This is because the little survey which we carried out indicated that social centres and local community centres needed this kind of help.

We have a very good partnership with the Department of Education. Our principal objective at the local level is to encourage others to do likewise and demonstrate that these approaches are worthwhile, as well as sharing a common culture. It would be a shame if everybody went off and devised their own individual form of sustainable development. I find it somewhat confusing to see E3D at the level of the Department of Education, the latter seemed to have pulled up the drawbridge and want to invent their own reference document for the same thing as Agenda 21. What is the point of inventing E3D? I really don't think it's helpful.

Annick DELHAYE, PACA Region

The idea of an educational continuum in terms of education for sustainable development represents a new form of governance for the local development of environmental education for sustainable development. Since 2004, all ESD stakeholders in the Provence-Alpes-Côte-d'Azur Region have decided to get together in an overall, collective approach with respect to information, raising awareness, communication and education for sustainable development for all, of all ages, throughout life and in every sphere be it public, private or professional.

We have brought together the two regional education authorities, the ADEME, the Water Agency, the six départements, the Department of Youth and Sport, the Regional Department of Agriculture and Forestry and the PACA Region. For three years now, these various stakeholders have got together to co-construct and implement a regional strategy for education for sustainable development. Last June, this group presented a joint guidance document which it is now up to each stakeholder to appropriate at their local level.

Antoine CHARLOT, Committee 21

In conclusion, local authorities also need to train, mobilise and raise awareness of local socio-economic stakeholders. This is probably the hardest part because there is still a genuine barrier in terms of language and habit between the public and private sectors which hinders partnerships between these two worlds.

Nevertheless, some local authorities have set up training and networks to encourage SMEs and SMIs to modernise their offer by gradually incorporating sustainable development, particularly with respect to responsible purchasing. Indeed, local authorities are increasingly incorporating criteria provided for in the Public Contract Code, but local SMEs and SMIs are not capable of fulfilling these criteria. This means, for instance, that you can have a tender for organic food supplied from the Netherlands or Germany.

Today, the Nord Pas-de-Calais Region has set up a responsible purchasing platform to promote convergence between the expectations of local authorities and offers from local SMEs and SMIs. The Pays-de-la-Loire has been training a number of companies in eco-design. However, these initiatives are still somewhat limited in scope and it can be seen, particularly as regards professional training, that Regions are finding it difficult to incorporate sustainable development in their professional training despite the fact that this is a regional competency - even Regions which are involved in an "Agenda 21" approach.

Another response by local authorities is to organise partner committees as part of "Agenda 21" initiatives which enable these partners to directly address aims which form part of the local strategy. This is something new, making it possible to transition gradually from a local-
authority based "Agenda 21" initiative to a local "Agenda 21" initiative in which everyone is involved in meeting the common objectives of the latter.

**Bernard GÉRARD, Le Havre City Council**

It appears to be quite natural to join forces with partners from industry, institutions, the Le Havre Port Authority and the University for major projects such as the Centre for the Sea and Sustainable Development, "Odyssee 21", for which I am Project Manager. Mobilisation is also easy if international meetings are organised for sustainable development of maritime and port activities: we have annual events which bring together between 300 and 350 people to deal with topics as complex as CO2 capture, for instance. It is not at all difficult to find institutional partners who will respond highly positively to this type of project. Taking part in local activities forms part of their development strategy.

We have realised that there was no reason to hesitate to invite them to take part in other projects such as the "Innovation for Sustainable Development" competition. They are actively involved in this and this is very encouraging for the project sponsors and participants.

In all these projects which contribute to implementing a local virtuous circle of sustainable development, we had discussions with all of these partners in the search for solutions.

In a few weeks, we will be having our own "Grenelle summit" for the Estuary. The City Council is no longer adequate for this, we feel somewhat restricted, and today the area of the estuary seems to be much more credible as a vehicle for major issues of sustainable development. The idea of this "Grenelle summit" for the Estuary is to create a major forum for debate and to seek solutions to problems we are encountering in this area at present in terms of sustainable development.

**Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes**

The term "Agenda 21", which has often been mentioned during this first assessment, is one which does not exist in the world of business, except for one or two companies who are close to the public sector. Even for such a basic term referring to the practical implementation of a sustainable development approach, it is clear that there is a language divide between the private sector and the world of local authorities.

**Assessment of "Company" aspect**

*by Olivier CLASSIOT*

*"Des Enjeux et des Hommes"*

For this assessment, I would like to call on three witnesses from the world of business: Pierre Erik Andrianarisoa, representing the Caisse d'Epargne, Daniel Catzaras, representing La Poste, and Jean-Pierre Mongendre, representing La Lyonnaise des Eaux.

"Des Enjeux et des Hommes" is a consultancy which assists companies in awareness-raising and training of their staff. We have had the privilege of assisting 50 or so French companies over the last five years and training several thousands of employees, either directly or via intermediaries, which has helped us to form an initial impression of what is happening in companies.

We have done some more work in order to prepare this assessment by sending out a questionnaire to which a number of companies have replied. We have looked at their "sustainable development" reports if they have published one, looked at what they said on their website and on any other media that they may have used. We have then been fortunate enough to have some of them agree to be interviewed by us in order for us to establish what they had really done over the last five years and find out what their position was today.

2007 was a turning point; a year in which the general public became aware of a number of issues thanks to Al Gore's film and the French presidential election campaign, and this was tangible in the people we were dealing with in training courses. Things have changed in
terms of people's level of familiarity with the subjects, although this does not necessarily entail being able to sort through the various issues and understand how they fit together.

In companies, 2007 and 2008 have been years of implementation. The idea has been to attempt to be practical and to go as far as possible in this direction.

The first item in this assessment relates to awareness. To make sure we are all speaking the same language, when we talk about "awareness" we mean an action of which the aim is to make people aware of something. "If I am thinking in terms of my job and changing my professional practices and behaviour, I am thinking more in terms of training than of awareness".

With respect to this first subject, awareness, it can be said that the perimeter is expanding.

In the first place, we have moved from dealing with specialists to dealing with all staff. We are no longer training or educating only Health, Quality and Security managers with respect to sustainable development. Over the last few years, there have been a number of initiatives in this direction.

Secondly, we have moved from being a highly specialist subject - the environment or social issues, depending on the company involved - to an approach which is designed to be much broader and take in the three dimensions of sustainable development. It is useless to raise awareness massively with respect to a subject if people do not understand the interactions and interdependencies between the social and environmental spheres. The example of biofuels clearly illustrates that if a problem is examined without including all the issues, the solution may be defective. This has involved a shift from a single-issue approach to a more cross-disciplinary one.

Thirdly, within this broad perimeter, we have moved from one-off initiatives to a continuous thread. Of course, we still have "five minutes for the planet", "Earth Day", "sustainable development week" and so on, but what do we do the rest of the year round? The issue for companies has been to move, over the last few years, from a wave of one-off awareness-raising initiatives in which rather generic concepts were explained, to a longer-term approach which has leveraged a large number of existing resources such as internal newsletters and company websites as well as awareness-raising events throughout the year.

There has also been a major change in terms of staff involvement. Awareness-raising has shifted from a passive experience in which "people who know more about this than I do explain to me that I have something to understand" to a more commitment-based approach. I would like to take the example of La Poste whose representative is here with us, but I encourage you to go and chat with the people from Monoprix who have a stand here and have also done a lot in this field. I'm going to hand over to Daniel Catzaras for him to say a few words about the initiative carried out by La Poste with respect to fairtrade cotton and ask him to explain how employees at La Poste were mobilised and what sort of results this produced.

Daniel CATZARAS, La Poste

At La Poste, we carried out a project relating to postal delivery workers' uniforms. This is an important aspect of the job because postmen work in all weathers and this means that clothing with a certain number of characteristics is required. What is more, it is a significant vehicle for our corporate image.

We were very cautious in how we approached this area. We began by carrying out experiments with clothes, asking some of our female postal delivery workers to test out a number of uniforms. We have a range of 10 or so garments (trousers, skirts, jackets and shirts).

These initial tests were positive, so we decided to deploy these garments for all our delivery workers. We have 100,000 postmen, so this very quickly added up to a large quantity of
fairtrade cotton being purchased. Our operator bought some 310 tonnes of fairtrade cotton, the equivalent of 350,000 garments. We generally aim for about three changes of uniform per postman per year, which represents 11% in this field at a national level.

This highly interesting approach went down very well with staff, all the more so in that it was an opportunity to harmonise post office uniforms across the country; in the past, there was quite a degree of diversity.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

What is interesting in this example is that the female postmen had the option of choosing whether or not they wanted to use fairtrade products. This was a genuine choice because it led to a slight difference in how many garments they would be entitled to in their professional wardrobe for each year.

I wanted to take this example to illustrate how employees can be involved in a professional decision which they have fully grasped and with a practical outcome.

The second part of the assessment with respect to companies is very important and mirrors what has been said about local authorities.

Companies have understood that it was important for them to place sustainable development at the heart of the business and that "doing a bit of sustainable development" (and thus awareness-raising, education and training) alongside their core business was pointless because as soon as there was a change in priority or a particular tension, things relegated to the margins were very quickly abandoned.

Placing sustainable development at the heart of a company’s business means that sustainable development has to form part of the corporate strategy of the firm and its core business itself. While there is merit in acts of greenness and things that anyone can do irrespective of their profession, it is equally if not more important to see how people in a specific job can apply sustainable development practically in this. In this respect, a buyer is not going to be doing the same sort of thing as somebody doing marketing or somebody researching prospects.

Over the last few years, companies have continued to raise awareness, and this has progressed, and they have also begun something new which is staff training. Employees need to be trained in sustainable development in order to be capable of putting this into practice in their profession. This is a training-action process; employees have grasped a certain number of things, and during this phase of education for sustainable development they practise how to implement them in their day-to-day actions, i.e. their professional practice.

What is more, we have moved into a system in which action plans will be created to address these issues. This will mean greater involvement on the part of employees, which has engendered new initiatives, for instance an innovations system and a suggestions box which has been used to invite employees to say what could be done to progress with respect to sustainable development in their specific job.

The best specialist in the business is the person doing that job in their company and in their particular field. This is all a very long way from the higher echelons of Departments for Sustainable Development but more practical, as we examine what everyone can do at their level. Ideas gathered in this way are then turned into practical action plans.

Another important aspect of this change is that we are now in an innovation-based approach. Until now, sustainable development has entered companies via continuous improvement procedures. Today, the issues are such that we need to do things differently. This involves asking employees to demonstrate creativity, and also work with other people, including people from outside the company, with the chief aim of placing sustainable development at the heart of a business.
At La Lyonnaise des Eaux, we have been working in partnership with local authorities for 125 years. We have 40 million customers and are responsible for managing water services, wastewater treatment and more generally, the management of natural environments, which indicates how important our corporate responsibility is.

We have been raising awareness with respect to sustainable development as part of our business for many years by raising the awareness of our customers, the general public (water classes and open days). In 2006, when we launched our Sustainable Development Charter, which forms an integral part of our managerial process, we wanted to launch a sustainable development awareness programme for all of our 8000 employees, not just the managers.

As training has progressed, we have moved from fairly general awareness-raising to genuine training, practical outworkings in professional practices and very concrete applications. This took place using the suggestion box system. Any employee, irrespective of the part they play in the company, has been able to suggest actions and implement them on a day-to-day basis, as well as suggest disruptive innovations relating to our offer to local authorities.

Four years ago, talking in terms of a carbon balance and the impact of a business on climate change was something almost unheard-of. Today, offering a carbon balance or assessment of greenhouse gas emissions as part of the contracts we offer is quite normal. This shows that there have indeed been practical outworkings of sustainable development in our business, innovation in our offers and significant changes in behaviours. One of the first initiatives we were keen to implement related to reducing greenhouse gas emissions from our vehicles. Vehicles belonging to La Lyonnaise des Eaux may not make up a large proportion of all cars on the road, but we believe that no contribution or saving is too small when it comes to assessing greenhouse gas emissions. This action had a direct impact on the two-thirds of our employees who use company vehicles.

This initiative helps us to implement our offer and adjust it to a changing context, demand from local authorities and demand at the level of individual customers. Water forms a significant part of local authority-based "Agenda 21" initiatives.

There are also a large number of "acts of greenness" which should not be looked down on. The fact is that for our 8000 employees, practising a high-flying form of sustainable development would have been in danger of having an adverse effect, with most people feeling this approach was over the top of their heads or too long-term, with no real idea of what to do on a daily basis. "What am I doing for sustainable development as an individual and as an employee of any responsible company?" is the question which must be answered.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

There is a world of difference between this example from La Lyonnaise des Eaux and simply getting all your employees together to watch An Inconvenient Truth. It is much more complicated to change the way business is done and apply what sustainable development means to each of these businesses.

The third aspect of this assessment relates to the professionalisation of team mobilisation, which involves three things.

First of all, Departments of Sustainable Development have found it increasingly easier to access top management. If you look back at history, the Sustainable Development Officer often answered to the Department of Communications, which was a clear demonstration that the issue was basically one of image and that the job consisted of talking to ranking agencies and about socially responsible investment. Today, for Sustainable Development Managers to use their leverage and get things moving internally, they need to be able to interact with other senior managers. This changes both questions of line management and issues of profile, because the need is for somebody who is capable of interacting with the
senior managers from other aspects of the business. An increasing amount of cross-disciplinary functioning can therefore be observed, as can the importance attached to those responsible for internal initiatives.

Secondly, things are becoming more structured. Just as an "Agenda 21" initiative is structured within an establishment, companies have created methods resources to enable them to state exactly what doing sustainable development means, particularly with respect to their specific work. This began mostly with industrial firms and then expanded to other fields. This has led to reference documents being put out which explain practically what sustainable development within various aspects of business means, describe actual practices and sometimes even enable those involved to carry out self-assessment of their performance as regards sustainable development.

This professionalisation therefore includes methods and practical tools enabling companies to know where they are at, compare one industrial site to another and carry out compilations for an entire nation or business unit within a given group. A single group may involve a number of different businesses, so it is interesting for there to be some degree of visibility in this respect.

Lastly, the third point is of particular interest to us today. This is because this professionalisation involves using relay people. Having between 2 and 12 people in the Sustainable Development Department is not enough. For a company whose workforce may run into the hundreds of thousands worldwide, you need to be able to rely on people who will relay the message on the ground. You need to be able to train these people and equip them: it is the professionalisation of these people which is on the agenda and which companies are currently looking at today.

I would like to call on the Caisse d'Épargne to share their experience. They have an approach known as "Bénéfice futur" ("future benefits") and I would like to ask Pierre-Erik ANDRIANARISOA to say a few words about the way that these contact people on the ground are prepared and trained.

Pierre-Erik ANDRIANARISOA, Caisse d'Épargne

One’s first instinct might be that a bank does not pollute very much. It produces accounts and income statements, and one could ask oneself what sustainable development might involve for a bank.

Everything which has just been said is particularly relevant to this. We have moved from raising awareness to application in business lines. Should a bank be promoting green funding or energy efficiency? Should a bank be involved in combating exclusion from banking services? Should a bank be helping people make their savings meaningful? Should a bank be supporting local solidarity initiatives, particularly if it is a local bank like the Caisse d’Épargne, which has 14,000 branches?

What is more, this bank is regionalised: there are 17 different Caisse d’Épargne regional banks in France and they are all autonomous. At the national level, we play a supporting and mobilising role, with a sustainable development officer in each of these 17 regional banks. Their role is to feed back information and extremely practical data, because we are committed to carrying out a carbon balance. To carry out this balance we need highly technical data which needs to be fed back, consolidated and harmonised in order to monitor whether we are achieving our objectives in terms of reducing our CO2 emissions. We are committed to reducing our CO2 emissions by 3% per year: if we continue to do so, by 2050, they will have been reduced by a factor of four.

So we have these women and men relaying information to us, and we get them together three or four times a year to give them information from head office, across-the-board information on what is going on in general (benchmarking information).
These sustainable development officers are a kind of compass for us. They are involved in the "Bénéfice futur" programme, which is based around four core components:

1. Action against climate change, with the awareness that most of a bank's CO2 emissions are indirect. Most of these emissions are the result of funding provided by banks. Their direct emissions relate only to transport and buildings. This is only a small part, but it is important for staff to be mobilised internally as well.

2. The development of socially responsible investment, which means offering products which have been selected by ranking agencies using criteria other than financial criteria, such as Vigéo, one of the better-known players who we work with. This enables investors to know that they are investing in companies which have an appropriate corporate social responsibility policy.

3. Modernising our role as a socially-aware bank: this relates particularly to philanthropy.

4. Promoting responsible marketing, which relates the most directly to our business. This involves labelling our products: in this respect, we are quite advanced because there is no other example of this in Europe. Each time we launch a financial product or offer one to our customers, this product has to be labelled according to the degree of financial risk involved. If we had done this 10 years ago, we would not be where we are today. In addition, this involves measuring whether the companies in which we have invested have an appropriate corporate social responsibility policy and whether our products emit large quantities of CO2.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

How are these relay people prepared? How are they trained? Is there a training module for somebody who is about to become one of these contact people?

Pierre-Erik ANDRIANARISOA, Caisse d’Épargne

We have an e-learning module, software which brings together 50 or so common questions relating to sustainable development. The relays are employees and they then pass on information to their local Caisse d’Épargne.

To give you a figure, counting the sustainable development offices in our banks and those of our subsidiaries, in total we have 45 sustainable development officers. Each of them is responsible for passing on the contents of this e-learning: about 12 to 15% of all staff in the Caisse d’Épargne branch have received the benefit of this.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

As regards the outside world, local authorities, associations and government clearly have a responsibility for raising individual awareness, but businesses also have a role to play. What has changed? Where do things stand today? We have progressed from citizenship education on broad themes during which companies have been involved in educating the general public, sometimes in partnership with non-profit groups, sometimes because the State has launched a campaign through the offices of the ADEME, to something different.

Today, precisely because companies are attempting to implement sustainable development within their own business and therefore in the products and services they are supplying, these products and services are becoming vehicles for this education and training. Companies want consumers to choose their products because they have better performance in terms of sustainable development, not simply for the customer to realise the planet is in trouble and then go and buy the competitor's product.

This is what some companies are working on at present. I am sure you have heard about the initiatives under way in retail distribution regarding the labelling of consumer goods. We have just discussed something similar for financial products with the Caisse d’Epargne who are clearly leading the way in this respect. The idea is to provide some simple points of reference, which is not easy because there is a wide variety of labels, lots of information,…
In addition, with respect to staff training, it will be necessary for staff to serve as the basis for interaction with the public (customers, users etc). Employees thus become ambassadors for their company and the same questions as for internal relays apply.

How can staff be trained? How can they be helped to be capable of fulfilling this role properly? I often use the example of a supermarket checkout girl. Either she is not capable of explaining what the issue relating to disposable bags is or she is capable of explaining it and responding to any objections customers may have. This means that she is more than a checkout girl, she has become an ambassador for the company's approach: it is clear how much of an impact this could have internally.

So we have reviewed the situation with respect to internal and external audiences. What sort of limits have we been able to observe? Firstly, in order for this education to be effective, there must not be any inconsistencies. If the Senior Management of a company does not state that this is important, essential and at the heart of a business, it will be seen as something secondary which employees will do only when they have time for it. The support of Senior Management and a consistent message are therefore very important. Secondly, there is the issue of measurement. Today, we are not really capable of measuring the impact of an awareness campaign or training. What use was it? Was it useful? We need to create measurement tools: work is currently underway in this respect. We have already discussed the training of relays, but who qualifies as a relay? How can somebody be qualified to take on this role as a contact person? Having technical knowledge of the subject is not enough, they also need to know how to bring it to life. How can people be prepared to play this sort of role? Lastly, as to awareness and education today, we can no longer afford to train people separately, even within a single company. For instance, in order for eco-design and the training which we will be implementing to have a concrete impact in a company, it is vital that different business lines are addressed together, sometimes along with the upstream suppliers, too.

This is a new approach to training because you are not dealing just with specialists. I would like to conclude there for this assessment of companies and thank our contributors, who we will be giving time to later so that they can tell us about their approaches in more detail.

Assessment with respect to society at large and ESD
by Roland GÉRARD
CFEESD

The CFEESD (French Collective for Environmental education for sustainable development) is a non-profit Association which was registered in 2002. Prior to that, in 2000 it had already organised a first conference on education with respect to the environment in Lille which led to a national action plan, as well as the second International Francophone Forum on Environmental education which took place at UNESCO in 2001. This collective brings together non-profit entities, trade unions and a whole diversity of associations (environmental education, conservation of nature, land management, mass education, parents associations, regional natural parks and sporting bodies) as well as trade unions from the world of education.

The ambition of the CFEDD is to set up a legitimate, representative platform in order for civic society to have a structured message, agree on a number of issues and play to the full its role in the ongoing relationship between the four spheres of stakeholders: the State, businesses, local authorities and civic society.

To carry out this assessment, we have based ourselves on a survey, even if mobilising all stakeholders is not easy. We have not had much feedback because these stakeholders do not have time and are very busy with other things. Within associations, people are thinking more in terms of laying staff off rather than recruiting even if there is more work to be done in terms of social demand.
We have also drawn on a meeting of the 19 local networks (département networks, GRAINE networks and ARIENA in Alsace, REB in Brittany and Ecole et Nature) which took place in October. This was an opportunity to interview some 30 stakeholders about leveraging opportunities and hindrances as regards education for sustainable development.

The Decade has not provided as much impetus as had been expected. Who today is capable of affirming that more individuals are concerned by ESD? That is the grassroots feeling, which would be worth checking, and I would be delighted if an observation mission could actually be launched in liaison with those localities which have already begun such observational studies.

Local dynamics are taken into consideration at a national level far less than they could be. I would like to present the regional plans from French Guyana, Brittany, the Pays de la Loire region and the PACA region as well as the Languedoc-Roussillon regional framework agreement. In these areas, many things have been achieved but we have the feeling that little attention is paid to this at a national level in terms of civic society.

As to the question of consistency, we are faced with a deluge of declarations and texts even as we are being confronted with cuts in the resources allocated to those acting on the ground. Not only do they not have any resources, they have to put up with declarations which lead people to believe that everything is fine.

Today, civic society has been left waiting and its assessment is not encouraging. Associations involved in environmental education for sustainable development are in serious difficulty because funding is insufficient and very late in arriving. For instance, the French Collective for Environmental education has had no guarantees as to its funding for 2008 from the Ministry of Ecology.

Some young people wanted to work in ESD but there is no professional training track in this field in France. The BEATEP training with a specialisation in the environment had existed for over 10 years, showed a great deal of promise, and was halted overnight with no consultation with grass-roots stakeholders. Elsewhere, there are attempts to set up professional degrees in universities, but none have seen the light of day so far.

In terms of public contracts, ESD is currently a disaster. Associations are not familiar with the mechanisms of calls for tender and how to respond to them. In addition, this brings associations into competition with one another and distorts projects relating to environmental education because the result of these calls for tender is that education is becoming a commodity.

For now, we do not have a national action plan which is universally recognized. We have observed that people who talk about environmental education for sustainable development are mentioning nature less and less.

The same is true of practices, and the extent to which these practices are educational is thus questionable. Does this not signal something which is more about style than substance? It would be far better to promote in-depth educational work on the ground. Grassroots work has become difficult, particularly with respect to security. It is true that there have been many tragedies, but that is not the whole story.

Grassroots practices have been hampered by many obstacles. I will not take time to list them all here, but reiterate that active teaching methods are not encouraged. Are we at a historic turning point? Are we not in the process of straying away from traceability? This is a serious question which I would like to submit to you. We feel that there has been a loss of clarity in what we are to do. If we want the younger generation to be committed, clarity is important. Are we still seeking for a better relationship with nature? Are we still looking for responsible contributions from all?

We are faced with major paradoxes with, on the one hand, a lack of resources and a preoccupying financial situation, a disparate and endangered non-profit association...
environment because larger organisations are taking over and on the other, stronger social demand. Today, people are awaiting practical action and want things to happen in this field. Grass-roots stakeholders have observed that if the local political climate is favourable and a dialogue can be set up, things progress, and that is really what all the stakeholders are waiting for.

The Department of Education frequently comes up, particularly its lack of resources. In addition, we have observed reticence with respect to non-profit stakeholders, with some Education Inspectors barring stakeholders from doing work in schools. Furthermore, having an education-based policy seems to be harmful to a project-based culture. We currently have the impression that access via a specific subject is in favour, whereas we continue to believe that the right approach is a cross-disciplinary access coupled with action, projects and active pedagogy.

Meanwhile, stakeholders also think that something is taking off with what the Department of Education is implementing with the school-based "Agenda 21" initiatives, with groups of partners getting together around the issue of schools which have adopted a sustainable development approach, and this is something which we think is very promising.

It should be noted that ESD is positioned on new fields: responsible consumption, health and so on. The issue of measures to aid employment remains unresolved. The way the recent youth employment scheme was dealt with has been a catastrophe and given rise to considerable stress in non-profit organisations. It is difficult for associations to act as employers because today jobs need to be cut and we are not employment professionals.

We have also emphasised economic difficulties, price competition and the varying degrees of professionalisation. In these respects, local stakeholders feel that quality reference documents are a solution. We feel that co-operation and working together are under threat. If associations are brought into competition with each other through calls for tender, they will no longer pool resources, share or advise one another.

On the other hand, we have this strong networking culture. It is in our DNA, with 30 years of history. While some may talk for hours about networks without ever using the word "share", we cannot identify with such an attitude.

In addition, there needs to be a policy message because this is significantly lacking at the local level. The people concerned are people of action and carry out action with children, adults, in out-of-school activity centres and in training courses. They are educators, so they do not always see things in enough context to be able to see the power plays at work. At both national and local levels, there is an absence of policy regarding environmental education for sustainable development.

There is a lack of recognition and intelligibility. When stakeholders portray things in terms of images, it is very interesting to see how successful this is. At the moment, there is a terrible conflict between what is visible and what is real: image is in the process of beating reality hands down. If the people who actually do things cannot make them visible, they will disappear. On the positive side, when the context is favourable, things work well. This does not hinge only on having the right politician but also on a good fabric. The approach must be a concerted one in a culture of complexity.

Associations are now focusing on their educational project. Since they have been brought into competition with one another, they are focusing down on their projects and looking even more closely at what individual meaning and commitment involves. It is vital for relationships between associations and state bodies to be developed. Non-profit stakeholders are convinced that government has a role to play in all this, because they are fundamentally citizens of the Republic.

The employment of project workers by local authorities is sometimes difficult for association workers if there has not been any prior discussion. Local authority teams do remarkable work.
and involved with local associations, but some municipalities go on to hire staff, which kills off the non-profit dynamic.

I have a little joke which is that we now need people who speak two languages. When you are on the ground, if you are talking in terms of visiting farms, fields and meadows and getting into contact with people, you have to talk "present". But now, you also need to know how to talk politics. Little by little, people who manage to speak both these languages and yet say the same thing may be able to move things forward.

In addition, there is a need for framework agreements, charters, and action plans at the regional, *département* and national level.

There are extraordinary collective dynamics. For instance, the Basse-Normandie Collective is currently organising next year's national conference and it's great to see the enthusiasm of businesses, local authorities, non-profit associations and government departments. This is the case in many areas, so there is hope. There is genuine creativity in the world of non-profit associations and new things are emerging which deserve to be better known and to obtain the resources required to have the kind of visibility I was talking about earlier.

In conclusion, education for sustainable development which is based on a grassroots practice is a key approach.

**Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes**

*In the first two presentations, we have heard that things are moving, and that for both local authorities and businesses there is a lot in common in terms of the problems encountered and the solutions implemented. We have heard about reference documents, training relays and so on. What is interesting in what we have just heard is that the question is to know how we can get organised to respond to this, share out the work to be done and the resources which can be allocated for this, irrespective of the means and procedures.*

*A few years ago, companies thought that they had sufficiently raised the awareness of their staff by putting a page of information on their intranet or handing out a brochure.*

*What does raising awareness mean? As Roland Gérard said, whatever the procedures and pedagogy, the question is how can we educate people such that we can talk in terms of a "before" and "after" change: these are the real issues when it comes to considering environmental education for sustainable development.*

*The last presentation raises an important question as to what government and government ministries are doing. For this final assessment, I am going to hand over to Jacques BREGEON who chaired the inter-ministry working party on ESD and who will be giving us a summary of this work.*

**Assessment of the work of the State with respect to ESD**

_by Jacques BREGEON_  
CHEEDD

*I would like to remind you that although it fell to me to chair this inter-ministry working party, I myself am not a civil servant. I am a committed citizen who, over a number of years, has developed a number of initiatives in the field of education for sustainable development, directed particularly at managers and future managers via the College of Higher Education for the Environment and Sustainable Development, the Ecole Centrale and the Conference of Higher Training Institutes.*

*I would also like to remind you of the extent of these issues. They are colossal, and require us to get organised to prepare for profound changes in society. The ultimate aim of the Grenelle bill is to promote and dynamise society into change towards a society of sustainable development. It is clear that education plays a primary role in this shift. Faced with these global challenges (climate, biodiversity, energy, demographics and food security) we have spent the last 30 years putting together as coherent a response as possible which has*
become known as sustainable development. Faced with these issues, society is confronted with the challenges of sustainable development, the first of which is education.

Time is of the essence in this matter, because major aspects of the problem are changing at a phenomenal speed - climate issues and biodiversity, for example. Social processes need to be thoroughly dynamised and we need to completely rethink the way our society is structured if we are to be quick and effective. The processes which characterise the world of education must be sidelined. We no longer have the time to wait for processes begun decades ago to produce their effects. Society needs to be roused.

What is more, in spite of the progress which has been observed in companies and government departments, this is only a tiny part of the picture. We must not allow our vision of society and its progress to be distorted by the restricted world with which we are familiar such that we view society through this filter. The reality is that a considerable amount of training and awareness needs to be produced and that efforts to this end must be as effective as possible.

At the end of the roundtable discussions at the Grenelle Summit in summer 2007, it could be seen that despite the fact that little was said about education, the ministries in question sought to set up a working party to see what kind of practical application of the Grenelle Summit there could be in the field of education. As a result of this, some 80 people put in a lot of work between November and January to produce a report at the end of January 2008. This involved cataloguing actions which were as practical as possible in order to implement the Grenelle summit within the field of education, taking into account everything which was already being done. Another aspect is that this related solely to the sphere of education and not society as a whole, although education for sustainable development is a matter of civic education which concerns everybody. As well as through school, this education takes place through channels such as the media in general and families. As a result, we cannot restrict education for sustainable development solely to the sphere of academic education. Our first recommendation was therefore to ask the government to set up an operational committee for awareness and communication, particularly with respect to the media. This became a reality during the month of July with the setting up of a symposium no. 34. With respect to this, I would like to remind you that the educational charter which forms the common basis for knowledge and skills incorporates the dimension of sustainable development at the highest level: understanding of the issues and cultures, the need to be aware of human rights, the need for development and protection of the environment and so on. Despite all this, there may be some discrepancies between what is said and what is done.

We have structured proposals on the basis of principles. The first principle has been to say that education for sustainable development is the HR policy of the national sustainable development strategy, something which has been somewhat forgotten. In 2003, when the sustainable development strategy was implemented, we forgot the HR dimension, despite the fact that all strategy should begin with HR. Secondly, in terms of education for sustainable development, we have moved from the experimental phase which prevailed during the absence of the State, to a new phase of generalisation via integration and partnership: the Department of Education and other ministries with responsibilities relating to education have also expressed a desire to be integrated, changing both the nature and scale of these issues. Another principle is that things should be progressed through a sustainable development approach.

Several of us would prefer this initiative, dubbed E3D ("establishment involved in a sustainable development approach") to be known as a "School-based Agenda 21" because this is better understood by the general public. Given that there is a degree of urgency, the public should not be confused by terminology which can only be understood by the initiated. We need to have more maturity in terms of communication and clarity; I believe that "Agenda 21" is the most comprehensible way of referring to a sustainable development strategy. This Agenda 21 approach must be a vehicle for sustainable development to be taken into account.
both in terms of teaching content and in terms of practices and lifestyles within establishments which thereby become sustainable development laboratories.

The pedagogical aspect is achieved through incorporation into specific disciplines; we believe it is necessary for all teachers, irrespective of their discipline, to make the effort to understand sustainable development and how it relates to their particular subject. This also involves devoting time and space to multidisciplinary approaches, something which is somewhat lacking today. The third dimension in this pedagogical integration is partnership with stakeholders, as enabled by Agenda 21 approaches. Non-profit associations have worked hard and in-depth for decades on a mission which was and continues to be that of education for sustainable development. Roland Gérard emphasised the need to remain close to nature and maintain contact with nature. However, it should not be forgotten that we have moved from talking in terms of the environment to talking in terms of sustainable development. Sustainable development is a philosophy for action, a new way of thinking and acting which incorporates the sphere of the environment but which sees the environment in the new light of sustainable development.

The specialist non-profit movements therefore need to adjust to this new context and transition from the environment to sustainable development and address a different kind of audience. The question is: who will train the one million teachers in state education? Clearly, it will be possible to mobilise the internal resources of the Department, which are of excellent quality, for instance the National Centres for Teaching Resources (CNDP) and the Virtual University for the Environment and Sustainable Development (UVEDD). We have pedagogical agencies, organisations and materials available to support this movement, but much more will be needed, particularly in terms of training trainers. However, teachers should not wait for their superiors to invite them to take part in training sessions relating to sustainable development. Whether we are talking about the Department of Education or any other organisation in France, given the extent of the issues and their urgency and the fact that we are not only citizens but also responsible individuals and parents too, the future generations we are concerned with are our children first and foremost. The major problems faced by society are those being raised today; the next decade and those immediately following it will be determining in this respect. As responsible individuals there can be no question of us waiting around for our employers to get around to scheduling some continuous training for us: we need to make the effort ourselves. As teachers, we have perhaps a further responsibility or duty to do this. Institutions may provide a framework and resources, particularly effective material resources, but it is up to us as citizens to get mobilised.

In terms of funding and support for stakeholders, we have also proposed the creation of a foundation for education for sustainable development. This idea has been taken up by the Minister for Education who, on October 8, 2008, stated that "education for sustainable development will be incorporated in the reform of upper secondary schools; training courses will be developed, particularly in professional training, for activities which are as close to actual practice as possible in order for these activities to incorporate sustainable development; a national charter, applicable to all establishments, will be proposed so that the latter can incorporate sustainable development processes in their functions, particularly as regards purchasing, catering and transport; teachers will be formed using modern resources, particularly e-learning and a platform for exchanging best practices; a foundation for sustainable development will be set up and all stakeholders invited to take part in this".

I will conclude by referring to the Grenelle summit. It is true that we were disappointed in summer 2007 by the lack of content in the Grenelle summit in terms of proposals concerning education. This was rectified by the inter-ministry group which a number of you took part in, with the production of a report and a set of practical measures which are beginning to be put into practice at present. For instance, within the Department of Education, the renewal of the assignments entrusted to the two senior inspectors who drew up the 2003 report on environmental education for sustainable development (EESD), Gérard Bonhoure and Michel
Hagnerelle and the creation of a standing committee for sustainable development, even if it is true that all this could have been done earlier and more quickly.

The legislative form of the Grenelle declaration is no longer organised in terms of the roundtable proposals from one year ago but states that education for sustainable development must be related to all disciplines; agricultural teaching is also called upon to incorporate more teaching relating to biodiversity, genetics and best environmental practices. As to higher education, universities and graduate schools have been called upon to implement green campus programs as of the start of the next academic year and to apply for "sustainable development" standards labelling. With respect to this issue, the Conference of Higher Training Institutes has put together a strategic reference document for the integration of sustainable development, not only in terms of campus management, but also in initial and continuous training, research and the governance of schools.

With respect to health care professions and local planning, in the light of the health/environment issue, the Grenelle bill strongly encourages the fields of health, planning and architecture to take account of these concerns in initial and continuous training. In addition, article 48 of the Grenelle law relates to support through continuous and professional training for the transitioning of society towards a sustainable development society.

It is also requested that for training in activities which are the most closely related to this subject, training with respect to the environment and the understanding of ecosystems should be provided and strengthened and that methods with a huge sphere of application, including eco-design and the analysis of life cycles, should be provided.

Finally, the government has clearly understood that the training of senior managers is required for the success of this sustainable development policy. As things stand, this is severely lacking in our country. We have people on the ground who are very involved in sustainable development, not only in words but in deeds also, while at present at the top of our structures, be they government organisations, various public bodies, local authorities or businesses, we have too few senior managers who are up to speed as regards sustainable development. While it is clear that we need to make significant progress at a grassroots level, it is also important that the top level does not get left behind. This is one of the most significant challenges facing our society today.

**Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes**

The way we analyse things varies depending on the environment we inhabit. Some things appear to be universal: a certain desire and direction. Nevertheless, genuine questions remain. How can coherence be brought to all this? How can complementarity be established? How can best practices and required actions be shared?

**Open-floor discussion**

**Jean-Paul ROBIN, SNES-FSU**

On the issue of inequalities, Jean-Michel VALANTIN emphasised the importance of generalisation relating to education for sustainable development. I believe it is particularly important precisely when it comes to reducing degrees of inequality. We are at a watershed moment in that everyone will be able to have access to this education for sustainable development which will no longer be the preserve solely of a few associations or organisations. I also note the use of the term 'shared culture'. Everyone will be able to have access to this shared culture which will enable all of us to progress and discuss together.

I have some questions about what we call the "21 paradox", in other words the contradictions which exist between education for sustainable development, which requires a project-oriented, cross-disciplinary approach and the difficulties which we have in implementing this. In the proposal by the Department of Education relating to the restructuring of upper secondary schools, there is absolutely nothing about cross-disciplinary or project-based...
approaches or any such innovation. We find ourselves locked into an approach which is especially backward-looking.

I would like to suggest four avenues: partnership; localities - a really determining factor in the discussions we need to be having together; assessment - several contributions, particularly those by businesses, have underlined the importance of identifying indicators; and participatory democracy, because it should not be forgotten that the primary objective of education is emancipation and that if we lose sight of this we will no longer be educating but formatting.

A participant, history/geography teacher

I am in an establishment which has adopted an Agenda 21 sustainable development approach and I would like to share my experience. Jacques Brégeon was completely right to say that we should not be waiting for training to be served up on a plate. In practice, we do a lot on our own time.

In the establishment where I am, we have been involved in an Agenda 21 approach since June and since June, all my work in this respect has been on an unpaid basis. I am indeed a citizen who is conscious of my responsibilities and a teacher of history, geography and civic education with a desire to see my approaches bear fruit, but the fact remains that my family and friends are suffering as a result. It is not possible to expect grassroots support to do everything all the time.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

With respect to the cross-disciplinary approach, are there any examples of local authorities or companies who have succeeded in creating synergies or joint projects in this respect within the 21 Committee?

Antoine CHARLOT, Committee 21

Not particularly with respect to state education. At present, local authorities agree partnerships with certain companies to train local authorities, associations or local businesses. For instance, the Caisse d'Epargne has such a partnership agreement with the town of Marmande, in an attempt by the latter to inform all local businesses with respect to social and societal responsibility, aimed at small businesses who do not necessarily have access to training resources. There is also the example of regional natural parks who are taking on increasing responsibility in this respect, developing ISO1401 and environmental management certification and carbon balance resources in partnership with Chambers of Commerce and Craftsmen and make these available free of charge for local businesses, particularly SMEs and SMIs.

As I said just now, it is true that we are still faced with two distinct universes despite the fact that they are both at work within the same localities. There is a whole area of debate which is directly related to the professional tax and the actual location of a business, but once a business has been set up, there are two worlds which go their separate ways and which at the end of the day are strangers to each other. The result is that it becomes a local authority problem and not a business problem. All the companies which I meet within a locality are willing to work with the local authority and help to put together local strategy, particularly as regards sustainable development. However, the fact remains that most local authorities are still reluctant to engage in this type of dialogue.

Jacques BRÉGEON, CHEESD

As to the time required by processes, I would say that as society is structured today, things work well, with highly reasonable and logical processes. However, my observation is that if we continue to work to the social rhythms of today's society, we are doomed to failure. We can no longer afford to play by the old rules of the game. Each stakeholder must find more effective avenues in their respective fields. We need to act quickly because three years ago, Jean Jouzel, chairman of the IPCC, said that we would lose the last of the polar ice caps by
2070. The year after that, the date was revised to 2050. At present, some teams within the IPCC are saying that this will have happened by 2025. Bringing deadlines forward by 10 or 15 years with every passing year is mind-boggling!

We are not conscious of this because we are in an extremely sheltered environment, but we now have a colossal loss of biodiversity of a scale similar to what palaeontologists have observed as defining the dividing line between different geological strata. We are witnessing the sixth great biological extinction. We therefore need to be conscious of this need for speed. It is up to us, those responsible, to find the appropriate processes.

As regards the issue of unpaid work, I agree with you. Unfortunately, everybody in this room is a volunteer to a greater or lesser extent. We have the duty to be volunteers because if we wait for society to pay us for the work we are doing today we will be waiting for a long time. This goes for companies too. Some pioneer companies are taking risks and moving forward, some remarkably innovative SMEs. These people are not covered and often not recognized. They are not paid to be innovative or show the way forward.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

To add to what you have just said, you have raised the issue of resources at your level. To give a very simple example, today, in companies, somebody who is a relay or sustainable development ambassador may or may not see this included on their job description or end-of-year assessment and count towards bonuses or things of this nature. These things are beginning to come into businesses and some have already incorporated them. Another interesting field within business is the training budget which represents funds which are already there for which the question is simply one of allocation. Therefore, if training staff in sustainable development is important, why should this not form part of the training plans for 2009? Typically, this resource exists in companies and we should accord it the importance it deserves.

Jean-Michel VALANTIN, MEN/DGESCO

The concept of establishments entering an overall sustainable development approach was developed in 2005 and 2007 within the Department of Education and has enabled teaching within a specific discipline, cross-disciplinary projects, school life and establishment management to be incorporated into the establishment project. When these various aspects are integrated in this manner, the result is an establishment which has adopted an overall sustainable development approach: this can have a whole number of applications with reference to a school-based Agenda 21 which must be based on a pedagogical dimension.

Françoise BOISSOU, CNED

In the Poitou-Charentes Region, we have created an Institute for training and research in environmental education in partnership with the primary teacher training college, the Region and the regional education authority.

I would like to speak on behalf of the National Centre for Distance Learning (CNED) in my capacity as Director of Academic Education and come back to what Jacques Brégeon was saying about e-learning and distance learning. People are familiar with the CNED’s role in academic education but its work in lifelong and continuous training and with local government training colleges (CNFPT) and business is less well-known. Within the framework of company training and lifelong training entitlement, there are environment-based modules including water management and water-related risks, zoning regulations and flooding, in partnership with University lecturers and the Montpellier region. E-learning can be a way for businesses, local authorities and individuals to engage in lifelong training.

Céline KURIC, student

I had supervisory duties in schools throughout my studies and am now finishing a Masters in co-operation and development, having just come back from a placement in Peru. Mr Valantin said that children are not involved in climate change and that it is our responsibility as adults
to teach them, raise their awareness and so on. I do not fully agree with this. Today, children and young people are the foremost consumers in our society and it is they who direct the choices of their parents. Being a consumer should mean being a consumer-stakeholder, i.e. being aware and being fully involved in development both as a child and as a teenager.

In my opinion, it is not simply a question of raising young people’s awareness of our environmental issues but also of everything relating to solidarity, with a responsible awareness of the issues surrounding us. Since there is an attempt to review academic environments and teaching content, why not invite these children and young people, who are fully capable of doing so, to take their place at the table and suggest solutions? On the ground, as part of a project, if young people and children are involved in putting projects together its success is guaranteed.

Inasmuch as we are reconsidering the role and place of children in our society, which is fundamental to my mind, it is time we considered children as stakeholders and not as recipients. If we have this desire to get our young people organised and involved, why does the Department of Education not work more with civic society?

Anne CALVET, History-Geography teacher

I have been carrying out ESD training for a long time for the Toulouse administrative Academy and I belong to its working party on generalising ESD. If we want to generalise ESD and do it quickly, it is worth considering three key words.

The first is coherence. In my field, state education, I do not think we have yet to achieve this, even in terms of syllabuses. This year’s syllabuses for lower secondary history/geography are not coherent with the life and earth sciences syllabuses of the previous year, either in the way they are scheduled throughout lower secondary education or in terms of the notions and problems they address.

The second key word is organisation. If we want to get beyond volunteer work, which appears vital to me, particularly with respect to E3D, significant work is required in terms of organisation. How can it be that cross-disciplinary school time such as inter-subject topics (IDD) are disappearing? How can it be that we do not have a school day resembling adult life in which it is necessary to work on a subject for half a day and not one hour of school time? How is it that Academy inspectors meet so few local stakeholders such as Département Councils? Why is there no valid, collective discussion of E3D indicators?

The third key word is de-compartmentalisation. I would like to speak about both initial and continuous training. How can we favour inter-category training? This is extremely difficult because things are not planned that way in academic training, and it is all more difficult in that support staff (ATOSS) are no longer trained by the Department of Education but by local authorities. How can joint CNFPT/DoE training courses be put together which are both inter-category and inter-structured so that partners and the Department of Education talk about sustainable development in the same language and have the same aims? How can multi-training and multi-trainers come into being, prepare together and act together?

Roland GÉRARD, CFEESD

As to the role of young people, the fundamental idea is that young people who are presently pupils are not responsible for taking decisions. We cannot ask young people aged 5 or 20 to get hold of issues as mature adults can. We have increasing numbers of examples of children who are experiencing anxiety with respect to the issues of the contemporary world, whereas one of the major aims of education for sustainable department is to facilitate understanding and remind people that it is possible to take action. For instance, the “school in action for sustainable development” initiative launched by the Department of Education provided a possibility for pupils and their teachers to suggest highly practical projects which were a blend of teaching and relations with the outside world in such a way as to teach them to be stakeholders in sustainable development.
As to the issue of co-operation and international solidarity, it is high time that education for sustainable development and issues of education in international solidarity were brought together to be strengthened respectively. The only thing is that it is difficult to do everything at once, you need to give us some time.

Lastly, urgency is not an appropriate tempo for education. We must train pupils today in order for them to be citizens tomorrow. However, the responsibilities which fall to the adults of today, and the decisions which must be taken today, should not be foisted on the adults of tomorrow on the pretext that they have had some good ESD teaching.

Olivier CLASSIOT, Des Enjeux et des Hommes

A large number of questions raised have focused on issues of coherence. We are going to divide into four groups made up of the various stakeholders: businesses, local authorities, government and civic society. I suggest that the leaders of these groups work with you to identify one or more topics which you deem must be examined in more depth and with respect to which we will be required to make recommendations together at the end of the day.

Conclusion
by Olivier CLASSIOT
"Des Enjeux et des Hommes"

During this session, we were able to bring together all stakeholders: local authorities, businesses, civic society and the world of state education. The highly detailed summary has received input from all these stakeholders: Committee 21 for local authorities, "Des enjeux et des hommes" for businesses, the inter-ministry working party on education for sustainable development and the CFEESD for civic society.

We then worked together to identify key themes and establish solutions. To be honest, we have altered the day's programme in order to make it possible for us to be capable of really working together, because this was a major expectation of those present.

As a result, we have identified four key themes on which we have worked. Firstly, the theme of coherence in terms of the time devoted to educational initiatives, as well as in terms of coherence within a given area between various stakeholders with initiatives which could, in an ideal world, be complementary. Secondly, the theme of assessment: how can the contribution and effectiveness of an assessment initiative be measured? How can we find indicators which are appropriate to oversee and monitor this type of educational initiative?

The third theme is that of mobilisation, with a particular emphasis on relay people, the stakeholders in this education, whether they are in local authorities, businesses or state education. The fourth theme relates to dialogue and partnership. How can the sharing of best practices be encouraged? How can partnerships be encouraged in order to progress education for sustainable development more effectively?

A recurring topic has been the common thread of resources. This relates not only to money but also to time.

In terms of coherence and assessment, two key proposals out of six have been identified.

The first is the generalisation of consultation platforms for education for sustainable development at the regional level and associating these with Social and Economic Councils which would then receive competency with respect to education for sustainable development. These platforms would be locally relevant and multi-stakeholder, enabling education for sustainable development to have greater visibility and significance and also enabling an action plan, monitoring and assessment to be put in place. This opens the circle of consultation to other stakeholders including businesses and local authorities.

The second proposal is to set up a procedure for assessing educational initiatives in which assessment would form an integral part right from the outset, forming part of the specifications of any educational project. A feedback loop would systematically be included.
in this so that the audience in question may also provide comments, criticisms and recommendations in order for this to constitute a continuous improvement loop as can be found elsewhere. This would obviously draw on what already exists, particularly existing criteria at the European level, since the aim is not that of reinventing the wheel, and would also make use of a reference document with appropriate indicators. We spent a long time in the group discussing what constitutes a performance indicator with respect to training and educational initiatives. It cannot be a quantitative indicator as may be the case in other aspects of sustainable development. The difficulty is knowing how to assess the impact and added value of an educational initiative. If we have to use a teacher’s time or a company’s budget to train and educate a child or an employee, we need to be able to measure the resulting benefits.

With respect to the third theme, mobilisation, two proposals cover similar ground.

The first is to create a skills reference document for education for sustainable development. We have emphasised the fact that competencies as well as knowledge are required if relay people are to be able to bring these issues to life. This competencies reference document will also list knowledge relating to the three dimensions of sustainable development. This is because we sometimes have to deal with people who are highly specialised in one area but who are less mature as regards other aspects of sustainable development. In addition, there are skills. This reference document needs to be able to be shared by other stakeholders so that a company which wishes to train its staff can use this same competencies reference document.

Secondly, this competencies reference document would be backed by a programme to train trainers entailing certification. We really are seeing how a climate of trust can be created along with a level of quality relating to people carrying out educational initiatives which is recognizable by others. This training would be accessible to all (initial, continuous, Individual Training Entitlement, etc), which would enable the competency to be maintained over time. This is because the sustainable development is a field in which things move very quickly, so people need to be able to top up their skills. What is more, this training will also be based on work experience validation. If a trainer, particularly one in a non-profit context, has been addressing these subjects for a long time, they should be able to have the experience which they are acquired throughout their career validated.

The last theme is that of sharing, dialogue and partnership and involves two proposals.

The first proposal is to promote multi-stakeholder networks. We are very used to meeting people like us, but we need to promote meetings on these topics between different stakeholders. As to resources, we have envisaged setting up an extensive database which would feature best practices from all quarters, although we are conscious that the more we attempt to centralise things, the harder it is. Nowadays, there are possibilities relating to search engines which make it possible to find information where it is if it is properly managed, rather than attempting to merge all resources, which does not appear to us to be the best solution in terms of effectiveness.

Moreover, as soon as the issue of partnership arises, different approaches to the analysis of sustainable development mean that a proper framework is required. Our proposal in this respect is for there to be an ethical charter in which the competencies and roles of each party are specified and in which we would write something about values, ethics and how we aim to work together so that everybody is comfortable with this closer co-operation. We all have things to contribute from which others can benefit, but this needs to be done in a setting in which everybody feels they have a part to play and are respected.

*******************
Local co-ordination and implementation of education for sustainable development: the example of local authorities in the Aquitaine region

Summary

• Introduction by Michel RICARD, Chairman of the French ESD Committee
• Contribution by Jacques RESPAUD, Vice-Chairman, Conseil général de Gironde (Gironde Département Council)
• Contribution by Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME Aquitaine
• Presentations:
  - Hervé CAZENABE, Director, GRAINE Aquitaine
  - Chantal DEMONGIN, DIREN
  - Laurent SALIN, Prevention Officer, Gironde Département Council,
  - Bernard DARGUENCE, Bordeaux Metropolitan District (CUB)
  - Sandrine PICHOT, Advisor, Info Energie Centre, Mérignac
• Workshops:
  - Workshop 1: Responding to the need to inform and raise awareness of as broad a population as possible by means of local coordination (Moderator and rapporteur: Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME)
  - Workshop 2: Coordinating Agenda 21 approaches in schools and universities (Moderator: Christine DELHAYE, Committee 21; Rapporteur: Julie CHABAUD, Gironde Département Council)
  - Workshop 3: Raising awareness of sustainable development by means of actions and events by organising local co-operation and networking (Moderator: Richard COCONNIER, Bordeaux Aquitaine National Theatre; Rapporteur: Dominique BOYER, Bordeaux City Council)
• Reports and conclusions from workshops
• Overall summary and closing contributions (Julie CHABAUD, Patrick BOBET, Hervé GILLÉ, Michel RICARD)

Chair: Danielle NOCHER, Managing editor, "Valeurs Vertes" magazine

Introduction
by Michel RICARD
Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade

Sustainable development involves education, training and information, and I hope that each of us will be involved in discussions which include all of these aspects.

It will also be necessary to incorporate discussion of the necessary educational continuum from the earliest age through to twilight years: education for sustainable development is much more than academic education even if it is true that academic education represents the start; the vital basis for any young person in order for them to be able to apprehend,
understand and use all the information and data to which they will have access subsequently.

This long-term approach is vital if everyone is to become a responsible eco-citizen, which is the key to genuine sustainable development.

We are in a society which is changing extremely fast, socio-economically, culturally and environmentally. It is therefore necessary for each citizen - as an individual stakeholder and within the various environments in which they go about their business - government, local authorities, associations and companies - to have access to information enabling them to be in total harmony with the world in which they live. The need is for all this information which they will be using in their everyday lives - their professional lives, social lives, leisure activities and family life - to enable them to consider, on the basis of this vital intergenerational link (which is itself vital for one generation to succeed the other) the ability for future generations to experience a life which is "as pleasant as the one we have". When I use the term "as pleasant" this does not mean that everything today is perfect, but when we consider how things could be in the future, the darkest days may not be those of the present but those to come. It is therefore indispensable that we get ourselves in the place in which we can plan and implement prospective strategies enabling living standards and quality of life to be maintained - even if it is certain, as has been evident in all our discussions (we will discuss this again on Wednesday at the summing-up session) that we are in a societal situation which will definitely require us to reconsider the criteria of quality of life and cease basing our life solely on a consumer society, which forms the principal basis of our current society.

To come back more specifically to the matter in hand, initially, the idea was for a state, considered in isolation or as part of the European Union, to provide a regulatory framework and for stakeholders to be incorporated into this framework. The principal stakeholders in our society are local authorities, which operate at a number of levels with specific competencies, with a slight degree of overlap which is precisely what allows the important connection between these various types of action.

Local authorities really do constitute grass-roots stakeholders. In terms of sustainable development, we tend to say that those at work on the ground are those who have credibility and legitimacy with respect to sustainable development. I am not trying to argue that action on the ground is very basic or primitive or anything like that. What I am trying to say is that these are people who are thinking about very practical action which translates into actual facts which are then assessed. From there, others consider the lessons to be drawn from these assessments to establish prospective analysis which enables a better grasp of the future.

Three topics have been selected to explain this approach by local authorities.

Firstly, a topic which is particularly significant, especially here in the Gironde. Indeed, we should not forget that in terms of the implementation of its "Agenda 21" initiatives, the Gironde is one of the leaders amongst French départements. The first topic, then, will discuss education for sustainable development. Christine Delhaye is much better placed than I am to talk about this. The second topic relates to the use of information and communication. It is clear that this aspect of information, awareness and making individuals responsible, on the basis of all the data with which they can be provided in a variety of ways, is extremely important. Finally, the third topic - even if this approach has not generated the beneficial effects that might have been hoped - will involve taking an example demonstrating the strong potential offered by coordination between the various local authorities and of the resulting synergy, in other words the initiative which constituted Bordeaux's candidature to be European capital of culture in 2013.

So very briefly, this is the broad outline for our busy day today, which will enable us to progress both in terms of discussion and in terms of proposals. Thank you for your attention.
Danielle NOCHER, Managing editor, "Valeurs Vertes" magazine

We therefore find ourselves in this major session with a highly motivating subject. Since we are together under the auspices of the United Nations, I would like to recall the work that René Dubos wrote with Barbara Ward, "Only One Earth". This book opened up endless philosophical possibilities and could well serve as a roadmap for our world in search of direction. It was Dubos who came up with the celebrated phrase "Think global, act local". This has really come into its own today, particularly for such an essential topic for our future as that of education for sustainable development.

The theme of this session is local coordination and implementation of education for sustainable development, supported by the example of local authorities in Aquitaine. It is very interesting to see that sustainable development is not a concept which is decided from the top down, but that within each region, town and home, any citizen may flesh it out in order to progress towards a brighter future.

We are going to start by hearing from Mr Jacques Respaud, who is Vice-Chairman of the Gironde Département Council with responsibility for heritage. Heritage in the Gironde is something quite extraordinary because it covers everything from wine and chateaux to state-of-the-art technology. In addition, the region has felt the influence of some important figures who laid the foundations of Western thinking such as Montaigne, Montesquieu and even people such as Elie Faure and Elisée Reclus.

The ESD mobilisation in the Gironde département
by Jacques RESPAUD,
Vice-Chairman, Conseil général de Gironde

It is a great privilege for us to be able to welcome this event and thereby benefit from the experiences of over 70 nations. This is all the more important to us in that the theme of education for sustainable development for all of all ages is one of the priorities for the Gironde département. It constitutes one of the six key objectives stated in our Charter for a Social, Responsible and Sustainable Pact which is a frame of reference for the work done by our institution, the Conseil Général (Département Council). We wished to give over a whole day to the exchange of experience and constructive debate on the topic of local coordination in favour of education for sustainable development for every kind of population and for all ages.

Today, it would appear vital for local stakeholders to come together with the joint aim of taking up the new challenges the world faces and taking action in favour of a society with more responsibility, respect and solidarity in which everyone can find a place. Of course, there are many international symposiums and legal frameworks, but coordinated local action also has something to offer in terms of the effectiveness which derives from its pragmatism, adaptability and flexibility. It is capable of mobilising and enables the issues to be clearly portrayed and also shows what can be done individually and together with available resources in a continuous dynamic of openness and learning. These questions lead us to set up new forums for consultation, new procedures for action and taking decisions which are based on institutional co-operation by all interested parties. Our discussions will be supported and enriched by a large number of experiences from many different quarters.

Firstly though, I would like to say a few words about the quite exceptional mobilisation in the Gironde, which is a good illustration of the guiding theme of our day. In the Gironde, 36 local authorities - municipalities, groups of municipalities (particularly the Bordeaux Metropolitan District), local regions and départements - are committed to local Agenda 21 initiatives and have worked together for three years now in a département Council for local Agenda 21 initiatives. In 2008, this network decided to enter a new phase by establishing a collective, concerted action programme in favour of sustainable development, in other words a sort of Agenda 21 for the network. Education to promote sustainable development aimed at all types of population is one of the three major aspects of this concerted programme. With regard to
the world of academic education, this is based on coordinated measures, support and accompaniment of school-based Agenda 21 initiatives in partnership with Agenda 21 local authorities and of course the Department of Education.

Another aspect of the inter-institutional collaboration I have just mentioned is local integration and coherence. Commonalities are structured between establishments at every level, perhaps more particularly between school environments and extra-curricular environments. This also takes place with respect to the population in general through social centres, cultural and sports associations and so on. As was mentioned in the introduction, school forms only a small part of a child's life. We therefore need to look at a holistic approach, and this notion of education for sustainable development must concern other forums besides school.

The Regional Council, the Gironde Département Council and the Bordeaux Metropolitan District have sought to take this approach further by pooling all their skills and resources in terms of education for sustainable development. This partnership has been officially enshrined by signing a three-way contract defining joint objectives, with the Metropolitan District being responsible mainly for education for sustainable development in primary schools. The Département Council does this where it has competency: lower secondary schools, while the Region does so for upper secondary schools.

This partnership, enshrined in this three-way agreement, means that these local authorities have got together on the basis of a jointly established frame of reference and shared objectives with respect to the world of education. They have also set up a common instrument of dialogue with partners from the Department of Education, non-profit associations and all other local stakeholders. The idea is to provide clarity and coherence with regard to public-sector action at every local level, from primary school through to the end of secondary education. Over and above specific recipes for success and good works, my hope is that the stories you will be hearing today will help us situate our discussions with respect to education for sustainable development within the broader context of the cultural revolution which is required to take up the new challenges faced by the world: a project for a society characterised by responsibility, respect and solidarity, as enshrined in the principle of the UNESCO Decade.

I trust that the workshops will be productive, that at the end of the day strategic and, above all, operational avenues will have been identified, such that local coordination of stakeholders in favour of education for sustainable development for all can be implemented as broadly as possible.

Danielle NOCHER, Managing editor, "Valeurs Vertes" magazine

What you have told us has shown us that levels of local government which are sometimes in competition are coming together on the basis of sustainable development, which supplies confirmation that this topic makes it possible to overcome divisions. Unity is necessary to acquire this new vision of sustainable development which will ultimately be highly political, but in the Pythagorean sense of the term. I'm now going to hand over to Jean-Louis Bergey, the regional representative of the ADEME.

Responding to the need to inform and raise awareness of as broad a population as possible by means of local coordination

by Jean-Louis BERGEY
Regional representative, ADEME Aquitaine

I am the regional representative of the ADEME, the French Environment and Energy Management Agency, a public agency overseen principally by the Ministry for Sustainable Development, as well as by the Ministry for Research. We are involved in six areas: waste prevention and recovery; energy savings and the development of renewable energies; the development of clean transport; restoring polluted sites; the quality of indoor and outdoor air,
and two other missions which require less time and funding, one relating to soil quality and the other to noise.

The title of this workshop is: "Responding to the need to inform and raise awareness of as broad a population as possible by means of local coordination". Some of you will not be familiar with the French administrative system. This includes municipalities, inter-municipality authorities, départements and regions. There is no hierarchical relationship between them. In addition, between inter-municipality authorities and départements, local regions ("pays") may also be added to make things simpler. Finally, there is of course the State and the EU.

All these levels are involved in a number of ways as regards information, awareness and education, and the idea of this workshop was to demonstrate, on the basis of what happens here in Aquitaine, how coordination can be achieved so that things can be done in the most sensible manner possible. Alongside these administrative levels there are also many non-profit associations, also represented here, who are also major contributors in terms of education for sustainable development.

The Aquitaine region is made up of five départements and just over 3 million inhabitants with 640,000 young people in primary, secondary and higher education. It is also important to educate those who will be in management positions and have responsibilities in the future so that they are made aware of this coming change in society.

In the private sector, almost one paid job in two may be directly or indirectly affected by climate change. This includes jobs in farming, forestry, food-processing, tourism and professions relating to forests - this sector may be affected by global warming, and the southwest is the region in France in which the temperature has risen the most during the 20th century compared to the national average.

We are now going to get down to brass tacks by hearing from Mr Hervé CAZENABE, the Director of GRAINE Aquitaine.

---

**Work by GRAINE in Aquitaine**

*by Hervé CAZENABE, Director, GRAINE Aquitaine*

GRAINE Aquitaine is a non-profit association whose purpose is to run a regional network for environmental education. Its members include individuals and also structures for environmental education set up locally and distributed throughout the Aquitaine region.

These associations frequently intervene with respect to issues such as environmental education, nature awareness and biodiversity, as well as issues relating to energy and transport. Some associations are devoted more to popular education and social or cultural events, and these have increasingly acquired expertise with respect to issues relating to sustainable development. These associations are to be found in all of the départements in the Aquitaine: the Gironde, the Pyrénées-Atlantiques, the Landes, the Dordogne and the Lot-et-Garonne.

Local authorities, area authorities and regional natural parks are also members. In Aquitaine today, we have two regional natural parks, the Landes de Gascogne natural park and the Haut Périgord Limousin natural park: these are also involved in what GRAINE does because part of their mission involves raising the awareness of the population with respect to the local area in terms of cultural, economic and environmental aspects.

We also work with other partners in project developments. These include government departments such as the Regional Departments of the Environment and of Youth and Sport and the Ministry of Agriculture as well as the ADEME, local authorities, the Regional Council and the five département Councils.

The vocation of GRAINE Aquitaine is to run a network.
Its primary mission is one of providing information with respect to questions about environmental education and sustainable development. This is implemented through websites explaining the association as well as professions and training relating to the environment which are covered on a website called Orfée, which lists stakeholders and resources for environmental education in Aquitaine.

We have a newsletter for our members and have recently started putting out a review of environmental education in Aquitaine, "Plume d’Orfée". In addition, we are responsible for hosting events for the general public as well as project sponsors, who we assist in projects for events and education relating to the environment, and people enquiring about professional retraining.

The second mission of GRAINE is to organise professional training. For many years, we organised the State Diploma for Popular Education Support Workers (BEATEP), issued by the Ministry for Youth and Sport. Along with the Sports Support Worker diploma, this has given way to a single diploma, the Professional Diploma for Youth, Sport and Popular Education (BPJEPS), a level IV diploma designed for the training of professional support workers.

Today, we still organise professional training for environment workers as well as a number of short training courses as part of continuous training for support workers on specific themes such as Agenda 21 and environmentally responsible consumption.

A final part of this training aspect is our involvement in training which we do not organise but in which we are a partner. This applies to agricultural training for higher technical diplomas (BTS) and professional degrees with Bordeaux 3 university for a number of training courses including a Masters and the Certificate in Human Ecology.

One of the resources we have developed is entitled "Planète précieuse": this forms part of our third mission, which is to promote exchanges, pooling of practices and the development of regional-scale projects. "Planète précieuse" is a solution offering an awareness module in sustainable development for secondary-school pupils in Aquitaine. It has been designed by GRAINE Aquitaine and its partners. In all this we aim to favour locally-based procedures because it is locally-based associations who respond to requests from schools.

"Planète précieuse" is an awareness module which is offered to secondary school pupils. It comprises four phases.

The first phase involves pupils establishing how they view sustainable development, in other words what they think about sustainable development and what they think the key issues of sustainable development are. Secondly, we look at situations using role-plays. Groups of five or six pupils have an area to look after. They will all have to meet the same needs, but they do not all have the same production capabilities. On this basis, they do their best to manage this area, using energy, thinking about means of transport and the potential of the area in terms of what sort of production they could develop; they have to set up trading relationships with other areas to satisfy their needs (housing, food, travel, healthcare, education and so on).

In the early stages, it is interesting to see that the instinct is to attempt to make one’s area as rich as possible. However, by doing this the participants push up the levels of energy consumption and pollution. This makes them examine other solutions which would enable sustainable development even as their needs are fulfilled.

This role-play has an essential function: stimulating debate in secondary school classrooms, so that pupils can get a feel for the issues of sustainable development and the rather systemic, complex and cross-disciplinary nature of the kind of thinking which is required. It is not enough to limit oneself to thinking about care for the environment or purely about production: all the needs and considerations need to be looked at together for a harmonious development of the area.
The third phase involves a general debate following on from the pupils' experience of the roleplay and their feeling about sustainable development. Although the idea is not to present a lecture about the whole subject, this does enable knowledge to be passed on.

During the roleplay, news flashes interrupt the normal course of the game: for instance, rising fuel prices, a stock market crash and so on. This enables people to learn about impacts, as well as things relating to renewable energy, including rather technical issues to do with wind power and the feasibility of installing this kind of infrastructure in a locality.

The fourth phase, which follows this general discussion about how a society is organised and how sustainable its story is, aims to get secondary school pupils thinking about what they can do at their level. This is a way of showing them that sustainable development is not just something which happens at G8 summits or at government level, but that individual citizens also have their share of responsibility.

We invite students to engage in this kind of thinking and offer them support for practical projects they develop in schools. For instance, there was the implementation of a waste management plan for a lower secondary school; pupils who organised a day for environmental delegates from agricultural teaching, for which they considered how to use this day to raise these delegates' awareness; assistance to set up the beginnings of a school-based Agenda 21 for an establishment; discussions relating to responsible consumption; initiatives relating to endangered biodiversity in the immediate vicinity of an establishment.

Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME Aquitaine

"Planète précieuse" is therefore a method. I imagine that you have a guide for the teacher or leader, as well as information and documentation.

Hervé CAZENABE, GRAINE Aquitaine

In practical terms, a resource file is made available to leaders and teachers. There is also a presentation guide for teachers, not for the support workers because we train them ourselves. It is not possible for an untrained support worker to be involved in the "Planète précieuse" initiative.

We have a kind of certification process for the people we want to be involved in leading this. As part of the solution, we have also tried to set up a support worker network, in other words in addition to initial training, we offer a continuous training process, with meetings and exchanges of experience.

Initially, when we launched the project, we had life and earth sciences teachers in mind. They account for some 40% of our invitations, but the solution is of interest to all teachers and is aimed at all types of teaching (professional teaching, technical teaching, general teaching and apprenticeship). This solution is now a highly successful: in three years, we have run over 1200 schemes and reached 30,000 pupils in 400 upper secondary schools and 800 lower secondary schools. This solution is free for schools because the ADEME, the Regional Council and the five départements Councils fund it between them.

We have also set up a "Planète précieuse" steering committee with all our partners (technical, financial and teaching) along with the regional education authority. This steering committee, which initially brought together those providing funding, has now become a genuine technical instrument and forum for discussing future development of this solution. Each partner contributes to how the solution progresses: fine-tuning, changes to messages and local specifics. As a result, the steering committee for the solution has become a genuine forum for dialogue and discussion as regards the issue of environmental education in the region.

Other instruments besides "Planète précieuse" exist for primary school teachers as well as secondary school teachers: some are particularly well put together because they were designed by teachers. Lastly, a whole network of associations are also involved in this.
Work done by the Regional Direction of the Environment in Aquitaine
by Chantal DEMONGIN
DIREN Aquitaine

The primary mission of the Regional Direction of the Environment (DIREN) is to disseminate all existing data relating to the environment. All DIRENs have a rich diversity of data relating to a variety of fields such as the countryside, listed sites, protected natural areas and protected species: all this data is available on the DIREN website. It is regularly updated and in high demand, particularly by design offices, students, non-profit associations and the general public.

Our second mission is to carry out successful regional planning. This may sound a lofty ambition, but the DIREN has to be present on key dossiers, reminding people of the existence of the environment and that it must be taken into account. These dossiers may include town planning and other major developments, and we attempt to give our opinion and advice. Another one of the primary roles of the State is to ensure that laws are abided by. This also forms an important part of our work and relates to laws concerning the natural environment, the social environment, town planning, water, listed sites, the countryside and advertising.

The fourth aspect of our mission is to promote active partnership relations. Our principal target is not the general public but associations, councillors and schools. We are not active on the ground in the sense that we do not go into schools to do events. This would be impossible because I am all alone for the whole Aquitaine region, but there are structures that take charge of this aspect.

My role is more one of coordination and mediation. This involves linking up individuals, getting associations to meet councillors and/or teachers, etc. While I am on my own, I work with hundreds of people so I feel very enriched by my job and never get bored. I believe that in this field of environmental education, partnership is absolutely vital.

Demand is changing because there is now a network of people involved in environmental education which is really quite big in Aquitaine with between 200 and 300 associations and other structures. One original aspect in Aquitaine is that we have Ecole et Nature which is the major national network as well as GRAINE Aquitaine. For some years now, the départements have each had their own centre for resources for environmental education, which have the same missions as the GRAINE at that level. In addition to this network, the Permanent Information Centres for the Environment (CPIE) have existed for at least 30 years.

Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME Aquitaine

You mentioned the "Environmental Education" Committee in Aquitaine. In what respect is this a local coordination instrument?

Chantal DEMONGIN, DIREN Aquitaine

The Aquitaine "Environmental Education" Committee is a very lively informal network, but is not easy to organise or coordinate.

In 2003, there was quite a favourable national and regional climate, the sustainable development strategy and many circulars from the Department of Education. We already had quite a network based around initiatives such as "1 000 défis pour ma planète" and "Science en fête".

In terms of the authorities, the Ministry of Agriculture were the first, some 20 years ago, to implement environmental education measures, followed by the regional education authority, the Ministry for Youth and Sport, the DRIRE (Regional Agency for Industry, Research and the Environment), the Environment Ministry, the ADEME, the Water Agency, the five département Councils, the Regional Council and the non-profit world represented by GRAINE Aquitaine.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
In 2003, there were three of us: ADEME, the regional education authority and the DIREN. Between the three of us, we launched this initiative, and our group very quickly expanded, with meetings three or four times a year.

In Aquitaine, as in all regions, environmental education was a matter for associations. The authorities came along later, in the shape of regional and local administrative authorities. We have our concerns, our own missions and our own policies, but mostly we have common concerns which were previously somewhat scattered throughout the area. We were all at different stages in terms of action, and in the interest of this committee lay in being able to define the key topics together, discuss projects and our concerns and attempt to organise action together in order to avoid becoming too spread out.

The first topic dealt with by the Committee was that of training in environmental education, and our first action was to share our ideas and questions in this respect. We started in the Pyrénées-Atlantiques and since then, thanks to the practical results in the field, this département has its own equivalent of the regional Committee. The partners are used to meeting together and have carried out initiatives in terms of training for a variety of populations, including staff workers and senior leaders from sports centres and holiday centres: this had not been a target population for the DIREN.

In terms of coordination, this measure, now five years old, had some teething troubles, but things have now improved and the future should see things getting even better provided that we ensure that everybody receives full information at the same time, including those who do not participate. Organising more joint actions would be desirable, but this is not easy because everybody has their own policy and work to do. Time is a very important notion in networks, so we organised a number of small workgroups within the committee alongside institutions with a particular interest. For instance, one workgroup has been examining how to set up a regional portal for environmental education. This portal now exists, we need people to get motivated to breathe life into it, but this is more of a network-related challenge.

Mathieu LEROUX, Environmental Education Officer, Aquitaine Regional Council

In December 2005, a plenary session of the Regional Council adopted regulations for action relating to environmental education and the implementation of measures to provide direct aid to associations identified as heading up networks devoted to environmental education initiatives at the regional level. These associations were those identified as being exemplary in their expertise in terms of environmental education, for whom environmental education was their primary mission, who brought together other structures at a more local level and who were capable of developing broader partnerships.

Today, there are 19 associations in this network and the mission of the Aquitaine Region is to bring these structures together in working meetings. In 2008, we looked at two themes, firstly that of employment within the structures, which remains a key challenge, along with staff training and initial training, secondly, the visibility of all these associations at the regional level. Other workshops have been planned in order to clarify what exists at the regional level in terms of environmental education.

The aim of the Region is really to be able to rely on these associations to implement joint projects and pool expertise, competencies and resources, so that they can then pass on messages and implement tools at the local level.

Work done by the Gironde Département Council
by Laurent SALIN,
(Prevention Officer, Gironde Département Council)

Until 2004, the Département Council (Conseil Général) did not have mandatory competency for waste, but even prior to this date, they were keen to take on this competency in order to be able to address at the level of the département an issue which was previously managed by central government.
Waste management incorporates a number of levels which makes it an interesting field. At the local level, there is actual collection, which is managed by groups of municipalities or private-public bodies. These are the people who are involved in waste management on a daily basis, but it is also necessary to supply short and long-term objectives with respect to waste management. This is why the law has envisaged the creation of a département plan setting objectives in terms of waste treatment and recovery.

As of 2004, the Département Council decided to take on this non-mandatory competency and set up the Département Waste Council. This brought together all the private-public agencies and groups of municipalities with responsibility for waste with environment protection associations, consumer rights groups, consular chambers and private waste operators.

Jean-Louis Bergey: This is a consultative body in its very essence, because the Département Council has an oversight role with respect to the département Plan, while the municipalities and groups of municipalities have the responsibility for collecting and treating waste on a day-to-day basis. Can you tell us what the Département Council has done in terms of awareness and information?

Laurent SALIN

Upstream from the département Plan, using the Département Waste Council, which was not yet a mandatory body, public meetings took place to mobilise people across the board for the purposes of drafting a White Paper for the whole département. This enabled us to set out the broad principles of the département Plan and offered an opportunity for all local residents to have their say. All the stakeholders in the département attended these decentralised public meetings, which enabled the département plan, which until then had been a technical and administrative document, to really come into being. We were able to incorporate the expectations of associations and individuals, and structure the plan around the recovery and prevention of waste, topics which had not been developed much at that time. Raising public awareness therefore took place mostly by means of these meetings to prepare the département plan, as well as by means of informational brochures and the Département Council website. These documents were then used locally for the joint organisation of public meetings.

Subsequently, under the aegis of the Département Waste Council and the Consultation Committee for the Plan, a "prevention and awareness" group was set up. This was made up of the private-public agencies and groups of municipalities who were prime movers in terms of waste awareness, as well as associations. Together, we put together a waste guide which was distributed by local authorities and available on request from the Département council or online from the website. This guide is innovative, not only as regards its section on sorting but also due to its "prevention" section, which discusses "alternative purchasing", raising people's awareness as to changes in behaviour which have a high impact on the production of waste.

In 2007, we carried out an initiative to get rid of plastic bags at supermarket checkouts in partnership with both mass retailers and local shops, some of whom had the courage to engage in some interesting actions at their own expense. This was all done very transparently; the charter had 217 signatories and concerned 80% of the superstores and supermarkets in the Gironde. We have always sought to have the documentation produced by the "prevention" group made available for these parties and public-private municipal agencies. We offered them all CD-ROMs, enabling them to incorporate this information into "waste sorting newsletters" and their websites. There has always been this relay aspect, which we expect to increase with the next campaign.

In 2008, a communications campaign entitled "Les Écomatismes" will be launched on November 3, targeting 18-35-year-olds. We have carried out an opinion poll in the département which shows that 18-35-year-olds are the worst performers in terms of waste management. We organised a competition which was won by an agency which decided to
direct its campaign to communication aimed at 18-35-year-olds using the Internet, cinema and the local television station, TV7. This campaign will be broadcast for one month in Gironde cinemas, on TV7 and on the radio and will have its own dedicated website. These are all virtual media and we are aiming for a carbon balance of zero for the campaign in order to be consistent with the guidelines that we set out in the prevention plan. In addition, all our partners will be able to use these media for their own websites, since the eight short films concerning acts of greenness are downloadable.

I should also say that the eight videos are derived from the guide which we put together, because we are aiming to deal with waste prevention. They deal with composting, remembering to take a bag when you go shopping, considering repairing or giving away rather than throwing away and so on. Prevention also relates to cutting waste production and harmfulness upstream, so one video deals with the harmful nature of some waste and the importance of taking harmful waste to a disposal site. The hero is a presenter from the local TV7 channel. We wanted a local person to give the campaign a really local flavour.

Jean-Louis Bergey: We have been talking about coordination with inter-municipal structures, without the Region being involved because it does not deal with the question of hazardous waste. What can you tell us about this coordination between the département level and the inter-municipal level?

Laurent SALIN

As technology has changed, each agency has its own website, which makes it easier to communicate. For the next campaign, the link between the Département Council and smaller structures will be even more apparent. We have moved from communication to genuine education which aims to achieve a lasting change in behaviour. We have noticed that the inhabitants of the Gironde really are conscious of how urgent the environmental issue is. They are now looking for practical actions which they can do, and this is what this campaign offers them.

As part of the surveys which we have carried out, we have established the zero level as regards prevention. We would like to be able to assess this communication in terms of its impact. This means that, following the next campaign, we will carry out another survey to see whether there have been any changes in behaviour. One interesting example would be that of waste sorting, which does not take place at present, and for which the equipment will be deployed very shortly throughout Bordeaux. However, even without sorted waste, some preventive gestures are possible (composting, changes in consumption and so on) which can be the subject of informational campaigns.

Work done by the Communauté Urbaine de Bordeaux (Bordeaux Municipal District - CUB) by Bernard DARGUENCE (Head of Internal Logistics, Bordeaux Municipal District)

The CUB is an inter-municipality cooperation structure bringing together 27 municipalities with a total of 670,000 inhabitants, one third of which are within the city of Bordeaux.

The remit of the Metropolitan District was established by a law dating from December 1966 which established a number of Metropolitan Districts and their competencies. These relate to highways, refuse collection, parking, transport, planning, housing, water and wastewater disposal. The Metropolitan District is therefore responsible for urban transport within its area. The subject of my presentation is the coordination which we have been able to establish with other transport organising authorities, namely the Region for the TER local train network, and the Gironde département for inter-urban transport.

Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME: Before discussing this particular setup, can you tell us a little about mass urban transport in the Bordeaux Metropolitan District?
Today, the urban transport network comprises 95 bus routes and 3 tram routes. In 2007, there were a total of 85 million passenger journeys on this network which is known as TBC (CUB Tram and Bus). There were a total of 60 million passenger journeys in 2001, but there has been significant growth with the arrival of the tramway.

At the same time, between 2006 and 2007, there has been a 30% increase in the use of local trains in Aquitaine. People who do not live in the Bordeaux Metropolitan District come here to work or study, and a lot of work has been done to attempt to coordinate all this within a structure which has existed since the end of the 1990s: with the Region and the Gironde département, we have created a solution which enables passengers to use local trains and the CUB network using a single season ticket covering both modes of transport. Since 2004, the various organising authorities have worked together to implement a solution known as "Modalis".

Practically, this allows what is known as inter-modality, a practice in which two modes of transport are used one after the other, and for which we have implemented a combined fare structure. Multi-modality also exists: this is where passengers choose to use a number of different modes of transport for a single journey, and again we have a combined fare structure for this. In practical terms, this takes the form of a transport card: for passengers, this makes matters much simpler because there is a single operator. As to what we call mono-modal tickets, fare discounts of up to 25% are available.

We do not as yet have a complete fare structure for Modalis. We have targeted certain populations as a priority, mostly season tickets for schoolchildren. Other than that, we mostly have weekly and monthly passes. We still have some way to go before we can develop annual season tickets, although a "youth" season ticket has been available for Trans-Gironde and TBC since 2008, destined for all passengers aged under 28. This is a monthly or annual season ticket incorporating fare discounts.

Modalis is backed by a number of things in terms of coordination. Initially, a study was carried out jointly by the three organising authorities in terms of a graphic standard, with joint funding split equally between the three organising authorities.

In addition, each entity had a ticketing system with different functionalities, so in 2002 an interoperability charter was signed to facilitate the use of public transport and to commit various local authorities to the development of intermodality. As the fare structure changes, each authority will need to adjust its ticketing systems.

Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME Aquitaine

Is it the systems which are preventing full interoperability at present?

Bernard DARGUENCE, CUB

We wanted to have a joint "Youth" ticket for the Region, Département and CUB ready for September 2008. However, the incompatibility between the ticketing systems hindered us from doing this, so it will take longer.

Of course, we would like to be able to offer a single pass for all three operators: for two years now, we have been carrying out a feasibility study on the subject of integrated fares funded equally by the various organising authorities. For instance, this would involve being free to use trains, the Trans-Gironde or the TBC network within the urban transport area for the same fare. This study is due to conclude at the end of the year, and a decision on the part of each of the organising authorities will then be required to establish whether they are willing to commit to this solution.

However, there are technical obstacles because although this coordination does exist today, each entity is still in charge of its own fare structure. Implementing a single fare will require a greater degree of coordination. There are also obstacles in terms of appropriate offsetting of fare revenues between the various entities. We need to define allocation keys given that we do not have the same levels of traffic or revenues across all the structures.
Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME Aquitaine

You also refer to a fourth operator, the SNCF (French National Railways). The three organising authorities you have mentioned clearly have the political will to progress; what is the place of the SNCF in this solution?

Bernard DARGUENCE, CUB

The SNCF is the network operator, just as we have our operator on the TBC network and the Département Council as an operator on the Trans-Gironde network. The SNCF has national considerations to think of, and in terms of fare structure, a lot of regional fares are tied into the national fare structure. This has meant that we have sometimes had some difficulty in changing some aspects. There is clearly a desire to provide a service for users, but there are still difficulties and there are not many existing experiences in France, whereas in other countries, there are some single-fare systems which extend over significant areas.

As to coordination, we have a fairly traditional structure, with a steering committee which meets at least once a year to adjust the "Modalis" solution. In terms of the outlook, independently from the single ticket, we also want to promote the use of public transport for occasional users.

Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME Aquitaine

Do think that this coordination in an attempt to improve the service has also encouraged people to use public transport more?

Bernard DARGUENCE, CUB

This does not represent a large number of journeys on the scale of our network. Out of a total of 85 million journeys, e-ticketing data from the TBC network indicates that 1% of journeys are carried out using the Modalis pass. This is not very representative, but nevertheless the solution is being taken up and we need to develop and improve our communication. Institutional communication between the three organising authorities was set up for the launch of Modalis, but nothing has been done since. It is therefore necessary to pursue this approach and encourage such institutional communication. At the same time, each operator has their own commercial communication aimed at users, and this is not necessarily coordinated between the various operators.

The Modalis campaign focuses specifically on this solution and the advantages of using public transport. In addition, the coordination does not simply relate to fare structures: there is also a desire to coordinate our offer.

It is of course very worthwhile implementing a fare structure which is attractive to users, and we are working at developing interchanges which would be served by a number of Trans-Gironde routes, enabling people to change easily on to the urban network. The same applies to stations, such as the multimodal stop opened recently in Cenon. Some trains stop at Cenon, where a connection to a tram route is available. Today, some 1000 passengers pass through the station daily: within four to five years, 6000 are expected in this station in Cenon, a municipality adjoining Bordeaux on the right bank. Basically, it is located on the Bordeaux-Paris line and is served by regional trains. The region is keen to develop this kind of station around Bordeaux and encourage passengers to make use of such stops.

Espaces Info Énergie (Energy Info Centres): the Mérignac example

by Sandrine PICHOT
Adviser, Energy Info Centre, Mérignac

The Espace Info Énergie is a space to welcome and advise individuals who are planning to renovate or build their own home. They come to the Energy Info Centre seeking solutions.

First of all I would like to relate how the Energy Info Centre network was set up. The ADEME set up this network in 2001 and sought partners among local authorities. In Aquitaine, the
Aquitaine Region, the Département Council and Mérignac Town Council provide funding for the Consumption, Housing and Environment Association (CLCV). This is a group which defends the rights of consumers and tenants. It exists at a national level with small local and département entities, with 30,000 members nationally and 1300 in the Gironde.

90% of the time, people who come to see us are planning building or renovation work or want to know whether they are using too much energy and whether they can do something simple for the environment.

I have been working at the Energy Info Centre since January 2003. Initially, I was doing a loss of awareness-raising with respect to the environment, especially with solar water heaters, because at that time there was a bonus scheme with the Aquitaine Region for solar water heaters. Since 2005/2006, the type of questions individuals ask has changed. They now come with much more specific projects. They have found out some information, been on the Internet and got several quotes. They come and see me with estimates and very detailed house plans to know what they should be doing, where they should put the radiators and what type of materials they should be using to insulated her home.

Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME Aquitaine

Do you sometimes get the impression that you are passing on more than information: do you get people thinking and will their behaviours change as a result of their discussions with you? That would be education rather than information.

Sandrine PICHOT, Energy Info Centre

We try and find solutions to every situation. When people come and see me, they have three types of question: insulation, the type of heating and renewable energies. I explain each of the systems to them and examine with them which is the most appropriate for them in terms of their family and financial situation. I endeavour to give them personalised advice and explain the various options to them so that they subsequently make the right decision.

People have changed their perspective and their behaviours with regard to certain number of issues, because they are hearing a lot more about the environment in the media. They are already aware of things when they come, but somewhat overwhelmed by the mass of information. They come to see me to sort things out a little. The primary motive of individual visits is still financial aid, particularly since 2005/2006 and the availability of a tax credit.

When people get in touch with me, I make an appointment with them and ask them to come with the plans of their home, their energy bills and any estimates they may have. If I see that they have decided to go for solar power simply because it's trendy and the neighbours will see that they have some renewable energy sources on the roof, I advise them to think first and foremost about insulating their homes properly.

Demand has soared since 2006, with some 800 individual interviews a year: this represents about two thirds of my time. The remaining third of our time is spent on communications and events. We need to make the Energy Info Centre known and tell people about the CLCV. In practical terms, this means taking part in fairs and exhibitions throughout the Gironde, and speaking at lectures and practical workshops.

This year, in Bordeaux, we did a presentation for members of the army about what they could do on a daily basis to save energy. We examine all requests and if a municipality invites us to give a lecture, we get back to them. I should add that this service is completely neutral, independent and free of charge.

We are also involved in communication. Sometimes we have articles in the local press. We work with municipalities, such as Mérignac Town Council, to put together environment guides and technical sheets about environmentally-friendly construction, as well as materials about alternative mode transport for the eco-mobility week. We organise other activities, particularly stands at exhibitions and lectures. Lastly, we have also surrounded ourselves with a network of professionals in order to familiarise ourselves with the latest techniques and technologies.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27- 29, 2008
We also offer site visits. This is interesting, because private individuals who have installed a solar water heater open their doors to us to show other members of the public how a solar water heater works. This enables people to discuss things with the owner and sometimes with the installer if they are there.

We had to have 200 contacts in 2003. We have now achieved cruising speed with 800 contacts a year (visits, telephone contacts, letters and e-mails). In terms of the number of people who have been reached through exhibitions, it is difficult to have a precise tally, but we think it must be about 1000 people a year.

The primary motive of individual visits is still financial aid, particularly since 2005/2006 and the availability of a tax credit. When people get in touch with me, I make an appointment with them and ask them to come with the plans of their home, their energy bills and any estimates they may have. If I see that they have decided to go for solar power simply because it's trendy and the neighbours will see that they have some renewable energy sources on the roof, I advise them to think first and foremost about insulating their homes properly. One assessment in Aquitaine carried out in 2006 showed that one Energy Info adviser generated €500,000 worth of works as a result of the recommendations made.

The ADEME provides joint funding for these Energy Info Centres: in 2007, along with the Regional Council we decided to rationalise requests. We have established a plan to 2010 and selected a number of Energy Info Centres in the region. There has been increasing number of advisers, but not necessarily in the number of sites. We cannot set up many more of them because this would involve a lot of money and other sources of joint funding (Département Council and/or local authorities). Furthermore, our assistance is designed not to be permanent: local authorities are supposed to be taking over.

When we began to set up these spaces in 2001, it was not very attractive time in terms of people wanting to save energy. Things have changed, particularly with the adoption of the Grenelle 1 law, which has introduced a number of obligations and/or incentives such as interest-free home loans. We can expect to see an increase in requests from individuals. How can we cope with this demand? We will be setting up centres of this type in places with high demand, aware that Energy Info Centres are not always used as well as they could be in some areas within the region.

**Workshops**

Out of the three topics which have been dealt with during the workshops which have lasted throughout the day, the idea was to present and discuss experiences and achievements in Aquitaine (morning), plus reports from other areas in France and further afield (afternoon).

**Workshop 1**

*Responding to the need to inform and raise awareness of as broad a population as possible by means of local coordination*

*Moderator and rapporteur: Jean-Louis BERGEY (ADEME)*

Aquitaine represents:
- almost 3 million inhabitants,
- nearly 640,000 pupils and students in primary, secondary and higher education,
- two out of three jobs affected by the climate
- the region of France the most significantly affected by global warming (+1.1° in the 20th century),
- a high-quality environmental heritage.

All these factors mean that it is necessary to act and pursue the raising of collective awareness with respect to the issues of sustainable development.
Environmental education for sustainable development of all citizens represents a vital component in providing everybody with the resources to become genuine eco-citizens, change their behaviour, and develop a sense of solidarity and responsibility.

This approach has been clearly identified:

- in article 8 of the Environment Charter: "Education and training with respect to the environment must contribute to the exercise of the rights and duties defined in this charter",
- in the national sustainable development strategy and the action programme "Citizens: stakeholders in sustainable development"

In Aquitaine, institutional and non-profit partners in environmental education have sought to strengthen convergence between the initiatives underway. Awareness-raising, information, education and training for sustainable development will not succeed unless the partners work hand in hand.

➢ A desire to work together

- **Overview of environmental education action in 2004 in Aquitaine.**
  - **Government departments** offered the "1000 Défis pour la planète" initiative: supporting products relating to environmental education by awarding a standards label and funding.
  - The **Gironde Département Council** got lower secondary pupils involved with the "Billet courant vert": subsidies granted to associations and environmental education structures carrying out work with lower secondary school pupils.
  - **The ADEME** (French Environment and Energy Control Agency) developed the "Planète Précieuse" initiative at a national level (a network of support workers plus an exhibition and workshops for secondary school pupils) with the support of the **Regional Council** as part of the Aquitaine Region Programme for the Environment.
  - The **Bordeaux Metropolitan District** experimented with the Agenda 21 approach in 5 primary schools.

- **The situation in 2008**
  - The "Planète Précieuse" initiative is now funded by ADEME, the Regional Council and the Aquitaine département. The network of support workers and institutions work closely together to define annual objectives and decide future changes; this partnership dynamic is facilitated by the concrete aspect of the project.
  - the "scholar Agenda 21" initiatives deployed experimentally by the Bordeaux Metropolitan District have given rise to new initiatives supported by the ADEME: 5 new Agendas in 2008. The Gironde Département Council and the Aquitaine Regional Council have also developed measures to encourage school-based Agenda 21 initiatives in secondary schools. The 3 local authorities are working together to establish a common, coherent action from primary school right through to the end of secondary school.

_Cooperation_ between institutions, environmental education associations and popular education associations integrates the desire to have joint references: getting to know each other better in order to work better together, so as to learn and become proficient in sustainable development.

➢ A common commitment; the regional charter for environmental education for sustainable development

In an extension of the regional dynamic, the Regional Department of the Environment (DIREN), the ADEME and the Bordeaux regional education authority have suggested setting
up a committee bringing together the principal institutional stakeholders in the region: the Aquitaine "Environmental Education" Committee.

The purpose of this committee is to create a dynamic for environmental education initiatives by developing partnerships between government departments, local authorities and environmental education associations: developing synergies between partners, experience-sharing, resource-pooling and endeavouring to be consistent in terms of funding, etc.

In addition to the 3 founders, the committee includes the following: The Regional Department of Youth and Sport, the Regional Department of Agriculture and Forestry, the Regional Department for Industry, the Environment and Research, the Water Agency, Adour Garonne, AIraq, the 5 Département Councils, the Regional Council and the GRAINE Aquitaine network.

This commitment has given rise to the drafting of the regional charter for environmental education for sustainable development. The Charter comprises three parts, the first retraces the founding principles of education for sustainable development (ethics, solidarity, participation, responsibility, precaution, etc), the second sets out the 9 articles of the charter (providing environmental education for all, offering citizenship education, assessing, developing partnerships, raising awareness, training, apprehending the various environmental themes, creating a regional dynamic); the third presents the regional action plan in which the 9 articles of the charter are developed.

➢ Examples of local co-operation

- "Energy Info Centres", a regional network

What Energy Info Centres are: these spaces where any individual can obtain free, objective information about controlling energy and renewable energies. The Aquitaine network comprises 15 Energy Info Centres (EIE) supported by the ADEME, the Regional Council and local authorities who provide financial, technical and logistics assistance for each structure. This cooperation has enabled the number of EIEs to grow from 11 to 15 and the number of advisers to go from 15 to 18. A charter guarantees that the services provided are free, neutral and independent.

The Energy Info Centre network now makes it possible to provide over 25,000 sets of personalised advice a year and generates €45 million worth of building work.

The experience developed with respect to raising awareness of individuals to energy issues and the results obtained have formed the basis for the creation of a local energy agency: Agence locale de l’énergie - Bordeaux urban district and the Gironde département - ALEAB 33. www.aleab33.fr

The Bordeaux Municipal District, the Gironde Département Council, the Aquitaine Regional Council and the ADEME have joined forces to offer local authorities and housing professionals a decision-making aid to help them implement the actions required for better control of energy consumption and spending.

- "Planète Précieuse": a free pedagogical resource for secondary schools.

In 2001, there were 100 lectures reaching 3000 pupils.

In 2007, there were 380 lectures reaching 11,000 pupils.

Since the end of 2004, the initiative has involved more stakeholders from institutions and the environmental education network: ADEME, the Regional Council, the Département Councils, the Regional Academic Inspectorate and Graine Aquitaine. This local dynamic has enabled 350 events to take place every school year. Between 2004 and 2008, there have been a total of 1200 interventions reaching over 30,000 young people.
The regional coordinating body carries out promotion, updates the resource, chooses the targets (extending to apprenticeship training centres), facilitates registration with financial support, etc.

➢ The next step

Since 2008, local coordination has started to involve new projects: raising the awareness of a broader audience at cultural and sporting eco-events, regional conferences on environmental education, etc.

The experiences in Aquitaine demonstrate the effectiveness of consultation, but still involve only a restricted type of audience.

The workshop may constitute a response to the following issues: how access to information and awareness-raising may be facilitated; how environmental issues can be related to the day-to-day needs of the population; the "environmental" aspect is neither more nor less important than the "social" and "economic" aspects. The issues of information and awareness should make it possible to incorporate the environmental aspect, naturally and for all parties.

Workshop 2
Coordinating Agenda 21 approaches in schools and universities
Moderator: Christine DELHAYE, Committee 21
Rapporteur: Julie CHABAUD, (Gironde Département Council)

School-based Agenda 21 initiatives are part of the overall Agenda 21 approach. They constitute action plans for sustainable development at the level of a school establishment. Their aim is to mobilise all stakeholders present in this space and who interact in the way it develops: pupils and their parents, the educational community in its broadest sense, local authorities, local representatives, support staff, companies who work on site and so on.

➢ Establishing a school-based Agenda 21

To respond to the challenges posed by sustainable development, education plays a crucial role in kick-starting the required change in our modes of consumption and production. Coordination, interconnection and coherence between public stakeholders is vital to provide a clear, relevant and effective sustainable development action.

The Agenda 21 methods guide for educational establishments, published by Committee 21 and the CRDP in partnership with the Department of Education, the Ministry of Agriculture, the Ministry of Ecology and Sustainable Development, the UN National Committee for the Decade of Education for Sustainable Development, UNESCO, ADEME and others, sets out the objectives of school-based Agenda 21 initiatives as follows:

"The primary objective of a school-based Agenda 21 is to engage young people and all stakeholders within the establishment in an initiative for social and environmental progress. There is no standard or template which can be applied to every type of establishment: each is free to establish its project in relation to its needs and priorities. The specific issues to be taken into account in establishment projects and action plans will differ from one establishment to the next according to the age of the pupils, the location of the site, its size and the resources available to it, its cultural makeup and so on.

It should however be recalled that Agenda 21 is a cross-disciplinary approach which harmonises environmental, social, economic and cultural objectives. It therefore represents a contribution to pedagogical action by providing concrete applications for both teachers and pupils of the lessons learned in a wide variety of disciplines.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
By encouraging young people to become practically involved and contribute to discussion, action and monitoring, Agenda 21 opens the way for active, participatory citizenship. It is a practical way of taking up the new issues which all of us face: the fight against climate change, the protection of non-renewable resources, renewing links with nature and biodiversity, the fight against inequalities and all forms of discrimination, solidarity with deprived populations both locally and worldwide, etc."

- **Local authorities in Aquitaine: a catalysing factor in school-based Agenda 21 initiatives**

The number and quality of Agenda 21-type approaches in Aquitaine (both those that go by this name and other equivalents) emphasises the dynamic and the quality of action on the part of the Region, the Département, the Bordeaux Metropolitan District and the Bordeaux City Council.

The area of Aquitaine is a good example - and a rare one in France - of the pump-priming role which local authorities can play in the implementation, application and generalisation of such approaches in educational establishments.

- **Approaches aimed at primary schools:**

In the Gironde, the **Bordeaux Metropolitan District (CUB)** has sought to develop a set of teaching measures since 2001. All these measures and the programme provided for teachers were designed by the administrative Academy in compliance with circulars issued by the Department of Education. Naturally, the school-based Agenda 21 initiative is the most highly-developed form of education for sustainable development which is available to schools. All stakeholders in the school are committed to this approach indefinitely. The CUB decided that an association, the CREAQ, should assist each establishment with this approach. This is because it is still experimental in nature and gives rise to many questions.

The CUB also decided that teaching staff, and more generally, all stakeholders involved in the programme, should have the support of an expert. In order for schools to be aware of what they are committing to, the CUB sends out a teaching guide explaining the various actions involved and organises an initial meeting with the school headmaster and a second with the teaching staff in order for everyone to be involved. It remains in permanent contact with the school.

Today, 10 establishments are committed to a school-based Agenda 21 process. Each of the schools has set up a steering committee, almost all of them have completed their diagnostic report on eco-mobility and that on eco-consumption, and some of them have even started taking action, such as Rosa Bonheur School in Bassens, with its walking bus. Following a decision taken by their steering committees, other schools have had a democratic vote in which pupils, teachers, parents and council staff took part in order to choose which actions should be implemented following the diagnostic report.

In order to improve this measure, an assessment meeting has been organised with the contact teachers from each steering committee. This has been an opportunity for the schools to get to know one another. Workgroups have been able to consider three topics:

- the forms of governance for elementary-level school-based Agenda 21 initiatives,
- supporting resources for elementary-level school-based Agenda 21 initiatives,
- methodological approaches for elementary-level school-based Agenda 21 initiatives.

These three topics were defined by looking at the results of an assessment questionnaire handed out to each stakeholder in the school-based Agenda 21 initiative. A central theme which emerged was the question of how much time should be devoted to this programme (very demanding in terms of time, no regulatory framework, training? etc). It was noted that one third of the time earmarked for teachers to attend teaching conferences could be devoted to our school-based Agenda 21 programme. Another proposal was that training
relating to sustainable development, other than hands-on training on the job, should be organised for teachers.

Lastly, the CUB has launched school-based Agenda 21 initiatives in 5 new establishments. It will be producing a report on the extension of this programme across the board. It has also undertaken to make the results of this analysis available to other local authorities in Aquitaine and throughout France.

The following primary schools are committed to a school-based Agenda 21: école Rosa Bonheur, (Bassens), école Joliot Curie (Bègles), école Raymond Claverie (Eysines), école Louis Pasteur (Floirac), école Jean Jaurès (Mérignac), école George Leygues (Pessac), école Les Bords de Garonne (St Louis de Montferrand), école Jean Moulin (Villenave d’Ornon), école St Anne (Le Bouscat).

Since it was set up, some adjustments have been made to the "pedagogy and sustainable development" resource with the following aims:

- Fulfilling teachers' expectations more effectively.
  

- Encouraging discussion and debate between the world of education, associations and local authorities about issues relating to sustainable development.

For the 2008-2009 school year, the CUB has set itself the following objectives:

- Raising the awareness of more primary school pupils. In 2007-2008, over one quarter of schools benefited from one of the initiatives developed as part of our approach. We would like more than one third of schools to be reached next year.

- Facilitating greater autonomy on the part of teachers with regard to obtaining information, carrying out projects and compensating them for this. The CUB will fund only actions which are incorporated into a pedagogical project.

- Bringing together institutional and environmental partners in the technical and financial implementation of this measure. This is the principal purpose of the contracts appended to this decision.

- Encouraging actions which are long-term, multi-themed and assessed.

  • Initiatives aimed at the lower secondary schools:

For lower secondary schools in the Gironde, the Gironde Département Council launched a request for projects addressed to establishments in June 2007. This project thus forms part of the local authority Agenda 21, and contributes to the promotion of education for sustainable development and school-based Agenda 21 initiatives.

The request for "school-based Agenda 21" projects is a further addition to the measures for raising awareness of environmental and eco-citizen issues taken by the Département Council to enable establishments who so wish to commit to an overall sustainable development approach.

The objectives of the request for projects are as follows:

- providing clarity and coherence with regard to public-sector action at every local level, from primary school through to secondary education and linked in with the Gironde Agenda 21.
- encouraging and assisting lower secondary schools who so wish to implement school-based Agenda 21 programmes in consultation with all stakeholders in the establishment and in the Gironde area, with special emphasis on the issues of participation (including society at large), the cross-disciplinary aspects and assessment, by means of a request for projects, a contract-based form of qualitative research with set criteria,

- promoting emulation and transfer of experience between Agenda 21 lower secondary schools.

The request for projects includes a number of fundamental principles:

- Lower secondary school Agenda 21s must place pupils in every year of the school at the heart of this initiative. Each pupil should be capable of apprehending every stage of its implementation. Agenda 21 approaches for lower secondary schools are complementary to local Agenda 21 approaches being run by local authorities (municipality, groups of municipalities, local areas, \textit{département}, etc),

- The Département is actively conscious of the strong teaching component in lower secondary school Agenda 21 initiatives and the autonomy of the establishment.

- The lower secondary school is actively conscious of the need for local authorities to be involved in the choice of actions to be implemented. In other words, the budgetary impact of the selected actions should not result in unequal treatment of establishments within a single administrative area.

Practically speaking, this support from the Gironde Département Council relates to consultancy assistance during the 2-year period corresponding to the concerted drafting of a school-based Agenda 21 initiative. On the basis of the establishment project, a subsidy for a maximum of €3000 over two years is earmarked for methodological support by an association selected by the school to implement the approach and organise consultation between stakeholders from the diagnostic report through to the action programme.

The department of lower secondary education, lower secondary school coordinators and the Agenda 21 office can also provide methodological and technical support for candidate establishments, as may Département Council departments, on a more sectorial basis depending on the priority themes which have been defined by the school.

Creating synergy between approaches is possible in a School-based Agenda 21 Département Committee, which provides overall coordination and encourages the exchange of experience and best practices in terms of sustainable development in the Gironde. This instrument also appears to be relevant to integrate assessments of the various approaches at the level of the \textit{département}, upwards, downwards and transversely.

\textit{The procedures and criteria for this request for projects are consistent with Department of Education policy, the national methods guide and, locally, with initiatives undertaken by the Bordeaux Metropolitan District and the Region concerning primary schools and upper secondary schools. They are in line with the objectives and principles for action of the Gironde Agenda 21.}

- \textbf{Approaches aimed at upper secondary schools:}

At the same time, the \textit{Aquitaine Region} is also supporting 10 Agenda 21 experiments in upper secondary schools.

The Regional Council has developed a policy promoting education for sustainable development as part of the exercise of its remit. This means that the Regional Council's commitments include training and raising awareness of upper secondary school pupils with respect to the preservation of the environment, the promotion of equal opportunities and making educational establishments exemplary in environmental terms. The launch of school-based Agenda 21 initiatives at the start of the 2007/08 school year in upper secondary schools in the Aquitaine has made it possible to ensure the coherence of all
these actions on the basis of a participatory approach adopted by the educational community.

By encouraging young people to become practically involved and contribute to discussion and action, the Regional Council has, through these Agenda 21 initiatives, opened the way for active, participatory citizenship which takes up the new issues faced by all:

- the fight against climate change,
- the protection of non-renewable resources,
- renewing links with nature and biodiversity,
- the fight against inequalities and all forms of discrimination,
- solidarity with deprived populations both locally and worldwide, etc.

This is based on the observation that educational establishments are much more than a place of learning and that they are favourable places to implement exemplary actions, particularly with respect to sustainable development. The Aquitaine Regional Council supports the development of Agenda 21 approaches within upper secondary schools in Aquitaine in order for the educational community to be actively trained in sustainable development.

In the 2007/2008 school year, there was an experimental approach with nine volunteer establishments which were representative of various branches of education and apprenticeship, located throughout the region and selected in consultation with the regional educational authority. In partnership with ADEME, the Regional Council will be providing financial support for the project to develop school-based Agenda 21 initiatives run by establishments as regards organisation and consultation.

The following educational establishments are involved in Aquitaine: LPO Alcide Dusolier (Nontron 24), LPO Val de Garonne (Marmande 47), LGT Gaston Fébus (Orthez 64), LP LG Elsée Reclus (Sainte-Foy-La-Grande 33), LP LGT Philippe Cousteau (Saint-André-de-Cubzac 33), LGTA CFA Hector Serres (Heugas 40), LGT Pape Clément (Pessac 33), LGT Condorcet (Bordeaux 33), LPR Saint Elisabeth (Saint-Pandelon 40).

In 2009, the Aquitaine Region will be inviting a further 10 upper secondary schools to adopt an Agenda 21 approach entitled "a climate plan for Aquitaine lycées", the aim of this being to reduce their energy consumption and greenhouse gas emissions.

• Approaches in university environments:

Higher education in Aquitaine is also highly active in terms of the implementation of Agenda 21 initiatives, for instance the Institut EGID at the Université Michel de Montaigne – Bordeaux 3.

The vocation of this public establishment is, in relation with its research activities, to train students from second-year degree level to second-year Masters level in geology, hydrogeology, imaging and human ecology.

In March 2007, a sustainable development policy forming part of a formal approach of an Agenda 21 type was approved by the members of the Institute and by the Chancellor's Office of Bordeaux 3 University.

The purpose of the project is to render the workings of the Institute coherent with its teaching and research activities in the field of the environment and sustainable development. Although it is focusing primarily on environmental aspects in the short term, to a lesser degree, it incorporates the social and economic dimensions associated with a structure of this nature.

It is also hoped that this undertaking, which is experimental in nature given the particularities of the Institute, may serve as a reference when the whole of the University of Bordeaux 3
adopts a sustainable development policy, and possibly even more broadly, alongside other initiatives, for the whole of the university campus.

Following the setting up of a steering committee made up of a score of people representing various aspects of university life - students, research lecturers, technical and administrative staff and university management - several working meetings have taken place in order to provide information to Committee members and identify priority avenues for action.

The following have been achieved as a result of the actions undertaken:

- collection of the opinions of members of the Institute by means of a survey (perceptions, level of awareness, suggestions, etc);
- carrying out the required technical alterations to correct a certain number of problems following a "water" audit;
- the start of investigations in the field of health and safety to improve laboratory procedures (labelling, storage, safety guidelines, etc);
- launching an "energy" status report (consumption, loss, wastage, etc);
- compiling a documentary file on Agenda 21 initiatives;
- carrying out an initial approach to student quality of life indicators.

This work was carried out thanks to the contribution of students as part of supervised practicals and placements.

Following the assessment at the end of the first year, new commitments have been made with respect to communications (internal and external), noise pollution (noise audit), waste management and monitoring indicators.

➢ "Partner" associations for school-based Agenda 21 initiatives

To respond to the needs of establishments which have adopted an Agenda 21 approach, associations have pooled their competencies to put together support methods and tools.

The role of these support workers is to help teams design and complete their collective project. They ensure that the various stages of the Agenda 21 are implemented. They are a resource person who makes available methodological resources and technical tools and offers the establishment their network of specialist contributors.

They help establishments to appropriate the method and establish milestones to ensure the project is completed and carries on in the long term. Their aim is to accompany those running the project so that the latter become autonomous.

At the same time, associations intervene to provide themed awareness sequences, which are designed to reinforce actions within the establishment in the field of sustainable development.

The network culture of the non-profit Association environment and existing structures at the regional level (as the GRAINE Aquitaine network) enable establishments to benefit not only from the experience of their support association but also from their network as a whole.

Meetings, virtual forums and the pooling of pedagogical and methodological resources are constant sources of progress as regards support procedures.

The various initiatives relating to the environment and sustainable development in Aquitaine also make it possible to develop genuine synergies between associations, local authorities and the world of education. Joint work is in progress with a view to ensuring the success of school-based Agenda 21 approaches.

In order to respond to increasing needs, a training programme to assist establishments using Agenda 21 needs to be considered. New associations could then take hold of this
opportunity to diversify their activities and develop their competencies in the field of sustainable development and mediation.

In order to implement this type of training, the support of all stakeholders involved in these approaches (associations, local authorities, Department of Education) is of primary importance.

Experience feedback and the assessment of Agenda 21 approaches currently underway make it possible to put together an appropriate training programme.

➢ Problems encountered in approaches in Aquitaine:
Implementing Agenda 21 approaches in schools and universities is not a simple task.

Some of the aspects with which local authorities are faced are as follows:

- the need to bring together all stakeholders and all school projects, taking into account the degree of familiarity with sustainable development and the degree to which the Agenda 21 approach is owned by the teachers concerned;

- official recognition by the Department of Education of the approaches (training; hours worked; compensation) and the difficulty schools have in organising steering committees, particularly during school hours (issue of pupil supervision). The approach requires a significant amount of work, teachers need to prepare each committee meeting but have little or no time to do so and therefore have to do this in their spare time;

- appropriation by teachers of this approach and its cross-disciplinary teaching application, particularly through the exchange and promotion of best practices.

- making the approach long-term by continuing to innovate as well as maintaining what has already been set up; combining widely varying timescales, which range from a few months (pupils/students) to years (staff and institutions);

- multi-partner cooperation to ensure a continuum of information in order for school-based Agenda 21s to form part of a pupil's entire educational experience, from primary through to the end of secondary education.

- the implementation of indicators and assessment tools to measure the effectiveness of school-based Agenda 21 approaches. This raises a number of questions: what should be measured? How can this educational movement be assessed in the long term? At present, it is only possible for local authorities in Aquitaine to assess the relevance of the methods offered; the survey carried out by the CUB may provide factors enabling behaviours adopted as a result of the approach to be assessed (which behaviours? By whom? With what results?)

- Training of people intervening in the classroom (from associations or under contract) to assist teams with the implementation of the Agenda 21 in the establishment

➢ Questions raised by local experiences in Aquitaine:
The implementation of Agenda 21 approaches in schools and universities is not a simple matter. Some of the aspects with which local authorities are faced as follows:

- the need to bring together all stakeholders and all school projects, taking into account the degree of familiarity with sustainable development and the degree to which the Agenda of approach is owned by the teachers concerned;

- the social representations and power plays within school environments, "political" local authorities, associations, etc. Fears of instrumentalisation, commoditisation and questions relating to the role and right of involvement of each stakeholder with respect to the others;
- the extent to which it is difficult for schools to organise steering committees, particularly during school hours, which raises difficulties with respect to pupil supervision. The approach requires a significant amount of work, teachers need to prepare each committee meeting but have little or no time to do so and therefore have to do this in their spare time;
- having teaching resources which are as appropriate as possible and teaching resources for pupils, particularly in terms of relevance and ease of use;
- making the approach long-term by continuing to innovate as well as maintaining what has already been set up; combining widely varying timescales, which range from a few months (pupils/students) to years (staff and institutions);
- the implementation of indicators and assessment tools to measure the effectiveness of school-based Agenda 21 approaches. This raises a number of questions: what should be measured? How can this educational movement be assessed in the long term? At present, it is only possible for local authorities in Aquitaine to assess the relevance of the methods offered;
- coordination which facilitates networking between various establishments, be they establishments in the same category (infant schools, primary schools, lower or upper secondary schools) or between establishments forming part of a vertical continuum from infant to upper secondary school in a single area (local integration);
- a greater degree of openness, with more co-operation with non-profit stakeholders such as GRAINE to establish a real sphere of ESD in the school and extracurricular environments.

➢ Creating synergies between approaches

Oversight and support for these various approaches are provided by coordinated action on the part of the various local authorities involved (CRA, CG33, CUB) in partnership with ADEME, the Department of Education and the local ESD non-profit association network, in order to provide clarity and coherence in public-sector action at every level of local government, from primary through to secondary education.

Within this context, and in order to fulfil the requirements of these projects in terms of coherence, support structures are involved in a continuous improvement and collective training process which is in harmony with national and international frames of reference.

Today, local authorities in Aquitaine are keen to pursue this approach by pooling all their resources and expertise in terms of education for sustainable development of the younger generation as well as the wider population.

This partnership will be officially enshrined, during this symposium, by the signature of a three-way agreement on joint objectives.

The three local authorities have decided to unite on the basis of a joint frame of reference and shared ambitions in terms of ESD in the world of education, thereby giving themselves a joint instrument of dialogue with partners from state education and non-profit associations.

This institutional commitment will enable the following:

- formalising the coordinated support by local authorities of school-based Agenda 21 initiatives,
- identification of a network of resource partners to support school-based Agenda 21 initiatives; establishing a training cycle for support workers.
- exchanges and pooling with respect to assessment and evaluation of the various measures.
In addition to creating synergies between institutional approaches, the establishments involved also encourage exchanges of experience.

The School-based Agenda 21 Département Committee has enabled a network of educational establishments with Agenda 21 approaches to be set up in partnership with the Bordeaux regional education authority. Furthermore, The Bordeaux Metropolitan District - CUB - will, as of the new school year, be opening a discussion platform for teachers involved in a school-based Agenda 21 process.

The aim is to provide coordination for the whole and encourage the exchanges of experience and best practices and the pooling of resources and reference documents, as well as encourage meetings between project managers and the transfer of best practices and useful local contacts.

**Workshop 3**

Raising awareness of sustainable development by means of actions and events, by organising local co-operation and networking.

*Moderator: Richard COCONNIER (Bordeaux Aquitaine National Theatre - TNBA)*

*Rapporteur: Dominique BOYER (Bordeaux Urban Community - CUB)*

As awareness of the general public with respect to sustainable development progresses, events and one-off activities are increasingly taking this aspect into account and seeking to reduce their environmental impact. Their transitory nature and the high concentration of people involved means that they often have a significant impact on the environment. The issue is therefore one of designing events incorporating the principles of eco-design (incorporating sustainable development right from the product design phase for goods, services and procedures) and encouraging the public to adopt environmentally responsible behaviour during their leisure activities. Commitments on the part of sporting, cultural and professional events which bring together many members of the general public also represent a good way of raising the awareness of the general public with respect to environmentally-friendly gestures and disseminating best practices.

Major national events have now adopted a responsible approach in this respect. The Rugby World Cup and the French Handball Cup in 2007 were opportunities for the Ministry of Sustainable Development to send out a call to the organisers of cultural and sporting events and professional exhibitions to implement environmentally responsible approaches. In support of this, a guide to environmentally responsible communications was published by the ADEME in 2007. Sports networks such as the National Olympic and Sports Committee and the UFOLEP took action, as did events management professionals, who have set up the ‘éco-événement.org’ website.

More recently, the organisation of the Beijing Olympics was the subject of a report by the United Nations Programme for the Environment on the investments made to limit the environmental impacts of the event.28

While the impact of such processes relies on the commitment of the whole chain of stakeholders (organising teams, suppliers, participants, partners, visitors, etc), it also requires the mobilisation of local resources which are available and can be mobilised, and the involvement and setting up of local, professional, topical and non-profit networks.

This enables various avenues to be pursued by the organisers:

28 "The BOCOG endeavoured to ensure that installations are paying special attention to energy efficiency, the use of environmentally-friendly materials, water conservation and environmental management and control on construction work sites. One interesting innovation was the use throughout all installations of heat pump systems to recover energy from the ground, air and water to provide heating in winter and cooling in summer."

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
how the event is to take place, examined well beforehand so as to have minimal impact on the environment: selection of the location, eco-design of stands, printing, recycling options, re-use of the facilities and assessment of the results;

- involvement of event partners: suppliers, exhibitors, contributors, and sources of funding, with a proactive editorial line;

- raising awareness of the public with respect to acts promoting sustainable development, with the publication of a "eco-visitor guide", suitable messages on traditional event communications media, exhibition/participation of associations, etc.

In Aquitaine, institutional and non-profit partners have decided to move forward together to address this dimension. The principal objectives of a collective approach undertaken in 2008 were awareness-raising, information, putting together common resources and sharing experience.

A desire to work together

In 2008, Aquitaine had over 40 local authorities involved in Agenda 21. Local authorities and other partners in the Gironde joined forces in the Agenda 21 Gironde Département Committee (CDA21), which comprises almost 30 local authorities, including the Regional Council, the Département Council, the Bordeaux Metropolitan District (CUB) 17 municipalities, 11 district authorities and 5 local areas as well as some 40 institutional, technical and non-profit stakeholders.

Approaches designed to serve as examples were launched by means of local Agenda 21 processes. Naturally, local authorities organising events found themselves with a new concern: being coherent with the stated sustainable development policies and making use of these opportunities to meet the general public and raise awareness with respect to sustainable development and environmentally-friendly citizenship. The second concern, which arose from the desire to identify avenues for improvement and innovation, was to combine our efforts with those undertaken in associations, sports and culture and those undertaken by events management professionals who were also active in this respect.

On the basis of a regional coordinating body made up of the stakeholders behind the approach (Regional Council, Gironde Département Council, the ADEME, the Aquitaine Network for Contemporary Music, Music’Action and Meduli Nature), a working group was set up in the Gironde, bringing together some 40 stakeholders from a variety of backgrounds: local authorities (municipalities, district authorities, the département, Region, CUB, etc), institutional partners (ADEME, DRDJS, IDDAC, etc), network leaders (CDOS, UFOLEP, RAMA, UFOLEP, Ligue de l’enseignement, etc) and events organisers (Musique de nuits, Music’Action, Journades de Villandraut, etc).

In February 2008, a joint action programme was defined for this "experimental year": this involved beginning an awareness-raising movement for stakeholders, identifying initiatives under way, supporting some "landmark" events in Aquitaine and, on the basis of all these experiences, producing a practical guide with plenty of space given over to regional experience.

Cooperation between institutions and event organisers represents a desire to share common references: a universally recognized technical partner was selected (the Meduli Nature Association), competencies and training were strengthened, experiences were shared, a common resource was produced (the basis defining sustainable events in Aquitaine), all this in liaison with work carried out at the national level. "Subsidiarity and partnership".

Regional particularity: solidarity and social concerns

Sustainable development is still too often understood as relating solely to environmental concerns and issues relating to the preservation of natural resources and the planet.
However, values such as intergenerational solidarity, equity, the welfare of all and social cohesion are fundamental to undertake any sustainable initiative.

This is why the regional coordination body decided to add an aspect dealing with solidarity and citizenship to the traditional themes present in environmentally responsible approaches. This is the particularity of this approach, which also raises questions related to financial and social accessibility, contact between generations, consideration of reduced-mobility and disabled individuals, partnerships with local and specialist structures, the design of solidarity-related aspects forming part of the event, etc.

Actions undertaken in 2008: a picture of local coordination

In 2008, at a regional level, with rather more been done in Gironde, a programme comprising 5 actions was implemented:

- Organising general awareness-raising sessions
- Organising practical themed workshops for event organisers
- Assisting 8 festivals by providing a Regional sustainable development manager
- Overseeing one festival in particular in order to engage more highly-developed and innovative actions
- Publication and dissemination of a practical guide featuring local experiences

These actions were established with the co-operation of all the local authorities involved in the Agenda 21 Gironde Département Committee (CDA21), who established the programme together and got the local stakeholders involved.

The relay function of local authorities was a genuine factor of success because they mobilised locally and because since they were already committed to Agenda 21 approaches, they had already raised the awareness of local stakeholders with respect to sustainable development.

• Stakeholder training and networking

Three awareness-raising sessions and twelve practical themed workshops were run by Meduli Nature in the Gironde between April and July 2008. These involved over 170 participants.

The aim of this programme was to raise the awareness of organisers of all kinds (local authorities, associations, events management professionals) and from all spheres (sport, culture, local festivals, etc), preferably ones working with local authorities engaged in Agenda 21.

15 sessions took place to examine issues arising from taking into account sustainable development in the preparation, organisation and progress of an event, based on six key topics: communication, transport and accommodation, water and energy saving and consumption, waste sorting and management, responsible purchasing and solidarity and citizenship.

The forthcoming practical guide will be produced on the basis of this content, once the principal recommendations have been "tested" at festivals and events run by the stakeholders involved or assisted by Meduli Nature.

Stakeholders who have been identified or who have signed up have formed the basis of a network for us, which will need to be consolidated in the years to come, naturally with the support of the existing network leaders.

• Assistance with "landmark" festivals

8 festivals benefited from the involvement of a sustainable development manager from Meduli Nature. These festivals were selected on the basis of a number of criteria:
demonstration of awareness and a desire to serve as examples; being a significant event at the regional level (attendance figures); being a member of the Aquitaine contemporary music network or being located in a municipality engaged in Agenda 21; benefiting from support from the Region or département.

The aim was to assist organisers in defining a sustainable development strategy on the basis of what they had already begun and those topics which they wished to engage with: actions which had already been begun in previous years; priorities for action in terms of the available human and financial resources and/or the educational impact for festival-goers and partners alike, mobilisation of suppliers and volunteers, appropriate communications, etc.

The idea was to help structure an internal approach and carry out assessments of the actions undertaken in order to prepare subsequent editions of the event.

A number of landmark actions have been identified from the eight festivals which received support in this way:

- 7 out of 8 festivals implemented waste sorting (organisers and general public),
- 3 out of 8 festivals used recyclable cups and did away with disposable cups,
- 4 out of 8 festivals provided dry toilets accompanied by specific information and ensuring that the waste was properly managed
- 5 out of 8 festivals encouraged people to car-share or use public transport

   • The example set by the local authorities involved

At the same time, the local authorities involved in this work applied the principles of responsibility to the events which they organised during 2008:

- For the lower secondary school festival and the inaugural evening of Scènes d’Été in the Gironde, the Département Council implemented in-depth actions relating to public transport, waste sorting and management, energy savings, responsible communications, the use of local products and even a zero-carbon-balance-objective meal for the school festival. A département charter for sustainable events will apply to all events organised by the Département.
- The cities of Pessac, Blanquefort, Bordeaux, Bègles, the Estuaire and Réolais district authorities and other members of the CDA21 were also involved in local festivals.
- As part of the "ADEME Example" approach, the Regional Agency implemented actions to reduce its impact on the environment on a day-to-day basis: transport, purchasing, services, waste and its involvement in exhibitions and fairs in the region.

   • A common commitment: the practical guide to responsible events

The objective of this first test year was the production and dissemination of a practical guide with a local emphasis and promoting the experience of regional stakeholders.

The aim of this practical guide is to facilitate implementation by providing both theoretical guidance (why action is required and what sort) and practical help (how to go about this, who to contact, pitfalls to avoid).

The content is based closely on the guide published by the ADEME and the Poitou-Charentes Region in order to be properly integrated with a national approach underwritten by the ADEME, as well as the experiences carried out during the experimental year: discussions during the awareness-raising sessions, feedback from the festivals supported by Meduli Nature, local authorities and stakeholders in CDA21, etc. In practical terms, this guide will provide three types of information:
- general information derived from the Poitou-Charentes guide (a list of actions to be developed)
- practical, virtually methodological information (action sheets)
- concrete information: feedback from past experience (experience-exchanging sheets).

This will take the form of a digital file; a multi-entry toolbox which will be available only online, making it easier to update.

However, a summary brochure is also planned: this will be used to raise awareness, particularly on the part of structures who ask for aid from local authorities.

➢ **The next step: leverage and questions**

One question is to know what avenues can be envisaged to progress further in the implementation of sustainable development approaches within the various events, what kind of leverage can be used and what sort of issues this raises.

Another is to know how the value of such actions can be demonstrated to the general public and to event partners.

➢ *What are the issues relating to communications relating to successful actions? How should communication with respect to actions implemented during an event take place? How can people be engaged in acts of responsible greenness and solidarity?*

The establishment of a network would facilitate the exchange of experience and make it easier to assist those starting out and those wanting to do more. Rather than setting up an ad hoc network, current proposals and initiatives are tending more towards incorporating these concerns into existing networks.

➢ *What is the new role of network leaders? What training do they require? How can experience exchange and feedback be organised?*

Pooling (skills, equipment and purchasing etc) is one way of facilitating implementation and keeping better control of the financial aspect.

➢ *What should be pooled? Which stakeholders should be mobilised and what leverage and tools are available?*

Some actions require specific competencies because they require not only goodwill and common sense, but also specific technical equipment and thus specific professional expertise, particularly as regards energy, the eco-design of stands and so on.

➢ *How can events professionals and technicians be impacted and how can events agencies be mobilised?*

How can partners and suppliers for events be mobilised and their awareness raised?

➢ *What are the issues in terms of mobilising and raising the awareness of partners and suppliers? How can the offer in terms of responsible products be expanded and how can partnerships and relationships with suppliers be progressed?*

Recognition of responsible approaches: some festivals and events declare themselves to be responsible or environmentally-friendly. However, not all have the same level of commitment and communication may be muddled due to these different levels of commitment.

➢ *Should events with a high degree of commitment receive some sort of certification? What common checklist could provide this type of recognition? What sort of inspection could there be? Should self-assessment approaches which encourage continuous and progressive commitment on the part of organisations be encouraged?*
Reports and conclusions from workshops

For the three topics which have been dealt with during the workshops which lasted throughout the day, the idea was to present and discuss experiences and achievements in Aquitaine (morning), plus reports from other areas in France and further afield (afternoon).

At the end of the day, the participants met together to attend a plenary session to hear reports on the work of all three workshops, discuss the results, take part in the presentation of the conclusions and select the final proposed recommendations.

- Reports from workshops

Before summarising the workshops, each rapporteur explained how their workshop progressed and what key ideas emerged.

**Workshop 1 - Rapporteur: Jean-Louis BERGEY (ADEME Aquitaine)**

In terms of methods, we had a presentation of five rather different experiences in terms of education as well as awareness-raising and information. We then had a presentation of experiences from abroad regarding a wide variety of initiatives which highlighted how worthwhile concerted efforts are.

To provide an initial summary of what education for sustainable development means to those who were present, I would say two things. Firstly, an awful lot of people and things are involved because there are many public and private stakeholders and a wide variety of information. This leads to an indistinct universe in which there are concepts, aims, objectives and terminology which are not always very clear for all concerned. In addition, there is more than one forum of information which sometimes leads to differing information. This has made it necessary to clarify things somewhat.

One point raised related to the training and awareness-raising of councillors and administrative staff in various local authorities, firstly in order for them to be familiar with sustainable development and with education for sustainable development, and to enable them to know who to turn to. The idea is for there to be a single window.

This training and awareness-raising are also important to improve transversality within local authorities. This is required because things are still structured and perceived in a highly activity-specific manner. This could also improve transversality between local authorities so that they speak and act in a concerted manner.

A need to provide certification for such training in sustainable development was noted, to make things clearer for everyone.

With respect to the lack of clarity in sustainable development, the idea is to use language which is simple, clear, understandable and based on highly practical approaches and requests by individuals.

Throughout, we noted the importance of working with things which can be measured.

Another thing which can hinder clarity is a lack of implementation of participatory approaches. Is there a fear of such participatory approaches? Opening up debate means placing oneself in an uncomfortable position in which one's own knowledge is challenged.

Another question was how to reach all types of audience, which ties in with the difficulty of explaining various competencies. What media should be used? We emphasised the importance of doing things outside office hours in order to reach everybody. It is only possible to reach some people at weekends or in the evenings.

The final point raised related to the notion of time. We are in a society of immediacy, whereas sustainable development requires time.
- **Workshop 2 - Rapporteur: Julie CHABAUD (Conseil Général de Gironde)**

The subject of this workshop was the added value of local stakeholder coordination with respect to school-based Agenda 21 initiatives. The workshop looked at the experience of local authorities in Aquitaine before opening up to consider experience from other local authorities and regions.

Various ways of leveraging local coordination in terms of education for sustainable development were identified:

- partnerships,
- pooling of resources by Agenda 21 establishments within state education and also within agricultural education,
- pooling of resources by local authorities and Agenda 21 establishments,
- the need for a common culture,
- the promotion of best practices,
- the proactiveness of local authorities with respect to school-based Agenda 21 initiatives,
- training within state education and, more generally, of all stakeholders,
- bearing in mind that pupils are at the heart of this measure,
- questions relating to dynamic governance,
- coherence between primary and secondary levels of education.

The obstacles relate to school-based Agenda 21 sustainable development approaches. These are overall approaches, which is difficult because we are not used to such all-encompassing approaches in such compartmentalised, subject-oriented environments.

Difficulties also reside in the calling into question of existing relationship structures, both within establishments, between teachers and learners and heads and staff in a process which tends to place everyone at the same level in a discussion, which is difficult to cope with on a personal level and to manage.

This calling into question also occurs when considering the relationships between different types of stakeholders who are supposed to be acting in a partner-based approach (Department of Education, associations, business, etc).

We also noted the difficulty with implementation, which requires distinguishing and properly identifying what is being done with respect to two objectives. Firstly, the pragmatic objective, which aims to implement actions, and which sometimes obscures an educational objective, despite the latter being the main priority.

Our role is definitely one of educating and engaging a profound change in society. Action programmes which are based solely on pragmatism may sometimes lead people to forget the fundamental issue which is the educational dimension.

Another obstacle which was often mentioned was that of time, with associations in particular raising the alarm regarding a halt to staff being made available.

In addition, we emphasised the anxiety factor in sustainable development issues, particularly for younger children in primary schools. The positive aspects of this approach must not, therefore, be forgotten.

Another difficulty is that of maintaining the dynamic over time, although there again we are dealing with a massive cultural shift. Everybody is fundamentally agreed as to the dynamics of sustainable development, but not everybody has perceived just what this means in terms of participation and assessment. This does not form part of our culture and can be difficult for everybody.
We also highlighted the difficulty inherent in the fact that we are committed to doing a lot of things, but also dealing with resources which are unchanged or even being scaled back.

As to our recommendations, we have attempted to be as brief as possible.

We have basically concentrated on local governance with the aim of ensuring effective local coordination. We heard about the example of the PACA Region with a multi-stakeholder exchange platform which enabled the definition of joint frames of reference, joint policy and joint action.

The issue of the need to have frames of reference arose repeatedly.

We also noted the need to have proper definition of what each aspect consists of. Being environmentally responsible is very honourable, but this is not equivalent to an overall sustainable development approach for Anna Agenda 21.

Lastly, the question of the mobilisation of local councillors was raised, particularly by means of local mobilisation.

- Workshop 3 - Rapporteur: Axel CREPEY (Meduli Nature Association)

The purpose of the workshop was to see how to participate in ESD by means of events and by organising cooperation at a local level in various areas.

The goal of the workshop was to review what had been done in Aquitaine and in the département. We heard about an initiative carried out in the Aquitaine region and the Gironde département which related to supporting organisers and training. We have several testimonies of events which launched various responsible initiatives and local authorities who endeavoured to make this knowledge and skills available to their local network.

There are several aspects to the idea of a responsible event. One relates to how the event is put on and attempts to minimise the impact of the event on the environment. This requires practical work, particularly as regards taking on board sustainable development criteria. A second aspect relates to the involvement of all partners involved in the events (backers, artists, participants and suppliers).

The third aspect relates to ESD and how this work carried out by organisers to take account of sustainable development can be used to educate the people attending such events. Participants are often consumers of various events, but we are now attempting to get to the point at which participants are also stakeholders and are able to see that new attitudes are possible on the basis of example actions performed at events.

The first source of leverage concerns the training and awareness of the organisers themselves. Organising an event is a job in its own right; incorporating sustainable development criteria into this job is another job in its own right. The leverage consists in training these organisers so that they reduce their impact on the environment and incorporate criteria relating to solidarity and social criteria.

Secondly, there is this indispensable work of coordination between various networks. In this respect, a working party has been set up in the Gironde, in other words on quite a large territorial scale. The issue is to know how all the information available and skills shared in these consultations at the regional level can be transferred to a more local level.

Concerning events, these not involve only events gathering tens of thousands of people, but also local dances, prize draws, sporting events and professional exhibitions. The issue is one of transferring competencies from a level of general expertise to a local level with the help in particular of themed networks such as cultural networks and sports federations who can pass on the notion of a responsible event in their particular sphere of competency.

A third source of leverage that was identified is the pooling of skills and experience. There is not necessarily much cooperation between the various structures in either the cultural or sporting environments. However, sustainable development represents a way for various
stakeholders to begin to work in corporation and seek to pool the purchase of equipment, competencies and jobs.

In addition, I mentioned the involvement of partners in an event just now; acting together can help to apply pressure or support progress in this respect as regards supplies and professionals working in the field of events. The greater the demand for partners to be involved, the easier it will be to implement visible actions to educate the public.

Another source of leverage relates to support by local authorities. Events stakeholders still need the support of local authorities in terms of technical, human and logistics support, with a resulting desire for transversality within these local authorities themselves.

The final source of leverage relates to recognition. When a responsible approach is launched with respect to an event, this can have a strong impact in terms of raising awareness. However, sometimes there are self-proclaimed initiatives or hype which exceeds what is actually done.

To see more clearly what is actually happening, a recognition tool such as some form of certification is called for, although this seems very complex to implement for this type of topic. A way of recognizing and identifying best practices and/or those who are doing the right kind of thing would be very worthwhile. This could take the form of a charter or other document of this nature.

We also noted a number of hindrances and difficulties, particularly as regards the extra workload. The job of the organisers is to organise the event, and they do not take into account all these sustainable development criteria beforehand.

The difficulty for them lies in the concepts, work and additional investment which may be required in technical, logistical, human and financial terms. We also highlighted the difficulty of various teams integrating these objectives relating to educating the public and education for sustainable development.

We have heard reports of people who are highly aware and motivated to go down this road, but also encountered difficulties engendered by people working with them who were much less so. How can our partners be made more aware so that we can all progress together in the same direction? The answer appeared of its own accord, because it became apparent that it is by example that we can incite others to launch this type of approach.

Lastly, we highlighted cooperation difficulties between various structures in various networks (both culture and sport). However, the sustainable development aspect does allow this to be opened up because there are already experiences underway in structures beginning to think about this kind of topic, which was not the case when they were working on other subjects.

**Conclusions from workshops**

- **Workshop 1: Local coordination to inform and raise awareness of all types of population**
  
  **Moderator and rapporteur: Jean-Louis BERGEY, ADEME**

  - Initial observations: a "lot of stuff" (multiple sources of information and stakeholders) and an "indistinct world" (in terms of concept, objectives, forums of information, etc), requiring clarity

  - **Key no.1: Training and awareness-raising**

    - Councillors and technicians,
    - To familiarise them with the subject
    - So they know who to turn to (single window?)
To improve transversality within and between local authorities

- Need for official certification of trainings

- **Key no.2: clarification**
  - Using simple, clear and understandable language
  - Start with broad-based, concrete approaches (e.g. Agenda 21) and simple initiatives (waste, water savings, etc) so that people are not confused and the results are measurable (the MEDDAT national assessment reference document for Agenda 21 initiatives is awaited)

- **Key no.3: participation**
  - Observation: weakness or absence of implementation of a participatory approach despite this being a key for mutual enrichment and education for sustainable development for all. The fears of losing power and knowledge etc must be overcome.
  - How can the general public be reached?
  - Difficulty of explaining the various competencies of local authorities and institutions: who does what?
  - Identifying good relay media
  - Moving outside office hours to reach all populations

- **Key no.4: Taking the time**
  - The time required by the project
  - Getting beyond political and/or economic short termism
  - The time required for thinking to mature and progress: “the pace of a novel by François Mauriac rather than that of 24”...

**Workshop 2: Local coordination for school-based Agenda 21 initiatives**

*Moderator: Christine DELHAYE, Comité 21*
*Rapporteur: Julie CHABAUD, Gironde Département Council*

- **Sub-workshop 2.1: local experience in Aquitaine**
  - *Alexandra Siarri*, responsible for the eco-citizen awareness department, CUB
  - *Julie Chabaud*, in charge of the Agenda 21 Commission, Gironde Département Council
  - *Jean-Christophe Mazurie*, project officer, department of education, Aquitaine Regional Council

- **Sub-workshop 2.2: local experiences in areas other than Aquitaine**
  - *Claude Corroyer*, Rouen administrative Academy, ESD project manager for sustainable development establishments in Haute-Normandie & Emmanuel Bon, regional support worker for sustainable agriculture and sustainable development, DRDAF/SRFD Haute-Normandie
  - *Christophe Bergerot*, sustainable development project officer, department of education, Franche-Comté Département Council for upper secondary school Agenda 21 initiatives
  - *Aurélie Steiger*, Paris administrative Academy, earth and life sciences teacher, ESD/E3D trainer for the Cité scolaire Bergson Agenda 21
  - *Gaëlle Le Bloa*, project officer, Provence-Alpes Côte d'Azur regional consultation platform.
- Identified sources of leverage and success factors in local/ESD coordination in schools:
  o Developing partnerships
  o Coherence of public policy (CAP Department of Education, Agricultural Education, Youth and Sport, Environment, etc)
  o Making Agenda 21 initiatives part of the establishment project
  o Coherence between primary and secondary education with a view to an educational continuum from primary school through to the end of secondary school and beyond
  o Pooling: between Agenda 21 establishments (Department of Education and Agricultural Education), between Agenda 21 local authorities and Agenda 21 establishments, etc.
  o Networks, shared databases, mailing lists, etc.
  o Training for all on an inter-category and inter-disciplinary basis, perhaps first and foremost within state education (and not only for the most enthusiastic): initial and continuous training on how to progress a project and cross-disciplinary work
  o Promotion of initiatives, best practices and outstanding examples
  o Placing pupils at the heart of solutions as stakeholders / generalising eco-delegates
  o Developing project-based classes / using available measures (scientific and technical workshops, artistic workshops, supervised projects in penultimate senior year, etc)
  o Proactive local authorities (this is often determining in getting school-based Agenda 21 initiatives off the ground)
  o Interactions between local and school-based Agenda 21 initiatives: local integration of broader sustainable development approaches
  o Dynamic local governance and dialogue between local stakeholders
  o Sharing a common culture and reference documents
  o Training non-profit Association support workers to support school-based Agenda 21 initiatives
  o Support from parents

- Obstacles and hindrances to local/ESD coordination in schools:
  o "Cultural" resistance: the difficulty inherent in a global approach within partitioned institutions organised into disciplines, etc.
  o Challenges to relationship structures (vertical, hierarchical: teacher/learner, head/staff) inherent in global approaches. The difficulty of leaving behind engrained roles and positions: being willing to meet others, dialogue, debate and engage in freedom of expression and ideas, etc.
  o The significant amount of turnover of "well-disposed people" (the Department of Education has suggested setting up permanent ESD-profile positions in establishments engaged in an Agenda 21-based approach, with more time available) in schools, associations, local authorities, etc.
  o A warning with respect to associations endangered by staff no longer being made available and budgetary constraints
  o A warning with respect to the cuts within the Department of Education and the focus on "basics" at upper secondary school level, which is liable to make it more difficult to carry out cross-disciplinary pedagogical projects which allow for a genuinely systemic approach in line with school-based Agenda 21 initiatives (debate underway), as well as
the difficulty of acting with resources which remain unchanged or which are even decreasing.

- Difficulties relating to implementation and a proper balance between the pragmatic aims (actions, resources, …) and the educational aim (not be forgotten for pragmatism's sake).
- The potential for anxiety inherent in sustainable development issues for younger children
- Time: the time required for projects, time devoted by enthusiasts, time for meetings, etc
- The difficulty of maintaining a dual approach: the pragmatic angle and the pedagogical angle
- The difficulty of maintaining a dynamic over time, communication, governance
- The difficulty of reaching beyond restricted groups of highly motivated people: generalisation
- Terms relating to a cultural upheaval: participation, assessment

- Recommendations and strategic avenues for local/ESD coordination in schools:

  - A shared frame of reference (National reference framework of the ministry of Environment for Agenda 21s, …? redefining the foundations of Agenda 21 with common values), specified locally by Charters, with shared multi-stakeholder policy applications and concerted, co-ordinated actions - the issue of certification, differentiating levels of commitment to eco-responsibility from overall sustainable development approaches like Agenda 21.

  - This would require the setting up of local governance for education for sustainable development, platforms for discussion and dialogue, areas of trust in which stakeholders can meet, express their doubts, proposals, dreams, etc.
    - Identifying together the specific competencies that will be required to "change the world" and, together as stakeholders examine, on the basis of the competencies and resources available to each, who can do what to enable all populations of all ages to acquire these competencies, etc.
    - Ensure coherence between what is said and what is done ("active pedagogy") (this applies locally for local coordination and at the national level)
    - Seeing ESD as a factor in academic success (better pupil motivation and attentiveness, etc)

  - Training for all of all ages in sustainable development
  - Mobilising councillors
  - Identifying each stakeholder's role: local authorities: initiative and financial support / Department of Education: design, organisation and pedagogy / associations: technical expertise and organisation / businesses: financial and technical support

---

**Workshop 3: Local coordination to promote the link between culture and Sustainable Development**

Moderator: Richard COCONNIER, Bordeaux Aquitaine National Theatre (TNBA)
Rapporteur: Dominique BOYER (CUB)

- **Sub-workshop 3.1.:** Local coordination for the candidature for Bordeaux 2013
  - Richard COCONNIER, TNBA and Dominique BOYER, CUB

Firstly, the link between culture and sustainable development is not natural or self-evident This is perhaps why there were only ten or so of us. The relationship between culture and
sustainable development still needs to be established and clarified. This is why the presentation by Richard Coconier of the approach taken for the candidature of Bordeaux as capital of European culture in 2013 was fully relevant.

The approach involving pre-candidature and candidature submissions made it necessary to be attentive to stakeholders and to create synergies between political stakeholders including the Bordeaux Metropolitan District, which does not have a remit for culture.

Bordeaux 2013 created a dynamic, partnerships and human-sized projects.

- submissions were put together by dynamising existing partnerships and creating new ones, particularly at the political level.
- all stakeholders were fully mobilised: individuals, institutions, cultural and economic stakeholders.
- the projects were human-sized because they emerged from localities, not from the intellect, and were directed at the general public.

This is how culture participates in the solidarity aspect of sustainable development (culture which is accessible to all, aid to cultural stakeholders for various aspects of their projects, development of amateur practices) as well as in social cohesion and the creation of wealth.

**Sub-workshop 3.2.: Local coordination for responsible events**

- *Gwenaelle TUDAL (CUB) and Axel CREPEY (Meduli Nature Association)*

This workshop was devoted to the presentation of local experiences along with discussions of leveraging and difficulties relating to collective action to promote the integration of sustainable development in events.

1st source of leverage: training and raising awareness of stakeholders

- By coordinating stakeholders involved, who share a common and commonly-acknowledged awareness-raising solution

- By mobilising networks and network leaders: disseminating information to the most local level (e.g. the experience of the regional coordinating body, with particular emphasis on the Gironde, relayed to local regions, to impact municipal and district events).

Second source of leverage: support from existing themed networks: those in charge of organisation / training of their members, particularly in the fields of sport and culture (in compliance with hierarchical considerations)

Mobilisation of professional networks (supplies, etc) and lobbying suppliers: event organisers present the same requests

3rd source of leverage: pooling competencies, employment and volunteers: these new initiatives require new competencies, sometimes even new jobs, such as that of "Sustainable Development Manager" (who can be shared through an employers' group), and raising the awareness of teams with respect to the issues of sustainable development, etc.

4th source of leverage: support from local authorities: raising awareness, defining a coherent framework, encouraging without obligating; this requires transversality between local authority departments and cooperation between departments with responsibility for culture, sport, sustainable development, etc.

Hindrances:

- The reluctance of teams with respect to sustainable development: "It's more expensive, achieves nothing, etc": How can they be persuaded? Possible solutions: leading by
example, large-scale, joint awareness-raising ("we are not the only ones"), carrying out assessment of sustainable development initiatives and communicating with respect to these assessments ("it works: we have reduced our impact", etc.)

- Fresh investments required for organisations: time, volunteers, financial resources for new actions

Questions:

- How can the organisers who are genuinely committed to sustainable development initiatives be identified and how can self-proclamation be minimised?
- Is a charter or certification required with a local application?

Overall summary and closing contributions

Julie CHABAUD, Patrick BOBET, Hervé GILLÉ & Michel RICARD

➢ Overall summary

by Julie CHABAUD (Gironde Département Council)

This session was organised by local authorities from Aquitaine who are partners of this event, specifically the Aquitaine Regional Council, the Gironde Département Council, the Bordeaux Metropolitan District, the Bordeaux City Council and other key partners, the ADEME and the non-profit association network GRAINE Aquitaine.

The purpose of the session was to discuss the particularity of local coordination in terms of education for sustainable development.

Three simultaneous workshops involved between 100 and 150 people. For the three topics discussed, the aim was to present and discuss experiences and achievements in Aquitaine, add to these experiences carried out elsewhere in France and Europe, and to identify sources of leverage, hindrances and proposals and recommendations in terms of local coordination for education for sustainable development for all populations and all ages.

The first topic was that of local coordination to raise awareness and train all types of population. Some of the relevant proposals have already been noted, so I will emphasise things which I did not hear so much about in previous summaries.

The first observation is "a lot of stuff in an indistinct world". There is "a lot of stuff" in terms of information and stakeholders involved in informing and raising the awareness of all types of population, ranging from businesses and marketing through to local authorities and the Department of Education: this is not necessarily helpful. It is an "indistinct world" in terms of the concept, objectives and forums of information.

The observation from this workshop is that it is necessary to clarify the context. The chosen keys are those of training and awareness-raising for all, a need for clarification and the need for participation, with an observation regarding the weakness or even total absence of implementation of a participatory approach. Despite the latter being one of the articles of faith of sustainable development, it does not occur much in the long term.

Many events, consultations and joint meetings have been held, but participation has been insufficiently implemented in the long term despite it being a key avenue for education for sustainable development of all populations of all ages. This also assumes that it is possible to overcome the fears of losing power and expertise and thereby becoming exposed.

Another issue is to be able to explain how competencies fit together within local authorities. We need to be able to reduce the level of complexity or at least make things more intelligible to all actors. Good media relay needs to be identified; reaching everybody means working
outside of office hours, which is not the easiest of things for local government or state education.

Another key is to allow appropriate time for projects, getting beyond political and economic short-termism and thinking more in terms of the time it takes thinking to mature and progress. Mr BERGEY referred to: “the pace of a novel by François Mauriac rather than that of 24”.

The second workshop was devoted to local coordination for school-based Agenda 21 initiatives. The success factors in local coordination for education for sustainable development are: the development of partnerships, coherence between primary and secondary education seen in terms of an educational continuum and pooling between Agenda 21 establishments, the Department of Education and agricultural education and between local authorities and the establishments engaged in Agenda 21 approaches. This involves networks and shared knowledge bases.

Other factors for success include training for all, perhaps initially within state education and not necessarily solely on the basis of volunteer work by enthusiasts; promoting initiatives, best practices and exemplary achievements.

Another significant source of leverage in terms of school-based Agenda 21 initiatives that was identified was the proactive role of local authorities, who do a lot to get this type of approach going.

We also highlighted the interaction between local and school-based Agenda 21 initiatives, in other words local integration of global approaches to education for sustainable development, the sharing of a common culture, the fact that pupils should be at the heart of such actions and dynamic local governance in which there is dialogue between all stakeholders.

As to the obstacles, these are first and foremost cultural in nature. It is difficult to have a global approach in institutions which function in terms of sectors and disciplines. There is also a calling into question of established (hierarchical, vertical) relations between teachers and learners and heads and staff, since a global approach requires people to get away from institutionalised roles and positions. This involves being willing to meet others, dialogue, debate and engage in freedom of expression and ideas, etc.

A further hindrance is a significant turnover in well-disposed individuals. It has therefore been proposed that the Department of Education creates permanent education for sustainable development positions similar to those which exist for European section teachers. Managing this turnover in associations and local authorities also needs to be considered. An alert was raised with respect to associations which are in danger because of staff and funds no longer being made available, despite these associations being the local operators of education for sustainable development.

Another alert was raised with respect to resources being cut within state education and a "back-to-basics" approach which, at least on first sight, does not seem to include education for sustainable development.

There was also a minor alert raised as to the levels of anxiety with respect to the issues of sustainable development for younger children: attention needs to be paid to the type of communication used. The difficulties of maintaining dynamics over time, communicating, and reaching out beyond the circle of enthusiasts were also mentioned. Lastly, issues relating to cultural upheaval: participation and assessment, were identified.

The recommendations for a strategy for local coordination in terms of education for sustainable development in schools are: a shared frame of reference applied locally in charters, shared policies, and concerted and coordinated actions.

The national MEEDAT framework for Agenda 21 initiatives was suggested in this respect, but there was no consensus on this. The issue of some kind of certification was also raised. It
should be possible to differentiate varying levels of commitment to education for sustainable development.

Eco-responsibility is all well and good but does not represent a global approach. This would require the setting up of local governance for education for sustainable development, platforms for discussion and dialogue, areas of trust in which stakeholders can meet, express their doubts, proposals, dreams etc.

There is a need to identify together the specific competencies that will be required to "change the world" together as stakeholders examine, on the basis of the competencies and resources available to each, who can do what to enable all populations of all ages to acquire these competencies, etc.

There is a need to ensure coherence between what is said and what is done, applying "active pedagogy" at every level and seeing education for sustainable development as a factor of academic success. The experiences presented show that there is less absenteeism and that pupils are more motivated and more attentive. A further recommendation was to mobilise local councillors and offer training for all of all ages.

The third workshop was devoted to local coordination regarding the link between culture and sustainable development. Not many people attended this workshop, apparently because it is not easy to establish a link between culture and sustainable development, but the quality of the workshop was outstanding.

The candidature of Bordeaux for the title of European Capital of Culture in 2013 was the basis on which we could observe that culture participates in the solidarity aspect of sustainable development by providing culture accessible for all and by assisting cultural stakeholders in various dimensions of their projects, developing amateur practices, social cohesion and the creation of wealth.

A sub-workshop was implemented on the topic of responsible events. The sources of leverage identified were: training and awareness-raising of stakeholders, the support of existing themed networks, pooling competencies, jobs and volunteers and the support of local authorities to raise awareness, define coherent frameworks and offer incentives rather than enforce compliance.

The issue of responsible events is very important in terms of education for sustainable development. Many people attend performances and sporting events. These impact a wide cross-section of the population and are an opportunity to pass on messages on how to conduct events. They are therefore key avenues for informing and raising the awareness of all types of audience. The issue of certification was also discussed.

These strategic recommendations were reported in a plenary session to our councillors, with the idea being to see how the latter could take these up. The councillors noted the need to strengthen inter-institutional co-operation as regards education for sustainable development and, more generally, all the aspects of sustainable development which transcend political constituencies.

They also noted the need for partnership agreements to be formalised, with charters of commitment, reference frameworks, certification and contracts.

They emphasised the need for impactful communication, particularly to make inter-institutional coordination more visible, the need for there to be inter-institutional messages in institutional communications, the need for renewed relations with the media, with an increase in trust and partnership in terms of awareness-raising and generalisation to audiences of all ages.

The role of councillors in local councillor networks needs to be strengthened and emphasised, with the sharing of information, experience and training.
The key words are: a shared frame of reference, certification, co-operation, pooling, training, and local governance for education for sustainable development.

In conclusion, I would say that these summaries are somewhat frustrating in that they come across as rather dry.

The summary of our work does not convey the enthusiasm and keenness that we ought to be able to get across. If we really want to mobilise as regards education for sustainable development, we need to learn again how to smile when we present things and communicate this keenness and enthusiasm that lie at the heart of all genuine projects concerning education for sustainable development.

Closing contribution
from Patrick BOBET (In charge of Agenda 21 and sustainable development for the Bordeaux Metropolitan Authority – CUB)

I would like to remind you that we have worked under the scientific chairmanship of Michel RICARD, and assure you that the Gironde Département Council, the Bordeaux City Council, the Aquitaine Region and the Bordeaux Metropolitan Authority, which I represent, have all been determinedly, fully and very proactively interested and involved in this work.

This proactive involvement on our part really is the best proof that sustainable development is vital, simply because the survival of humanity is at stake. I believe it is important for our local authorities to get to know each other, discussing and meeting together as often as they can.

I am grateful that there are so many of you here with us and I am very proud of the fact that our four local authorities (Bordeaux City Council, the CUB, the Département and the Region) are able to work hand in hand. You spoke of Aquitaine in terms of a community; I would say it is fertile ground in terms of contributing ideas and approaches, and that it is also a very pleasant place to live. Thank you for your attention.

Closing contribution
from Hervé GILLÉ (Chairman of the employment and social insertion committee, Gironde Département Council)

First of all, I would like to thank you all for organising this event and thank all the contributors and the rapporteurs for the various workshops.

Cooperation between local and regional authorities has become vital today and due consideration should be given to this. It should enable us to overcome certain divisions and any reluctance we may have previously felt; it is a new way of conducting public policy with respect to the vital issue of sustainable development.

To overcome in this way requires us to play to our respective strengths and have more joint discussions. Perhaps we could consider the idea of a network of elected officials from various local authorities in which the different objectives of each could be clearly stated and the extent to which they could be complementary be assessed. On this basis, we can also make use of contractual agreements to provide meaningful, joint procedures for the whole of the region.

We have begun to adopt such an approach, particularly with the Bordeaux Metropolitan Authority and the Region with respect to school-based Agenda 21 initiatives. We need to go still further in this respect, progressing perhaps to discussing communications and education and too, perhaps, the level of debate in which we should be engaged and what sort of key message we should be putting out. These issues can sometimes be complex and we need to get beyond approaching the concept on a methods basis to communicate to people effectively and ensure that there is good take-up.
There is still much to be done in terms of inter-institutional communication. We have made a start, but here too, we need to get beyond traditional formats to achieve shared communication which results in our citizens feeling that we are standing together in solidarity, in order to implement these policies relating to sustainable development across the whole of the area. This is perhaps something of a minor revolution which doubtless requires considerable political willpower via our Communications departments to move beyond the prevalent frameworks which are usually encountered.

In addition, we should very probably be working differently with the media. Which media should we be working with? What are the most appropriate media to be used today? We need to be able to have discussions with mainstream media to see how they could serve as partners for our policies. A commonly-held attitude which is often encountered with respect to institutional communication is one involving a fair degree of suspicion, because the media feel that we are attempting to push our political agendas via our institutional communications. However, this issue is far more important than political communications relating solely to specific institutions, so we should doubtless endeavour to establish fresh partnerships enabling a wider audience to be reached. This would be something of an innovative approach which will take time to implement. Be that as it may, we need to change the game with respect to the daily press, television, radio and all mainstream media, and see how they could become partners in effective sustainable development policies at the local level.

Another significant issue has been raised which relates, unfortunately, to concerns with respect to legal and technical issues: the problem of stakeholder training and certification of networks. At present, we are well aware that we need to assist all stakeholders, be they elected officials, technical personnel or volunteers. This means that training actions needed to be set up, which involves reference documents, specifications and certifications. We need to establish what is required to implement these training courses and find the right people to run them. This is an issue which will require a lot of thought on our part.

We also need to tend towards a joint certification process with the partners with whom we are already working. We are already working with joint operators and stakeholders at the level of the Region, the Département and the Metropolitan Authority, so we need to manage to implement a certification/recognition process in order to get beyond the public contract format. This also raises a technical issue, because behind all this lies either a public-sector order involving a public contract, or a specific contractual agreement. We need to work on this, and defining who we put behind all this and who we approve at this level is an absolutely key factor.

I would also like to come back to another point which has been raised concerning stakeholder networks. As local authorities, we need to ensure we can clearly identify the networks and federations with whom we are working. We can use grass-roots stakeholders, but we should not lose sight of the federative aspect which is structured at a regional level. This is because federations of this nature form a basis on which we can organise training, disseminate reference documents and implement common processes. I therefore believe that this level of exchanges is important.

So that is what I have noted as regards what I think raises issues at our level. I believe I am not alone in this and that today, there is a genuine desire on the part of local authorities to work together, get to know each other better and establish how we can put together joint public policy commensurate with our respective competencies. Thank you.

Closing contribution
from Michel RICARD (Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade)

Today's proceedings have underscored the fact that local authorities are both the closest to the ground and those with the most resources and competence is to act at this level. In addition, the fact that they are so diverse means that they can be involved at the most local level, that of a municipality, up to the broadest level of coverage, that of an entire region.
These particularities are why they are certainly the most appropriate stakeholders in terms of the implementation of sustainable development through their initiatives and through the citizens which they represent in partnership with the State, businesses and civic society. The concepts of partnership and co-operation have come up again and again, as has the need to rise above personal and institutional self-centredness to succeed in an undertaking which can only be achieved positively and rapidly if each player commits to a task which brooks no delay or absence.

This means that a clear message is required, that we know what we are about and are clear on the direction in which we wish to proceed - and also that we need to call on trained, well-informed stakeholders. Unfortunately, everybody has observed the fact that as regards teaching, there is a cruel lack of training of trainers. So there are these problems relating to training, co-operation and communication. A lot of work relating to sustainable development is done at the level of local authorities, Government and the EU, and we need to maintain our levels of enthusiasm. This can only be achieved long-term by institutional stakeholders providing a clear explanation of their policies and the progress which will result from these. This progress must not be described merely by statistics or in an abstract manner, but must be made tangible by in-field examples which are appropriately tied in to local, national and international benchmarks.

We are all persuaded of the fact that sustainable development is a complex process which requires action at every level, at every time and by all stakeholders. Many topics have not been dealt with at this conference because even in the most studious and intense event, it is difficult to deal with all the issues relating to sustainable development. Nevertheless, bringing together so many experts in one place has led to highly fruitful discussions, enriching summaries and promising recommendations. This day devoted to local authorities will certainly, therefore, have offered many lessons for all stakeholders and participants in this session, having demonstrated that local authorities are undertaking many things and that what is being done in Aquitaine can serve as an example for other local authorities and indeed for all stakeholders in sustainable development.

********************
Session 8

Education for sustainable development in the Euro-Mediterranean basin

Summary

• Foreword (Paolo Soprano, Chair of the task force of education for a sustainable consumption, Marrakech process)
• Introduction (Paul MISFUD, Coordinator Mediterranean Action Plan)
• The network of Mediterranean universities for ESD (Vicky MALOTIDI, Mediterranean Information Office for Environment Culture and Sustainable Development- MIO-ECSDE)
• Education and culture in Euro-mediterranean countries (Maryse CLARY, Association U Marinu)
• Open floor discussion
• Conclusion (Philippe PYPAERT, UNESCO-BRESCE)
• Summary (Philippe PYPAERT, UNESCO-BRESCE)

Foreword
by Paolo SOPRANO
Chair of the task force of education for a sustainable consumption - ESC, Marrakech process

My name is Paolo Soprano. I’m from the ministry of environment in Italy and actually, also leading the Italian task force of education for a sustainable consumption within UNEP Marrakech process on sustainable consumption and production. I’m here to chair this session devoted to education for sustainable development in the Euro-Mediterranean basin. This session is devoted to present and to discuss the main initiatives and the situation in the protection of environment in the Mediterranean area through the participation of some of the most relevant actors in this region. The first intervention, and also as an introduction, will be given by Paul MIFSUD, coordinator of UNEP Mediterranean action plan.

Introduction
by Paul MIFSUD
Coordinator Mediterranean Action Plan - MAP

I would like, first of all, to thank the organizers of this conference on education for sustainable development, and for inviting my organisation to participate. In particular, I would like to express my thanks and appreciation to Professor Ricard for this invitation.

During my presentation I will be speaking about the Mediterranean Action Plan (MAP); the development of the strategy for the Mediterranean, which has been developed by our organization; and about the topic that we have before us today, “education for sustainable development”. Of course, these references will be in general about the region, reflecting the
different situations in the Mediterranean countries, especially those in the South Mediterranean.

Briefly, what is the Mediterranean action plan? It’s an action oriented to programme. It brings together all the 21 countries with a Mediterranean coastline and the European Community as contracting parties to the Barcelona Convention. All these countries have been working together for over 30 years addressing environmental pollution in the Mediterranean sea. In 1975, these countries realized that they had to join forces in order to address the major pollution problems in the Mediterranean with respect to the marine environment.

The Mediterranean Action plan has a very strong legal basis. First of all, there is the Convention. It was adopted in 1976 and amended in 1995 and today it is called the Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment and the Coastal Region of the Mediterranean and its Protocols commonly known as the Barcelona convention.

Since 1976, the contracting parties have also developed a number of protocols in order to give effect to the different provisions of the convention, because the convention is a framework legal instrument. The protocols address various thematic issues, from dumping at sea, pollution from marine activities, pollution from land-based sources, which is the major source in the Mediterranean. 80% of Mediterranean environmental pollution comes from land based activities.

The last protocol to be approved deals with coastal zone management. It was approved by the contract parties in January, during the last meeting in Madrid. This is the legal basis on which we organized and coordinate the activities among these countries.

The structure of the organization consists of the secretariat based in Athens. MAP is administered by UNEP and is in fact the first of its regional seas program. The contracting parties to the Barcelona Convention meet every two years to review progress and to approve the program for the next biannium. The structure includes also 6 region activities centers are based in different countries in the Mediterranean region.

A very important development, which enables the contracting parties to address sustainable development, was the setting up of the Mediterranean Commission for Sustainable Development. This is a unique commission in the region and was set up in 1996, following the amendments to the convention.

The objective of this commission is to provide a forum for discussion on topical issues of relevance to the region and to submit their recommendations to the meeting of the contracting parties. The next meeting is schedule to take place next year in Cairo and the topic will be adaptation to climate change. A part from the representatives of the Contracting Parties, members from civil society, economic actors and NGO's and local authorities also participate. Recently, the terms of reference of the commission were amended in order to include other categories including eminent experts, members of the scientific community and IGOs.

In the preparatory phase for the development of the strategy, several working groups discussed what were the most important issues that should be addressed in the strategy. They looked at what was at stake in the region, what were the risks that needed to be addressed. Of course, the region is very unique. It brings together 500m with different culture, traditions, and diverse environmental and social conditions. Definitely the environment was mistreated environment. The urban environment and water resources are still threatened to this very day. There was a trend which was not sustainable. Therefore there existed good justification in order to devise a strategy to address these stakes and these risks in the region.

The MSSD is a framework strategy and has various objectives. The idea is to adapt the international commitments, including those of the WSSD and the Agenda 21, to the regional level. The idea was to bring the objectives of sustainable development closer to the region. It also has a long term vision for sustainable development based on common destiny. As we
are all aware, the region is very diversified with different levels of development from the North to the South, different cultures. It was also important to address and to keep in mind the issue of the common destiny and the differentiation approach because of the different economic and social status of the countries.

This strategy has 4 long term goals. Seven priority areas for action we also identified; we wanted the strategy to be very focused on what is really important and relevant and in need of attention in the Mediterranean, of course keeping in mind our remit on the basis of the Barcelona Convention.

These priority areas are better management of water resources and demand, improved rationale use of energy, increased renewable energy, sustainable mobility through appropriate transport management, sustainable tourism, sustainable agriculture and rural development, sustainable urban development, sustainable management of the sea and coastal areas and marine resources.

Apart from identifying these 7 priorities, the strategy also identifies different actions that should be promoted in the countries in order to address and achieve the goal with respect of these priority fields. These 7 priorities were identified as the most threatened by unsustainable trends, they are important areas at an economic and social level, and they are very crucial to social-economic development. We found that these areas, on the basis of studies, on the basis on experience gathered over the years by the Barcelona convention, provided the potential for improvement and were ripe for action as well.

The strategy for sustainable development also addresses education for sustainable development. Under the objective 4 specific reference is made to education for sustainable development.  It is stated that education and training in sustainable development are recognized as a prerequisite for improved governance.

The MSSD identifies a number of difficulties in promoting Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in Mediterranean developing countries. Among these one finds the significant levels of illiteracy, particularly among women, which is still a problem in the region and has to be address if we want to promote education for sustainable development; there’s still an unbalance between the skills taught in schools and universities an the needs on the employment market, it is felt that there are not enough job opportunities for the younger generation coming out of university; research and development expenditures also need to be address because compared to the other regions, the level of investment and expenditures in R&D in developing countries is low; the lack of promotion and knowledge about education for sustainable development doesn’t favour participation, even in civil society or in decision making; an education for sustainable development is lacking a high levels of administration.

When implementing the MSSD we address this concern by helping national authorities to develop their own studies for sustainable development and in these exercises, we give importance to the issue of education for sustainable development; there is still a great need to insure primary education for all the countries in the Mediterranean.

I must admit that we still have a lot to do. The issue of continuous training to young people to acquire the necessary skills to find employment is also a major challenge in the region. There
are several UN declarations that promote education for sustainable development. In this regard, it is important that before we come up with new declarations, that the countries should implement what has already been decided and agreed upon.

As a beginning, in order to address some of these challenges the following proposals could be considered:- the implementation of relevant UN resolutions; make education opportunities from primary to university level available to all; establish research and training centres at the regional level; involve more the NGO community because they can play a major role in promoting education for sustainable development.

The challenges in education for sustainable development should be addressed also by teaching the people to adopt a sustainable lifestyle. We all have to do more in order to adapt ourselves to less consumer oriented approach and way of life. We need to teach and motivate people to identify and adopt sustainable practices, to achieve the objectives of the Millennium Development Goals, with in particular the goal of universal primary education, to introduce education as a structural element within the frame of sustainable development.

Another challenge is to raise the awareness on ESD through initiatives like the one we have today. Even more important is the political commitment by the governments to promote education for sustainable development.

Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC

Thank you for the very wide and comprehensive presentation. The presentation made clear that there are strategies, there are long term goals, including the education for sustainable development, and there are priority fields of action, and, underlining the need that the role of such strategy should be supported by implementing tools among, which education for sustainable development means a shift toward a new cultural perspective.

Of course, difficulties in promoting education for sustainable development, in this region, characterised by many differences and diversities, and also constitute the richness of this region.

Moving from the strategical and political framework toward more concrete and operational activities, I’d like to introduce Ms Vicki Malotidi of Mediterranean Information Office and network on Mediterranean Environment Information based in Athens, who will present a communication on the network of Mediterranean universities.

The network of Mediterranean universities for ESD

by Vicky MALOTIDI

Mediterranean Information Office for Environment Culture and Sustainable Development

First of all, few things about MIO-ECSDE. It’s a federation of NGO for environmental sustainable development from all over the Mediterranean region. It accounts for about 100 member organisations. MIO aims at the protection of the natural environment of the Mediterranean region.

The main types of the federation activities is networking, capacity building of NGOs, promotion and drafting of common geopolitics for the Mediterranean scene, international collaboration, raising public awareness and sensitization through appropriate campaigns, materials, trainings, etc., and the promotion of the education for sustainable development in the Mediterranean countries.

The initiative of a network of Mediterranean universities started 3-4 years ago. It was first discussed during the conference for the launching of the UN decade for ESD in the Mediterranean region in Athens. The initiative was further discussed and promoted in various meetings and consultations – we’ll talk more about the working meeting in Sarajevo supported by UNESCO-BRESCE – during the international conference on ESD in Cyprus, education for ESD disciplines in other cultures and in other symposiums and conferences.
The main goal of the network is to promote ESD in higher education in the Mediterranean universities and to establish a post-graduate course on mass level on ESD. Other objectives are: to create opportunities for synergies and to coordinate and complement related efforts for the promotion of ESD in higher institutions of the Mediterranean; to promote the whole institutional approach in higher education institutions; and in general, to contribute and promote further the UN indicators and UNECE strategy implementation in the Mediterranean. The network has 2 general main types of activities. Type A refers to the members of university that are going to develop and implement the master course on ESD. This call group of university members will be around 10 universities but it could be enlarged in the future. Type B is the wide network: to facilitate and promote ESD aspects in the university departments; to improve and enrich the existing courses; to promote a collection of best practices of the members; to participate in related meetings and events organized by the network; to facilitate the whole institute approach in the university itself.

We are in the phase 1 of the working plan of the network: in the drafting, the memorandum of understanding for the members of the network and the formation of the core of the university partners.

About the working meeting that took place in Sarajevo last year hosted and supported by UNESCO-BRECE, it actually took place adjacent to a specialized event of UNESCO-BRECE in partnership with the university of Bologna. In that meeting, the scope, the objectives and the types of activities and logistics about the network were elaborated and deeply discussed. The characteristics of the Master course on ESD were elaborated also, included curriculum, subject, the target group, the candidates, etc.

About the themes of the Master course, they are still under drafting and development, as you may understand: concepts related to sustainable development; basic principles of natural systems, ecosystems and also socio-economic systems; management; evolution from environmental education to ESD; international, regional schemes; the principals and characteristics of ESD, with a focus on interdisciplinary characters; the pedagogy of ESD; the methodology in innovative practices; the integration of ESD in higher educational institution; the integration of ESD in other educational curriculum; ESD communication on public awareness; the value of ICT in implementing ESD; indicators and tools for assessment; research topics; and ESD as a tool for sustainable development policies.

About the candidates of this Master course, they have to be graduated of all relevant disciplines from a related background, including good level of English and computer skills; because it'll be an international Master course, it was agreed that the language, for at least the first 2 years, will be mainly English. But this will be further discussed during a meeting, next month, in Athens supported by UNESCO-BRECE, again, and the University of Athens and will take place under the hospice of the Athens university vice-rector, professor I. Karakostas.

The major topics that are going to be discussed for this network and most probably, the agreement on the memorandum of understanding between the universities to take part in the network will take place as well. The universities from Slovenia, Spain, Italy, Albania, Egypt, Tunisia, Cyprus, Morocco, Lebanon and Greece have already express their interest in participating in the meeting and in the network.

**Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC**

The presentation was focused on the need and the importance of putting together competences and capacities of different subjects in these Mediterranean areas and the importance of promoting sustainable development culture at the higher possible level, with training, Master and other activities.

Now we move to the presentation of education and culture in the Euro-Mediterranean countries. The presentation will be given by Maryse Clary.
Education and culture in Euro-Mediterranean countries  
by Maryse CLARY  
U Marinu Association

The U Marinu association is signed up to the Mediterranean Action Programme (PAM) and forms part of the MIO-ECS. During this presentation, my aim is simply to share our thinking with respect to education and cultural dialogue with respect to the Mediterranean. The Mediterranean basin is a region which is distinctive in a number of ways both in terms of its geography and its history, which are closely linked together. The sea itself, the complex geography around it and the unique climate have all had a significant influence on the extraordinary development of civilisations around its shores. The duration and increasing intensity of this development has profoundly impacted and changed an environment which is fragile and home to limited resources, most often irreversibly. Nowhere else has man been so shaped by nature and lower else has man, in turn, had so much influence on nature.

This sea is located between three continents: Europe, Africa and Asia. The regions around this stretch of water are home to famous sites in cultural terms but are also increasingly faced with the problems arising from the major contrasts which exist in human terms at these crossroads. The increasing numbers of people and their social and economic development have led to the presence of a number of threats.

The Mediterranean is the foremost region for tourism in the world. In the Mediterranean basin, it is not possible to talk solely in terms of the environment because the environment and development form an indivisible whole. There are many avenues of development as well as many ecosystems, and their particularly complex interactions take place over long periods of time. This engenders a greater degree of uncertainty and makes it difficult to adopt a policy despite the necessity for this.

The development of modern modes of transport has turned to the Mediterranean from a sea into a lake, bringing various populations closer together but also accentuating diversities and sometimes creating tension between the local and global.

What sort of future do we want for the Mediterranean? Do we want it to become a fault line or a locus of hope in which links can be created and bridges built? As educators, we are working to develop solidarity between all the countries round the Mediterranean, combat intolerance, preserve the environment and progress towards a better way of life, helping to transform de facto interdependency into voluntary solidarity.

Most international organisations do not recognize the Mediterranean as a geopolitical entity, since it is like a puzzle with pieces from Africa, Central Asia and Western Europe. It was only in the 17th century that the term "Mediterranean" became a proper noun. On the global scene, the Mediterranean is viewed as a troublesome and somewhat marginal element.

Today, it could be said that what was once full has become empty and the sea a virtual frontier. And yet, for centuries, as Edgar Morin put it, "this sea was a matrix". It was the birthplace of three major monotheistic religions and a multitude of civilisations. Although it may never have formed a uniform whole, it has witnessed an intense mix of cultures. The concept of the Mediterranean has been fashioned by the intellectual and cultural history of each nation. It is important to think of the Mediterranean in the plural, and our relationship to the Mediterranean has many facets.

The predominant image is not that of a glorious, sweeping picture of the Mediterranean as the mother of all civilisations but that of a sea which constitutes the proving grounds of the world to come and to be established.

The decisive questions to which the Mediterranean peoples must find an answer embody the major challenges which the start of this century is laying down for future generations: the contrast between rich and poor nations; issues of overpopulation; pollution in every shape and form; the inability to conceive of a harmonious society; to establish solidarity as a basis
for individual fulfilment; to consider culture as an adequate response to the social, human and environmental bankruptcy to which the unbridled quest for profit is leading us.

The Mediterranean is currently witnessing a rise in religious antagonism and the emergence of national antagonisms. It is a microcosm of the clash between East and West, North and South, fundamentalism and modernism, wealth and poverty. What is more, in its own way it is the victim of the global threats hanging over our planet.

The preliminary issue resides in the need to accept and recognize the paradox of there being a Mediterranean identity despite the differing and sometimes opposing religions, cultures, histories and economic situations. Mediterranean peace needs to be imagined not as some idyllic state but as a reality; a process whose contradictions are themselves the source of its creativity. If the Mediterranean area truly constitutes the proving grounds of the 21st century, it is because it has become a microcosm of the planet as a whole in which all the key issues facing our society are present. The Mediterranean has begun to be the subject of a number of international programmes such as the PAM, created in 1975 and adopted in 1976, the bringing together of UNESCO's Mediterranean activity, the Barcelona declaration and the Civic Forum in Malta.

The Mediterranean is an unusual ecological environment which has also enabled other environments with similar characteristics to be defined, and it is also a crucible of civilisations which needs to be preserved, because culture is at the basis of the relationship of the individual to the environment. The distance between what is global and what is local is too great for there to be any genuine interaction between the two; a relational space enables them to draw closer together and allow each to be understood by the other.

Spaces which provide meaning, eco-cultural spaces, are necessary, and it can be said that the Mediterranean is an eco-cultural area. That is to say that its history is one of cooperation, conflict, war and peace, but that it shares the elements of a single culture; a culture which can be observed first and foremost in our day-to-day lifestyles around the Mediterranean, all of which trace their origins back to the same matrix of civilisation even if they have diversified. Unlike states, which attempt to unify on a centralising basis, eco-cultural areas are a crucible of complexity which must not be simplified but rather apprehended in a multi-dimensional intellectual approach.

The Mediterranean has progressed from being a simple geographical concept to becoming the source of a sense of belonging to a cultural community. The uniformisation engendered by the processes of globalisation does not wipe out particularities and differences, it only muffles them. When these differences are considered as a whole, we can look to identify a global multicultural characteristic of the Mediterranean in which physical, geopolitical, historical and cultural differences are all inextricably interwoven.

We cannot make do with a superficial approach to cultures. The breaking down of global barriers and the speed with which ideas and cultural models are exchanged mean that it has become necessary, in terms of both social practices and research and education, to take into account the interrelatedness and multiple aspects of cultures and the ensuing consequences.

Education has particular responsibility when it comes to building a world in which there is more solidarity. What is our association doing? We aim to bring together children from the Mediterranean, who will be tomorrow's adults, in education which provides awareness of environmental threats as well as of the multiple cultures presence within each society and into cultural dialogue.

For the past 15 years, we have been organising an event called "la mer en fête" where we invite children on board a boat. This event lasts for one week during which we welcome some 5000 children. Similar events have been created in Tangiers, Algiers and Tunis. Others are planned in Lebanon and Alexandria. Regardless of whether these children are in Marseille, Livorno, Tangiers or Algiers, what predominates is the friendly nature of these
encounters: meeting and getting to know one another, gaining an awareness of others, their culture and shared problems relating to their environment; the Mediterranean.

These encounters are about emotion first and foremost. It is already quite an experience to get on board a boat, find out about the sea and its wealth in terms of different cultures, and above all to be able to engage in dialogue. Children are thus able to meet, communicate and appreciate one another. It is a way of finding out what we have in common amidst our differences and of breaking down the prejudices which prevail on either side of the Mediterranean.

At the same time as this "la mer en fête" event for children, for the past 10 years we have been organising Mediterranean eco-cultural meetings known as "Med'Educ". 12 nations took part this year. We are organising this meeting to develop cooperation between educators. We belong to the world of informal education but we meet along with formal educators, NGOs and scientists to exchange our experiences and improve our educational approaches in order to see how education, sustainable development and the Mediterranean all fit together. The Mediterranean is our territory. With similar aims in mind, in 2002, UNESCO asked us to organise, under its auspices and in partnership with Moroccan associations, the second cross-disciplinary Mediterranean conference, part of the UNESCO programme which led to a declaration for Johannesburg.

We would now like to organise a travelling conference around the Mediterranean, open to people with responsibility in the world of education, be they scientists, form educators or members of NGOs, in order to look jointly at issues relating to the environment, culture and development. We would also like to implement a joint resources centre where we could capitalise experience and work on making it transferable, in order to make the Mediterranean a forum for dialogue.

In this region, which is currently undergoing very rapid demographic, social, cultural, economic and environmental change, the issue of the relationship between development and the environment urgently requires addressing, and commitments in favour of sustainable development must be made.

More partnership agreements must be concluded and the role of education as a foundation on which a viable future can be built in our specific context must be affirmed. As Jacques Berque has said, "it is time for trans-Mediterranean dialogue to bear fruit".

Open-floor discussion

Michel MONBRUN, Francophone networks

I am involved with a structure for implementing sustainable development and education for sustainable development in the Essonne département, in France. For many years, I was involved at a national and international level within the United Nations as regards sustainable development, particularly with UNITAR. I had the pleasure and the joy of knowing and sharing the initiative which has just been presented, "la mer en fête", which has so many points in common with what I would like to say now.

Just like sustainable development itself, education for sustainable development cannot be carried out by decree. It is rooted in a soil which is vital for education to sprout and produce fruit. Education for sustainable development must be addressed to all, and as the definition to which we all refer - that of Rio and the Brundtland report - reminds us, must "meet present needs", with the additional clarification in the following phrase, too often forgotten, that this concept of need embodies two notions: firstly meeting the needs of the most deprived populations to whom the highest priority should be granted.

I believe that in terms of education for sustainable development, we need to re-situate our action in terms of meeting the needs of the most deprived.
In other words, how can we educate for sustainable development by recommending energy savings to people who do not even have access to this energy? How can we educate for sustainable development by recommending responsible water saving and management to those who do not have access to drinking water? How can we educate for sustainable development by recommending proper home installation to the homeless? How can we recommend care for the environment to those who have nothing but deadly water to drink or who will not be able to receive treatment if they do not have access to healthcare or prevention?

Education for sustainable development must first and foremost constitute a response in terms of access to the most essential needs and services, failing which it will be meaningless and have no hope of achieving its ends, because unfortunately this concerns a large part of the population including in countries to the north of the Mediterranean. In France in 2007, official figures show that 25% of the population was not capable of paying their electricity for heating bills and required public money to do so. Nearly 10% of this 25% no longer have access to electricity and heating. If we do not make it possible for these populations to have access to these essential services and needs, no education is possible.

The primary mission of education for sustainable development should be defined as being a pedagogy of action enabling access to water, energy, housing and healthcare: a global pedagogy of education which incorporates all the key issues relating to sustainable development, but which does so by providing concrete answers to these needs and services. There needs to be a fundamental shift in our cultures and approaches to achieve this.

The Mediterranean is indeed an area in which creating a network would be a priority: a network of stakeholders working to satisfy essential needs and services and which forms part of a genuine educational initiative, one promoting the capability of individuals to define their own life and future. This is not education which is dispensed but education which enables each individual to be fulfilled and structure themselves. This represents an extremely significant pedagogical undertaking.

There are many examples, many of which are not well-known enough, which contribute to this, like the magnificent example which you have just heard about, "la mer en fête", making it possible for children to meet together so that on the basis of their concerns, curiosity and preoccupations, they can get to know each other, come to like each other, discuss together and build tomorrow's world together. Adults need to do the same thing by re-establishing meetings between people which respond to the most basic needs within an action-centred pedagogy enabling fulfilment: access to autonomy and thereby freedom and the ability to establish one's own mode of development.

This network is vital in the Mediterranean, of which we are all the heirs of all the magnificent cultures which have gone before us. We need to re-establish encounters between different people in order to build this future.

This requires a major calling into question of our practices and the determination of a hierarchy of priorities for action. I have just referred to one priority which is as essential for the southern Mediterranean countries as it is for these so-called rich countries to the north of the Mediterranean. The latter are rich only in terms of volumes of money, and much poorer in terms of their ability to invent approaches to take up this challenge. If the issue is not a human issue, what is the point in making any effort?

**Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC**

Thank you for this contribution. I see the need of shifting directly from education to sustainable development and identifying 2 mains emerging concepts.

The first one is that in these contradictory situations of talking about reduce the consumption of energy for whom do not have access to energy at all and introducing the need of education to sustainable development as education for Millennium development goals,
including not only the environmental goals but also the social and economic ones, including fight against poverty, including the redistribution of richness.

The second one is the urgency of acting and the need to identify priorities in this action, considering the increasing number of crisis in environment, in economy and social fields instead of being sold to policy, strategy, action.

This leads me, again, to the issue of urgency, priorities and what can we do. How can we develop such a new educational and cultural pattern considering that education must be not considered only as a formal tool within the schools but also, as UNESCO teach, as a lifelong learning process, including activities for young people outside the school when they are reach by information, advertising, invitation for new and new consumption.; also, in the elder age through, again, information, training, professional training, media information and advertising.

This is, in my view, a very important part of the program: the discussion is on how to integrate, in the education of our young people, important concepts and goals such as poverty eradication. But, in the same time, the logic of the market, the relationship between supply and demand offers always and everyday new inputs for increasing consumption, for maintaining the idea that development is only possible through this kind of consumerism logic.

Sylvia DROVS, National council for sustainable development of Montenegro

Montenegro has been mentioned as a young country, only 2 years old, which has developed a national strategy for sustainable development and the council with its office and it has also worked out an action plan for education for sustainable development. I’d like to make some remarks in addition to what the speaker before me said. I fully agree with me and I’d like to come from another side.

There is very big pressure on the Mediterranean coast of Montenegro. On the national level, there’s a big conflict between, on one hand, the minister of economic development and on the other hand, minister for tourism and environmental protection, which is a conflict itself. For example, on the integrated coastal zone management, they don’t agree on the priorities: the economy or the ecology?

Regarding the development of the coast, which has been almost untouched for a long time, in the last few years, big money came to the country, especially from Russia but also from Britain and other investors, buying land at a huge extent and buying old houses on the coast. The perspective for sustainable development of this very beautiful Mediterranean coast is not very good. For me, the main question is: out of which motives people are facing such challenges, money and the use of land? What is done with the land that has been bought? There are really horrible scenarios for this “Greenfield development” of the coast and I’m very concerned, not only me but many people that are thinking sustainable that in a few years will be gone, as in most other Mediterranean countries.

One argument is: we are poor; we cannot afford the luxury of ecology. Also, why do the European countries, especially the UPD Reunion, want to prevent us from using our coast as a capital for the economic development? That’s what everyone has done and now, we’re the last in the whole, there’s only Albania, in a similar situation. Why do they want us to take more attention to the ecology than for the economy?

Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC

Thank you very much. Allow me to recall that the minister of environment in Italy had the pleasure give some support to your country in preparing the strategy for sustainable development of Montenegro.

Your question is: short term view versus long term perspective. Of course, the situation of Montenegro and the development of the coastal area that Montenegro is experimenting has been the same in that part of the coast of the Mediterranean region, including Italy.
Paul MIFSUD, Mediterranean Action Plan

Drawing also on the experience that we had during the discussion and negotiation of the new ICZM protocol, which is specifically a legal instrument to help the countries in order to safeguard the coast from overdevelopment. What the speaker has said can be applied to other countries of course. The pressure for the development of the coast by developers applies to all the Mediterranean countries. But I think it’s important for Montenegro to have the opportunity not to repeat the mistakes that other countries have done in respect of the development of the coast.

According to our estimate, 40% of the Mediterranean coastline is already concretised, somehow, has been developed and unless the strand is addressed in less by 20-25, this percentage will go from 40% to 50%. So the pressure is there.

During the negotiation of the protocol for coastal management, the crucial issue, that was the final issue that we had to address, was the set back zone, which means: what sort of area should be left for the enjoyment of the public? Some countries, because of their development policies, wanted less, some wanted more. Finally, we managed to arrive at the conclusion that the set back should be 100m. But, as I said, it took us even more than we expected to reach an agreement about this protocol. This is another legal instrument which provides the Mediterranean countries, including Montenegro, as a framework in order to develop strategies to ensure the sustainable development of their coastline.

I’m pleased to say also that the feedback that we are receiving is that a number of countries are moving forward with the ratification of this legal instrument, because this is when it’ll become effective, when the countries agree to adopt and integrate the previsions of the protocol into their national legislation.

I understand Montenegro in saying, what shouldn’t we continue to develop when we have these opportunities but at the same time, I think it’s important to learn from the mistakes of others in order not to repeat the same mistakes.

Mohamed TAWFIC, Professor, Suez Canal University, Egypt

I’d like to refer to the European program of higher education called “tempus”. This program is promoting research between universities from the northern part of the Mediterranean and the southern part of the Mediterranean. It might be a good idea if we can dedicate a certain percentage of the budget of this project to embrace some ESD projects. The advantage of this idea is that it’ll promote ESD in both of the Mediterranean and will initiate a lot of cooperation between universities of both sides.

Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC

Thank you for this proposal that possibly would be given to the EU Commission Authorities.

Lamine KADI, Network of researchers in the environment and sustainable development, Francophone University Agency

I am an academic from Algeria and a member of the Francophone University Agency network of researchers in the environment and sustainable development.

Much mention has been made lately of the Euro-Mediterranean area, and there has also been the recent initiative regarding the Union for the Mediterranean. Although this is very recent and has not yet been fully defined, the term “union” also has the connotation of solidarity, and we were discussing this concept yesterday during one of the sessions. I believe that the new framework which is currently being established should enable sustainable development in solidarity of the Mediterranean basin to be incorporated as a strategic, priority objective. It is clear that everyone holds that education, training and development of capabilities together constitute one of the key pillars for this aim to be achieved. I am thinking in terms of an instrument which would be institutionalised in this new
framework, funded partly by an ambitious European Union programme, consisting in the creation of a kind of Mediterranean college of sustainable development, of which education for sustainable development would constitute one of the missions and also be implicitly included in other topics. Such an instrument would make it possible to optimise all the initiatives and programmes which have already been launched and which are still in operation on both sides of the Mediterranean, the EU programme TEMPUS, for instance.

Many programmes have made it possible to set up networks of academics, economic stakeholders, non-profit associations, private-sector companies and so on: a Mediterranean college of sustainable development would make it possible to optimise all these actions and create a framework bringing together all sustainable development stakeholders; sustainable development is a participatory approach which of necessity calls on all stakeholders and excludes none. This would make it easier to benefit from support on the part of these existing networks. A structure like this is the only possible way of having an objective view of all the issues relating to sustainable development, ethics, governance and so on.

Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC

This gives us the opportunity to include another concept in these discussions: the need of partnership; gather together different subjects from both the North and the South; and also, recollecting that from the side of the European Union, a lot of programs and initiative are already devoted to improve these cooperation, also through bilateral support program aimed at develop the institutional capacities in the southern Mediterranean countries. I believe that is one the most important principal of the partnership, it’s necessary to involve many different subjects, considering the wide characteristic of interdisciplinary of sustainable development issues and also to improve the participation of different subjects, to straighten the bottom map approach, considering the difficulties that politicians, usually, have, considering goals and objectives in such long term, as sustainable development is.

Ahmed ABDOLLAH, Léo Lagrange Federation, Morocco

Since we are in the course of identifying initiatives in terms of education for sustainable development, I would like to share an experience I had last week in a Euro-Mediterranean seminar on education for sustainable development. This seminar brought together a score of associations from seven Euro-Mediterranean countries. The idea was to make the most of European measures such as the European "youth in action" programme and "euro-med jeunesse" to put together partnership and development actions and launch projects and procedures with respect to education for sustainable development.

As regards decentralised co-operation, this involved launching school-based Agenda 21 initiatives for education for sustainable development involving countries, partners, academic and educational structures from both sides of the Mediterranean.

Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC

Thank you for sharing this information and also interesting idea in developing the local Agenda 21 process applying it to the school.

Céline BROUSSARD, Director, marine world discovery centre, Nice

I would like to tell you about an action we are currently undertaking as part of a youth programme. We are coordinators of the "Youth and Mediterranean Conference" which brings together 12 nations from around the Mediterranean and is intended for environmental education stakeholders, schools, associations and businesses.

In the course of youth programmes, we can establish exchanges between countries: this is happening this year with Greece, where we are setting up one-week exchanges between French and Greek young people. One difficulty we often encounter is that we are dealing with too many countries.
We would like to put together large-scale exchanges but the programmes are not really designed for more than one country to be involved. Another concern is that this relates to the Euro-Mediterranean area and that southern nations are often not incorporated into these programmes.

**Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC**

*Thank you for these interesting issues that have been raised by the interventions from the floor.*

**Conclusion**

Philippe PYPAERT

UNESCO-BRESCE

To summarise these contributions, what emerges from the presentations and this discussion is a key element which our colleague from the UNEP set out: the instruments for cooperation in the Mediterranean basin are in place.

There are strategies for the region as a whole and for each of the Mediterranean region nations, supported by their local office. This should be emphasised, as should the fact that nothing will change if the political willpower is not there. It is clear that the Union for the Mediterranean will not be disrupting all these instruments but rather strengthening them and making them more effective; at least, this is the desire of those who have signed up to this political initiative. This has created a new framework within which we can devise actions for the promotion of education for sustainable development.

The different presentations have clearly shown that a number of initiatives are under way at a variety of levels, particularly on the part of the UNEP, with training of capabilities at the institutional level, ministerial representatives and people responsible for defining and implementing these strategies. We have also discussed more technical and scientific training regarding the integrated management of coastal areas. The other presentations have also shown that there are initiatives under way concerning universities, teachers and schoolchildren.

What has struck me in both the presentation and the discussions, is that despite the absence of recognition as a region on the part of the United Nations with respect to the Mediterranean, since it is somewhat outside our traditional definitions, there is a sense of networking and strong partnership across the region and this is currently growing. This is less formal, but it works. I particularly liked the expression "these networks and partnerships enable people to get together". The last contribution presented exchanges between schoolchildren, which is promising for the future.

Many networks were mentioned: a planned university network; many associations in the Mediterranean basin are meeting together; a network of Francophone researchers. One of the characteristics of this Mediterranean basin which should be maintained is the liveliness of the world of associations, networks and partnerships.

While I have the floor, I would also like to mention other networks with which UNESCO is more directly concerned: the local networks with international designation, such as the network of biosphere reserves which form part of the "Man and the Biosphere Programme" and which have been emphasising the relationship between man, nature and the environment since the 1970s: this relationship is seen as generating a culture which generates civilisation which in turn generates not only what we can see in terms of the wealth of the past of this region, but also the possibility of a different future.

This questioning of the relationship between man and nature still lies at the heart of this programme. This programme has designated pilot areas, experimental areas throughout the whole of the Mediterranean basin. This is also an invitation to view this network in particular as one with which it will be possible to work in the future on this issue of the relationship between man and his environment. This also offers the possibility of experimenting with...
alternative tourism, more sustainable forms of production and consumption and local governance policies. These questions should be raised in the forum of the Union for the Mediterranean for instance.

Biosphere reserves are not protected areas but localities which contain protected areas and which may also contain areas devoted to tourism, production, farming and towns and cities. I would associate this network with the network of world heritage sites. If we take into consideration sites which are important in cultural terms, this also leads us to the issue of the relationship between man and his environment. It is impossible to preserve a cultural environment without preserving the surrounding community and subsequently preserving and developing modes of production which enable what we seek to preserve by listing such sites on the world heritage list to be maintained. Again, some sites of considerable interest all around the Mediterranean could represent an opportunity to work on this kind of topic.

Social issues and questions relating to equality, reducing inequalities and eliminating marginalisation also need to be discussed. Indeed, it would be interesting to consider these kind of issues together in symbolic locations redolent in history and with highly visible expressions of cultures and civilisations, which are different and yet very close. A number of aspects of this nature could be developed, for instance Mediterranean food, with an examination of the relationship between what is eaten and what is sold and more generally, forms of sustainable consumption in the Mediterranean. What lies behind the offer of tourism in all the riches of this region? What lies behind what one eats? What brings us together in the way we eat and produce? Things like olive oil, vines, wheat and everything else which has contributed to the history of these civilisations round the Mediterranean.

I am very enthusiastic on these topics because I am not from the Mediterranean. I come from Belgium, but I have been living in Italy for a number of years now and have travelled extensively around the Mediterranean; I find it fascinating to explore it in terms of the cultural expressions constituted by food and traditions. Here again there is much which can be promoted to draw us closer together rather than pulling us further apart.

In terms of partnerships, local school-based Agenda 21 initiatives have been mentioned. I would also like to refer to traditional skills which represent a wealth of expertise. In my opinion these are not mentioned enough. These range from earthworks to oases and the frequent ability to manage natural resources, often in difficult or changing conditions. The Mediterranean basin has a wealth of resources and from the perspective of sustainable development, this traditional expertise also provides a source of inspiration. Projects are underway in this respect and it would also be worthwhile networking these, offering them opportunities for discussion and more particularly a core which could serve as a source of inspiration for innovators seeking to develop tomorrow's technology.

The third message which emerges from your contributions is the importance of establishing priorities. It is true that we often forget the priority of attending to the most underprivileged and their needs. Establishing a network between stakeholders working to satisfy these needs and placing them in perspective of education in favour of autonomy and the ability to play a part in defining a different future is a significant point for discussion and a key message.

It is definitely true that the Mediterranean can be seen as a place where there is a lot of diversity and therefore a place which offers plenty of opportunity for enabling individuals and populations to get together and work to this end. In the presentation on the network of universities, the issue has not been to devise a North-South network enabling people to travel, especially from the south to the north, but to create the possibility of a different view of the world in which viewpoints can be changed, exchanged and enriched.

For those from northern countries it is interesting to see how issues such as water shortages, energy problems and waste management are dealt with. There are also difficulties relating to marginalisation and the fight against poverty to the north of the Mediterranean and it is interesting to see people from southern nations coming to study this.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
With respect to the contribution from the representative of Montenegro, and to come back to
UNEP representation, the instruments are in place, but political will is also required, as is a
desire for implementation on the part of all stakeholders. Montenegro is a case which
particularly embodies this issue. They have declared themselves to be an environmentally-
friendly state first and foremost: this forms the first article of their constitution. However, as
their representative said, the nation's politicians and decision-makers are concerned first and
foremost by economic development.

A sustainable development approach is particularly relevant with respect to the question of
tourism. It is true that it is possible to promote a form of development which may give
economic advantages to a country in the very short term, but development of this sector, in
Montenegro in particular but also in other regions, is closely related to the development of
the sector of energy and therefore of water. The major source of energy in these countries is
fresh water. It would be paradoxical if Montenegro were to succeed in supplying the energy
required by the tourism industry only by destroying other major natural sources.

Some years ago, we discussed a highly controversial plan to build a dam to produce the
energy which these sectors require by destroying a world heritage site, that of the Tara River,
the most beautiful canyon in Europe, which is 1200m deep. This is a source of grave
concern. It is easy to see how a vicious circle can be completed: the benefits of tourism are
there, but this creates enormous costs, not only in environmental terms but also in terms of
possible future development relating to other sources.

Water is definitely a highly limiting factor today and will be even more so in the future in this
region. A more courageous and, as has been emphasised, more difficult approach must be
promoted: we have little choice.

**Paolo SOPRANO, Task force for ESC**

Merci. I’d like, as a chair of this session, to underline few concepts, continuing on these
problems of contradictory development posed by the representative from Montenegro.

I’d like to recall an idea that Italy proposed as the main focus on the environment program
within the last Italian European Union presidency: consider the environment and the
protection of the environment not as a burden in development but as an opportunity; try to
shift from this idea that environmental protection means to have binding regulations and
burden to development process, but to consider the shifting forward more sustainable
patterns of development as an opportunity, for developing countries as well as the so-called
emerging economies in the eastern part of Europe.

As far as education is concerned, I’ve already said the need to adopt a very long term
perspective, changing in the cultural behaviour of people means to wait for results in term of
generation, not in term of 4-5 years. It’s usually the timeframe within which politicians wait for
results because the programs are always linked to the period of government. This means
difficulties and this means that there’s the need for a very wide participation of all actors
involved: participation of citizens, on all levels, and also participation of the different
stakeholders involved.

As I’ve said before, there is a role for education for sustainable development not only in the
schools but, of course, at the main institutional subject that we need to change, to involve in
these perspectives and also for the social and economic side of the society.

The importance of advertising, proposing patterns of lifestyle is fundamental, also, during the
training period for young people. The investment should be made mainly on young people
because of the longer perspective in which the results of the changes can have and develop
their effects.

**Paul MIFSUD, Mediterranean Action Plan**

One very important comment made by the speaker from Algeria was the issue of solidarity.
It’s very important with respect to the needs of developing countries in the Mediterranean.
We are all aware of the grand demand and the burden that these countries are facing in respect to the economic, social or environmental aspect. This is one element that needs more attention.

Definitively, the southern Mediterranean countries got so many other priorities, for them, the most important are the basic needs; but we also have to address the issue of sustainability. This can move in parallel by addressing the sustainability and use of the resources, we can also transfer the resources in order to address the other issues, the other basic needs of society. So, solidarity is an important issue. It’s about time that the countries themselves pass from words to deeds. It has been quite some time that southern countries come up with so many ideas and declarations, but it's really important to show solidarity with these countries and help them to move forward.

This is where most of the investment has to go in education and primarily, in the younger generation. We need to catch them young if we want to change habits, culture, attitudes. As you’ve said, it's hard to change my habits after so many years doing things the same way.

We shouldn’t, of course, give up on this issue but it’s important to target the younger generation and I think that these kind of activities, meetings, like we have today, are very important in that direction.

*Paolo Soprano, Task force for ESC*

Thank you. I’m not part of the « Francophonie » but I appreciate your reminding of the next world environmental education congress that will be held in Montreal next year. The previous environmental education congress was held in Turin, Italy, in 2005.

Thank you very much in participating in this session.

**Summary**

*Philippe Pypaert*

*UNESCO Bresco*

The Mediterranean area constitutes a microcosm; a laboratory for the world of the future; a space which is anything but uniform and which is a good representation of the multiple contradictions and tensions in today’s world, with a whole series of cultures, religions and ways of seeing the past, present and future.

This means that it is of considerable interest as a place with which to experiment with education for sustainable development. It is also home to strong identities and a strong sense of belonging.

This means that it offers particular opportunities in terms of drawing peoples together, tolerance, solidarity and experimentation in education for sustainable development.

It is very clear from the presentations that institutional legal instruments are already in place (agreements and a Mediterranean strategy for sustainable development). The UNEP itself supports a number of countries in this region as regards the formulation of their national sustainable development strategy, and is naturally seeking to incorporate education for sustainable development within these national strategies.

In this regard, the action plan for the Mediterranean offers help in the implementation of a number of instruments. Over and above the formulation of national strategies, the development of capabilities in incorporated management of coastal areas has been mentioned, with recent approaches that incorporate sustainable development, first and foremost a series of awareness-raising actions directed at public decision-makers. It has been strongly emphasised that political willpower must be accompanied by action: this is not the case often enough in the region.

The Union for the Mediterranean is not designed to replace all of this, but rather to reinforce
it, particularly in terms of commitments by governments and decision-makers regarding the implementation of the necessary actions.

Actions, specifically those related to education for sustainable development, are left to the initiative of partnerships, networks and stakeholders at various levels (associations, universities, schools, researchers, teachers and local Agenda 21 initiatives). There is a wide range of diversity, not only in terms of culture, history and the environment, but also with regard to all these actions, and this needs to be taken into account when our recommendations are formulated.

This session has made it possible to establish a number of proposals for recommendations. These recommendations are not being presented in order of priority; this will be established subsequently.

It is important for education for sustainable development to feature high on the agenda of the Union for the Mediterranean. Particular attention should be paid to sustainable development, but specific actions relating to education for sustainable development should also be borne in mind. To enrich the network of actions which is already in place, funding instruments and exchanges must be devised.

I particularly liked the expression: "First and foremost, these actions should enable women, men and children from around the Mediterranean basin to meet together as a priority", with an emphasis on the solidarity aspect of education for sustainable development and attending to the most deprived. Particular attention should therefore be paid in these actions to stakeholder networks working to satisfy fundamental needs. With regard to education promoting autonomy, individuals need to be supported in their role as stakeholders in their own future.

I have mentioned a number of existing networks such as the biosphere reserves which form part of UNESCO's "Man and the Biosphere" intergovernmental programme, as well as world heritage sites. These are local networks and I was especially interested by this whole local dynamic which France in particular contributes to education for sustainable development. It is a good idea to see localities as places for experimentation, particularly in countries which still need to make a huge amount of progress on these issues.

These networks lend themselves very well to this type of work, particularly with respect to the biosphere, in which the idea of sustainable development has really been the focal point since the 1970s.

They offer an opportunity to explore the relationship between man, nature and culture more fully in that the cultural wealth represented by the Mediterranean basin derives from this relationship.

I have also noted the importance of promoting popular wisdom and traditional expertise in the fields as varied as land management, water supply, farming and food. We could also apply the same considerations to the role played by such knowledge in terms of aggregation and discussion, particularly with respect to food, comparing what we have in common, what differences exist and what draws us together.

Another important aspect is that of traditional expertise in the fight against desertification. This is a necessity in the region because there is a heritage of expertise which absolutely must be preserved. For instance, oases, qanats, earthworks and dry wall techniques - a whole series of things which characterise the Mediterranean and provide as many sources of inspiration for future actions.

We have had a detailed presentation of the network of Mediterranean universities for sustainable development. This must be encouraged and supported; we view this as an incubator for changes in the educational system, particularly universities, but also as a system for training trainers and, more generally, as an instrument for implementing national sustainable development strategies within Mediterranean countries. This network of 10 or so
universities from the Mediterranean region will be meeting together soon and starting to define a common curriculum. It will be examining the best way of generating this education for sustainable development incubators within universities.

Lastly, as to teacher training, the idea of setting up a Mediterranean college for sustainable development was raised. This would involve formalising training instruments for trainers to support networks.

**********************
Session 9

Education for sustainable consumption
and sustainable lifestyles

Summary

• Foreword (Michel RICARD, Chairman French Committee DESD)
• Introduction (Arab HOBALLAH, UNEP)
• Introduction (2) (Paolo SOPRANO, Chairman task force "Sustainable Development", Marrakech process)
• Consumer education at OECD (Peter AVERY, OECD)
• Do we need an education on sustainable consumption? (Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network)
• Open-floor debate
• Thematic workshop on Education for Sustainable Consumption (Fabienne PIERRE, UNEP/DTIE) cf. Appendix

Moderator:
Arab HOBALLAH (UNEP) and Fabienne PIERRE (UNEP)

FOREWORD
by Michel RICARD
Chairman French Committee DESD

I am delighted that we have been able to hold this session, which has been prepared in close collaboration by the UNEP and the French Committee for the Decade. I am also delighted to see in the audience and on the platform many of those who have been committed for several years now to an approach which aims to make our habits in terms of production and consumption more coherent with sustainable development.

Just as a household attempts to balance its budget so as not to be overdrawn at the end of the month, our planet needs to make sure it is not overdrawn and adjusts its lifestyle to its resources if it is to act in solidarity and survive in the long term. At present, we are living on credit, and the current context of the subprime crisis makes it easy to get a grasp of the consequences of unreasonable behaviour in this respect in the medium term. The current financial crisis is nothing more than an illustration of what happens when civilisation is based on overconsumption.

We are too enslaved by invitations to consume: education for sustainable development must be able to direct each of us to have more responsible behaviours. Our quality of life should not be measured simply in terms of the quantity of manufactured products we own or the quantity of products we consume.

The French committee of the Decade mandated Fabienne PIERRE (UNEP/DTIE, Paris) to realize a preliminary document intitled "Thematic workshop on Education for Sustainable Consumption". This document is presented in Appendix 4.
Education for sustainable and responsible production and consumption, whether as part of the approaches undertaken as part of the Decade, the Marrakesh process or any other regional, national or international initiative, is aimed at changes in behaviour which are necessary for ourselves and for future generations [since our current behaviour] is leading us into a dead-end both for ourselves and for future generations.

Introduction
by Arab HOBALLAH
UNEP

I would first like to thank Michel Ricard, our host and friend in this meeting, for having invited us and having associated the United Nations Programme for the Environment, as well as thank the organisers for this excellent meeting. I would also like to thank Victoria THORESEN, because she has done a great job on the document which will be presented later on about Here and Now: this name will be explained when we come to discuss modes of consumption and production; and too thank my colleague Fabienne PIERRE who has done a lot of work to produce the summary document which she will be presenting to you.

This document, which we will be using as a reference for our discussion, has been the subject of extensive discussion by experts, several of whom are present here today and who I would also like to thank. We will in any event be thanking them by name for their contributions to this report when it is published, and I trust that it will constitute a landmark report which will be of use as we endeavour to progress on this notion of education for sustainable consumption.

I will return to this later, but our analysis indicates that it is fundamental to address the issue of sustainable consumption and production if we really want to progress on what is known as sustainable development. In my view, sustainable development remains a somewhat abstract notion. I feel qualified to say this because I have been working for 15 years in the field. I feel that the consumption-production approach is highly practical and addresses entrepreneurs, politicians and consumers alike. We will be coming back to this later: it is at the heart of this four-hour session.

As I said, it's extremely important that we perceive the sustainable development process through consumption and production patterns, of course moving from the unsustainable ones to sustainable patterns. Education in this context is extremely important.

First of all, if you consider the wealth of some regions of the world, the CO2 emissions and the next generation for consumption, who are the young in Africa, in Latin America and mostly in Asia, and if you imagine that the Chinese, the Indians, the Filipinos, the Malaysians will increase their wealth, then, there is no space left into square and then, there is no Earth to support us. That's why we consider that looking at the consumption patterns is extremely important if you want to move toward sustainable development. This is clearly showed on scientific analysis on where we stand today: the trend will increase, is still increasing and it's still alarming, but it'll be much more because we can't stop the Asians, the Africans from, at least, satisfying their basic needs. So only by satisfying basic needs and increasing a little bit, we'll be in trouble somewhere, so we have to reconsider our lifestyle, which is the purpose of the two Marrakech task forces that we have, education and lifestyle.

The global environmental outlook from UNEP, the report from OECD, the report from the World Bank, all show very clearly that we don't have the capacity to keep on consuming the way we do because the resources are not enough. We can count a lot on the genius of human kind in creating, inventing, innovating, but there are limits to this.

We do have a certain number of challenges and opportunities that can let us some hope but still, it's worrisome. First of all, over the last 50 years, according to the analysis of million ecosystem assessments of more than a thousand scientists all over the world, we have changed our ecosystems much more rapidly and extensively than any other period of time.
So we do have serious challenges to consider: the consumption and the production patterns; the supply and demand; the impact we have on environment and health; the degradation of resources, we are not yet enough aware about that; and this important notion of individual versus common goods. Sometime ago, the common good had a sense, people at community level, village level, knew about common goods. Now, it’s completely lost, except in small villages far away in Africa or Asia or in the Amazon. We’re going to individual goods so to extend that nobody worries about the other ones, only to worry about his own issues. This is extremely damaging the ecosystem. But hopefully, we have some opportunities in the sense that there has been some environmental and sustainable development policies, not just reports put on a shelf but some of them have been progressing well; and this includes education, training and awareness-raising. Fortunately, people understood that environment is also good for economy and that it’s an excellent opportunity for the business to work on environment, but we have to make sure that they work on a sustainable manner. Awareness of consumers has increased but not enough, we have to work more on that.

Thanks to you and others, we have to put pressure on actors so the investments can be done in a sustainable manner. But, as I said before, we still can’t count on the scientific and social genius in human kind in inventing and innovating, there are limits. Unfortunately, everyone has his own issue and has to see how to deal with it.

We have to respond to a number of challenges that we can put on the table related to sustainable consumption/production patterns. Our knowledge is increasing; we still need to know better but we know enough to act. More knowledge will improve our actions but we know enough in order to move ahead. So we need to see seriously how we can strengthen the enabling framework for the governments and for the business sector, because we can’t move on sustainable consumption/production patterns just by business alone or government alone or citizens alone. It’s jointly or we don’t move. The biggest challenge we have is how to take on board the requirements and necessities of those 3 partners and move ahead. We need to really change the people mentality in order to see how we can mainstream all these important issues by education, regulation and incentives.

The education for sustainable consumption has to be looked from a wide angle. We need to develop education into strategies; we need to include very well the consumption/production patterns, national plans, strategies and so on, in order to show the link between consumption, production and the behaviour of the citizens. We talk a lot about we don’t act enough. It’s extremely important that we find the right mechanism to inform the consumers and to promote corporate responsibility. We need to make sure that we have the right holistic objectives ahead of us; mitigation versus adaptation, we need both, we need to act on both them; the resource efficiency versus the depletion; the durability of the goods we have.

The attitude of everyone, would it be a head of a country, a UN organization, a citizen, saying, ‘why me? Let the others start’, is one of the big problems that we have on sustainable development: who will be courageous enough to take the first step?

Our approach is to promote not only environment from an ecological perspective but environment for development; that’s why we want to go through the approach of consumption and production where people can see the impact on the health, the impact on their pocket and look what’s around them. The whole purpose of the Marrakech process is the 10-year framework of programs on sustainable consumption and production that we have been requested to prepare in Johannesburg, we are now preparing it and in 2 years, it’ll be discussed at the next CSD meeting.

We have lot of publications, available on our website. We are ready to cooperate with anyone of you who wants to progress on that. We are undertaking, presently, a global survey on sustainable lifestyle trying to see the meaning of a sustainable lifestyle, respecting the different cultures and trying to adapt those principles to the region and culture. There are specific issues, tourism and other sectors, and we try to see how we can move onto changes and so on.
An analysis has been done recently by HEC showing that this is the first time in history that the way we are moving will create huge risk ahead of us.

Finally, food for thoughts, a matter of education: what is the biggest danger, energy or war? Energy will have much more harmful impact than a war.

**Introduction (2)**

by Paolo SOPRANO

Chairman of the task force "Sustainable consumption", Marrakech process

I’m here representing the task force on education for sustainable consumption, an Italian voluntary initiative within the Marrakech process on sustainable consumption and production.

First of all, I’d like to thank the UNESCO French National Committee for organizing this conference and for hosting this workshop which will provide us the opportunity to share our work on education for sustainable consumption. I’d also like to thank UNEP for its key role in organizing this meeting, as well as other meetings, and in particular, of course, the division for technology industrial economics for its contribution.

In 2005, through the institution of the Decade on education for sustainable development, the United Nations emphasized the key role of education in achieving the objectives of sustainability and to achieve a social model based on sustainable development objectives. Considering the increase of industrialization in developing countries and the human impact on the environment, it became urgent to strongly considerate the global consequences of individual lifestyle, choices, and to reorientate our consumption models toward sustainability. Current consumption patterns, in particular in developed countries, are the main cause of the increasing deterioration of our planet environment. At the same time, a large part of the world population can’t be even classified as consumers; they fight, day after day, to simply survive. Any access to basic human needs, as safe water supplies or affordable energy, imposes greater land and control waste and pollution. For these reasons, the promotion of sustainable consumption and production patterns should be considered a global responsibility. Education represents the tool to empower individuals providing them with the appropriate skills and competences which will allow people to be active, informed and aware key actors of the process leading toward more sustainable consumption behaviours and production patterns. The task force on education for sustainable development represents, in the framework of the Marrakech process, the effort to move in this direction and a concrete contribution to the implementation of the UN Decade on education for sustainable development.

Considering the objectives included in the chapter 3 of the Johannesburg plan of implementation, the Marrakech process is a global initiative to support the implementation of sustainable consumption and production, SCP, and the elaboration for a 10 years framework of programs in support of regional and national initiatives to accelerate the shift toward SCP. In particular, the outcomes of the Marrakech process will be formally presented and discussed at the United Nations Commission for sustainable development 18th and 19th sessions in 2010-2011. In particular, the SCD 18, in 2010, is the review session and a compilation of best practices on sustainable consumption and production and will be presented as a contribution to highlight the progress of commitment, targets and goals. During the following session, CSD 19, in 2011, the policy session where negotiated decisions will be taken, the discussion will be oriented to understand how overcome constrains, obstacles and barriers in the implementation of the 10 years framework of programs.

In order to contribute to the Marrakech process, Italy decided to take leadership of the task force on education for sustainable consumption. This task force was launch during the 14th session of the UN Commission on sustainable development in New York in May 2006. The main objective of the task force is to focus on the role of formal learning processes. As a matter of fact, the task force wants to contribute to the development and reinforcement of sustainable consumption and production patterns focusing on education as a tool of
implementation both in a long and short term perspective. Behavioural changes require the development of cultural models of development as well as the more immediate accompanying measures in strategic sectors. In collaboration with UNEP, UNESCO and consumer citizenship networks, the task force on education for sustainable consumption carried out guidelines and recommendations in the introduction of ESC informal curricular.

“Here and now”, which is the cover of the publication, represents the first concrete contribution to the Marrakech process and it’s aiming at: helping decision makers understand the importance of education for sustainable consumption supporting other policy goals such as citizenship and democratic participation, environmental protection or energy and climate policies; secondly, providing guidance to policy makers on how to integrate education for sustainable consumption into existing educational and sustainable development strategies; thirdly, providing educators with tools and instruments in order to include education for sustainable consumption in formal curricula. “Here and now” is composed by 3 different but integrated sections. The first one, addressing the challenges, is written for policy makers, teachers, trainers and contains core curriculum suggestions. The third part, the final, is an overview of resources and teaching materials existing that provides references to theoretical research and practical materials, as well as a list of web links. The list of the levels, principles and objectives that education for sustainable consumption involves is addressed to the political action at several levels and concerns: considering the interdisciplinary of education for sustainable consumption; ensuring that educational institutions reflect their daily management to the priorities given to sustainable development, otherwise we’ll have our children in non-sustainable buildings; including teams, topics, modules, courses and degrees about education for sustainable consumption in the formal established curricula; encouraging research in education for sustainable consumption related areas; straightening connections between researchers, lecturers, teachers, trainers, social economic actors and stakeholders; enhancing cooperation between professionals for diverse disciplines in order to develop integrated approaches to education for sustainable consumption, it’s not only a matter of scientist network or geography but really a cross-sector pattern of education; teaching and teacher training which strengthen global future orientated constructive perspective with education for sustainable consumption; rewarding a creative, critical, innovative thinking related to education for sustainable consumption ensuring that education for sustainable consumption respects indigene knowledge, cultural diversity and recognises alternative lifestyle; fostering intergenerational learning as an integrated aspect of education for sustainable consumption and providing opportunities for practical applications of theoretical studies through social involvement and community service.

This conference represents one of many opportunities to share the task force activities, and in particular to communicate the document “Here and now”. Last week in Paris, OECD showed attention to our work on education for sustainable consumption during the conference that had been jointly organized by UNEP and OECD Committee for Consumer Protection on consumer education. We hope that we’ll have the opportunity to carry on the collaboration with the OECD Committee for Consumer Policy. Furthermore, there will be the Bonn conference on education for sustainable development organized by UNESCO that will provide us an opportunity to highlight the relevance of education for sustainable development to all education, to promote international exchange on education for sustainable development, especially between the North and the South, to carry out a stocktaking of the implementation of the UN Decade and to develop strategies for the way ahead.

I believe that “Here and now” could be considerate a relevant contribution to the Decade, highlighting the importance on education for sustainable consumption in the achieving of education for sustainable development objectives.

I hope the activities of the task force will be followed by many other participants and actors, as I said, it’s a voluntary initiative. I believe that being together with the other 6 task forces
active within the Marrakech process has been one of the most important and active engine in the process that will lead to complete the preparation for the CSD 18 on sustainable consumption and production. As Arab HOBBALAH has said, this is the core of the program; sustainable development is a process more than a list of objectives. I believe that we have to learn by doing, sustaining the sustainability. The relationship between consumption and production is at the very core or the base of the main economic mechanism regulating our life, the market mechanic. So, if we succeed in changing some of the basic mechanisms within these relationships, I believe that we'll have done a lot for sustainable development.

**Consumer education at OECD**

*by Peter AVERY*

*OECD*

First of all, thank you Aran and Paolo. As you said, we have a lot of challenges facing us in the field of sustainable consumption and education. We have a lot of work to do together and we welcome all invitations to continue to cooperate with us.

I’m here today to talk about the work that OECD has taken up in the area of consumer education and focus on the particular work we’ve been doing on sustainable consumption.

First of all, the OECD, who are we? We are an intergovernmental organization, 30 countries, mostly in Western Europe, Japan, Korea, Australia, North America, but we’re expanding and applications were considered for Russia, Chile, Estonia, Slovenia and Israel. We cover, as an organization, social and economic issues that you can think of, everything from tax to environment to social issues and employment. We have about 200 committees, one of which is the committee on consumer policies. We bring together seniors, officials who are responsible for consumer policy in our member countries. We meet twice a year. Our main issues, currently, are e-commerce, product safety, consumer economics and a variety of horizontal issues, including sustainable consumption, and there is a very important work we are doing on consumer education.

Briefly, concerning our projects on consumer education, we’ve experienced that consumer policy people were involved with consumer protection but also are looking ways to empower consumers to make more effective agents and markets. Markets have been opened up, worldwide, creating all sorts of new opportunities for consumers, there have been technological advances, internet, they’ve really increased opportunities, providing consumers with lot more opportunities but, in many ways, more challenges. From the consumer policy area, we realized that squeezing the most out of these more dynamic markets require educated consumers who are fully informed. So, the committee decided, back in 2007, that it’ll be worthwhile to explore what is being done in the area of consumer education in our member countries and importantly, what we could do to improve education. The goals of our project are: to examine approaches that countries are taking to provide consumer education; to identify effective policies and programs; and to develop policy recommendations to strengthen the consumer education initiatives. So, as you can see, there are some important links with the work that’s going on elsewhere.

In terms of outputs, we have prepared an analytic report, which is really comprehensive; we’ve conducted a lot of independent research but also collected information from our member countries on what their policies are and ask them to evaluate them with the view towards identifying good and effective practices. Our report covers 27 countries including 4 non-member countries as Brazil, Chile, Malaysia and Thailand. We’ve completed a draft this year.

In terms of our key findings and observations from the report, we looked at various aspects of consumer education, looking first at goals and objectives; we think it’s extremely important to establish, in any policy, what the goals and objectives are. We’ve found that most of the countries have a general agreement on the importance of consumer education but,
unfortunately, the process for setting goals seems to be rather weak and fragmented and strategies are not very well developed or defined. Also, in OECD terms, it's always important to have techniques for evaluation because we have to have some ideas of if we're doing the right thing or what might be improved. This is, of course, very complicated undertaking and there are very difficult measurements, difficulties in developing indicators. The complexity of the evaluation process can be underestimated but it's not a reason for not trying. We find that, generally, evaluations are not carried out sufficiently by countries and it really would behoove us all to look very carefully at developing sub-techniques that could be used.

In our study on major approaches to consumer education, we looked at 2 aspects. One is through the delivery mechanism, we've heard about the importance of the “school education”. We find that rarely it’s a separate discipline but it seems, in most countries, to be integrated into other studies. There is an exception in the Nordic country where they have developed it as a separate discipline. Looking at our report, we find some key challenges that have been identified by the countries themselves, including the need to enhance quality, problems due to limited resources and an important lack of motivation for the educated and educators. That's the point we all need to stop and think about: if we don't get this motivation, it's going to be hard, in many respects, to advance this work.

We also looked at the non-formal education that occurs and which is associated with school education. We see this as an important aspect, as a complementary form of education and we identified some good initiatives in Denmark, Portugal, Slovakia and Austria.

In formal outside school types of education, important for adults, it's a challenge and it's difficult because adults often don’t have time available on their free time and they might be themselves not highly motivated.

Looking at the consumer education thematically, we find that in the field of consumer education, it's actually very rare in countries to have identified this in any source of policy or direction that they want to take. The UK, Korea, Japan and Hungary are exceptions in the sense that they've identified this conceptually as something that they’d like to do but they really haven’t proceeded very far in terms of implementing an action plan for lifelong education. Japan is, however, working very actively in this area, so we're looking with great interest in what they might be able to achieve in the next several years.

Also, thematically, one of the approach is to look at consumer education on a subject targeted area, this seems to be the most common way that countries develop consumer education, this would include sustainable consumption or education on climate change or ways of protection consumers against fraudulence practices and product safety. Finally, another theme that the countries pursue on consumer education is that it's target at different groups. This is frequently done and here we find programs and approaches that cover, for the most popular ones, the elderly, the very young children, women and immigrants.

Concerning the ways consumer education is being delivered to people, in terms of government, which is our primary focus in this work, we find it's highly decentralized and the cooperation among agencies is often weak; we find that education ministries involvement is often weak and the consumer agencies often take the lead, but here again, we have an exception in the case of the Nordic countries. In terms of public and private partnerships, we see these as growing in importance and effectiveness. We find important and interesting examples in Australia, with their financial literacy initiatives where government, financial institutions and academics are actively involved in developing and implementing consumer education for financial literacy, and in France, where the private sector and government, along with other organizations, have gotten together to develop very far reaching programs to enhance energy efficiency and promote more sensitivity to climate change.

The next step is the finalization of the report that will be taken place in several months time. The next step after that is to develop a set of policy recommendations, which will be coming out in spring 2009.
Briefly, about the meeting we had on October 24th, which was a joint conference with UNEP and UN American Task Force, we had, in the participants, government officials, consumer associations, business sector, academia and NGOs. We looked at consumer education in general but we had a specific break out session on education for sustainable development.

The key points and preliminary observations that came out of the joint conference on consumer education in the sustainable consumption area are that ideology and paradigms matter, they have profound implications for consumer behaviours. It’s extremely important to establish values at early ages; we’re talking about kids going to school where they’re spending a lot of time with teachers that will influence them, perhaps profoundly. Focusing in citizenship aspects is very key in this regard.

Information, awareness in education are often equated. Consumers get a lot of information but are not educated to use that information on a critical way. It’s important for everyone to understand what education is and to distinguish it between raising awareness and providing information. We’ve also heard that a balance needs to be struck between regulation and education, the right mix can enhance efficiency incredibly. We see that regulation tend to follow on the producing side and education is something on the consumer side. We need to look more carefully what we could do on the consuming side to make policies more effective.

Pedagogical tools and related resources are often insufficient, web based approaches are promising but they seem only to be a partial solution. I want to congratulate the work of the UNEP, “Here and now” provides very powerful way forward in terms of advancing in some very cost effective and efficient ways. Teacher training is inadequate, incentives for teachers and pupils to tackle sustainability issues are weak, curriculums are already overcharged. So unless priorities are changed, the ability to influence student in the most formative years will be limited. So the “Here and now” guidelines are really important in this regard as a good way forward, because it provides some very practical suggestions on how that can be done.

Another point, ESC initiatives are being co-ordinated largely by environment ministries; the social and economic dimensions are very important compound and need to be addressed. More inclusive approaches are needed and education and consumer agencies need to be more actively involved. Sustainable consumption strategies for education are often unclear, not adequately co-ordinated and duplicative. This is an area that we need to work carefully on because we have limited resources.

There’s a need to understand consumer behaviour, what drives it and then, it will provide, maybe, indications on what we can do to change it. And then, we have to work with, and not necessarily against, the behavioural biases that we sometime run up against. Consumer short-sidedness is well known; this is something we can work with and needs to be done in the field of sustainable consumption. The consumer surveys are proven to be highly useful in developing targeted policies.

Do we need an education on sustainable consumption?
by Victoria THORESEN
The consumer citizenship network

We’ve been hearing about consumer education, I’d like to ask a question: is there anyone here who identifies himself as a consumer educator? Not many, this is interesting. How many of you would identify yourself as teacher of environmental issues? A few. Are they any of you here who actually use your time and energy teaching civic education? A few. I mention these 3 groups because they are the important actors, perhaps the most important actors. We’ve now had a description of what consumer education has been and for many years, it has been focused, very much, on other issues, rather than environmental issues, social issues, etc. When one talks about education for sustainable consumption to people, they look at you and they say, “Somewhere over the rainbow, that will never happen, you can’t change people attitudes. People are greedy, egoistic, hedonist. You’ll never manage to make radical changes in people’s lifestyle”. However, I don’t know if I agree to that. The question is: why
do we need sustainable consumption. We've heard several presentations about that but I’d 
like to ask you to remember, when we think about sustainable consumption, we are talking 
about things that relate directly to the financial crisis that the world find itself in today; we’re 
talking about things that have to do with poverty; we’re dealing with issues and themes that 
are connected to the question of the disproportionate distribution of resources, services and 
products in the world; we’re talking about issues and themes that have to do with the limited 
natural resources; we’re also talking about national, international insecurity and yes, energy 
or the bomb is the question but when you look at why the wars are being fought, a lot of them 
are conflicts that have to do with resource accessibility; it’s also a question of environmental 
degradation; we’re talking also about themes that have to do with physical and mental 
ilnesses and addictions.

When we talk about education for sustainable consumption, we have to remember the social, 
the economic and the environmental aspects. The social aspects are frightening sometimes. 
The problems we have to face, both in terms of health and safety, are enormous. We also 
know that crimes increase. Why education for sustainable consumption? If we agreed the 
fact that we need to change our ways of consuming, of making choices, of living, then why 
do we need to learn about this? The OECD report mentions that consumer education has 
focused, rather well, on consumer protection and basic forms of consumer awareness. It has 
also provided certain skills, like we’ve learnt how to complain, but we haven’t learnt very 
much or we haven’t taught in school very much about public interests, they refer to 
environmental issues or social issues.

What are the key challenges? I’ve chosen to take the key challenges presented in the OECD 
report on consumer education. There is a lack of overall strategies. We need to enhance the 
quality of the education provided. We also have look at the limited opportunities in the school 
settings. How can we expand those? As a teacher, you are constantly being given new 
themes that you have to include in your curricular. How these relate to education for 
sustainable development? Of course, it’s an essential part but we can also relate it to other 
themes.

There is a lack of cohesion, in terms of other policies. There is also a lack of motivation. And 
we also have limited resources so how are we going to teach and help people learn about 
this when we don’t have the tools that we are used to have in other classes? There are many 
ways of doing this: we have to identify the learning outcomes, the generic outcomes; critical 
awareness, we have to be able to look at ourselves; we have to have the ecological 
responsibility and social responsibility on a wide scale, for my local community, for me and 
my family but also globally; we have to be able to develop action and involvement; and the 
local Agenda 21 is coming slowly, but surely. It’s a long list, we can’t go through all of them 
but in the “Here and now” document, you’ll find a suggestion list of competencies to be 
achieved when you’ve done education for sustainable consumption. These could be called 
general but we you look at them closely, they are essential, all of them, and this involves how 
we use the internet, how we deal without advertising. All of these can be translated into the 
specific topics that we use.

We don’t have the answers for the problems that tomorrow is going to have. If you look back 
10 years, we have to recognize that a lot of the problems and challenges that young people 
face today as consumers are things we never knew about. How many of us had to decide 
whether we want a chocolate made with GMO or not 30 or 40 years ago? These kinds of 
things are coming up daily and we have to develop ideas, the ability to look for new solutions 
in our students and our children.

The themes of education for sustainable consumption span from life quality questions to very 
specific issues such as rights, responsibility, health and safety, change management and the 
global. Do you know the word “glocal”? It means global and local. ESC methodology had to 
be glocal, personal, practical and creative. That means that, as a form of evaluation, we can 
use these 4 words every time we set up a teaching session or a learning situation. The
Methodologies are enormous. There’s a lot to do, lots of ways of doing it. In a classroom, you can do everything, as well as take the kids out of the classroom and take them in the neighbourhood, and let them see what people are doing, because when they experience examples of social innovation, they get inspired, face to face, they find things out.

I’d like to remind you that the major points in this roadmap, as a kind of ladder to come over the other side of the rainbow, are how to ensure that the principles we are talking about are shown in the schools; how to include this in a curriculum; how to encourage the research; how to strengthen the connections between the civil societies, business and education. What can we do? Do you have ideas? How can we implement them? How can we convince the policy makers to do this? How can we enhance the cooperation between the disciplines? How do we get together? How do we encourage this necessary cooperation? How do we get this into teacher training? How do we reward innovation? Do people need prizes or do they need other kinds of motivation? How do we get indigenous knowledge and alternative lifestyle to be respected and not looked down upon? How are we going to foster intergenerational learning when we can hardly understand what our teenagers are saying? How can we encourage, stimulate, create opportunities for bringing our ideas and our learning out into the community so that we can, voluntarily, help others understand how they can achieve sustainable lifestyles? Who should make these commitments leading to change? And what can we do to make sure that the recommendations that we are going to make in this discussion can and will be acted upon in the future or this conference will be another conference with a paper with some recommendations? What are we going to do when we go home?

A lot of question marks so good luck with the conversation afterwards.

Open-floor discussion

Fabienne PIERRE, UNEP/DTIE

I’d like to remind you the objectives of the workshop on ESC. We have 5 points to discuss. First one will be about how to integrate ESC into educational institutions and curricula as a crosscutting issue. Then, we could talk about ESC into professional training; ESC as awareness raising and as related specifically to media literacy, which is a very important aspect for ESC. We’d like to approach also the question of multi-stakeholder cooperation when it comes to ESC, cooperation at a local level. The last point will be about how to assess the impact of ESC. As you noticed, we’d like to discuss and to see how to implement “Here and now” recommendations on ESC. If we have time, we’d like to have a short focus on the Mediterranean region.

Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network

The first issue we are going to look at now is about how to integrate ESC in the established curriculum in schools and universities? We request that you talk about constructive ideas rather than analyse too much why it doesn’t work.

Khadi DIOP, Education Ministry, Dakar, Senegal

My name is Khadi DIOP, I am from Senegal and I am a member of the Francophone network for education with a view to sustainable development.

We have heard many interesting things about the work done by the UNEP with respect to ESD, both in general and particularly in regard to its highly relevant approach via education for consumption. I fully agree with the relevance of this choice.

With respect to the question which has been raised, I think we have been placed within an outline which intends to incorporate this dimension into programmes, particularly if it is borne in mind that regarding education, there are three sub-sectors: the formal sector, the non-formal sector and the informal sector. As to the formal sector, we have worked particularly on the issue of academic education. We have developed several programmes, similar perhaps
to what has been done elsewhere: environmental education, developed by the Ministry of the Environment with involvement by the National Department of Education; education for family life in terms of population, a project which is funded by the United Nations and also based out of the Department of Education; rights education and so on. All this to say that there have been many projects which converge on education for sustainable development. I recently heard education for consumption mentioned within our Environment Ministry.

We have been deploying such programmes, assessing them and incorporating them into the new curriculum for 10 years now. Five years ago, we decided to rewrite our fundamental educational curriculum, because we observed that teachers were too taken up with traditional coursework to introduce the teaching innovations aimed at incorporating ESD themselves. We therefore needed to reorganise things and attempt to see how to incorporate these sectorial syllabuses within a global syllabus to be taught at school level. We therefore decided to rewrite the syllabuses which have been in force in our country since 1979. We thereupon changed the new basic education curriculum, taking into account everything which was being done in the syllabuses for each sector. We trained the various stakeholders, particularly teachers. We discussed these newly incorporated syllabuses with the academic community, parents and pupils as part of the expansion of the offer of education. This is because we have difficulty in getting children into school, and we thought that these topics could help to broaden access to education. We have also raised the awareness of populations to the issues of sustainable development. We now have a global programme at ministerial level, the new basic education curriculum which we have started to generalise as of this year. We have backed this up with an approach designed to strengthen capabilities so that the teachers who are called upon to teach these syllabuses will actually be able to do so.

In terms of pedagogical approach, we are using a skills-based approach. We decided that we needed to equip pupils with skills in order for them to appropriate these new elements which are designed to add to what was already being done in terms of school education.

We now therefore have a global programme which embodies all these concerns in terms of sustainable development.

Myriam BOUVERAT, Education and Development Foundation, Switzerland

I would like to say that I find it difficult to draw a distinction between education for consumption as you have presented it and education for sustainable development. As far as I'm concerned, the competencies and topics presented are exactly the same as what we present in Switzerland in terms of education for sustainable development. There is no difference. I therefore find your approach interesting, but for us education for consumption is not something specific because it corresponds exactly to what we place within the broader notion of education for sustainable development.

Michel MOMBRUN, Francophone networks

Firstly, I am slightly ill at ease to have to talk solely in terms of sustainable consumption, because I believe that education in this field should be about education first and foremost. Education does not consist in saying "this is what you have to do". Education consists in saying "these are the resources, it's up to you to decide what to do". This is a significant difference, and I felt this unease in that one permanent aspect of most of the contributions was this "this is what you have to do" angle. I do not share this view.

Secondly, with respect to education, be it for consumption or sustainable development, I appreciate and subscribe to the point of view of Myriam BOUVERAT. We need to develop capabilities in terms of autonomy and responsibility without inciting people to consume, leaving individuals free as to whether or not they consume.

I would like to say that individuals need firstly to recover ownership of their lives and lifestyles and their ability to choose, protest or even resist. In this respect I am sorry that the fact that if people consume, it means that others produced and sold has not all been discussed. What of modes of production, trade, advertising and all that? Citizens can be as responsible as you
like, but can change nothing fundamentally in the face of such influences. So why have we not discussed modes of production? What about the lack of respect on the part of producers producing goods and services for the environment, as they consume vanishing raw materials, dwindling sources of energy which pollute and alter our climate? What about the issue of responsibility for controlling what is sold to us, which constitutes an offer and not a response to our needs? What of the capability of individuals, so weak today, to face up to the power of money, producers, advertising and trade? This has been glaringly absent from your presentations, because we cannot discuss issues of consumption and ask consumers to make individual efforts, or even joint efforts, if major action is not taken in this respect. I agree with some others that there should be a highly stringent minimum of legislation to address things which, today, are harmful to health and fulfilment and may even lead to death.

El Khebir ALAOUI, UNEP, Morocco

Michel MOMBRUN's question has perfectly summarised a good part of my introduction. If we want to educate, we need to know how to educate for consumption and have some control over those who decide our modes of consumption. Here we are dealing with the specialists in consumption, people who create new lifestyles, those such as Coca-Cola, Pepsi and Nike who create lifestyles which cannot be challenged by schools and faced with which the educational system appears very weak. I believe that in order to address this problem, education should also be positioned within these specifiers themselves.

How can we train and educate managers, senior managers and future senior managers of these companies and ensure that these people take on board the concepts of sustainable consumption and production? There is this whole connection with the private sector as recommended by the report: I believe it should start at this level so that we can ensure that what is taught to children in school can have a degree of continuity with what is found in advertising, the media and products offered to children.

Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network

It's very important that we realize that we are not talking about anti-consumerism; we are not talking about not being a consumer at all. We are talking about developing consumers who can be critical and engaged in dialogue with the producers, with the government, with others.

Mike LATCHER, UNEP

I haven't heard the word “production” at all, except for Michel. Why don't we speak about production? In fact, there are rules in some small communities, that you can only consume what you produce, of course in a flexible way. So, that's perhaps one of the ways of ensuring that people don't look at themselves as consumers. I'd like to see in your approach the production aspect.

Arab HOBALLAH, UNEP

I would like to clarify one point. The goal of my contribution was to point out from the outset that we are dealing with consumption and production and that what was to follow was going to focus on consumption. The issue of stakeholder responsibility was very clear in what I said. I said clearly that we are not going to ask the Chinese, the Indonesians and so on to stop consuming but that modes of consumption needed re-examining and that all this depends on the legislative and regulatory frameworks available in each country. This was clearly specified. It is fundamental to continue to examine modes of consumption; this must be placed within the global context of consumption and production, but our purpose here has been to focus on consumption because that was our chosen topic. There is no sense in which we are ignoring production. There is another whole aspect, I am responsible for this approach for the United Nations, and believe me, we have plenty of discussions about production. We have decided to focus on consumption because consumption is talked about much less. In the vast majority of discussions, only production is dealt with and consumption is completely ignored. This is therefore not a closed book for us: linking production to consumption is fundamental, producers and politicians must be held accountable; there must
be a legislative framework and market instruments to encourage this. All of this is fundamental for us. Please believe me therefore when I say that this has not been sidelined and is just as important to us as it clearly is to you. However, we are dealing with a specific field here: the other subjects are just as important and are being discussed extensively elsewhere.

**Céline PRONO, Chrysalis association, France**

I would like to give an example of an initiative in terms of non-formal education. Crystals is the leading association in a consortium of nine African and European NGOs who are working on a project which would enable education for development programmes to be set up in European schools and universities. We have several targets, but as to students in the 18-25-year-old bracket, we have wondered a lot about which students to target. To address the question of how to incorporate education for responsible consumption in curricula, we discussed this a lot and finally decided to target students of educational science, so that there might be a multiplier effect in the long term as a result of their awareness on these issues being raised first. The context is broader, because development education does not relate solely to responsible consumption, but this is one of the topics which we deal with, and we thought that by targeting these students, who will end up being teachers and trainers, there might be a genuine effect in schools some five or ten years from now.

**Marina GRUSLIN, Haute École Charlemagne & Association Cerise, Belgium**

I have been a teacher for some 20 years, so I am a grass-roots stakeholder. Regarding education for sustainable development, I work in a teaching department where we train teachers for a number of different levels: infant, primary and secondary education. In 2000, we set up training for education for sustainable development in establishments structured mainly around interactions between health and the environment, two motivational avenues with respect to our target populations. Initially, we addressed ourselves to teachers, and then broadened the scope because naturally, not only teachers are concerned by education for sustainable development, education for consumption and so on.

I agree with Myriam BOUVERAT that education for consumption forms an integral part of education for sustainable development: it is one of the aspects or resources. Tomorrow, in fact, I will be presenting the specific methods which we have developed: we can now look back on seven years’ worth of operation. In any case, one avenue is to bring the pedagogical project to life, with a socio-constructivist approach. Words are not enough: actions are required. It is necessary to get out of the classroom and have partnerships with associations. At least as regards Belgium, the non-profit world is highly active, putting together teaching packs on eco-consumption; there are also online networks of eco-consumers. There are therefore all these resources which you have mentioned and media education, but also the use of the Internet to put together teaching tools: all these techniques are used in the training which we have developed and which I will be presenting tomorrow morning for anybody who is interested. In any case this is one avenue: committing to the pedagogical project, bringing it to life and not only talking about doing it.

**A participant**

I did a postgraduate training course on sustainable development in 1986 in an agricultural school in Châteauroux. There were 21 of us on the course, and we carried out a local diagnostic audit for five municipalities. We put together a weighty report which we presented to the various politicians and other département leaders and the President of the Brême regional natural park. Four or five years later, there was nothing to be seen for this. We presented this report at the Châteauroux agricultural school. This makes me ask myself what sustainable development really consists in, given that young farmers are still being trained in intensive and extensive farming. We may talk in terms of territorial audits, local land management contracts and taking the environment into account, but there is something of a dichotomy between credit and money on the one hand and sustainable development on the other. Perhaps things have changed since 1986, I don't know.
Thank you for these contributions, which bring us back to our opening question. I would like to move on to the next topic, which will enable us to cover the comments made with respect to production and to which Mr Arab Hoballah responded. I would like to say that of course stakeholders, producers and politicians must be made responsible, but so must consumers, since there is also an attempt to give them the resources to act with respect to markets and what producers and politicians do. The objective is therefore also to give them the resources and information and perhaps a little more room for manoeuvre than they have at present.

This brings us on to the second question, which concerns the integration of education for sustainable consumption in professional training, particularly with respect to marketing, advertising and communication. This ties in with the comments which have been made. How can education for sustainable consumption be developed and integrated into this kind of training in business schools, Masters in marketing and advertising and so on, for those who will play a role in tomorrow's consumption? What should be the role of universities, public stakeholders, companies and NGOs in this process of incorporating the issue of sustainable consumption in this type of training? Your comments and contributions in this respect would be most welcome.

**Marida BOMÉ**

I work in an association which sponsors environment-related projects amongst students; I have just left university. With respect to the question raised by Fabienne PIERRE, I'm wondering what will happen once attempts have been made to include the concept of sustainable consumption in university curricula and students have to do internships in companies which don't necessarily incorporate sustainable development in their production methods: how will these students react?

**Arab HOBALLAH, UNEP/DTIE**

I fully appreciate your question, especially because I have already had to address this issue with students from the HEC, ESCP and ESSEC business schools. Some companies are incorporating it and such placements can be found. However, this is not easy. Such teaching is not carried out in graduate schools. I myself have attempted to see how this could be incorporated at the ESCP and HEC, and some thesis supervisors from the ESCP have attended a few lectures to find out how sustainable consumption and production could be integrated. The best responses I have had have come from business schools.

Myriam GRUSLIN was saying just now that perhaps the focus should be on educational science. Of course, educational science is fundamental, but attempts should be made to impact those who will be managing tomorrow's companies or entering government. It is they who will have to establish the rules required to shift towards sustainable production and consumption. We should not remain solely within the role of education, but also teach tomorrow's decision-makers how they can change things. There is an emerging market for sustainable production and consumption, but unfortunately it is no more than emerging: it needs a little more encouragement. This market exists mostly in Europe and the United States and is beginning to show signs of life elsewhere.

When Myriam GRUSLIN said that consumption forms an integral part of sustainable development, I think this is true for those two countries, but when I go to Asia, Africa and Latin America it is clear that consumption does not form part of their sustainable development strategy, which resolves around production, cleaner production, adjustments and so on. The preventive aspect, and how consumers can change, is not examined. Many government ministers have said things to me like "how is it you want people not to use 4WD vehicles when Americans drive nothing else?".

We need to find the right arguments to adapt one culture to another. You are on a promising market, so do not lose heart. Companies have understood that there is plenty of money to be made with the environment. This is a huge market which is gradually progressing, and we
Dominique GANIAGE, Department of Sustainable Development, EDF, France

To come back to what the student was saying, I work for EDF (Électricité de France) in their Department of Sustainable Development, and we receive a great number of applications for placements in the Department of Sustainable Development. We try to persuade all the students not to come to our department, which has quite a small team, but to go into other departments in order to encourage the same people we are trying to encourage to take action and acquire new competencies which they will use to implement different modes of production and consumption.

Pamela PUNTenney, Co-chair, Caucus for education, UN SD Commission

I’m going to just talk in general, from my own work as a professional environmental educator working internationally. I think there is a key thing going on here about personal responsibility and personal choices, and how do you build that into looking at production and consumption. A lot of decisions are not ours. We are presented with products and we have no choices or we don’t have access to those choices. So, where do we go from here? One of the things that strikes me is, in your analysis, your framework was quite negative when in reality, there is so much going on out there that is so positive. People are putting a lot of energy into this, making information available to society. Children, older students, college post-doc live in society so how do you engage them in the process of what’s going on and look for those successes, not only good practices? What’s going on in your community, in your region? Many of the business schools have now joint programs, Master, PhD level, which are a joint between environment and business. Their programs are phenomenal so if you want look at some examples on consumption. I’m deeply concern about fragmenting us further and I think that the Swiss lady and the example of the teacher helped pull us back in looking into larger arena, which lead us to the work on organizing principles called “eco-effectiveness”. How effectively are we protection the environment? When you start looking through that prism, then you get out what you try to get out, because you have to examine production and consumption.

UNEP has a great program that is just about to be released called “sustainable societies”. A lot of your questions on your list are actually within that tool kit and curriculum, which is part of environmental education training units mesa program mainstreaming environment and sustainability in African universities. They created stakeholder dialogues – it’s a very engaging process, it’s very different from what has been presented here – to get out the same things you’re trying to get outside. Put that on table to think about, explore and examine because I believe there are many examples just like that worldwide.

El Khebir ALAOUI, UNDP, Morocco

To respond to Fabienne PIERRE’s question about how to improve education for sustainable consumption in terms of professional training, I suggest that links between professional associations should be encouraged, for instance the cement manufacturers' association and those for the chemical and para-chemical industries, and that these should be linked up with universities, training courses and schools which specialise in these fields, so that together they can identify conclusive ways of introducing education for sustainable consumption. I would qualify such people as primary consumers, because by consuming, they will produce new products which will then be sold to secondary consumers including the general public: much more attention should be paid to this primary group.

Another possibility is to examine how priorities can be emphasised with respect to national policies. For instance, in arid areas, one of the priorities would be water. In this case the best way of addressing primary consumers would be to work with farmers, as someone mentioned earlier. We need to look at how to work with smallholders and farming groups and ensure that these people understand sustainable consumption more adequately. For
instance, in Morocco we are working on land around oases. The issue is how to ensure that smallholders abandon pumps: water pumps have become a plague and have totally destroyed some arid areas. Everybody now has their own pump which can quickly be hooked up to a battery and draw lots of water. The question is how we can work with these populations that will in turn produce products which could be described as sustainable.

**Elisa JIMENEZ, Costa Rica**

I agree with several speakers that said that values and ethical principles are in the core of an education for sustainable development. I was wondering what ethical framework the Marrakech task force is using because I think it’s vital. What are the values that we are promoting for helping students and consumers to guide their actions? The UNESCO adopted the ethical framework for the decade of education for sustainable development and I was wondering if the task force has adopted any ethical framework or has thought about that.

**Fatma TARHOUNI, General Secretary, national UNESCO Commission, Tunis**

We are virtually halfway through the Decade. When you look at what is happening, in terms of discussions, attendant issues, the overall direction and the many examples, what you see is that everybody is concerned by sustainable development and that education is the pivotal question and also lies at the base of the development of responsible, aware behaviour to achieve a modicum of change. Speaking in the most overall terms, I therefore believe that the right direction would be to discuss and implement strategies mobilising all stakeholders in a progressive, systemic approach.

We have also had the example of students of educational science and student interns who will one day be leading companies. These relate to medium-term approaches, but in the longer term, it will be necessary to address the issue of those who will be responsible for the behaviour of individuals from a very young age.

In a previous session, with people from the Francophone Quebec Energy Institute, the question of how to encourage political decision-makers who have made commitments since the 2005 UN General Assembly to become still more committed was raised. Perhaps other ministerial meetings, such as the CONFEMEN, (Conference of Francophone State Education Ministers) could be one forum for this. How can national strategies be implemented in order for this work of awareness-raising, information and training to be done in order to reach the principal component: the learners? I think all these questions need to be debated, perhaps by groups of operational stakeholders, in order for us to make progress. Time is passing, we are halfway through the Decade, and I think we have not yet found our feet.

**Florent BAARSCH, French Student Network for Sustainable Development (REFEDD)**

I would like to say that some contributions seem to see production and consumption as being two opposite things. I believe it is a mistake to talk solely in terms of either consumption or production. Both need to be discussed, at the same time neither needs to be discussed. What I often like to say is that education for sustainable development does not exist. It is not a subject in and of itself, but should form part of everything we teach pupils and, as regards my own interests, students in particular. What should be promoted is really a global approach to sustainable development, and doing much more than talk about carrying out education for sustainable development, recalling that sustainable development dates back to the 1987 Brundtland report and bringing to bear a few other concepts. Sustainable development really needs to be incorporated into all curricula, not as a subject, but as an integral part of all subjects. The danger is that sustainable development becomes somewhat restricted, with the creation of sustainable development specialists, which is not really much use at the end of the day. What is needed is for people who are completing their studies at the moment to be trained in such issues and develop environmental awareness and a social conscience which will enable them to play a part in bringing about the social change we are all seeking.
I think it was Dominique GANIAGE who said that we need to encourage what could be termed an "inroads approach": students who are trained and aware of these questions relating to the environment, sustainable development and social issues should be making inroads into a wide number of companies and different departments in order to contribute to this change. If we remain cloistered with other motivated people by being involved in NGOs or other local associations which defend the environment, nothing will change. I am convinced that it is by making inroads into every level of society: politics, business and associations, that we will manage to achieve genuine change. This is why it is worthwhile training students who are aware of all these issues so that they can then spread out into every area of society. Rather than education for sustainable development, this is truly education for intellectual emancipation, be it environmental or social; this is what education is all about and what we will be promoting, and I would like this to be discussed too since it could be said to constitute the foundation of sustainable development, which is not a subject but forms an integral part of a whole society.

Annelaure WITTMAN, Enda Tiers Monde, NGO

The preparatory document for this workshop mentioned that consumers were somewhat fed up with communication relating to sustainable development and with 'greenwashing'. Despite this, in the recommendations, you discuss how to encourage the development of education for responsible consumption in professional training solely with respect to approaches relating to communications and sales. Is this really an effective way of combating greenwashing? This really does raise the issue of knowledge, over and above what is sold and how it is sold, if the suggested approach - which may indeed have an impact in terms of communication - is to change the nature of what is sold. I think that at the end of the day there is also a need to encourage education for sustainable consumption at the level of disciplines relating to how consumer goods are designed. The NGO which I work is involved with the National Telecommunications Institute in France, which trains future telecoms engineers. We discuss sustainable development and the issue of electronic waste, including for southern nations. This leads to the question of waste management. I believe that this kind of awareness-raising is important and addresses the origins of consumption.

Gunilla BLUMQUIST, ministry for environment, Sweden

I’m also the chair of the Marrakech task force on sustainable lifestyles. Regarding your question, Fabienne, there should be a request to integrate education for sustainable consumption and the training from the public of organizations agencies in their procurement processes for services. The public of organizations could set good examples in requesting for these skills, when purchasing different services from different companies. But also, of course, enterprises could ask for these skills as well in order to meet consumer needs and also needs from society.

I’d like to inform about an African project on sustainable lifestyle that we have. It’s on integrating sustainable consumption in different university programs. The way to create interest for this it’s that at the same time to promote new business development, ideas. So I think this project can be very interesting to integrate sustainable consumption and at the same time, develop business opportunities.

Education and information are, of course, essential but it needs also to be complemented by other needs, for example, efficient infrastructure. It needs to be the software, education and information, but also the hardware, like infrastructure.

Fabienne PIERRE, UNEP/DTIE

To respond to Enda with respect to the question about marketing training. People who carry out market surveys have an extremely important role to play in the development of products and concepts and not solely in terms of communication. Incorporating these issues of sustainable consumption as part of their training is therefore really quite important. As to schools of advertising, it can also be highly interesting to incorporate teaching about existing
regulatory frameworks at national or European level, for instance the directive or recommendation of the French Advertising Standards Authority (BVP) regarding sustainable development. It is important that these existing schemes are incorporated in schools of advertising and marketing who, as you rightly point out, are those who communicate but also contribute to the development of consumer behaviours.

This leads me to come back to the question of media education and advertising education and the way in which this education, which teaches people how to read, understand and interpret messages, including advertising messages, forms an integral part of the issue of education for sustainable consumption. This again raises the question of the role of stakeholders, be they from the public sector, society at large or even the private sector, in taking into account the need to understand and know how to interact independently with the media which surround us.

Arab HOBALLAH, UNEP

I would like to respond briefly to a number of questions which have been raised during this session. There has of course been much discussion of education, but education, information and awareness-raising go hand in hand with consumers as well as producers.

Perhaps I could come back to the issue of electronic waste, which is of some interest.

In Africa, the UNEP is working closely with a number of countries on how to incorporate production and consumption modes within existing strategies. Some countries have decided to adopt national strategies for sustainable production and consumption, such as Mauritius and Madagascar, and we are working with them, whereas in Senegal, we have taken the programme devised by the World Bank on the reduction of poverty and we are trying to see how the sustainable consumption and production mode approach can be incorporated into this in parallel with the approach to poverty, a fundamental issue in this country. So we are looking at how to take up this sensitive issue and work on this question of sustainable consumption and production. As you can imagine, when you are affected by poverty the issue is not one of which car you will be buying but one of basic, fundamental consumption, along with your relationship to the outside world.

The example of electronic waste is fundamental today, and shows the extent to which it is difficult to deal with sustainable consumption and production. I have tried to launch a major project in Senegal with France Télécom and I have been looking at things in Asia, Singapore, India and China, which are all major electronics centres today. However, this is not solely a question of the environment but also one of health and a huge issue in terms of trade. It is also an issue of contraband and relationships between nations at the highest level. There is a gigantic market in contraband computers which arrive in Nigeria from Europe via the United Kingdom and which are then shipped elsewhere. When you go to India or Bangladesh and tell them "you know, these computers you are using are bad for your health", these health-based arguments do not have much impact in nations where the average life expectancy is 50; when you tell the government "set up some legislation and try to get all this under control", the response is that these practices provide jobs. An alternative must therefore be proposed, and this can be achieved only over a long transitional period. The problem - and this touches on a global problem regarding the treatment of electronic waste worldwide - is that the responsibility is not simply that of the Indians or the Bangladeshis, but also of the Americans, the French and their respective governments, who, too often, look the other way when it comes to dealing with the quantities of waste which are shipped to these countries. When we try to bring even a small degree of change we are not always very welcome. The main thing is to encourage as many people as possible to act responsibly to see how we can achieve our aims: this is difficult, but we need to persevere.

Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network

If we’re going to keep on this program, we still have 2 issues that we hope to discuss about and at the same time, we’re supposed to come up with a recommendation or more. The 2
questions we haven’t gone into any detail about yet is the one concerning multi-stakeholder cooperation, involving civil societies and different organizations, the different tools they have adopted. And the last issue deals with the impact of evaluation assessing what education for sustainable consumption can be done.

We should also try to agree on a recommendation which emphasizes the fact that we recommend education for sustainable consumption to be integrated in schools and informal education as an integral part of education for sustainable development.

Michela MAYER, ESC Network

We are initiating a network working on environmental education and ESD for many years. ESC, and we all agree, is an integral part of ESD and it’s very important to recognize how it was evident from the beginning that this problem is a problem of power relation. Power relations are evident in ESC and in many cases, we forget about it in environmental education or ESD.

About today assessment, my general recommendation is to be held on top of what ESD has already done. We know a lot about assessment and quality from other experiences. We know, for example, from OECD, Pisa assessment project has the main problems that we have now all over the world: the competences of reading, not only reading text but messages. How can we extend our competences in reading and understanding very ambiguous messages, as the one from publicity? So it’s really a kind of assessment we need in ESD that is in totally agreement with many of the general kind of assessment proposed.

We ask for critical thinking. The example you gave about electronic waste is a clear example of complex thinking. Our aim is to have people able to make decision. It’s so difficult to understand what the real problem is and what could be the solution.

I think we have to start to work together about quality criteria. We have associations, we have already proposed a set of quality criteria that can help schools and NGO to work and to assess their own work on ESD, and probably could be the same for ESC.

Fatimata DIA TOURÉ, Francophone Institute for Energy and the Environment - IEPF

I would like to say something about collaboration and cooperation in this field. In previous contributions and discussions, the importance of engaging in ESD through activities and action programmes in order not to be restricted to teaching which takes place in schools has been emphasised. A practical, pragmatic approach has been discussed, providing education with concrete elements enabling both children (in the formal and informal sectors) and others interested by this type of education, to gain a better understanding of what sustainable development is, as consumption, production, farming and so on is discussed. So for instance, the fact that a farmer at a Moroccan oasis should come to appreciate the availability of water which he has today using a pump which enables more water to be drawn, but should not forget to have a sustainable approach and avoid exhausting a rare resource which will be exhausted if his actions are not properly sustainable.

In the ESD approach, I suggest that there should be cooperation between the various categories of stakeholder, but also that there should be fundamental stakeholders at a national level. The Ministry for the Economy and Finance is generally responsible for all this strategic development programming in countries: too often, these ministries are not interested or concerned by such training, as confirmed by the fact that ESD is often approached via the environment ministry or the education ministry. However, commitment at a national level could certainly be achieved by awareness-raising or even training of economists from finance or economy ministries, those who put together various strategies.

In Senegal, we endeavoured to take action using the poverty reduction strategy document (DSRP). We endeavoured to incorporate sustainable consumption and production strategy in this. But what does this mean in practice if, at a level of a national budget, for example, or even in terms of taking into account resources or measures to be brought to the table to
support education for sustainable development or education for sustainable consumption and production, the institutional, legislative or political environments are not present? This raises an important issue and for once, we need both North and South to engage in a dynamic in which a new mode of consumption or even a new lifestyle is sought together: this must be done together without further delay.

Arab Hoballah says that in some developing countries, people object to being told not to use 4WD vehicles when they have adopted this practice following the example of northern countries. Today, in terms of construction or lifestyle, people are in the process of adopting an anarchical approach which is virtually obsolete compared to what we are looking for here today. We therefore need, within cooperation or collaboration, whatever one wishes to call it, the avenues and mechanisms by which states themselves can take on responsibility for addressing these types of issues. In the fight for survival or the fight against poverty, the poor today aspire to be like somebody with a SUV, or with a large house, who turns on the lights as they wish, and so on. So I believe that there is a lot of work to be done at a national level: at this level, environment ministries are certainly the most conscious of this type of issue because that is their field, but this is not true of other ministries which should also be taking up issues of sustainable development. I therefore propose that we should find an inroad at the level of these ministries of Planning and/or Economy and Finance with responsibility for economic and social development planning for a nation, who assess, analyse and define budgets. It would also be desirable to get these countries to incorporate the need for education for sustainable development within their budgets.

There is another aspect I would like to discuss. We have talked about social and societal responsibility for sustainable development, and the work done at the level of international unity as regards ISO 26000 should be noted. It should also be possible for the ISO 26000 standard to be taken into account in training for sustainable development, particularly in universities and institutes which carry out training for senior executives who will be having to examine these issues. I think it is important that the drafting of this standard, which will be operational in 2010, is monitored within the Francophone area, and that we discuss how countries should be incorporating these issues as 2010 so that in five or six years' time we do not find ourselves having to review or restart these discussions, given that we have the opportunity of having them now.

A participant from the floor

It is important to incorporate production, eco-production and sustainable consumption in ESD but the religious aspect has been completely overlooked. France is a secular nation and at present, this dimension is not taken into consideration at all, but if I take the example of Thailand, we carried out a programme in conjunction with Buddhist thinking, which proved to be a considerable help in bringing the environmental aspect to the fore. I therefore suggest that we reconsider the religious dimension. After all, do not all religions teach that you cannot eat to your heart's content when your brother has nothing to eat? 

A participant from the floor

With respect to what was said earlier, I believe that if we look at the title of this conference, we are indeed talking about "Acting together". Ministries of all kinds should be working together. Transversality is being called for, and this should take place at every level, including at the highest political levels. Before making any recommendations, such as adding an additional topic i.e. education for consumption to ESD programmes, time should be taken for all teaching teams to work together.

There is no point in imposing things from the top down if we do not take this time, because we know that things must be cross-disciplinary and transverse if teachers are to work together to establish what we are discussing today, and have been discussing for almost 30 years now. If the educational system remains partitioned, we will get nowhere. We need to break down these partitions and create project areas.
Antoine HEIDEVELD, learning for sustainable development program, Holland

In this program, 7 ministries try to integrate sustainable development in all kind of education programs from primary schools to universities. In Holland, we established, in order to instrument for sustainability in higher education, a very concrete assessment that can be used at all level of institution. It’s also available for primary education.

I think that before we can concrete things like you mentioned in your presentations, we should be see what is coming to the schools, because a lot of issues coming to the schools like ecological things, social things, schools don’t have time to have all those issues in the curricula. I think it’s not very wise to set sustainable consumption beside sustainable development because you’re going twice to school with almost the same issue. So before doing those kind of things, we should really discuss if there is a real difference or not, because otherwise, schools are overloaded with programs.

Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network

One the one hand, please don’t go from this room thinking that education for sustainable consumption is anyway in competition with education for sustainable development. It’s an integral part, yes, and it focuses on special issues that take the macro to the micro and that help people look at the principles, the systems and the processes. It helps people understand the risks and the consequences, the symbolic value of their choices. But it’s not, in anyway, something that should come as a double or as something that takes over from education for sustainable development.

All the things mentioned here are suggestions because they have to be adapted to the situation, whether be North or South cities. These suggestions will, hopefully, help the focusing on the specifically consumption issues.

Concerning multi-stakeholders and religions, I think that it’s exiting to hear that mentioned in Europe. We have approach the ethical values which lie the basis of education for sustainable consumption with words such as “sufficiency”, “moderation” and “balance”. If we really mean that ESC, no matter how we define it, no matter how we implement it, is important, we need to have recommendations to give to the conference for the final concluding proposal.

We tried to make a suggestion that it’s very short and to the point. It’s perhaps very general but we hope that you can feel that this is something that you can agree upon. It was discussed much about what kind of environment the education should take place in: the formal, the informal and non-formal. The suggestion is: encourage the development of education for sustainable consumption in formal, non-formal and informal education, as an integral part of ESD. It would be encouraged as a part of ESD by including ESC themes in existing curricular and programs, by stimulating it in teacher training, by fostering ESC in business education, by sharing tools and good practices for ESC assessment; and by strengthening local multi-stakeholder cooperation in connection with ESC. These are general recommendations but they try to encompass what was mentioned here of different suggestions showing that there are different approaches and ways of dealing with this.

Arab HOBALLAH, UNEP

To open up the discussion, it’s important to induce stakeholders to consider ESD also thinking about the mean for that, so not to just what to do but how to do it, in order to be practical. It’s essential, but difficult, to put on the table the interest of having some quality assessment indicators. It might be a good contribution for the education system to look at the quality. Of course, into the quality, you can have the ethical and religious component included, but we leave it to the professionals to do it.

A participant from the floor

We could add leadership by example and encourage responsible public-sector ordering, particularly in teaching establishments. Furthermore, would it not be interesting to see what
impact this education for responsible production and consumption could have on health, budgets and lifestyles? In a cross-disciplinary, across-the-board approach, this would involve relating consumption to the approaches and topics, for instance, as regards healthcare, obesity and the practice of sport.

**A participant from the floor**

Something should also be said about matching demand with respect to supply, provided that this is properly done. This could be achieved by a debate, which is highly important because there is no democracy without debate. I believe that democratic consumption requires a debate.

Supply follows and precedes demand, and consumers are not aware that they are manipulated by those who are behind this supply. If supply were to be faced with aware demand, this would virtually constitute a revolution.

With this in mind, particularly with respect to teacher training, work should be done on meta-communication, debate, awareness and project pedagogy. All these teaching approaches place students or learners at the heart of the training. They become stakeholders, who are conscious of what they are learning and choose how they learn. People talk about learning to learn, but we also need to learn how to consume, choose what we buy and read the labels. Labelling ethics is something which is already done, but this should start in the classroom.

In addition, there is also a lot to be done with respect to the itinerary of a product.

The idea of establishing a major link between consumption and education for sustainable development is a fundamental one. This must be stated and restated, because trade is the basis of life and society. What is the basis of the European Union? It is the exchange of goods, services, individuals and capital: what is missing is individuals’ awareness in all this.

**Robert LITZLER, Aqpere, Québec**

The word coherence has often been used in our discussions. As we all know - and as is the case for us in Quebec and most probably in France and in other countries worldwide, universities are under-funded. Universities complain that they do not have the funding they require, even though it is the State that should be supplying the resources needed by universities and colleges.

What have school directors and universities done to compensate for this lack of funding? They have gone to companies, respond to offers from large multinationals and agree to receive fees from these companies in return for allowing them to install soft drinks dispensers which, as we all know, are fundamentally damaging to health.

If we teach our pupils and students responsible consumption, we should be getting rid of these vending machines. We need to ask our universities to assume their responsibilities and fund university requirements adequately. Failing this, there will be no coherence and it will no longer be possible to teach sustainable development to our students.

**A participant from the floor**

In terms of strengthening multi-partner or multi-stakeholder cooperation at the national level, we should add the following: "particularly by enlisting the support of one of the prime contractors, the Finance and/or Budget ministries". This is indeed a key bottleneck. If this is not stated clearly, the Ministry of Finance, which is the principal contractor, the organisation which defines state budgets, is likely to withdraw. This makes arbitrage difficult subsequently.

**Antoine HEIDEVERLD, learning for sustainable development program, Holland**

It’s a very complicated discussion because of the words you use. I’ve been working for more than 12 years in education for sustainable development in the Netherlands and I’m worried about 2 things in inducing education for sustainable consumption. One is to we induce some other things beside sustainable develop by reducing by almost the same things. If you look at
all the things said, it’s almost the same in documents on sustainable development. I don’t really see the difference because if you educate on sustainable development, you educate on specific themes like sustainable consumption. I’m worried about setting a new thing beside when education is already full with all kind of things that should be addressed.

The second thing is that most of teachers, members of boards, members of department of education, don’t want to do something with education for sustainable development because they think we’ll influence the consumption patterns of students, when it’s not the task of education. That’s really a big issue for a lot of employees in department of education, as education is not meant to change consumption patterns; education is meant to make students very critical. You think the words “sustainable consumption” might address these people with your own work and that’s why I’m worried about using it in this way. I think we don’t disagree on the content of what should be done in the classroom, but it’s the way we get it in the classroom we disagree on.

Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network

I’d like to emphasize one thing, as it has been mentioned by several people, I only gave you the major titles for the themes, the specifics were not mentioned because we didn’t have time. In the “Here and now” document, it gives more specifics. Research has been done indicating that many of these topics are not dealt with in educational institution today, topics such as media literacy, help and safety in connection with products. You’re right, this doesn’t have to do with telling people how to change their consumption habits but it’s emphasizing the consequences of their habits and helping them become critical and able to find alternative lifestyle and choices.

The question of whether or not it should be called education for sustainable consumption is a valid one but perhaps not terribly relevant here right now because on levels far beyond us, it’s already more or less decided. We can, in our work, refer to it in other ways. Some of us refer to it as consumer citizenship, others as responsible lifestyle education. There are many ways of calling things as long as the contents cover the areas we want. But I think we have to look at the broad picture in terms of what it covers.

A participant from the floor

Au niveau du renforcement de la coopération multipartenaires ou multi parties prenantes à l’échelle nationale, il faudrait ajouter : « notamment en nous appuyant sur l’un des grands donneurs d’ordre qui s’appelle le ministère des Finances ou du Budget ». En effet, c’est un peu le goulot d’étranglement. Si nous ne le disons pas clairement, le ministère des Finances qui est le principal donneur d’ordres, le principal budgétaire du budget de l’État, risque de se retirer. Par la suite, les arbitrages deviennent alors très difficiles.

A participant from the floor

Within my work as a resource waste manager, my clients, coming from business companies or industrial companies, are more interested in the term of sustainable consumption and production than in sustainable development. They are more used to the terminology of consumption and production so it’s, from my point of view, much easier to come along and to get into a process when using their language.

Pamela PUNTEMENNY, Co-chair, Caucus for education, UN SD Commission

Given the comment that you made that it’s already set in stone, the decisions are already made, I’m trying to work with this in such a way that will lead to success and not failure. You can’t put it in the existing curriculum and programs. Secondly, teachers are oriented in their training to pedagogy, not specific subjects unless they majored in it, like a professor of economics. The all movement around education for sustainable development is critical in thinking in terms of systems and multi-stakeholder dialogue that is not coming through. So if you want this to be a part of the process, you’d be much more successful in this if you look at some of the concrete examples out there. If you’re looking at a school, primary school,
medical school, any kind of school, how can they green? Look at it as a community level. A school is a community so back off from the teachers because they are very well trained in pedagogy. You’re not addressing pedagogy and they’re getting paid to do pedagogy and the parents, who put pressure on the schools, want their children coming out educated, not good consumers. And about the teenagers, you won’t get them to change their mind about consuming but if you create a community, an environment and the schools become very aware on how they are running their school, whether it’s energy, consumption, the kids will become also very aware because they’re living in that environment and they’re becoming a part of that environment, contributing to it. There’s a shift of the wind here that I think that if you shift that slightly, you can have a positive impact.

Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network

I think these comments are a come back to what several of us presented in our presentation, which was actually the first recommendation of the “Here and now” document: “to ensure that educational institutions reflect, in their daily management, the priorities given to sustainable development”. Since so many people have mentioned that, I think we can easily include that as a part of the beginning of our recommendation.

We are here to also discuss ESC in terms of schools and education. Having work internationally with curriculum development and as a teacher trainer also, you have teachers who have been trained in pedagogy in some places, other parts of the world, teachers have been trained in disciplines, they are restricted, in many cases, by core curriculums that are made nationally or regionally or locally, and they have to relate to that. The suggestion here is to encourage that ESC be included in some form, not necessarily a specific subject, either as a theme, a crosscutting theme or a general principle. I wonder if we necessarily agree on the fact that point 1 is undermining the basic principle that we’re trying to get across.

Arab HOBALLAH

I think it might be very useful to include something there that says about promoting participative approach at school, community level. Bringing the people concern within a community is the best way to approach the consumption.

A participant from the floor

A comment on the how. In 1988, we were trying to introduce an environmental dimension to business schools, medical schools, engineering schools and all of them said “no, we don’t have time to teach a new module”. So we change to, as you said today, introduce the dimension and that works. Talking about the how, asking the introduction of new modules in schools may not work because there’s already knocking at the door to enter. Now, introduce the dimension of, in that case, sustainable consumption may work.

Often, the lecturers in medical schools, business schools are not aware of these issues. So the training of the trainers is quite vital. I strongly support the fostering the ESC dimension in schools rather than introducing new themes.

Paolo SOPRANO, chair of the task force “Sustainable consumption”, Marrakech process

On this point, I’d like to add also that there is a direct relationship, trade off, between the schools (high schools, business schools, medical schools, etc.) and the employment on the labour market. From this point of view, it’s important to improve, from the business institutions, enterprises and in general from the employment market, the sense of urgency in assuming their own social and environmental responsibilities. This means to raise professional needs to be met through training, business school, engineering, etc. It’s not a matter of adding one or more modules to the course, it’s a matter of including a new perspective with new technologies, with environmental friendly technologies that are already available but that are not considerate. The challenge is to modify the employment market,
the request from the employment and this means to incorporate social and environmental responsibility.

Monique TRUDEL, International consultant in education and communication for the environment

As to cooperation with respect to education for sustainable consumption, we have emphasised the importance of incorporating Finance and/or Budget ministries, but stakeholders from society at large also have a very important role to play: NGOs, for instance very often provide support for teachers in order for them to move from theory into practice.

A participant from the floor

To complete these partnerships, access to objective rather than subjective resources should be provided for. One worktool used in the training I am responsible for is eco-assessments. These sometimes give a good overall perspective, and associations do amazing work in this respect. We have examples relating to the cotton route and various consumer products. Besides food, this includes textiles and other items.

Olivier SIGAULT, Teacher, environmental management, Institute of Political Studies, France

I do not believe in the slightest that consumption can be sustainable or responsible, rather that this is a contradiction in terms. The comments which have been made add to this controversy. When diagnostic reports are carried out, people come with their certainties and a single business model which is that of growth, which lies behind every form of development. In my opinion, it is important to include critical analysis and awareness of lobbying tactics in teacher training.

When I was a teacher for the Ministry of Agriculture, I once found a brochure from Monsanto in my pigeonhole. When I made enquiries, I discovered that Monsanto was paying for some of the experiments being carried out in the establishment and that the authorities were not aware of these experiments.

Being a teacher does not make one for or against GM crops, but we find ourselves in a system which is under pressure. Although this may be appropriate for some particular courses, companies are generally not designed for the public good. Unless proved otherwise, this is not the case and we should abandon our illusions in this respect. Sustainable development has become a way for today’s companies to do business in other forms and by other means. We need to be aware of this.

In terms of training, we should not embarrass teachers with explanations about models of consumption or models to be passed on: they are equipped in this respect. However, we need to develop critical analysis, a sort of attentiveness and alertness with respect to the various pressures which may be brought to bear. In terms of environmental education, this has been difficult for a number of reasons, but education for sustainable development is highly problematic because it makes room for any and every corporate strategy attempting to gain territory in any kind of environment, particularly by means of the Trojan horse of associations. Some associations serve the cause of corporations because they lack funding.

We need to be highly vigilant on these sorts of issues. All teachers and others working on these kinds of subjects are aware that this shift to education for sustainable development raises huge problems. Lucie SAUVÉ has long worked on these questions and has sounded the alarm. Although I do not agree entirely with her wholesale rejection, it is true that this kind of paradigm is currently being established and requires deconstruction.

Michel MOMBRUN, Francophone networks

First of all, I would like to restate the extent to which I am in favour of the idea according to which education contributes to autonomy, freedom, freedom of judgement and individual responsibility, and that education is not a content which is delivered to format people’s
thinking in order for them to adopt the gestures which others have deemed appropriate. This means that it is important to clarify our conception of education.

One person reminded us of the need to frame the proposals made with references to ethics; to meaning and values. In terms of ethics, are we still in the philosophy of having and of having more and more in competition with others? Or are we thinking more in terms of a life-based approach and a philosophy of being and well-being of ourselves and others in solidarity? I find that all the literature on which the values of sustainable development rest relates to the latter scenario. This may go without saying, but I believe it is better to have it in writing.

I therefore propose that explicit reference is made to a number of terms and values, prior to the proposals being made here. I think it is essential for all this to be framed by such a structure of meaning and values, which make it possible for individuals to commit to such approaches.

Arab Hoballah, UNEP

I myself am an economist and unfortunately I have had first-hand experience of how a country can be destroyed, which is what has led me into sustainable development. This is a process, not an end in itself, and this tends to be forgotten. In order to achieve this, people need to be brought on board. This is why I have been led to analyse modes of consumption and production.

In fact to be completely honest with you I am now looking at a further stage: the efficient use of resources. This concerns consumers, business and politicians: this is the new strategy which we are developing. If the use of resources is examined from an economic point of view, this enables an even better approach to sustainable consumption and production modes.

What we are seeking in these questions of education is not a university lecture or school class about production and consumption modes, which will be nothing more than yet another generic message. What we would like to see is, for instance, a school of chemistry which incorporates a way of manufacturing a product with greater respect for health and taking into account environmental impacts. As to engineers and schools of architecture, ways of integrating parameters for designing buildings which use less energy and make better use of water should be examined. This is not how teaching is currently done in most universities, but these things are beginning to be introduced. In business schools, there is traditional business, but also business which incorporates the idea of better use of resources.

If it can be proved to companies that they can have the same product using less resources: while that may seem obvious, many have not thought of this. They therefore need to be encouraged to do this, and the educational system and partnership initiatives can help in this.

We need to be able to demonstrate that environment also has a business aspect and that saving resources engenders progress, better living conditions and innovation in new fields. Not even governments are aware enough of this, so we need to work as hard as we can to convince them.

Pamela Putenney, Co-chair, Caucus for education, UN SD Commission

I think we have a semantic problem and it think that by changing the words, you’re going to solve it.

I did my doctor work on environmental education and I’ve looked at it from a systems perspective, from the budget, central administration, the support system, I’ve looked at the curriculum, the support staff, I’ve looked at the children. If you turn the camera lens and if you’re thinking away from teaching, away from educating to learning, you’ll be there, instead of dividing things for people. People who come with the training and the education are not creating a learning system or a learning organization. One of the key components of us
getting out of this mess and getting a handle on it is in understanding that what works yesterday, doesn't work today. How do you shift the schools? How do you create a curriculum when you don't have the knowledge? This is an incredible important topic but it's part on inner relationships, inner connections, multi-stakeholder dialogue. Who should be involved in this equation? The Caucus works with the UN Commission on sustainable development, on learning systems, because if you want to see the process stop, you just start talking about sectors and this, etc. And we don’t understand where we are, what is working, what is not, where do we go from here, we don’t talk to each other in informal dialogues, and we’re stuck.

In Sweden, they came up with a new model using sustainability as a natural boundary and starting from upstream; that’s one of the 10 paradigms that the ISO uses. How do we begin to get access to that information? My suggestion, for you all to considerate, is to add another point: the responsibility is on your shoulder to help the rest of us get those focal points; a learning exchange, it’s more than just good practices. The people need it, the government, the ambassadors, the classrooms need it.

Victoria THORESEN, The consumer citizenship network

To take the research point, one thing we haven’t mentioned is that as a part of the “Here and now” document, there is a resource file, a database bank of a number of things collected around the world that will come online very soon. But as you said, it’s something that needs to constantly be developed and improved and categorised and made available. So we'll try to include that in the suggestions.

I don’t think we can translate all of this into a learning mode because as a point of departure, we’ve been using the word education for sustainable consumption. I agree with you that the semantic here is very important.

Fabienne PIERRE

The first modification related to the suggestions is, at least, to make a reference to an ethical framework for ESC. In document that we prepared there is a part specific to the ethical framework for ESC and we can take one sentence from it: “we suggest to base ESC on the values upon which ESD is founded, which means training responsible citizens and consumers, as individuals need to be aware of them fundamental rights and freedoms, appropriately informed to participate actively in the public debate oriented towards a conscious participation in the markets”.

We added also the reference to educational institution integrating the principles and practices of sustainable consumption: “ensure that educational institution reflect, in their daily management, the priorities given to sustainable development”.

Then, in the same part including ESC themes in existing curricula programs, we can mention also the fact that it’s meant to educate on an informed and democratic demand.

Then, we added the fact that we should foster some dimensions of ESC, that we should provide the means to act, infrastructures, frameworks, at a level of educational institution and actors, to allow them to put students at the centre of learning processes.

We could include the comments on ESP terminology when it comes to business into ESC and business education part, saying that “ESC should be developed in business education and notably using the ESP terminology, so that it’s understood by its actors”.

Regarding assessment and evaluation, “we should share tools and good practices for ESC assessment and develop quality assessment indicators that can include ethical indicators or ethical principles”.

Concerning strengthening local multi-stakeholder cooperation in ESC, we can highlight the cooperation between NGOs and educators; allowing the access of resources and the development of networks for learning exchange.
Finally, we could mention the fact that financial support should be provided to ESC practices and research involving more specifically the participation of economics and finance ministries.

**Arab HOBALLAH, UNEP**

Thank you for your contributions. While there are some disagreements, this is exactly the problem with sustainable consumption and production. We need to be able to make progress together.
Special session 1

Raising awareness of the general public by means of television and internet resources

Summary

- Introduction (Jamy GOURMAUD, journalist at France Télévision, presenter of the programme "C'est pas sorcier")
- Presentation of Clim City (Eric GORMAN, CAP'SCIENCES Bordeaux)
- Conclusion (Jamy GOURMAUD)

Moderator: Michel RICARD (Chairman of the French Committee for the Decade)

Introduction
by Jamy GOURMAUD
Journalist at France Télévision

For once I have not brought my truck with me, but I have come here by train! I have not seen all of Bordeaux, and I have not been here for a very long time, but I have been delighted by what I have seen. The city has changed a lot and appears to have done a lot to take the environment into consideration.

The TV programme "C'est pas sorcier" [a children's science programme] is beginning to age somewhat, but only superficially: fundamentally we are still fresh and the whole team which puts together this programme still has the same approach and dynamic. We have been producing "C'est pas sorcier" for 15 years now; I have not counted how many episodes we have done exactly but I know that we have dealt with more than 450 different topics. They cover a wide range of issues, everything from fire and firefighters to digestion and materials. We recently did a programme about materials and we are currently preparing one featuring disability, tall ships and international justice. So there is a very broad range and the same dynamic is at work in the team which puts together "C'est pas sorcier".

The aim of this team is to make knowledge available. I think we do consider the content first and foremost, but we do also think about how this is packaged. Nothing can be said against the content, because we really do work very hard on our material. We get to the bottom of things, sometimes going much further than what comes out when the programme is broadcast, and it is important to make this effort, going into much more detail in order to engage in vulgarisation subsequently: in other words, disseminating scientific culture to as broad an audience as possible.

I believe the issue of "vulgarisation" is important, as is the other term I just used: scientific culture. This is also one of the aims of this programme. The point is not to make a 26-minute programme with a few questions for viewers at the end. During the course of each programme, we take viewers on a little scientific adventure and our aim is that by the end of the programme, this audience has enjoyed themselves, enriched their knowledge and, more
generally, their culture. I could say their scientific culture, but I always find this something of a bothersome phrase because I believe that science actually forms part of culture. Another aim of our team is to communicate cultural data relating to scientific topics.

So there is the content and also the packaging. What has been the secret of producing a programme which has been on air for over 15 years and which viewers still enjoy just as much? One of the key factors has of course been the dynamism and motivation of the team which puts the programme together. In addition, we have set ourselves very strict rules in which not only the content is important but also the packaging, which must be very carefully done. When we put together a programme and endeavour to clarify a complex topic (materials, digestions, sleep, the nervous system, disability, etc), we could simply make do with what we have found out from a scientist who has explained how things work, albeit in a way which is sometimes rather complicated and using language which is not always very accessible for the general public. Our work consists in taking these aspects which are perhaps not initially very accessible and deciphering them so that the average viewer who is keen to learn more finds the way that we tell him about these things and impart knowledge appealing. This is a question both of the specific structure which we give to a programme and of the words we use. Whenever we say something, we work hard on the script to make sure that it is accessible. I always have a little voice inside me saying "is what I am writing and what I'm going to say accessible for my audience?". If I have the slightest doubt, I start again, using a different word or a comparison, one which I choose carefully, so that people can follow what I am trying to get across through to its conclusion. This does not happen automatically and takes quite a lot of work.

This applies both to the script and to the visual aspect. When you see Fred and Sabine in an outside scene running around all over the place, it looks very attractive, but if you look more carefully, you will see that there is never anything superfluous. We don't just move the camera around for fun or to add a bit of movement. The image is also meaningful and every time something changes, every time there is something other than a standard still shot or the creation of some kind of effect, there is always some specific meaning attached and we work very hard on this. This also applies when we choose to build a model to explain a phenomenon. For instance, if I want to explain photosynthesis in vanilla, I do not use an actual leaf. I ask our model maker to make a model vanilla leaf so that there is continuity and to make sure we do not lose our audience halfway through. In order to succeed in getting people to understand complex things, we have to make sure we do not lose the audience on the way; we have to take its hand and never let go. If, when we discuss photosynthesis, we mention vanilla, we need to use a vanilla leaf and not some other leaf: if it is different, or shaped differently or has a different colour, the audience will be distracted and lose the thread of the explanation which we were in the process of giving them. Constant attention needs to be paid to this kind of little detail to make sure we do not lose our audience but bring them with us. We very much enjoy watching our programmes from start to finish and seeing that on the basis of a complex topic, we have managed to put together a plausible narrative, which can be followed even by a non-specialist; we know that people will be able to follow this narrative from A-Z without losing the plot.

I could talk to you about "C'est pas sorcier" for hours. But actually, I am very much hoping that you have lots of questions.

I could have brought you some clips from "C'est pas sorcier" but Eric Gorman will be presenting you with Clim City shortly, and this resource has been devised in a similar manner. I often make use of it because it is a highly interesting and easily accessible database. When people ask me what my job is, I always say I am a ferryman, shuttling between those who have knowledge and those who do not. My work as a ferryman involves finding information at its source and divulging it in a format such that those who are capable of receiving this information, who may perhaps not seek it out but who will be in front of their television screen at some point, will receive this information and assimilated in a very simple manner.
Clim City is a resource based on the same principles. It enables anybody to search for data very easily, to find it and in fact once you've started it's hard to stop! When I browse this site, I always feel I need to look a little further here and there and in the end I need to be dragged away from it.

Thierry HERDEWYN, Hauts-de-Seine Département Council

You have mentioned this top-down flow of information: you obtain it from scientists and process it to assist your audience, taking your audience by the hand. I am the head of a department responsible for raising awareness with respect to the environment and sustainable development. I go to see engineers and specialists, seek out information and attempt to package it for the general public, but often when a technical expert gives me the information, they tell me it is not perfect and worry about it being distorted. I find it very difficult to engage in dialogue with such specialists. How do you manage to get people to agree to the way that you put information across?

Jamy GOURMAUD, Journalist at France Télévision

The first thing is to know who you are trying to reach. When you say that you are aiming for the general public, do you mean really really general or do you in fact have some specific targets? I think that one of the very first things is to know who you are trying to reach.

For my part, I know that I am addressing non-specialists or indeed people who are uninformed: a really general public. This means that I will refrain from using a certain number of terms. I know I will not be using them and that I will need to use paraphrases to get my point across. When I put a programme together, the script will become more complex as the process develops. For instance, every time I mention an ion today, I always start by reminding people what an ion is. I say it once and then, during the course of the programme, once I have given the definition once, I don't repeat the word. I give my keys at the start and then little by little, I use them less and less.

As to your question, I have to say that so far, I have never found the scientists I work with to be reluctant in any way. However, we also work with journalists, one of whom is also a doctor. If he puts together a programme for us about a four-stroke engine, there's no problem. In fact, we have made sure that he does anything but medical programmes because as soon as he started doing anything medical it was hopeless. We realised that this doctor-journalist was afraid of being judged by his peers if he talked about medicine. He would say to himself: "I can't call it that, that's not its proper scientific name". So we needed to do a lot of work with him, particularly with regard to our aim of enabling people to understand how things work.

In this simplification process, we cannot allow ourselves to simplify to the point that we say something which is inaccurate with respect to the process we are describing. However, with regard to terminology, we sometimes have to go against our inclinations and bear in mind that if a particular term is used, it will not be understandable. An alternative must be found, and the technicians, engineers and specialists you're working with should have no difficulty in understanding this. Sometimes adding the correct name in brackets is all that is needed. Very often, even when I am writing the script, I will say that something is called such and such, and then explain practically what is happening using words which everybody can understand.

When I explain what is happening in a nuclear power station, or what nuclear fission is, I probably don't use precisely accurate terms. But at the end of the day, the aim is to explain to people that the nucleus of an atom splits and that this gives off energy. That's my aim. Is what I show and explain accurate? This has to be verified. If the scientist agrees, we then have to work together to find a formulation which will be accurate but perhaps more simplified, because I'm not talking to another team of researchers or writing a research paper or scientific article.
If the principle aim is to enable people to understand a process, scientists, engineers and technicians of all stripes will be capable of doing this genuine work of vulgarisation in which the meaning is not watered down but conveyed using paraphrases which enable people to understand very complex subjects.

I have told you something about how my work: when I write an article or a programme, I systematically send my text to scientists. This make sure we do not make any mistakes: very often, they say to me things like "What you have put there is not quite right, you should put it this way". We then have a discussion about this. If I have said something grossly inaccurate, I start asking questions again until I have understood. We then try to agree on a way of putting this which, although it will of course not be the way a scientist would have put it in discussion with one of his colleagues, will enable the general public to have an overall understanding without the meaning having been distorted. This involves a lot of work and takes time.

Florent BAARSCH, Chairman, French Student Network for Sustainable Development

Unfortunately, I do not watch enough television to have the answer to my question. Is there a "C'est pas sorcier" on sustainable development? I have the impression that the medium of television could be an excellent avenue for such issues given the right format. The pedagogical work you do with "C'est pas sorcier" with respect to scientific questions could also be applied to issues of sustainable development which sometimes really are in need of vulgarisation.

Jamy GOURMAUD, Journalist at France Télévision

The media have been endeavouring to address the issue of sustainable development for a very long time. We have considered doing a "C'est pas sorcier" programme on sustainable development on a number of occasions. However, we have decided not to devote a specific programme to sustainable development because in fact, sustainable development comes up all over the place as we work on various topics.

If you look carefully at "C'est pas sorcier" programmes, you will realise that sustainable development features in almost every episode. Today, there is not a single episode which does not deal with sustainable development in one form or another at some point. We do not tackle it head on but via various topics, explanations, or a sequence with Fred or Sabine. This is the way we have chosen to talk about sustainable development, because this is the best way for us to be able to discuss it regularly. In any case, the topic of sustainable development is so vast that I have no idea how we would be able to fit everything in to a 26-minute programme should we ever decide to do so. My perspective is that we deal with this topic on a regular basis.

However, I can tell you that a lot of people are examining what sort of format of programme could be used to address sustainable development. Finding topics for programmes is not difficult; we could do 10-minute slots on sustainable development every day, but television programmes involve not only content but packaging. When we put together an episode of "C'est pas sorcier", there is the content and the packaging. Whatever anyone says, television is basically for entertainment. If somebody decided to do a daily 10-minute programme on sustainable development, this would only be effective if they had found a format and a narrative such that viewers have the desire to watch this programme. Nobody has yet come up with the right solution, but I can assure you that they are looking.

Isabelle FORGE, Foreign and European Affairs Ministry

Through "C'est pas sorcier", you have enabled me to learn a whole load of things, some of which I have learned via my children. In fact, even if you present your programme as being for the general public, it is unfortunately targeted quite specifically at children. As evidence of this I would point to the fact that the videos of the show are on sale in the children's section of stores. I think there is also a need for more substantial communication, because adults have plenty of things to learn from these programmes too.
What could you do to make the programme really accessible to the general public as a whole, perhaps with programmes at different times advertised as being for the benefit of older viewers as well as children?

As to education for sustainable development, you have indeed identified the complex nature of sustainable development and it is clear that you have incorporated this. We who are working in this approach and with this mindset on a daily basis are aware that it is a cross-disciplinary philosophy, but we are continually faced with people who still think that sustainable development relates solely to the environment. You have clearly incorporated it yourself, but the victory will be won only when we have found a way to raise the awareness of the general public to the fact that sustainable development is part of daily life and not solely related to the theme of the environment. I am delighted that you have clearly grasped this, but this needs communicating and we need help to find how to raise awareness in this respect.

Jamy GOURMAUD, Journalist at France Télévision

When we started "C'est pas sorcier", in TV jargon our target audience was teenagers and pre-teens. So initially, the programme was destined for children aged 10-15. In the months immediately following the first episode, when the channel carried out audience research, it very soon transpired that the programme was watched by children, adults and seniors, with a slight dip among 18-25-year-olds. At that time, the programme was broadcast on Sunday mornings, and those people who tended to go to bed late on Saturday evenings were not likely to be watching television on Sunday morning. From the age of 25 upwards, people had settled down in their lives and started to watch again.

The time came when the channel considered changing the slot for this programme. In 1998, there were two attempts to broadcast "C'est pas sorcier" at 8.50pm, but this was not a success, although the programme was a hit in the mornings and afternoons. There were two reasons for this lack of success.

Firstly, there was an issue of packaging: the register of what was said varies depending on what time a programme goes out. For instance, I have on occasion taken part in the health magazine programme presented by Michel Cymes during which I do features or explain phenomena which relate much more to health - although in fact the other day we were discussing the environment and sustainable development, because we were talking about nutrition. This programme goes out at 8.50pm and is aimed at an adult audience. In terms of levels of information, I actually say much less in this programme when I do a demonstration relating to nutrition than when I do a demonstration in "C'est pas sorcier" which is aimed at children. What I'm trying to say is that the content will be different depending on what time a programme goes out.

Secondly, I think that the French viewing audience is rather hung up. People in France often say to us "you have a great programme, my children watch it", and it takes a while in the conversation for people to admit that the programme is good for adults too and that they learn things from it. This is typical French feedback. The programme also goes out in Belgium. When I meet a Belgian, they always say to me "you have a great programme, we watch it with the kids and even when the kids are not there". So in France the viewers themselves tend to see this program as a kids' programme. In Belgium, this programme is seen as being aimed at a very broad audience. So you have two very different approaches.

To add to this answer, we have used this parameter, simply because we know that the general public in France is convinced that this programme is basically aimed at children, but also that adults watch it just as much as children do. If we had decided to put "C'est pas sorcier" out at 8.50pm, I don't think my antics would have amused the general public. I use this as a pretext, I use humour because I know that people assume that the programme is aimed at children, and that way I can get things across. If I were to address adults in the way in which I am supposedly addressing children, I am not sure I would get away with it.
That said, we are currently working on a 110-minute “C’est pas sorcier” programme. The decision has been taken: in September 2009 there will be a much more substantial “C’est pas sorcier” derived from the classic “C’est pas sorcier”. All the same ingredients will be there; we will be moving about a lot, and the first topic we have chosen will be of interest to you because it relates to biodiversity.

There is no easy answer to your question, this is a complex issue which relates to the reasons we are here, but we’re also looking at our broadcast time and so-called target audience in order to put together a programme with the awareness that there is another audience also watching the programme just as much: an adult audience. More generally, we are always addressing a so-called uninformed audience. When I put together a script or storyboard, I always tell myself that I am addressing an uninformed audience, whether they are aged 10 or 90.

Albert de PETIGNY, Éditions Pour Penser

I have a question regarding the production of the programme itself. Do you pay attention to the environmental footprint of your programme? Does it consume more or less energy than 15 years ago?

Jamy GOURMAUD, Journalist at France Télévision

I really don’t think the answer is more. Do we pay attention to this? Does our programme have a greater impact than 15 years ago? Does it have an impact on the environment?

We do not use our truck every Sunday, but we will talk about that privately in a minute because there are children present! In fact, almost all our travel is by train, and we only take the plane out of necessity if we have to travel to places on the other side of oceans. Otherwise, to be perfectly honest, I have not carried out an assessment but I do not think we have a major impact. I suppose you could tell me that I should have done what Yann Arthus-Bertrand has started doing, but I think that we will be thinking about doing this more for the 110-minute programme.

Mustapha DEROUICH, Higher Institute of Study of Sustainable Development, Morocco

I would like to congratulate you on your “C’est pas sorcier” programme, which I like very much: it is a pedagogical, educational programme and I invite teachers to do similar things to explain science. I often watch it, find it very interesting and learn many things.

However, I have two technical questions. Firstly, we see three people in the programme, Jamy, Fred and Sabine, but there is also a whole supporting team. How many people are involved in putting together each programme? Secondly, how long does it take to put together a 26-minute programme before it is put out?

Jamy GOURMAUD, Journalist at France Télévision

“C’est pas sorcier” has a small team. It’s easier to talk in terms of the team for a single programme rather than in terms of the team as a whole. For a typical programme, we will have one journalist, Fred and I work with this journalist to put together the storyboard, an editor-in-chief, a model maker, always the same one, and a manager - also the same person for some 10 years now. In editorial terms, in terms of content, these six people will be the ones working on a programme. There will then be a producer who takes on this programme. For filming, there will of course be all the technical teams, but when Fred does an outdoor sequence, the team is fairly small, consisting of six or even five people. For my sets, we record three programs at once, once a month, with some 20 people working on this for three days. In addition, there is a small production team which consists of three or four people. So at the end of the day, to produce one programme, some 10 people will have been working on it full-time. In addition, there are part-time workers for the shooting and editing phases. In addition, when a programme is being put together, from the time when we pick a topic, if the journalist starts working on it straight away, it takes between six to eight weeks from when we start working on the programme to the time when it is ready to be broadcast.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
Presentation of Clim City
by Eric GORMAN
CAP'SCIENCES Bordeaux

Clim City is an adventure which began two years ago. It is a big project and quite ambitious, and I have had the privilege of overseeing it. We are drawing towards the end of the process, because we are currently completing the test phase of the game which should be online shortly.

Cap Sciences is a Centre for Scientific, Technological and Industrial Culture (CCSTI). The largest CCSTI in France is la Villette in Paris. CCSTIs were set up at the end of the 1970s in an attempt to re-establish the link between the general public and the scientific community, with the researchers, scientific and technological discoveries which marked the 20th century - a century which was outstanding in terms of the development of research and scientific progress. The mission of CCSTIs has been to interface between the general public and these researchers, industrial players and these discoveries.

A second mission relates to mobilisation. CCSTIs are regional structures: CAP'SCIENCES is the Aquitaine CCSTI. This mobilisation is directed at various local stakeholders: universities, industrial players and the general public, in an attempt to create a kind of symbiosis and a genuine scientific culture. Scientific culture exists. When we use the word culture, we tend to think about art, literature, cinema and so on. However, there is a genuine scientific culture which needs to be appropriated by the general public. In France and in the West and industrialised nations as a whole, we have the privilege of having this type of structure which enables us to have access to all these scientific innovations.

Another mission is the design of exhibitions and events. Exhibitions may be presented within our structure or they may be exhibitions travelling to elsewhere in France or abroad. We also work in schools, non-profit associations and other activity centres.

The Clim City project was born following a request from the project's principal partner, Gaz de France. This request in turn followed a Climax exhibition which took place at la Villette and which was found to have been too inaccessible for younger people and with respect to which many scientists were quite disappointed with the approach taken to the issue of climate change. We wanted to set up quite an innovative exhibition targeted more at 12-18-year-olds.

At Cap Sciences, we had already set up an exhibition on climate change called "Climate under the influence" which was highly successful both within the Bordeaux metropolitan district and nationwide. We also have some experience with virtual exhibitions, since we had already done two prior to Clim City.

This is the new way of disseminating information and informing the general public via the Internet. The exhibition is now virtual which means it is accessible not in any given museum but on the web. This means that it is accessible worldwide and moreover that there are no transport costs or CO2 emissions involved in visiting it.

In terms of mobilising our partners, Clim City is a project on a national scale and we are privileged to have Gaz de France as our principal partner, now known as GDF Suez. We have also benefited from the support of the Aquitaine Region, the ADEME and the Aquitaine Poitou-Charentes Caisse d'Epargne bank. Clearly, we could have done nothing without them because we needed funding in order to operate. Cap Sciences is a non-profit structure financed by national, European and local authority subsidies, plus private subsidies from a number of companies.

The aims of the project were to meet the challenge of presenting an objective, global approach to issues relating to climate change. We became aware that the general public was somewhat misinformed and had some false assumptions, so we carried out a survey of the general public at Cap Sciences using the questionnaire in our "Climate under the influence"
exhibition. The aim was to see how people approached issues relating to climate change. We realised that many people felt guilty as individuals, and that practically speaking, most people thought that farmers and industry were those with the most responsibility for climate change and greenhouse gas emissions. What is more, hardly anybody knew what a climate plan was.

We wanted to incorporate the multi-stakeholder dimension into the exhibition so that nobody would feel guilty; we are endeavouring to characterise it by this dynamic in which all stakeholders in society are involved in climate change and in cutting both energy consumption and greenhouse gas emissions. This is a holistic, collective approach which needs to be coordinated, because isolated initiatives are pointless: we need to pool our skills.

As for any exhibition, for this project we firstly analysed what already existed in order not to duplicate existing offers. We then defined the concept and created content, which involved a major phase of bibliographical and image research and so on.

Next, we had to put together a scientific advisory committee to provide scientific validation. Yesterday, I was in a lecture in which the issue of the plethora of tools for education for sustainable development which sometimes lacked scientific validation was discussed. For us, as a CCSTI, it seemed natural to put together a scientific advisory committee. For the "Climate under the influence" exhibition, we were lucky enough to have an outstanding advisory committee. This included Hervé LE TREUT who is a member of the IPCC (International Panel on Climate Change), Director of the IPSL Jussieu laboratory and a French specialist in climate modelling and scenarios, Michel RICARD who needs no further introduction, Serge PLANTON from Météo France and who is also a member of the IPCC, scientists from the Aquitaine region, Patrick BUAT-MENARD, Philippe BERTRAND from the Epoque laboratory and Jean-Michel CARNUS from the INRA. Working with them was highly enriching and I would like to thank them very much for having taken part in this project.

We also have a teaching committee. This provides us with the support of teachers and a support worker from the GRAINE Aquitaine network who specialises in environmental education. This has enabled us to see how to integrate the various types of content in the exhibition into a fairly school-based educational dynamic and to explore possible links to various teaching programmes.

As you know, one of the virtues of sustainable development is being exemplary. This means that before disseminating best practices, they have to be applied internally. We therefore endeavoured to incorporate eco-design into the project. Generally speaking, this exhibition is virtual, so we have not mobilised very much in terms of hardware except for some printing and transport for the various people involved in the project. We did our best to eco-design our communications campaign by favouring virtual communication and the Internet, using certified "Imprim'vert" printers who have been involved in this type of approach for many years now.

We are also aiming to calculate the CO2 emissions generated by this project and carry out carbon offsetting subsequently.

With regard to the Clim City site environment, we have chosen to use four typical landscapes (mountains, countryside, city and coast) because each natural environment has particularities in terms of ecosystems, is affected differently by climate change and has its own particular types of activity. We have tried to make browsing the site intuitive: you click on objects in the environment to access various types of media. In all, we have designed over 300 videos including interviews, flash animations, charts, tables, maps etc.

Sustainable development affects all types of activities within society, so this is a global, transverse approach. We also wanted to present all those activities which are sources of greenhouse gases, and you will find topics such as energy, transport, waste, industry, farming, forestry, fishing, construction, tourism, nutrition, climatology, politics and all types of natural environments (forests, lakes, glaciers, oceans and rivers).
All the different media is accessed in the same way, with a short introductory text providing some context. This is followed by a series of questions. When the user selects one of the possibilities, they access an interview, a video or something else. Each object within the site environment makes it possible to access this type of window, following which the various questions can be explored.

We have endeavoured to provide an objective vision throughout this project, particularly with respect to energy production systems, pointing out the advantages and disadvantages of each system. We attempt to show that while renewable energies do make it possible to cut CO2 emissions, they are also limited in terms of their production capacity. This means that we must try to use all of them and diversify. Similarly, with respect to nuclear power, we present the advantages and disadvantages of each type of means of production.

It is possible to browse within the environment itself and find the objects, but it is also possible to have direct access via a small tab which makes it possible to access the object directly. If I want to find out about solar energy, I can click directly on this topic. There is also access to general information relating to energy, so, for instance, I can investigate greenhouse gas emissions irrespective of whether they are related to energy. For instance, one question is: What is the distribution of greenhouse gas emissions? There follows a presentation of emissions worldwide, and it emerges that energy production is responsible for 26% of greenhouse gas emissions worldwide. If I go a bit further in the slide, we can see those countries which produce the most greenhouse gases: the United States, China, etc. Then, if you want to look at emissions per inhabitant, you can see that the US still comes out top, but that China ranks ninth. If this is compared with France, our greenhouse gas emissions are due principally to transport, industry, construction, agriculture and forestry, with energy in next-to-last place. This is because the CO2 content in French energy has dropped since the 1970s.

We can also look at solar energy. How is this used to produce electricity? Our Flash animation explains the principle of solar panels, with light energy exciting silicon photoelectric cells in the solar panel. The electricity then flows through a regulator and may be stored in batteries or used directly by electrical appliances. It can also be hooked up to the National Grid and be sold on.

Here is another video on the future of solar energy. It is a presentation of an Australian project entitled "EnviroMission", the aim of which is to create a complex of five solar updraft towers or chimneys. The operating principle is as follows: the heat warms up the air contained beneath the huge greenhouse surrounding the chimney and warms the lighter air: the chimney creates a draw effect which activates the turbines. These are pretty huge projects which are compared to well-known landmarks, and as you can see the solar tower is much larger than any of them. It is one kilometre high: it could be imagined that in a few hundred years' time, our descendants will think that it was some kind of temple. This type of project is capable of producing around 200 MW, so the complex of five solar power stations could produce 1 GW. By comparison, a typical solar power station produces some 900 MW. Another project in Spain relates to a solar tower, which is the first European prototype. This type of installation can be constructed solely at certain latitudes with a certain amount of sunshine. In Europe, the south of Spain is a suitable location, but most projects are being developed in Australia, at least at present.

In the "Clim Infos" section, it is possible to download information sheets from the articles themselves. The "Clim infos" section enables you to download all the videos on the site and use them as you wish to prepare lectures, events, classes, presentations and so on.

The "Clim fiches" contain the most significant text, content and graphics. They are PDF files which can be downloaded and reused.

We have also included a list of professions which GRAINE Aquitaine was kind enough to place at our disposal, for the benefit of young people with a particular interest in these topics.
who might consider careers in sustainable development, so that they can find out about the types of profession available to them.

We also have an index which includes the terminology used on the site and the sources. In this respect, I would like to thank all the scientific institutions, the CNRS, INRA, IRD, IFREMER, and CEMAGREF who have provided us with their productions, scientific publications and researchers. We would also like to thank the ADEME which has made its entire photo library available to us.

Clim City consists of two modules, an informational module which I have just presented and the module of which development has just been completed, the game module.

The aim of the Clim City game is to create a climate plan. Players have 50 turns, and the scientific approach carried out in factor 4 (stability triangle, climate plan, etc) is used. The aim is to establish a climate plan for Clim City which progresses on its own on a trend-based scenario, in other words one in which no involvement is required, development continues as at present, with the aim of the game being to adjust this trend-based scenario to make it sustainable.

The aim is also to combine attenuation and adaptation: attenuation relates to reducing greenhouse gases, while adaptation relates to the implementation of actions enabling players to withstand climate change which, as things stand, is inevitable. Even if we halted all CO2 emissions today, the planet would continue to warm up. What is variable is the extent of this warming, depending on the emissions produced over the next 50 years.

The two other objectives are the development of renewable energies and reducing energy consumption.

As to the game's scientific content, we worked on the basis of currently existing climate plans, the French climate plan, the Aquitaine climate plan and the factor 4 report. Why factor 4? The aim is to divide by two, because in order to stabilise global warming to a degree which is acceptable for the planet, global greenhouse gas emissions need to be divided by two. In order not to hinder the development of emerging countries, industrial nations which started producing greenhouse gases a long time ago, are required to divide their greenhouse gas emissions by a factor of four.

Stability triangles are a technique devised by British and American researchers in the search for solutions enabling the reduction of CO2 emissions. The National Observatory of the Effects of Climate Change (ONERC) works mostly on the adaptation aspect (heatwave plan, forest fire prevention plan, animal disease surveillance, tropical disease surveillance, etc). They endeavour to assess how society will have to react and more specifically, how it will be able to adapt and anticipate climate change.

Lastly, in Clim City we have used all the statistics relating to greenhouse gases and energy consumption in France, by sector of activity and type of energy. This means that Clim City has the same dimensions as those which exist today in France. The environment is quite western, indeed quite French, because we wanted to place players and visitors in a context which was similar to their own with which they will find it easy to interact.

In the trend-based scenario, Clim City continues to use more and more energy, as compared to Néga watts, an association of energy scientists who have put together a sustainable energy scenario which, over a 50-year period, allows for satisfactory development of renewable energies and therefore a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions.

The Clim City environment is not one which is created but one which must be adjusted. You start with an existing environment, reality, a context which is very similar to the one in which we need to act in daily life.

When you open the website, you have an introductory scene which provides the context of the issue of climate change, i.e. the fact that the planet naturally undergoes phases of heating and cooling. The problem is that since the beginning of the 20th century, we have
become aware that the rate of warming has accelerated, more particularly since the beginning of the 1990s. The aim of the introductory scene is to place players in a context which is both that of action with respect to climate change and to that of a videogame.

We conclude with the IPCC conclusion, which is that it is highly likely that man is responsible for the global warming observed in the 20th century. We therefore start from this basis and the aims of the French, European and other climate plans.

The site also shows the energy consumption of Clim City and the production of greenhouse gases. As you browse the site, abbreviations and other apparently complex terms are explained. This is with roll-overs: when players roll their mouse over a term, the explanation appears.

There are also "Cim astuces". These are tips for players which guide them to more specific solutions or actions. The site also states which year you are in and other types of marker. In Clim City, there are three types of stakeholder, each characterised by three types of action point. Action points include the economic aspect, the financial cost and the personal commitment required to change behaviour. There are also "government", "business" and "citizen" points. Again, this is an attempt to convey the sense of a collective, holistic approach involving all sectors and stakeholders.

For instance, if I click on the "homes" section, I can see electricity consumption, heat consumption, fuel consumption and production of renewable electricity. I can see that the houses and blocks of flats in Clim City are using a lot of energy, electricity and heat. The aim of the game is therefore to organise all the positive actions which will enable this consumption of heat and electricity to be reduced and to start producing renewable electricity.

If I choose to carry out renovation and insulate homes, I click on an action. Here, we have access to some text describing the action, the advantages and disadvantages of this action and how much it costs in terms of points. So, renovating and insulating all the homes in Clim City would cost me 10 government points, 0 business points and 12 citizen points. In terms of the impact, we can see that this mainly affects heat consumption. So, we have improved building installation, but we can also see that this action will take 10 turns, which corresponds to 10 years. This action takes a long time to implement, so it needs to be started quite early on in the game in order for it to have an effective impact.

The aim is to use these action points as well as possible, complete a year and thus a turn. You can either use up all your points or try to save some because you have identified some actions which you prefer but for which you do not yet have the required budget.

I have just carried out the renovation and insulation action. I can then visit the "Clim Stats" section of the site. This is the game's control panel. In this game, if I click on "homes" I can see that my action has made it possible to reduce greenhouse gases resulting from the consumption of fossil-fuel generated heat. My insulation/renovation action has made it possible to reduce the heat consumption of houses and tower blocks in Clim City. There are also statistics for each sector which enable you to see where priority action is required throughout the game. Here, we can see that transport is quite a priority, followed by buildings, and then farming and industry neck and neck. During the course of the game, these levels will fluctuate depending on the actions you perform. This will be the case, for instance, if you reduce greenhouse gas emissions and energy consumption.

In this example, I have set up an intermodal transport hub. I then set up offshore windfarms, developed marine energy, did some work on waste, set up flame towers at the waste disposal sites to burn biogas and then recover the energy generated. I am also going to work on a solar power station, build one, and so I see that my production of renewable electricity has started to grow significantly. In the chart for the wind farm, we can see that wind power production has increased significantly. I have set up an intermodal transport hub which has made it possible to cut the use of trucks within Clim City - because the preferred mode of
club sporting goods in Clim City is by truck. As a result of the intermodal platform, I have been able to develop other forms of transport.

In addition, there are unexpected events which disrupt the game. For instance, this oil crisis, which will have a greater or lesser effect depending on whether or not you have managed to cut Clim City's oil consumption. I have been developing hydrogen production in an attempt to have a substitute for oil-based fuel.

There can also be climate events, for instance a forest fire. I have not implemented a forest fire prevention plan, so I am penalised and will lose points. If I had implemented a prevention plan, this adjustment would have enabled me to save points.

At the end of the game, you can generate your climate plan and retrace all the actions which you have implemented in the game, year by year and object by object. You can then put this climate plan online and compare it with those of other players, enabling you to see how other people have played and what sort of results each has achieved.

To conclude, there are a wide variety of potential uses. It is up to you to appropriate the game: it could be an aid in a presentation, event or teaching session. It can be played individually or by several people at once, at home and at school. We carried out a test last week with upper secondary students, and it became apparent that many topics could be raised by means of the game.

We have almost completed its test phase and the game will very probably be going online at the beginning of November 2008, with free access to the "exhibition" aspect and the game.

Conclusion
by Jamy GOURMAUD
Journalist at France Télévision

In conclusion, the best thing is what we have just seen. The site and the game combine all the elements required to transmit information. I believe that information can be passed on much more effectively when receiving this information and digesting it is enjoyable. In addition, this game requires some understanding of the phenomena involved. Understanding these phenomena does not involve particular effort or difficulty; this type of game or website makes it very easy to understand these things and see them in practical terms, make them very concrete and apply them.

Just now, we were talking about doing programmes about sustainable development. While all this information is vital, I believe that the quality of information and of the messages which we wish to communicate are essential. Much is being said today, and the general public is somewhat lost amidst all the information it is being bombarded with. Something is said about sustainable development almost every day and the impression I get as I talk to people is that nobody knows where to go to find out more or which information is correct. Sometimes this information is contradictory, and it is extremely difficult for the man in the street to understand how they can adopt appropriate behaviour for today. Who should they be listening to? What for? What can they do?

This site brings everything together in a highly practical manner without the content being ephemeral or vague. This is my impression of the site as a whole and of the game, and I very much hope they will be online very soon.
Special session 2

ESD in the Francophone world

Summary

- Understanding in order to prevent mass violence as part of education for sustainable development: image, memory and the culture of peace (Sonia FOURNIER, University of Quebec at Rimouski and Centre for Cross-Disciplinary Studies on Genocide, Kigali, Rwanda)
- Environmental assessment: a methodological tool for sustainable development (Aoua B. LY-TALL, Mahamed V University, Rabat, Morocco)
- Education and sustainable development as seen and related by those who have experienced it (Monique TRUDEL, Educom Environnement, Montréal)
- Mobilisation of members of parliament to protect nature in Senegal (Oumar SY, UICN Senegal, Dakar)
- Presentation of the Méditerre website (Annie DE WIEST, French-speaking community of Belgium)
- Examples of ESD in the world of education in Togo (Claude DALMEIDA, Tokoin Lycée and University of Lomé, Togo)
- Discussion
- Conclusions (Boufeldja BENABDALLAH, IEPF, and Michel MOMBRUN, UNITAR)

Moderator: Hega MARTIN (REEDAC, WGS, Gabon)

Understanding in order to prevent mass violence as part of education for sustainable development: image, memory and the culture of peace

by Sonia FOURNIER
Professor of Education, University of Quebec at Rimouski (UQAR), Quebec, Canada
Centre for Cross-Disciplinary Studies on Genocide (IGSC), Kigali, Rwanda

First of all, I would like to thank the French Committee for the Decade for inviting me, and I’m delighted to be able to share with you my research work relating to mass violence and imagery. This research is a work in progress involving a number of disciplines including literature, history and the arts, and which attempts to develop teaching resources designed to encourage creativity, practice and development with a view to international solidarity.

The research forms part of a request for research funding addressed to the Centre for International Development Research. The project is growing and expanding with partners.

The unprecedented context of the 1994 Tutsi genocide in Rwanda has led us to consider the children of parents who were the perpetrators or survivors of the Tutsi genocide in their school environment. In Rwanda, both perpetrators and victims have been living together side
by side for some 15 years, and most children alive today were not born at the time of the genocide.

This tragic event in 1994 gave rise to a number of questions and debates about education in Rwanda in relationship with the policy of reconciliation. Rwandan families survived crimes, murders and torture, so there are also questions about parents and teachers who perpetrated or survived the genocide. This event has obliged Rwandans, both Tutsis and Hutus, to rebuild a culture of peace in an educational environment in relationship with the reconciliation policy established by the Government. As part of this, the International Convention on the Rights of the Child constitutes a major resource which necessarily implies better observance of human rights.

Furthermore, Rwandan teachers are wondering about how to pass on an accurate memory at the same time as ensuring children’s overall development and avoiding any possible trauma.

The objectives of this research are as follows:
- devising and establishing tools with teachers and pupils in relation to education in the rights of the child and using the history of the Tutsi genocide, with the creation and use of images and using product-based pedagogy
- creating teaching resources for three target localities: Rwanda, Brittany and Canada,
- analysing teaching resources devised and established by teachers and pupils in relation to education about the rights of the child using the history of the Tutsi genocide and taking into account the similarities and differences with respect to classes targeted in the three locations defined in this research.

The question is as follows: Is it possible to present education focused on the rights of the child on the basis of the history of the Tutsi genocide?

Schools are in the midst of change in many places in the world, with a large number of reforms underway. in Rwanda, the principal strategies and initiatives carried out in 2008 and 2009 consist in assessing and reviewing syllabuses, particularly with the aim of introducing into curricula the necessary competencies to deal with the many risks of contemporary life, especially HIV-Aids and values such as a culture of peace, tolerance, reconciliation, human rights and the protection of the environment.

In written texts, mention is made of health education, education relating to the environment and sustainable development and intercultural education. Each requires the local environment to be involved in achieving these objectives and sharing common values. The community needs to be involved in training citizens: this is referred to as citizenship education.

We will not be looking at all the concepts of the conceptual framework for this research which includes imagery, the Tutsi genocide, the UNESCO and UNICEF International Convention on the Rights of the Child, a culture of peace, constructivism and project-based pedagogy.

Several paintings have been inspired by two trips to Rwanda and several symposiums which I have held worldwide in an attempt to establish an original theory focusing on painting and the Tutsi genocide. I will not be explaining all these paintings, but I will pass on the titles of those representing the first part, which relates to the pre-genocide situation and inspired by historic and scientific works, testimonies, literature, art and other disciplines. These paintings are called "Identity", "the Falcon 50 and the start of the genocide", "Church, God and the red carpet", "Fragmented memory".

Three paintings relate to the period of genocide itself and relate the three important concepts involved in the construction of genocide. These are an ideology, a means and a plan. The Tutsi genocide took place over a period of 100 days with a total of over one million deaths. The head represents ideology and thought, the hand with the machete represents the...
means, and the plan has been determined over time - the extent to which this was well orchestrated is widely known.

Thirdly, we have the post-Tutsi genocide period. One painting describes the reconstruction after this drama, with initiatives, forgiveness and truth. We have the feminine aspect, because we know that this is one of the countries in the world with the highest representation of women at government level in the wake of this tragic event. The solidity and fragility of women are somewhat contradictory, but have contributed to a highly distinctive outlook in Rwanda. The last painting, completed this summer, is entitled "Human magma" and is a summary of the Tutsi genocide, a kind of accumulation of several paintings offering a better understanding of this event.

In terms of methods, this is qualitative research based on case studies; this has been established within a constructivist paradigm focused on the pupil. Constructivism argues that individuals construct their understanding of the reality around them through the interaction which they have with their environment.

Project-based pedagogy allows for the creation of complex and meaningful situations, creates an open-ended solution which can be adjusted to a pupil's progress, leads to a practical, creative product and promotes the socio-relational development of pupils and the holistic development of the individual.

The project-based pedagogical approach consists of three phases:

- Exploration of the project: the fields of study, the formation of sets and the choice of integrating themes, the clarification of interests and questions, and the identification of learning processes related to pupils' personal and social cognitive development.
- Design and completion of personal projects.
- Communication and sharing of what is learned.

The rights of the child are presented in a number of categories, including the right to education, to a family, to expression, to protection, to health and the right to exist.

Project-based pedagogy aims for an integrating theme which has been defined as follows: "My rights and my life as a child". This pedagogy relates to the theoretical foundations of the constructivist paradigm with the use of art as a mode of learning and of expression. The pedagogical project is therefore governed by the integrating theme of "My rights and my life as a child" and is established on the basis of the rights of the child and the history of the Tutsi genocide in Rwanda, with concrete links and a recognition of connections with previous and/or current manifestations of this.

Assessment of competencies relates firstly to personal and social competency in terms of communication and the intellect.

The project extends over a five-year period, with total classroom time in each of the three localities of six weeks, and relates to the subjects of history, French and plastic arts. It concerns primary school pupils aged between 10 and 12, with three periods per week.

Several collecting instruments and techniques have been noted: observer-participation, interviews with teachers, a logbook, description, anecdotal notes, the exercise book and the work produced.

Analysis of this material is to be carried out following documentary classification, transcription of materials, discovery of these, establishing distinctive profiles, the constant-analysis approach and content analysis. A committee of teachers, psychologists, researchers and staff working in the field of education will be able to oversee pupils' progress, the teaching approach and discussions relating to the product.

How can education in the rights of the child be interpreted and passed on to pupils on the basis of the Tutsi genocide without creating conflicts or creating excessive distress?
What tools should be favoured in the classroom by the key people involved in education in the rights of the child and the history of the Tutsi genocide?

How can tools which are appropriate for the cultural context be devised with Rwandan, French and Canadian teachers and their pupils?

I would like to conclude by referring to a rather legendary bird known as the Sankofa Bird, which flies with its head turned backwards, often with a seed in its beak. This bird with its characteristic flight is an embodiment of advancement, progress, devolution and overcoming adversity. Sankofa is a word from a popular local language in Ghana which means that referring to major events in the past is not taboo when it comes to rectifying our mistakes and moving on in life.

Environmental assessment:
a methodological tool for sustainable development
by Aoua B. LY-TALL
Institute of African Studies, Université Mohamed V-Souissi, Rabat, Morocco

I am an environmental sociologist and an expert on gender. I am an associate researcher at the Institute for Women's Studies at the University of Ottawa (Canada) and I have been researcher in residence for a few months now at the Institute of African Studies and hold the UNESCO chair in "Women and their rights" at Muhammad V University in Rabat (Morocco). I am also a member of the network of researchers and practitioners for peace, understanding and the prevention of conflict and genocide.

Education for sustainable development as established by the United Nations Decade calls for a number of pedagogical resources, as with any form of education. We need stakeholders from education, training and information for sustainable development, and you are these people. Sustainable development was defined by the Brundtland report as being development which fulfils the needs of the present without comprising the ability of future generations to fulfil theirs: this has now become a planetary issue. In order to achieve this, a number of initiatives have been carried out, particularly following the Rio Summit, and a number of tools have been perfected in this respect.

Tools and approaches to development education nonetheless suffer from a major weakness, which is their failure to take into account the "gender" aspect, in other words the relationship between the men and women in development be it in planning, execution or assessment of energy development projects. In fact, the full title of my presentation is "Taking gender into account in environmental assessment: a methodological tool for sustainable development".

A number of energy projects, be they large or small, do not take the gender aspect into account. As a result, sustainable development - that is, development which is environmentally sustainable and socially equitable - cannot be achieved.

In this presentation I will be seeking to argue that if gender is not taken into account, there can be no sustainable development. To do this I will use the illustration of one of the major hydroelectric dam projects in Francophone Africa, undertaken by the Organisation for the Development of the Senegal River. This is of particular importance in this region, where men in the valley and the Senegal River Delta have left in search of better conditions. This is similar to the way in which immigrant workers who were in France have gone to some cities in Gabon or even to America to work and send back money to feed their families. This massive immigration of men has created particular conditions, in which women have become the dominant force in the remaining communities.

It is in this context that I have been called upon to establish a methodological guide for environmental assessment which takes into account the gender factor on the basis of the Harvard analysis grid, which is also known as the "activity profile". This guide aims to be a contribution to the United Nations Decade for education for stable development: once it is
finished, I would like to make it available to all education for sustainable development stakeholders so that they can adjust it for their specific contexts.

By way of introduction, I would like to emphasise that achieving sustainable development relies on the necessary condition of equity and equality between North and South, between present and future generations, between rich and poor and also between women and men. The Brundtland report is very clear when it says that a world without equity will always be subject to environmental, social and other crises. The financial crisis we are experiencing and the ensuing recession are evidence of the accuracy of the Brundtland report.

Similarly, as the development strategy policies which have been applied up to now are being called into question, the issue of "women and development" has, after Nairobi, moved during the 1990s from an approach of "gender and integrating women into development" towards "gender and development". The latter concept emphasises the relationship between women and men in development. Indeed, today the taking into account of the gender aspect has become a criterion for the approval and funding of any development project for a large number of international bodies. This is because this conception, which is also an approach and an analysis tool, constitutes a major issue in any development initiative, particularly in southern nations where, due to the social division of labour, the community assigns highly distinct roles and responsibilities to women and men.

Environmental assessment is another necessary tool, one which allows sustainable development to be achieved. This concept was developed in the 1970s following the denunciations by environmentalists of the destruction of the environment by "developers". Today, this has become a vital tool for sustainable development. It involves in-depth examination of development plans and projects with a view to identifying the impacts which they may have on the environment, in other words on the physical, biological, human, socio-economic and cultural contexts, and either preventing these or optimising them to make them positive impacts.

This means that environmental education can help developers to design better political projects and programmes. It may make it possible to identify negative impacts fairly early on and to find alternative solutions in time. Similarly, the process of environmental assessment makes it possible for the public to be involved in the decision-making process. It makes policies and programmes more effective. As André Hérvé puts it: "Impact assessment is above all the science of prevention".

The absence of environmental assessment may compromise the success of development projects, particularly when these impact assessments are applied in Third World countries. The example of the project to develop the Senegal River using hydroelectric dams is quite a good demonstration that without prior, in-depth environmental assessment which takes the gender aspect into account, no sustainable development, in other words development which is environmentally sustainable and socially equitable, can take place.

In the face of challenges relating to development or even survival, the threat of drought and desertification and the accompanying phenomena such as famine, deforestation and the dispersal of livestock, the nations of Mali, Mauritania and Senegal joined forces to develop the Senegal River. The aim of this organisation, known as OMVS, is to undertake the construction of hydroelectric dams, the Diama dam near Saint-Louis and the Manantali dam in the upper basin of the Senegal River. These dams have a number of functions with a number of objectives.

Formerly, this region was very favoured, with crops based on the river flooding and receding, and women working orchards. The river also provided a good supply of fish. Fishing, farming and livestock rearing would even create surpluses which could then be sold or bartered. For instance, there was bartering between North Africa and sub-Saharan Africa at a very early stage. People from North Africa would cross the Sahara desert to barter salt for millet, certain spices and gold. Before the great droughts, it really was a region where life was good and people were healthy because they had all the required nutritional inputs. The changes have
been due to both environmental and political reasons. The fact is that the Senegal River was not properly developed in this region which could have fed the whole of West Africa.

These large dams therefore represent high hopes, because it is thought that they will restore life to the sub-region and engender socio-economic development, with a hydro-farming complex which would irrigate an area of 350,000 hectares, a hydroelectric aspect with the production of 800,000 MW of electricity per year, enabling the mineral resources of Mali and Senegal to be exploited and open up Mali.

Funding to the tune of 500-600,000 US dollars and the involvement of all major industrialised nations and wealthy Arab nations highlights the stakes in this project. In the light of negative experiences, a large number of third-world activists and African intellectuals opposed these hydroelectric dams, and environmental assessments provided recommendations. Unfortunately, these have not been adequate, particularly as regards women and ethnic considerations, and have not always been taken into account by the OMVS decision-makers and the funding bodies.

A good number of negative impacts have been confirmed, without the achievement of the hoped-for positive effects, particularly as regards health, nutritional self-sufficiency and the environment.

For instance, these impact studies show that with respect to health, a number of diseases have developed, aggravating existing diseases and affecting the population, all the more so because healthcare is not very good. In terms of food and nutrition, the area to be developed annually is decreasing, and the planned dual development for growing rice has not been carried out. The result is that the post-dam situation has not provided the promised sufficiency or food security, all the more so because the wildlife and fish stock has decreased and the dismantling of the livestock economy no longer allows for the provision of additional proteins from milk and fish.

The ecosystem of the basin has being significantly damaged by a long period of drought, but also by the hydroelectric developments that have altered its cycle, affecting flora, fauna, the soil, water and the air. These environmental disruptions have led to the damage to traditional socio-economic sectors, which in turn has led to a loss of sources of food and revenue: this has affected women in particular and generated more work. At this level, the Senegal River development project provides ample evidence to support the argument that the deterioration of the environment affects women more than men, particularly in rural areas.

It should be determined whether a project is gender-sensitive right from the planning stage of development projects. This enables data to be gathered about the living habits of populations, foresee negative impacts and optimise any remaining ones.

Time considerations unfortunately prevent me from presenting my methodological tool, just to say that it is a contribution to achieving sustainable development so that we can at last see equity between nations, generations, races, cultures and civilisations in order to establish peace and a better world for existing and future generations.

**Education and sustainable development as seen and related by those who have experienced it**

*by Monique TRUDEL*

*Educom Environnement, Montréal*

During the last 25 years' worth of co-operation in Africa, the IUCN has initiated a number of tools and methods which have provided leverage for partners and support organisations (associations, NGOs, research institutions and technical services) to be attentive to local communities in order to analyse their situation and identify appropriate, sustainable solutions. The IUCN World Conference enabled a number of these people to be present and to take part.
The members of the panel deliberately chose to discuss modes of expression which would enable the most underprivileged to contribute so that their voice could be heard from and so that they could influence and change things. They also decided to recognize and analyse simple tools which they are developing on the basis of what has been expressed by these rural communities (young people, women and nomads) so that their voice could be heard, quite distinctly from any new technology. Internet and cellphones will not be being discussed as means of communication.

For our part, we have decided to promote the expertise of stakeholders from Francophone Africa in terms of their creativity in serving communities, so that it becomes possible to influence politicians and contribute to the changes in behaviour to which we all aspire as we carry out education for sustainable development.

Initially, we asked ourselves the question of why it was important to give communities a voice.

The first reason is altruistic: enabling people to participate in humanity's debates and encouraging people who do not spontaneously express themselves because they find themselves at the bottom of the ladder, feel too oppressed or are not sure that they are important enough to have a right to speak out and give their opinion, to do so.

The second reason is more of a microeconomic one: justifying funding by having it validated by the beneficiaries themselves, also with a view to preserving the positive aspect of relations.

The third and most important reason is methodological: this is a way of establishing needs, sticking points and aspirations for change. Methods and approaches have been developed by educational science and sociology, and together make up what has been called the participatory approach.

In Africa, the participatory approach was developed in the 1970s as part of development aid. People quickly became aware that if they wanted results, it was important for everybody to participate and be given the chance to act and react with respect to what they were being offered.

In the 1970s, a movement developed in Burkina Faso with the CDAO known as GRAAPP (Research and Support Group for Popular and Rural Self-Promotion). Many people have certainly used this method or drawn inspiration from it.

The method was developed around three keywords: seeing, thinking and acting. This involved getting villagers to see their current situation, think about the consequences and causes of change, and decide to act in order to progress as they wished. This is pretty much what we are trying to do through education for sustainable development.

The tools which were presented in Barcelona are highly practical and have produced tangible results, at least in terms of helping communities to express themselves, taking into account the diversity of their constituent members. The people presenting them start by listening to local populations, and then interpret their concerns and needs in terms of tools which can be vehicles to change influences.

The first experience was presented by Haïdar EL ALI from the Senegal Océanium. He is a great maritime and wildlife enthusiast who has observed that there are many problems with fishermen, particularly because of the use of dynamite to fish. He attempted in vain to persuade the fishermen of his point of view, so instead he made himself a submarine camera using a pressure cooker and managed to make a three-minute film. This celebrated three-minute underwater film created a shock wave in the population because the fishermen could see the impact of their actions. This is an illustration of how simple tools can be developed: but this involves talking to people about what concerns and affects them.

Haïdar went from village to village to raise the awareness of local populations using his video. He now has the support of a regional programme for the conservation of coastal and
marine areas and has been given a truck which enables him to travel widely throughout West Africa. Haïdar emphasises that it is very important to address the people concerned, those who exploit the resource, directly, but he is also convinced that the whole community needs to be involved in the process, as do researchers and the decision-makers. He also reminds us that we need to realise that the job of education is a long haul, that materials and resources need to be produced in the language of the communities in question if we really want to achieve something in terms of decision-making and change.

A second contribution came from Mr Carlos Chouat, one of the founders of the first community radio stations in Guinea-Bissau. He says that this resource is an instrument which people believe it is impossible for local communities to appropriate. This is because when people think of radio stations, they think of what they know of the media, journalists and so on. He used an emergency situation to start his first community radio station. In Guinea-Bissau, he used a cholera epidemic as a basis on which to launch his first community-based radio station. This was managed by young people who took on the responsibility of raising awareness in neighbourhoods and getting people in these neighbourhoods to change their hygiene practices in order to reduce the spread of cholera.

Radio is one way of giving a voice to those who do not have one. It allows for social identification, conflict resolution and increased promotion of culture, traditions and history. Local radio should provide local information first and foremost, serving the interests of the community, dealing with all types of social issue, and be managed by the community or by local elders. Community-based radio has enabled better control and better confidence in terms of the development of communities by the communities themselves: they know what they need in terms of development.

We then had a contribution from a person from Guinea who uses radio and networks of journalists with regard to projects, in the French language. This person really emphasised that the problem is that unless translation into local languages is provided, it will always be difficult to get the message across.

We then had a contribution from two people who presented a tool consisting of environmental education tools developed by the UICN since the mid-1980s. These contributors emphasised that it was important for written resources to be a means of sharing, informative, interactive and encouraging action. This enabled young people to approach adults, providing an intergenerational link, and brought people together to act more effectively by creating a forum for consultation with the local communities.

With had a short contribution from Marie-Laure who has combined photos and text to put together books containing "words and visual perceptions". The idea is to give communities the opportunity to participate in putting a book together, relating their life experience and aspirations, and asking the community’s help to illustrate this.

In Cameroon, she worked with a nature club, giving disposable cameras to the young people and asking them to photograph their environment and the things which were important in it. This forms the basis of a participatory book. In Mauritania, women and fishermen took the photos and wrote the stories, which resulted in a book in French and Arabic.

I was the last contributor. I have been working in Africa the 25 years, but I chose to speak about the use of very simple resources such as drawing and communities' maps of their resources.

The ideal was to give a voice to women who were illiterate and therefore did not dare to speak, by asking them to draw pictures of their expertise and what they took a pride in, in order to help them realise that even if they are poor, they do possess something. They have children, a little plot of land perhaps, or a cow. By becoming aware of what they have, the idea was to get them to tell us what they would like in their lives; what their dreams are. In most cases, in the most deprived populations with which I have worked, the first thing which people ask for, whether they are women or men, is education.
In conclusion, the discussion in these various workshops has emphasised the importance of taking sociocultural conditions into account in the implementation of tools with a view to optimal use and appropriation of these. Furthermore, what is important is not the tool itself but the objective. What do we want when we talk about sustainable development?

The experiences I have shared with you this evening were all successful: the local stakeholders who carried them out were attentive and listened to their own hearts. My hope is that we will be inspired by the example of these experiences so that education for sustainable development begins with, and speaks to people's hearts: if there is no heart in it, if there is no love, our planet will be no more.

Open-floor discussion

Oumar SY, UICN Senegal, Dakar

I believe that giving a voice to the underprivileged is extremely important, all the more so because they are often accused of being at the origin of damage to the environment. The fact is that the underprivileged damage the environment less than the rich, and there are several types of rich people.

You Europeans represent one form of wealth, but we also have wealthy people in our country. Citydwellers are richer than country-dwellers. For deforestation, for instance, this is carried out more by country-dwellers than by the rich. However, the charcoal produced is sold to the rich. Fish caught in overfishing is sold to the rich. So allowing the poor to make themselves heard helps them to feel that they are not the only ones responsible for damage to the environment. Enabling them to see the kind of action which they can develop is excellent and I congratulate you for this.

Fatimata DIA TOURÉ, IEPF

I would like to come back to environmental education and the preliminary environmental impact study. This really is a development tool and not a gadget. It may sometimes be referred to that way because it is not yet very well known, but the Francophone world is doing work on this subject with the Energy and Environment Institute.

We have a programme entitled MOGE (Managing Environmental Management Tools) which deals with environmental education, strategic environmental analysis and the preliminary environmental impact study for projects and for any type of investment.

This is something new in our context and we need to train stakeholders and create the institutional, legislative and regulatory framework in order for this to become a reality and not simply a promotional gimmick to attract funding or investors. We very much need stronger capabilities in this respect; this tool really is a resource for education for sustainable development.

We often understand education as meaning having been to school and having acquired scientific knowledge, but there is empirical knowledge which, so far, has certainly not come into contact with what we refer to today as "development" in the modern sense of the term. Introducing an integrated, participatory approach into education for sustainable development makes it possible to do without a stage which we have experienced in developed countries and which has caused what we are experiencing today in terms of negative impacts on climate change, loss of biodiversity and situations arising from the use of certain chemical treatments in agriculture. In France today, two thirds of groundwater is polluted and this has become a major issue.

Sonia FOURNIER, UQAR

Concerning the family environment, it is definitely a good idea to be in touch with parents. I was reminded of significant needs when I went to Rwanda. For instance, one parent had a
lot of trouble with their child at night. The child would wake up and the parent did not know what to say to their son. This parent told us that one of the things we should be looking at in our research was providing tools for parents so that they could explain to their children why so many people in the family were missing and explain to them why they were still feeling so afraid. It is very important to help parents, but since we have to make methodological choices and start somewhere, I think that school is a good starting point. We can then work outwards subsequently.

Otherwise, to answer your question, I painted these pictures on the basis of impressions. The paintings are not designed to represent horror but to provide an opportunity for expression: imagery can form the basis for learning processes.

Other forms of expression exist, such as cinema, theatre and strip cartoons, and expressions of the massacres, for instance, have all been introduced into these more powerful media. I have intentionally chosen images which recall the history of the genocide in which children and adults assume a role as they wish and are capable of identification without this being traumatic. The aim is not to use intense emotion, but to use children's capabilities in terms of their emotional and cognitive development, and enable learning to take place through their story and memory.

Project-based pedagogy will involve the children creating their own narrative in order for them to become workers for peace on the basis of their rights. At present, in this research, we are doing this using paintings.

Monique TRUDEL, Educom Environnement

It is indeed very important to give people a voice: this is a stage which makes it possible subsequently to present results showing what it is that people want and what they think it is possible to do. In Madagascar, we were able to present this to the government, ministries and cooperation agencies in order for them to better target the approaches they should have with local communities.

In addition, when people are given a hearing, they are proud of the fact that people are taking an interest in them, and I believe that this really is where we should begin. So long as people are proud of what they are, this gives them hope about the way that things can be changed.

Aoua B. LY-TALL, Mohamed V University

Is environmental assessment a gimmick? Admittedly, it may be perceived this way at the present. Indeed, people have not yet mastered this environmental assessment resource, despite the fact that in North America, for instance, it is used systematically. For my part, I applied it by adapting the Harvard profile to activities. For instance, I asked countrywomen living on the banks of the Senegal River about the activities they performed during the day.

For instance, we might want to establish a women's literacy programme and schedule it on Fridays from 2pm to 4pm.

The gender-based approach has a number of tools and concepts, and the activity profile makes it possible to classify the work done by women. This reveals that women get up very early in the morning, fetch water, prepare meals, find firewood and come back to prepare another meal. At the end of a one-year literacy programme, we carry out assessment, and we find out that women did not attend this literacy programme, simply because the possibility for them to do so was not taken into account.

Another example relates to access to resources and loans: loans are developed for men despite the fact that very often it is the women who are doing the bulk of the work.

I hope that the Francophone world will help us to develop this powerful preventive resource which will enable programmes, plans and development projects to be successful and ensure that development is sustainable.
Mobilisation of members of parliament to protect nature in Senegal

by Oumar SY
UICN Senegal, Dakar

I am not going to be presenting you with a study, research or a programme relating to education for sustainable development, but a network of Members of Parliament. Education for sustainable development is for everybody, at all times, in all seasons, in every sphere, and we believe that Members of Parliament are also an important target for us to address in order to progress things in terms of the environment and sustainable development.

The Senegal National Assembly is an impressive structure which dates from colonial times. When we consider the colonial era we often highlight the negative, but there were also many positive aspects.

In Senegal, as elsewhere in West Africa, we can see that the environment and natural resources are under attack from natural causes (climate change, drought, desertification) and man-made courses: inappropriate use of resources, extensive agriculture, stock-breeding and fishing, bushfires and pollution of various kinds. The consequence of all this has been a drop in the production of the primary sector, on which 70% of the population of these countries depends, and an increase in poverty with all the related issues such as urbanisation, with people leaving the rural areas to go to cities, delinquency, immigration and so on.

The State, development partners and private-sector environmental players are combining their efforts to reverse this trend. In this respect, Members of Parliament in Senegal and elsewhere in the sub-region increasingly appear to be in the front line. For this reason, in 1998, Members of Parliament in Senegal who had become somewhat aware of environmental issues set up a network with four principal aims:

- Strengthening their own capabilities. Indeed, Members of Parliament find themselves at the confluence or intersection between decision-making, action and controlling these actions. In this respect, Members of Parliament are important targets for environmental education and education for sustainable development. They are passing laws, treaties and conventions, so it is necessary for them to know something about what they are voting for.
- Ensuring the interests of local populations are defended. Members of Parliament are there to exercise a mandate entrusted to them by their constituents. It is therefore their responsibility to defend the interests of these populations vis-a-vis the State and others who affect the environment.
- Promoting the development of partnerships.
- Developing activities such as environmental watch, information, awareness-raising and education of local populations, petitioning and lobbying government authorities.

The Senegal MP network is particularly interested in five fields:

- climate change and living environments,
- biodiversity and the management of protected areas,
- the management of wetlands and water resources,
- desertification and the management of arid areas and forests,
- the conservation of coastal and marine areas.

To implement the action plan structured on the basis of these five topics, the MPs have four types of principal activity:

- Informing, raising awareness of and educating the public.
Parliamentary actions. Members of Parliament can submit oral or written questions to ask the Government about a certain number of issues, hearings, Parliamentary inquiries and draft legislation.

Developing partnerships with government departments. This involves the Members of Parliament seeing how, in partnership with Government departments, NGOs, and cooperation agencies, they can advance the cause of protecting the environment as well as actions for the protection and management of natural resources. This involves field visits to observe environmental conditions and discussions with stakeholders with respect to actions to be implemented in order for resources to be preserved.

During the 2007/2008 parliamentary year, this network developed a number of activities. These include site visits. For instance, the MPs visited sand extraction sites, because especially around Dakar, this phenomenon has reached such proportions that it has become responsible for coastal erosion which is now threatening the survival of certain neighbourhoods in the city. They also visited the national bird reserve at Djoudj to look at the problems with regard to the management of this park, the Languede Barbarie National Park, the protected marine area of Abéné to the south, the Diama dam, the factories at Ziguinchor and the Boutout electric power station. The purpose of these visits was to observe the environmental situation in these areas, define actions to be developed and what arguments could be envisaged in favour of better management of these sites.

In addition, these MPs are currently attending information and training sessions. They need to acquire a better understanding of environmental issues and be better equipped to address these problems as they exercise their responsibilities as members of parliament, legislators and those responsible for controlling the actions of the state.

MPs are elected at the national level, but there are also local elected officials. We therefore decided that an interface was required between these two categories of elected officials in order for elected officials at every level to take responsibility with respect to issues relating to the environment and sustainable development.

The work of these MPs has had a significant impact on Parliament.

Firstly, there was increased interest, more commitment and a greater degree of motivation of MPs with respect to environmental issues. Secondly, their knowledge with respect to major environmental issues has been increased. For instance, we have organised sessions on sustainable development, international conventions, and the management of marine and coastal areas. We have also observed improved control of the executive by means of oral and written questions. At the start of independence, there were no questions relating to the environment; in 2007/2008, there were ten or so such questions.

Lastly, we have observed greater involvement of MPs in international meetings. They are used to being invited to such meetings, but they generally attend them as if they were tourists because they do not fully grasp the issues which are being debated. MPs in developed nations do not function in the same way as those in underdeveloped countries. While we do have MPs who are engineers and university graduates, we also have people who have never been to school and for whom training and awareness-raising are necessary.

These MPs have developed a certain number of partnerships, principally with UICN and the embassy of the Kingdom of the Netherlands. The Netherlands is the country which provides the most funding for the environment in West Africa, mainly in Senegal. This partnership has enabled the implementation of a support and consultancy programme which has provided the network of MPs with two Parliamentary assistants of which I am one, and financial resources for them to develop their activities.

In addition, the network has expanded its partnerships with government institutions, development partners, the private sector, the United Kingdom Embassy, the Ministry for the Environment and its departments, the World Wide Fund for Nature, the Senegal Association of the Friends of Nature, and so on.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
In terms of outlook, the network is looking to strengthen its partnerships with local authorities. There needs to be an alliance between MPs at a national level and local elected officials (mayors, rural councillors, regional councillors and so on).

Another perspective involves engaging in a process which should result in the development and adoption of a coastal law. In Senegal and throughout the west African coastal sub-region apart from Mauritania, there is no law with respect to coastal areas.

With the support of the Environmental Monitoring Centre (CSE), the Members of Parliament are seeking to implement a permanent training scheme. At present, training is organised on a one-off basis: the idea would be to have somewhere where it is possible for MPs to be offered permanent training.

Another perspective again is to increase and improve the participation of MPs in major national meetings and contribute to the implementation of a regional network in West Africa. Today, Senegal has a network. There is also a network in Central Africa, but this does not yet exist in West Africa.

To conclude, within the parliamentary institution, the network of Members of Parliament for the environment is an autonomous body consisting of members of the National Assembly and senators from a variety of political backgrounds who have joined of their own free will; their actions and decisions do not necessarily reflect the viewpoint of the government.

This network of Members of Parliament therefore constitutes a watchdog body and addresses all stakeholders, reminding them of their duties of care and responsibility with a view to virtuous management of the environment and of natural resources.

In West Africa, the future regional network of Members of Parliament and local elected officials will be contributing to the coordination, synergy and harmonisation of policies, legislation and programmes relating to the management of the environment and of natural resources. It is only by the creation of such global coherence and concerted management that natural and cultural resources in this area will make it possible to contribute to sustainable development in the West African sub-region.

Presentation of the “Médiaterre” website

Annie DE WIEST
French-speaking community of Belgium

I would like to present a resource which the Francophone world has made available to us. This is a portal of Francophone information worldwide relating to sustainable development, known as Médiaterre.

This portal came into existence at the Johannesburg world summit, more especially at the initiative of France. It is being supported by the Francophone world and France and organised by partners who seek to be as motivated as possible.

The purpose of Médiaterre is to produce and disseminate information about sustainable development as well as to provide media coverage of major and other events. So if you have something to communicate about the symposium we have been having over these last few days, you can access the Médiaterre portal.

Médiaterre is also a resource serving language and cultural diversity, since it is the only worldwide information portal available solely in the French language.

Médiaterre gives you the possibility of having a customised interface, with a real-time consolidated news feed, electronic bulletins, the 50 Agenda 21 topics, news via Google.fr, and a calendar of all forthcoming events. It also provides 10 themed portals, including one relating to education to which we would like to draw your attention today.

It is also possible to arrange a special banner ad for a particular event, as has been the case for the United Nations Sustainable Development Commission and various other events.
There are several ways of being involved in Médiaterre. Firstly, you can register and consult the site, but you can also post messages. It is also possible to become a message moderator, however this requires a contractual agreement with the site management. You can also lead the discussion of a given topic. I have the privilege of leading two topics (education and gender), for which I have the assistance of a number of helpers. You can also become a helper for a portal or join a portal organising committee.

Médiaterre’s executive office is located in the IEPF in Quebec. The site has 21 partners, 25 portal sites, 8500 visitors, 280,000 connections and almost 24 million page visits. In addition, I would like to point out that all this enables us to save enormous amounts of paper.

**Examples of ESD in the world of education in Togo**

_Claude DALMEIDA_
_Tokoin Lycée and University of Lomé, Togo_

I am a literature teacher and I work in an upper secondary school and the University of Lome (Togo). This evening, I would like to share with you my small experience of sustainable development, but by way of introduction, I would like to say something about my country so that you will be better able to understand the situation we are facing.

Togo is a small country with a total area of 56,000km² tucked in between Benin and Ghana beneath Burkina Faso. The country has been excluded from the international community because of a lack of democracy. In this rather tense political climate, the Mayor of Lome had the brilliant idea of running off with the municipal funds. Since then, the entire city has been a shambles, with rubbish everywhere and so on. In addition, we have a plague at the moment, particularly in East Africa, although I suppose it is the same in Benin and Cote d’Ivoire, that of plastic waste.

I am also a member of the Agenda 21 Workers Group (GEPA) set up by teachers at the French lycée in Lome. We meet twice a month and during the course of these meetings we have decided to work on very specific areas.

When I arrived at the Tokoin lycée, which is the largest upper secondary school in Togo with 3000 pupils, the first thing that struck me was how dirty the premises were. The entire school yard was covered in plastic and all sorts of waste. We had to choose a working topic with the GEPA. The French lycée had chosen to work on recycling batteries and paper, so I asked if we could work on recycling plastic. So we began to do this work with a team of pupils which I tried to put together. To do this I set up an environmental club called "Arc-en-Ciel". Every Thursday, I give up part of my time to work with these pupils. NGOs also come and help us to raise awareness: over a two-year period, we have carried out awareness-raising with respect to sustainable development.

Last April, with the French school, we organised the sustainable development week at the Lome CCF. We did not have much in the way of resources, but some major companies did come and take part in this sustainable development week.

The person in charge of La Togolaise des Eaux, the agency which supplies water to the city, said that the water table was dropping, he was searching for solutions in vain and that in the long term he will be obliged to import water from Ghana. When I heard this, I realised that these people had understood what was at stake and the need to do something about it.

Having carried out an awareness phase at the school, I decided it was time to move on to a more practical phase and start collection. The awareness-raising related to a number of fields. Since we are dealing with a French lycée, for the texts presenting arguments, I have used documents I have tried to adjust to present arguments and examples and ask the pupils to identify their logic. This makes it possible to establish certain ideas in the pupils’ minds.

With respect to the dirty conditions in the classrooms, the first thing I do when I arrive is to open the broom cupboard, because pupils often drink water out of cartons and throw their
carton into the broom cupboard. So much so that this has virtually become a mosquito farm. So I open this cupboard and air it so that all the mosquitoes come out. The pupils then try to kill them, but I tell them not to, saying: "mosquitoes have the right to French lessons too!". The pupils are not happy with this, but I tell them that they are in no position to complain since they were the ones who bred the mosquitoes. This helps them to understand that what they did was bad, and it is in this relaxed atmosphere that I attempt to communicate values.

So we completed the awareness-raising phase and it was time to move on to the practical phase: but as always, there was a lack of resources. So we approached companies. Since a number of company representatives had attended during the sustainable development week, expressing interest and perhaps pretending to understand, I had the idea of approaching them. I drew up a project and quickly sent it out to a number of companies.

The Environment Ministry expressed their support for my project, but had no resources. The same was true of the Health Ministry, and too of the Togo plastics industry, despite the fact that they were concerned by this because they buy plastic granulate in Brazil when it would be perfectly possible to recycle and process plastic on site. Just one structure agreed to help us, the City of Lome. They were engaged in a funding project from a French cooperative agency and so I was quickly able to latch on to this project.

There was not a huge amount of funding, some 171,000 CFA Francs, and we needed to purchase gloves, facemasks, barrels to carry out the collection, bags and so on. The City asked us to give them invoices, but when you are buying barrels and trying to use second-hand materials, there is no way you’re going to get an invoice. While we were thinking about this problem, during the holidays I was appointed as director of studies in another school. I was having a number of difficulties implementing this project in the school I was working in and I thought that perhaps this new appointment would give me a little bit more leverage.

So I accepted the position and in this new school, I started to put the structure in place. I started by appointing an environment representative in each class. There is then one person in charge of the whole environmental organisation within the establishment. All these people are de facto members of the "Arc-en-ciel" environment club. I also kept up links with my former school so that we could work together.

What we did in the end for the barrels was to buy plastic dustbins, which enabled us to provide invoices. Since this was cheaper, I was able to buy 20 dustbins. There will be 10 for my new school and 10 for my former establishment. In addition, the new administrative head at my former school is a former student colleague of mine who is up to speed on environmental issues, so we will be able to work on these questions together.

To conclude, I have tried to show you the kind of struggle we are involved in in Togo to try and move forward this environmental dynamic at the level of the population and of the authorities. The Minister of Education is favourable and I am counting very much on him to help me to make genuine progress.

Open-floor discussion

Fatimata DIA TOURÉ, IEPF

In the light of these contributions, I would like to make some observations and formulate some recommendations. We can observe that a number of initiatives are being carried out to address the issue of sustainable development at every level. It is clear that education is not restricted solely to the academic world, but that other forms of education are also being taken into account. It is true that the academic environment is helpful in terms of a long-term approach, but the other forms of education should also be taken into account, particularly as regards the involvement of the community.

What is taking place at the level of the network of members of parliament is one form of education, but I would suggest that Oumar Sy advises these Members of Parliament to raise
the awareness of decision-makers as regards the taking into account of education for sustainable development once they themselves have become aware of these issues. They should not restrict what they are doing to their own circle and their own knowledge in this respect: they need to be able to help raise the awareness of the authorities and decision-makers in order for this dimension to be taken into account at every level.

The need for co-operation has been stated and should be emphasised. Indeed, it can be seen that a number of things are being done with a view to this education, but I would have liked to see more co-operation at this level, similar to what is done in France. In France, sweeping measures have been taken at the institutional level and this is what has led, since the start of the Decade, to this national Committee for education for sustainable development. This body brings together all the different initiatives, regulating and monitoring these actions, in order to make it possible to have an overview of everything which is going on with the aim of achieving results.

I would like to see the same thing happening within the Francophone world, so that synergy is created between the various organisations working in this sphere. At the level of the United Nations, many actions are also undertaken but these are often rather dispersed and operate on a project basis, which means that they run for a set period only and a short period at that. The various efforts undertaken should be combined so that we can progress towards the various projects being more structured in order to achieve more results and have a greater impact on the population.

In conclusion, we are in the Francophone world and we have seen that the Francophone world has carried out many initiatives since the beginning of the Decade in 2005 and the Ouagadougou symposium in 2006. A network for education for sustainable development has been set up, as has the Médiaterre portal, which is a very important resource in terms of information and awareness-raising; but I would like to see us go even further than that.

In our conclusions, I would like it to be noted that we need to be able to call on our Governments to make more commitments with regard to this issue and that the CONFEMEN (Education Ministers’ Conference) which is an operator in the Francophone world should also be called on to assume responsibility for supporting the efforts currently being undertaken by various bodies in order for our actions to be more effective.

Corinne VIALLE, FSU, Trade Union Committee

I would like to thank all contributors for sharing their experiences and examples providing insights into this issue. The issue of resources has been raised at a number of levels through the various examples which have been presented, whether it is at the very local level of a group of pupils or at the level of structures close to government. It is clear that the question of resources is essential for such projects to exist, as is the question of communications tools, relationship tools and so on, along with the issues of partnership and the pooling of tools. Médiaterre is an interesting resource in this respect, but it should be borne in mind that the digital divide is a significant reality.

Education for sustainable development involves fighting poverty, something which appears self-evident on the basis of what has been presented. It should also be noted that poverty worldwide impacts women more than the rest of humanity. This is true irrespective of whether you are from the north or the south. Indeed, the studies carried out in Western countries also show that women suffer more from poverty, particularly as regards access to knowledge.

This relates to the fundamental issue of democracy. I was particularly struck by the various presentations which demonstrated that by giving the most underprivileged people a voice, the same issues could be addressed but could as result of this could also be dealt with by people who thereby became stakeholders. This appears essential in terms of education for sustainable development. In this regard, there is much to be gained from our wide varieties of experience.
Furthermore, as regards the Senegal Members of Parliament, I believe that these institutional stakeholders should be representing the populations they have been elected by. How can we make these members of parliament even better stakeholders, properly representing the populations who have appointed them?

This is a fundamental question of democracy and also relates to everything being done by NGOs, trade union organisations and other structures for ESD to be conducted in partnership for the purposes of improving situations and changing behaviours.

This offers us a number of interesting avenues of exploration which will not provide miracle solutions, since these do not exist, but from which approaches can emerge. Resources such as that proposed by Ms LY-TALL are of interest because studies on gender have not gone into enough depth, and we need tools to endeavour to identify approaches, modes of discussion and analysis of the various strategies that we are implementing.

Khady DIOP, Ministry of Education, Senegal

To add to the various contributions, within the Francophone world, we need to make a recommendation about pooling best practices, which would require carrying out an inventory of existing resources as regards ESD.

It would then be necessary to involve communities, which can only be achieved by means of non-formal education. Indeed, people who have not been in school are not in a position to feel concerned by sustainable development as discussed in school.

A participant

With regard to plastics, from what I have understood you are currently collecting them but not reusing them as yet. I would like to inform you that there is currently an initiative in Ndjamenahere collected plastic is being turned into paving stones for streets and pavements. The European Union has also just awarded a major contract, following a request by Ouagadougou city council in partnership with the city of Lyon, so there are things being done to re-use collected plastic.

I did two weeks' worth of training on sustainable development for public works engineers in Cameroon during August. This was continuous training for people aged between 35 and 40, and I would like to let you know that I made huge use of the Médiaterre site. They quickly grasped how to use it and with each person working on a subject of their own choosing, they were able to find all the necessary information.

Otherwise, I have also had discussions with two people from the AUF environment and sustainable development network. Our first conclusion was that we needed to discuss how to strengthen the issue of international solidarity in calls for tender and the work done by this network of researchers. We felt that not enough attention was being devoted to this highly important issue, especially in Western countries where people tend to see sustainable development in environmental terms and not in planetary and socio-economic terms.

A participant

I would like to salute the initiative presented by Oumar Sy, because it is not often that we see members of parliament taking action. I would like to salute these members of parliament as they take action in terms of the environment and sustainable development. I would also like to say that networking is good, but more must be done. Indeed, we know that the foundation for any undertaking on a national or international scale requires a basis in law. I believe that Members of Parliament are the best place to ensure that such a legal basis exists and lends support to this undertaking. This is how we can approach the harmonisation of our efforts with political decision-makers.

Members of Parliament are busy people and we are very much in need of them. In this respect, UNESCO has decided to provide a partnership with Members of Parliament in order to support the achievement of objectives with respect to education for all.

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »

Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
Hega MARTIN, WCS Gabon

For my part, I would like to add that the subject of environmental impact studies has come up and that this is a crucial problem today. There is a plan for a Chinese company to build a dam in the middle of a national park in Gabon. Everything has been halted for now because we have requested an environmental impact study. In general, this study is not carried out despite the cost of the procedures involved. Sometimes, the laws exist but there is a problem at the level of monitoring whether these laws are applied. This is a real problem, which is why we are really keen for the Francophone world to provide us with some encouragement in terms of training because there is a real need of training in this sphere today.

As regards the setting up of national committees, this is a real problem in our nations: it was only last year that a national sustainable development committee was set up in Gabon. This really is a handicap because in spite of our efforts and conventions being signed, it is difficult for us to keep up on the legal level. This is why I salute the setting up of the network of members of parliament: when MPs are well informed and are familiar with the issues, they can accelerate the processes involved in setting up all these national structures.

Oumar SY, UICN Senegal

It is true that Members of Parliament have an important role to play in the adoption of legislation and the adaptation of international treaties and conventions. This solves the problem at this level. In Senegal, there is not a single convention which has not been ratified. The instruments for ratification have been adopted by Parliament.

We are currently carrying out a survey within the regional network to see where things stand in terms of the ratification of conventions and treaties relating to the environment throughout the sub-region, from the Mauritanian coast to Sierra Leone. If we do not harmonise legislation between these various countries with shared natural resources, we might as well do nothing at all. Parliaments therefore have an important role to play in this respect.

With regards to the network of Members of Parliament in Senegal, we have gone still further, because we are currently involved in raising the awareness of populations. Each time Members of Parliament travel to visit a site, it is also a way for them to bring together local populations and raise the latter's awareness with regard to environmental issues.

Another issue has been to consider whether Members of Parliament could petition or carry out lobbying with a view to environmental issues being incorporated into educational systems. When the budget was voted on during the budgetary session, when Parliament heard the Minister for the Environment, there were 70 contributions relating to environmental issues. 43 of these contributions related to issues of communication, awareness-raising and environmental education. This means that today, our Parliament is studying these issues of the environment and sustainable development.

Annie DE WIEST, French-speaking community of Belgium

I would like to speak for a moment in my capacity as a civil servant of the Belgian French-speaking Community with responsibility for sustainable development issues and for the Decade in particular, to emphasise the extent to which we believe that we could support an approach by means of which a request would be made for the issue of education for sustainable development to be placed on the agenda of the CONFEMEN. This could form part of our recommendations.

Otherwise, the issue of the digital divide also continues to be a major concern.

In addition, it is also important for the gender aspect to be taken into account. If anybody is still in doubt as to the relevance of this approach after having heard the contributions and the quality, heart and significance of what has been heard today, that is their loss. We can no longer afford not to incorporate the issue of gender in recommendations. It is important and must be supported and served by research into the methodological tools which need developing.
Claude DALMEIDA, Lome lycée and university

As to the involvement of other stakeholders, during the sustainable development week which was organised in Lome, we invited teachers from all the establishments in the capital. Together, we prepared teaching sheets, so they all have the information, everything else is a question of motivation. Perhaps I need to do a little more to see to what extent we could meet together more often in order to harmonise everything which we are doing.

In terms of experiences with respect to plastic recycling, we only have the experience of Burkina Faso. I had vaguely heard something about the paving stone project, but it would be interesting if we could have some more information about that. Indeed, the streets of Lome are full of potholes even as there is loads of plastic lying around in the sewers preventing water from draining away. I think that we could attract the attention of politicians with this type of plastic recycling.

Monique TRUDEL, Educom environnement, Montréal

I believe that it is important to identify simple tools which enable people to express themselves. In addition, it is also important to create a link between schools and their local communities. We talk a lot about education for sustainable development programmes (in schools, the media, etc) but we forget to make a link with local communities. Literacy is very important in this respect. In the communities where I have been and heard discussions by women, men and young people, they are asking for education.

I visited a literacy class were there were 20 people aged between 7 and 72, and each of them explained why they were going to school. The 72-year-old said that they wanted to learn to read and write so that when they signed something, they knew what they were signing. A stock breeder said that he wanted to be able to complete the government register by writing in the exact number of cows he owned.

It is necessary to develop very simple tools to enable a situation to be assessed, how people are living and what they think, and use this in order to establish sustainable develop strategies.

Conclusions
by Boufeldja BENABDALLAH (OIF/IEPF)
and Michel MONBRUN (Francophone network)

Boufeldja BENABDALLAH, OIF/IEPF

A call has gone out to the Francophone world, and this is all to the good because we are more than happy to speak on your behalf for the actions to be undertaken in the years to come. I have noted a number of issues and you can rest assured that we will be writing all this up properly so that it features in the proceedings of this symposium.

So, I have noted that it is necessary to call on States to contribute in a tangible manner, particularly via the CONFEMEN (Conference of French speaking ministers of education), which could act as a spokesman for the question of education and training for sustainable development.

We have also noted that we need to study how resources can be pooled and that it is vital for the issue of women to be considered in this major dossier. In addition, we should also be implementing projects which give a voice to the most underprivileged. We need to ensure that best practices are pooled and that communities are involved.

Another worthwhile project would be to make an inventory of what already exists in terms of education for sustainable development at the level of the Francophone world. The Méditerranée site is a database into which this information could be incorporated, and we could also envisage this taking place on other websites and in other forums for discussion and debate.
One project which is important to us and which is innovative is the plan to approach the sector of university research as regards increased solidarity. The Francophone University Agency (AUF) will be starting this and I think that the IEPF could support them in this work.

The work begun by Members of Parliament cannot be overlooked, and I would like to salute Oumar Sy for this work. The IEPF has already worked with him and will continue to do so.

I would also like to emphasise that we need to support training. The IEPF offers various types of training and will continue to do so according to your wishes and the priorities of the countries in question. We will not be working in terms of training dictated by our own scheduling, but arrange the scheduling in terms of national requirements. In order to achieve this, we will carry out an inventory of the priorities in this field.

I would like to thank you for your patience, your commitment which is not in doubt, and I think there will be other opportunities for us to get together and present results and initiatives to be carried out together. I would like to remind you that there is now an embryonic Francophone network for education for sustainable development, another piece in the great jigsaw which is so important in terms of successfully ushering in this dynamic of education for sustainable development. We need to be carrying out more actions, without dispersing our efforts, because this is how we will manage to achieve a certain number of things.

Michel MOMBRUN, Francophone network

I will attempt to ensure that we all leave here imbued with hope. After what I have heard this evening, I have to take my hat off to all those who are carrying out actions, sometimes in conditions which are so difficult that it is hard to imagine how they manage to persevere. I would like to offer them my congratulations, respect and admiration.

There are some other things that I have heard which I would like to summarise in a few words.

Firstly, we need to rebuild a culture of peace everywhere. This is the foundation of all modes of development and of sustainable development in particular.

We then need to build a culture of brotherhood, equality, solidarity, respect and love. In fact, we need to devise a culture for the peoples of the 21st century: this is what you are in the process of doing, what we are in the process of doing together. This will necessarily advance, even if it takes time.

In all these things, we often get the impression that work has already been going on for so long. Is it ever going to produce results? Will this particularly difficult period enable us to see something emerge so that at last we can discern the success of this mode of development amid solidarity and fulfilment in which relationships and humanity will be at the heart of the concerns of all human activity?

We are living in very difficult times, particularly just at the moment, but I also believe these are amazing times. They are amazing because everything is up for invention, the world needs to recover its sense of enchantment, people need to be able to take pride in their localities once again, and human relations themselves need to be re-established. These relations do indeed need to be re-established; we are in the process of reinventing cultures and we already have the basis of doing so.

We should be able to leave content, imbued with hope, because this type of hope always overcomes. I would like to conclude with this example:

During the Second World War, there were those who risked their lives every day in the Resistance. Among their number were those who set about reinventing the world of freedom and democracy which would need rebuilding. I had the privilege of knowing one of them who was a young man at the time. His name was Bénigno CACERES, the son of a Spanish émigré who, having emigrated to France, joined the Resistance against the Nazis.
A carpenter, he fought alongside teachers, lawyers, doctors and steelworkers, all of whom were ready to risk their lives for freedom and the opportunity to rebuild democracy. During that period, at a time when they were risking their lives on a daily basis, they invented the popular education movements.

What are we doing today in education for sustainable development? We are undertaking the popular education of the 21st century, not only in the name of freedom, but also to enable the human race to be able to survive in the future. The struggle for freedom remains, as does the struggle for democracy, but over and above these, it is quite simply the existence of the human race which is at stake.

Let us be inspired by our forebears who had the wisdom to resist and risk their lives so that ultimately, freedom and democracy would overcome! I am not asking each of you to risk your lives today, but to take the risk of joint commitment: this is the ground on which we stand and where the struggles and involvement in which we are all engaged are most fundamentally meaningful.

***************
"Working together on Education for Sustainable Development"

Final Recommendations

In the lead-up to the UN Decade's mid-term and during the French presidency of the EU, the Bordeaux event will bring together French and foreign specialists in Education for Sustainable Development, both in order to review the progress made during the 2005-2008 period and to define the strategies to be implemented for the 2009-2014 period.

More specifically, the work of this conference will serve to highlight the following points:

- A national and international review of France's performance in terms of education on sustainable development over the period 2005-2008 and the outlook for the period 2009-2014, corresponding to the second half of the 2005-2014 Decade;
- Placing teachers within an educational continuum which involves other stakeholders, institutional and otherwise, who contribute to a common, socially-oriented project concerning sustainable development;
- The need for regional coordination for the implementation of an ESD policy that addresses the actual needs of inhabitants;
- The progress made and the prospects for the UN Decade of ESD in EU member countries;
- ESD in various French-speaking partner countries;
- The role of various media in the implementation of a responsible approach to ESD;
- The Euro-Mediterranean basin as prime area for the implementation of a policy of ESD;
- Providing education in responsible consumption and production to move everyone towards a more sustainable lifestyle;
- Teaching resources to support Education for Sustainable Development.

This conference enabled those involved in ESD, whether they belong to State organisations or regional authorities or are part of the make-up of the public or private sector, to undertake a critical review of the progress made since the launch of the Decade and to suggest recommendations for the second phase, and therefore contribute to making this Decade one of the major influences encouraging our societies to adopt lifestyles more respectful of our planet.

Session 1:
Progress made and outlook for the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development in the European Union

Rapporteur: Christine Affolter (Environmental School Initiatives-ENSI)

The aim of this session, which brought together representatives from most European countries, was to assess the progress made in the 27 EU Member States since the beginning of the Decade in 2005 and make proposals for the second half of the decade, 2009-2014.

Analysis of the different forms of progress made and reference to the report from the European conference in Belgrade (October 2007) led to four issues common to all EU countries:
- analysis of institutional ESD systems and the role of schools in society;
- a systemic approach to programmes developed in school-based education;
- needs in terms of professional education regarding ESD fields;
- informal education and the social challenge of educational systems for the decade.

On the basis of this analysis, a number of proposals were made in order to incorporate formal education, more particularly school-based education, within a broader approach involving the population as a whole and emphasising a comprehensive social approach.

- ESD should not consist of a standardised, normative, “turnkey” approach, but rather draw its inspiration from the various national and local contexts. Conceptual formalisations such as national ESD strategies are important, but not sufficient. Networking at the local, national, international level forms a fundamental tool for ESD.

- A global and integrated approach to ESD in school environments calls for the presentation of strategies and guidelines to teachers, with clearly defined objectives, processes and assessment tools. The fields of study should be extended to include nature, real life and social discussion. ESD in school environments also requires structural support, which involves forward planning: the time allocated to managing the project needs to allow time for planning, a teachers’ meeting, classroom work and time for discussion.

- The fundamental pedagogy needs to appeal to the motivation of those involved, implement appropriate methods and identify specific topics. It is also important for the teacher to work as part of a team so that practices can be improved collegially.

- Apprehending the social learning approach to sustainable development requires more time and resources than traditional top-down teaching methods. The benefits of social learning must be clearly explained to teachers in order for them to see this type of learning as providing genuine added value for ESD.

- Lastly, it is important to present all the various training bodies encountered at different stages of life as being suitable instruments for stimulating social learning. In this respect, the Decade of ESD is an excellent platform for highlighting the importance and value of this type of education, alongside other initiatives within formal education.

**Session 2:**

**Positioning teachers within an educational continuum alongside other stakeholders contributing to a social sustainable development project.**

*Rapporteur: Renée-Paule Blochet (Académie de Grenoble, MEN)*

The observation that the existing educational continuum is structured around differing educational spaces and target audiences formed the basis for identifying four proposals designed to improve how teachers are positioned:

- First and foremost, state education should **train its teachers in project-based pedagogy** and extend ESD to all types of school population;

- Secondly, the **creation of forums and opportunities for consultation** (in the shape of discussion platforms, for instance) between various partners is recommended, with such initiatives being formalised where possible - for instance by means of partnership agreements and contracts - in order to:
  - get to know one another better and establish a common culture;
  - agree on the issues and objectives;
  - agree on who the recognized stakeholders and/or participants are;
  - establish joint actions on the basis of guidelines drawn up on a consultative basis.
• The teaching body should also strengthen its links with the University world; research by the latter should enable it to be of assistance in supplying current, validated data and training in order to facilitate implementation of the scientific approaches to be adopted.

• Lastly, the educational continuum should seek to develop forums for sustainable development-related actions beyond state education to reach audiences other than school populations, particularly senior citizens.

**Session 3:**
ESD in the French-speaking world
Rapporteur: Hega Martin (NGO WCS, Gabon)

Experts from 23 French-speaking nations called for solidarity and cooperation with a view to fighting poverty and exclusion. The examples presented are intended to encourage solidarity and cooperation in terms of education, training and information.

• Calling on governments, via CONFEMEN (the Conference of Francophone State Education Ministers), to ascribe greater importance to ESD and organise a meeting on this topic in 2009.

• Strengthening modes of governance and partnerships between local stakeholders, notably by involving grassroots communities, first and foremost women.

• Developing teaching practices by means of new programmes, listing and pooling available teaching resources.

• Identifying and promoting local skills, which constitute a very rich heritage of popular expertise, and establishing projects which give a voice to the poor.

• Creating an inventory of research projects relating to ESD and implementing a database listing these projects and best practices; establishing simple criteria for assessing ESD actions.

• Developing projects which aim to strengthen solidarity, particularly with the support of academics and recognized experts within the AUF and the OIF/IEPF, through the setting up of the Francophone Education for Sustainable Development Network.

• Supporting and relaying initiatives developed by French-speaking members of parliament from Southern nations.

• Increasing the number of training projects for sustainable development aimed at grassroots communities (formal and informal training).

• Using all forms of image to serve the cause of ESD.

• Taking into account Human Rights and the Rights of the Child and promoting the value of belonging to a specific culture and locality.

• Accelerating the setting up of national ESD Committees in each country.

**Session 4:**
The role of the media in educating and informing about Sustainable Development
Rapporteur: Jacqueline Denis-Lempereur (Journalist, Committee for the Decade)

The media must play a key role in raising public awareness and promoting adoption of new behaviours relating to sustainable development. A certain number of initiatives aimed at both operators and audiences are essential for this role to be fulfilled:

• The media must be credible and serve as an example by committing to a genuine sustainable development policy.

• The media must broadcast simple, clear and scientifically verified messages, since all media,
especially the Internet, serve both as databases and as forums for dialogue and exchanging information, but suffer from a lack of information classification which makes it difficult to differentiate press releases and advertising from articles with genuine scientific content.

- Programmes dealing with Sustainable Development have seen a considerable rise in their ratings, but care needs to be taken that such programmes are not restricted solely to environmental issues but also discuss other aspects, particularly social, society-related and cultural aspects.

- The subjects dealt with by the media must be clearly defined and content should be a source of information and discussion, rather than being sermonising or guilt-inducing.

- The media need to enter into dialogue with their audiences in order for information to become more participatory in nature, as in the example of the creation of a responsible radio station conveying positive messages intended for children and young people.

- Training journalists and media professionals with respect to the issues of SD should form part of the common-core training given in journalism schools, alongside more traditional disciplines. All media companies should encourage their staff to receive training and/or improve their knowledge of this topic throughout their careers, so that they keep in step with changes in the world around us.

- Journalists generally come from literary or economic backgrounds and thus require additional scientific training in order to deal with major topics such as climate issues, energy resources and biodiversity.

- Decision-makers (editors-in-chief, media bosses, etc) need to be aware of the issues and also need to attend training sessions on the subject of sustainable development.

The setting up of a regulatory body - a press council - was envisaged, similar to what already exists in several places, such as Quebec, Switzerland and the United Kingdom.

Session 5: Teaching resources for ESD: review of current resources and new schemes

Rapporteur: Patrick Le Provost (CNDP/Scéren/MEN)

"Resources" should be understood in a broad sense since it also includes the schemes themselves. The same goes for "teaching", since this extends to areas other than school education.

There is a highly diverse - and even disparate - range of existing resources, since they are geared to a variety of audiences. In spite of this diversity, several key aspects are widely sought-after:

- the need for resources based on high-quality scientific information, especially for topics which are open to debate;
- addressing what appears to be a relative lack of resources for pupils in secondary education, compared to the plethora of productions aimed at primary-school children
- harmonising resource assessment and validation criteria at the European level: many partnership projects are currently being developed internationally, but some project sponsors have been troubled by the discovery that criteria differ from one country to another,
- promoting the exchange of best practices and resources both locally and internationally in order to improve information about existing measures.

On the basis of these observations, the workshop defined four key words and related recommendations:
**Audiences:** Adjusting resources to the target audience: From the outset, resources must be designed in terms of their intended use (informing the general public, educating pupils, training decision-makers, etc)

**Partnerships:** Improving potential synergies between various partners by taking into account the specific expectations and requirements of each sector.

**Exchanges:** Facilitating access to resources and best practices both globally and locally (bearing in mind that Internet access is not available absolutely everywhere).

**Approaches:** Including resources in a global approach which incorporates understanding of the issues and encourages genuine appropriation of the relevant knowledge and practices.

Resources for ESD should fulfil two requirements: they cannot simply be ‘ready-to-eat’, and must be of genuine assistance in dealing with complex issues.

---

**Session 6:**
France and ESD: stakeholder review for the first part of the Decade and proposals for the second part

*Rapporteur: Olivier Classiot (Des Enjeux et des Hommes)*

Representatives from government, local authorities, businesses and civil society carried out a stakeholder review and put forward joint perspectives for the second half of the Decade.

Four major topics emerged from this review:

- **Consistency** with respect to the timing of ESD initiatives and the various levels of local government;
- **Assessment:** measuring the contribution of educational and training initiatives, and defining indicators enabling effective oversight of this type of initiative;
- **Mobilisation** to define ESD competencies and for training in-house and external relays;
- the Sharing - Dialogue – Partnership approach, i.e. promoting the sharing of best practices in terms of ESD

Two proposals emerged with respect to the themes of "Coherence" and "Assessment":

- **Extending ESD consultation platforms to include the regional level and linking them with CESRs** (French regional economic and social councils); these would thus acquire competency in terms of ESD. This type of platform at the local level is particularly relevant because it is multi-stakeholder in nature (Government, Education Authorities, local authorities, associations, unions and businesses), which should enable a common strategy for education for sustainable development to be established and implemented in each locality.

- **Implementing a means of assessing ESD initiatives**, with the systematic inclusion of upstream assessment of educational projects and a return loop for target audiences, making use of existing European criteria and based on guidelines and indicators which are appropriate for ESD, in order to measure the quality and effectiveness of initiatives and policy efficiency - the principal difficulty being that of assessing ESD's "added value" (the issue of measuring the social benefit of a given educational initiative).

As to "Mobilisation", two proposals have been put forward:

- **Creating a set of ESD reference skills** to include both the knowledge required in all three aspects of ESD and the related skills (adult teaching methods, teaching abilities, etc). This reference document should be designed for use by all stakeholders (businesses, local authorities, education, etc).
• Implementing a trainer training programme to professionalise ESD; this programme should be based on accreditation (reference document), accessible to all (via initial or ongoing training or Personal Training Leave) so as to maintain expertise over time, and should incorporate the notion of work experience validation.

Lastly, there were also two proposals relating to the "Sharing-Dialogue-Partnerships" aspect:

• Promoting multi-stakeholder networks and resources to encourage the exchange of best practices, with an emphasis on research tools (engines) rather than the creation of individual databases.

• Formalising a partnership charter between the various stakeholders involved in ESD initiatives allowing for local specifics detailing the respective competencies, commitments and roles, and including details of coordination and monitoring on the basis of shared values (Charter of Ethics).

**Session 7:**
Implementation of ESD by the Aquitaine regional authorities
Rapporteur: Julie Chabaud (Director of Agenda 21, Gironde Council)

The session presented achievements and experiences related to Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in the Aquitaine region and identify strategies for local government coordination of ESD for all audiences and all ages.

1. Local government coordination to raise awareness and inform all types of individual

Given the multiplicity of information, stakeholders and concepts, better explanation of institutional initiatives to the public is called for, bringing into play a variety of approaches:

• **Raising awareness of and training local government technicians and elected officials** in ESD and improving cross-functionality both within and between organs of local government.

• **Clarifying the initiatives undertaken through the use of simple, clear and understandable language.** Drawing on the strengths of generalised, concrete approaches (such as Agenda 21) as well as targeted initiatives (waste management, water-saving, etc) and assessing the progress made.

• **Promoting implementation of participatory approaches** for a greater impact on the public as part of an overall partnership-based approach with appropriate media connections.

• **Overcoming** political and economic short-termism and encouraging long-term approaches to facilitate better appropriation of Sustainable Development.

2. Local government coordination for school-based Agenda 21 initiatives

Recommendations aimed to improve local government coordination and school-based ESD:

• **Setting up a national reference framework** as a basis for local Charters and concerted, coordinated multi-stakeholder initiatives.

• Implementing **local governance of ESD**, discussion and dialogue platforms, and trust-based environments in which stakeholders can meet,

• **Prior, collective identification** of the specific competencies required and allocation of the various tasks to be accomplished to stakeholders according to their attributions and resources.
• **Mobilising elected officials** in order for these approaches to be implemented and become long-term so that training with respect to Sustainable Development becomes available to **all individuals of every age**

### 3. Local government coordination workshops to cultivate the link between culture and sustainable development

The link between culture and sustainable development is not self-evident, despite the fact that culture contributes to sustainable development in terms of solidarity (culture accessible to all, aid granted to cultural stakeholders, development of volunteer activities), social cohesion and wealth creation.

Local government coordination should facilitate the organisation of cultural events relating to Sustainable Development:

- **Stakeholder training and awareness-raising** by means of common, recognized schemes, encouraging the circulation of information right down to the local level.

- **Drawing strength from existing theme-based networks** responsible for the organisation of sports and cultural events.

- **Pooling of skills, employment and volunteer resources** and the development of new competencies and positions, such as that of "Sustainable Development Manager".

- **Assisting local authorities** and encouraging interconnectedness to achieve greater cooperation between departments responsible for culture, sport, SD and so on.

### Session 8:
Education for Sustainable Development in the Euro-Mediterranean basin

*Rapporteur: Philippe Pypaert (UNESCO/BRESCE)*

This session brought together all the stakeholders from around the Mediterranean basin and was an opportunity to emphasise the fact that the area is a perfect example of the many contradictions and tensions facing the world today. It is also an area with a strong regional identity which is set to become an especially favourable place for drawing together different peoples and fostering tolerance and solidarity, and thus for implementing sustainable development approaches through education, training and information.

The legal instruments are already in place (the Barcelona Convention, the Mediterranean Sustainable Development Strategy (MSDS), the Marrakesh Process, etc) and the UNEP Mediterranean Action Plan (MAP) is helping these to be implemented (national sustainable development strategies, expansion of integrated management capabilities for coastal regions with a view to sustainable development, awareness-raising).

Political willpower needs to be expressed in concrete terms through practical initiatives. In this regard, the Union for the Mediterranean ought to lend its support to the commitment by governments and accelerate implantation of these processes, bringing together stakeholders from the nations in question on the basis of practical initiatives.

At the end of the session, the following recommendations were submitted:

- Incorporating Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in the agenda of the Union for the Mediterranean – instruments to fund exchanges (e.g.: Tempus-Meda) and to support networking initiatives.

- A priority of all ESD initiatives should be to **draw individuals and promote solidarity**, with special attention paid to the needs of the least privileged.
• **Stakeholder networks** working to satisfy the basic needs of these individuals through education which aims to enable these stakeholders to become autonomous must be supported.

• UNESCO suggests that **well-established networks** such as the MAB programme's Biosphere Reserves and World Heritage site networks should be better promoted in order to implement ESD based on localities and the links between mankind, nature and culture.

• **Popular expertise and traditional skills should be promoted** (management of land, water, agriculture, food, etc) since they can serve to draw different peoples closer together and encourage individual participation in joint projects.

• The **Network of Mediterranean Universities for Sustainable Development must be encouraged and supported** in its role as a change incubator, via Sustainable Development, for education systems (training trainers) and as a means of implementing national Sustainable Development strategies in the various countries around the Mediterranean.

### Session 9:
**Education for sustainable consumption and lifestyles**
*Rapporteur: Fabienne Pierre (UNEP France)*

The development of Education for Sustainable Consumption (ESC) is a fundamental necessity in formal, non-formal and informal education and forms an integral part of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD):

• Founding ESC (education for sustainable consumption and lifestyles) on values which also underpin ESD: training responsible citizens and consumers so that they are aware of their fundamental rights and freedoms and informed enough to be able to take part in public debate and take conscientious decisions in markets.

• Improving the integration of ESC into sustainable development strategies and procedures both internationally, nationally and regionally.

• Creating awareness among the public and private decision-makers with a resulting shift towards responsible investment in sustainable models of consumption and production.

• Involving competent government ministries, particularly those responsible for finance and the economy, by supplying financial aid for ESC practices and research.

• Providing educators with the means with which to act (infrastructures, frameworks, resources, etc), enabling them to place students at the centre of the learning process.

• Ensuring that training institutions incorporate the priorities accorded to sustainable development into their day-to-day management.

• Incorporating ESC-related topics into school curricula to encourage critical thinking throughout the educational process.

• Incorporating ESC into commercial and industrial training, particularly through the use of terminology relating to sustainable, responsible consumption.

• Strengthening the role of ESC in training regarding teaching methods.

• Sharing resources and best practices concerning ESC assessment and developing quality indicators.
• Strengthening the cooperation of local multi-stakeholders involved in ESC, such as the cooperation between NGOs and educators, and promoting cultural diversity and traditional skills.

• Providing access to educational resources by setting up teacher/learner exchange networks.
Appendix 1

French companies and ESD: 2005-2008 assessment and proposals for 2009-2014
by Olivier CLASSIOT
"Des Enjeux et des Hommes"

In France, 2007 was a pivotal year in terms of awareness of the need for the issues of Sustainable Development to be taken into account in the mode of operation of our society.

The combined actions of political stakeholders and the private sector (cf. Nicolas Hulot in the 2007 French presidential election and Al Gore with his film "An Inconvenient Truth") have enabled citizens to acquire an initial level of understanding of the issues of sustainable development. However, it should be borne in mind that although 3/4 of French people had heard of Sustainable Development by the end of 2007 (40% more than in 2005), only 1/3 of them could give a precise definition of this concept.

Businesses have also contributed to this development. While the first signs of commitment at the start of the new millennium tended to be the result of a commitment by a boss or a sense of civic responsibility, today many businesses have grasped that taking into account Sustainable Development issues has a direct impact on their activity and their relationship with their environment in the broadest sense of the term (natural, human, social, etc). They have gradually adjusted their approach to ESD in-house and today, they are seeking to introduce Sustainable Development into business lines in highly operational, practical ways.

This shift in ambitions has led them to have recourse to more sophisticated measures (so, for instance, training actions now outnumber actions devoted solely to awareness-raising with the communication of information) and to implement change management measures which call on the active participation of their workforces. Such measures are affecting an increasing number of staff, to varying degrees depending on their specific line of work.

The aim of companies is to create in-house processes to maintain the education of their staff. They are also beginning to pay more attention to the extent to which these issues are dealt with in initial training, particularly in common-core subjects (as opposed to specialist training in sustainable development which only involves a minority of students).

They are reviewing their internal training programmes in partnership with their in-house universities and external stakeholders (schools, training institutes, etc).

They are calling on specialised partners to provide training for their internal experts (purchasers, marketers, etc) and managers. Lastly, they are endeavouring to put together training courses which allow for interaction with a number of types of stakeholder (local authorities, NGOs, etc).

While these awareness/training initiatives are directed at an internal audience, it can also be noted that companies are broadening the field of their actions and that they are now addressing their business partners, customers and suppliers, sometimes even their competitors. Eco-design initiatives are a good example of this: they relate to the whole of a company's internal chain (R&D, marketing, industry, shipping, packaging, etc) and also to strategic suppliers and key customers.

To support company actions of this kind, a large number of networks are active (Orée, Comité21), setting up workgroups aimed at facilitating discussion and the exchange of best practices.
2005-2008: Education of internal populations via awareness-raising and training

- Education extending beyond the environment to take into account other aspects of Sustainable Development

Between 2005 and 2007, many companies implemented awareness-raising actions for their staff with respect to sustainable development issues, and a number of key aspects can be noted in the development of such actions.

**Topics covered:** initially relating basically to the environment, as a result of the ramp-up of environmental certification and the implementation of environmental management systems, topics have progressively expanded to include social and societal topics.

**However,** awareness-raising actions providing an integrated approach to all three aspects of sustainable development are still the exception not the rule.

**Target audience:** initially aimed at experts and staff with a particular concern (HSE profiles, buyers, etc), they are now being extended to address all staff.

These awareness-raising actions are also a way of creating transversality and of people from different business lines and different levels in the company meeting together.

**However,** most of the time these relate to one-off actions linked to external events such as sustainable development week, mobility week, fair trade fortnight and any other event related to sustainable development.

**Leverage involved:** they are no longer limited to top-down actions involving internal communication (internal newsletters, intranet, leaflets, lectures, drama, etc) but to seek to involve staff in a more active manner (interactive exhibitions, films followed by debates, workgroups, creative sessions with idea feedback, role-play, etc).

**However,** the information relating to sustainable development still tends to be fairly remote from the company's core business. During this period, staff education has remained at the level of current affairs rather than taking its place in managerial practices.

This trend can also be observed in the way initiatives have been managed and the position of those responsible for sustainable development initiatives in companies: at the turn of the millennium, initiatives were often undertaken by the Communications Department or by a Department of Sustainable Development reporting to the Communications Department: they are increasingly being overseen by tripartite committees: Sustainable Development, Communications and Human Resources.

To provide support for their actions, maintain these over time and continue to raise the awareness of teams amidst frequent high staff turnover, people responsible in-house have had to create networks of sustainable development officers.

At the same time, on rare occasions, transverse internal workgroups are set up (sometimes linked with external partners, experts, etc) with responsibility for carrying out feasibility studies or for overseeing the roll-out of a particular initiative.

In some companies, Sustainable Development Managers have even become members of the Board of Directors or answer directly to one of its members.

This change corresponds to the increasing awareness of the strategic dimension of sustainable development by companies (image management is one of the central motivations of sustainable development departments), with a change in the models and a strengthening of the strategic role of CSR.
Examples of awareness-raising actions

➤ Crédit Agricole SA (2005 and 2006): virtual exhibition on the issues of sustainable development for the banking sector set up online on the intranet, including the responses by the Bank, aimed at all staff in the holding company, federation and some of the regional branches.

➤ ABN AMRO (2006): organised the screening of Al Gore’s film "An Inconvenient Truth" followed by a debate, for staff at head office.

➤ Orange: Eco-gestures campaign

➤ Renault: Global Compact awareness campaign for purchasers

➤ La Poste: training in responsible driving and Eco-gestures campaigns

➤ L’Oréal: diversity awareness campaign

➤ PPR: Ethics awareness campaign tied in with the dissemination of the code of conduct

The first actions mobilising teams

Several companies served as pioneers, mobilising their teams over and above "responsible citizen" awareness at a very early stage. Very often, these companies work in a sector which had come under a lot of pressure (energy, automotive, chemicals, etc) or one which was central to sustainable development issues on the solutions side (public transport, environmental services, etc).

The initiatives undertaken are different from those listed above in that they expressly seek to disseminate in-house at CSR policy to staff, root sustainable development in the culture and alter professional practices and the behaviours of teams.

To achieve this change, the companies in question used a wide variety of leverage: training modules, giving responsibility to in-house contact people, interactive teaching tools, etc. Some of them went so far as to establish "bottom-up" participatory approaches in which staff were asked to come up with ideas and feed back best practices.

Examples of mobilisation actions

➤ Veolia Transport (2007): Created a CD-rom on the subject of sustainable mobility used with customers by sales staff and agency managers to discuss issues relating to sustainable development and the business in question with local authority customers and show VT’s responses.

➤ EDF (2002/2003-2005): awareness meetings for staff with respect to climate issues, the French energy mix and EDF policy (Agenda 21) relating to Commitment 14 undertaken by senior management to provide staff with information and training to help them and discuss the environment with their customers (this scheme involved using 1000 internal contact individuals).

➤ Lyonnaise des eaux (2005/2006): training/awareness scheme in each of its 31 centres to establish its commitment (cf 12-point charter) in sustainable development and call on staff (bottom-up approach) to formalise local sustainable development action plans

➤ Moët et Chandon (2006): Oxygène training module (1 day for each employee) involving the use of some 30 internal contact staff. This reached all 1100 employees and led to a participatory brainstorming approach (in the first year, over 950 ideas were collected, analysed and implemented)

➤ Adecco: temporary employment agency teams were mobilised with respect to anti-discrimination issues and practices (role-plays and testing) and training was carried out for sales staff to interact with customers with respect to these sensitive issues.
As of 2007, the leaders had incorporated the notion of sustainable development into their strategic vision and made their sustainable development commitments an element of their corporate culture.

While 2007 marked a turning point in collective awareness, leading companies had already decided to incorporate sustainable development into their strategies well before this date. This position engendered the creation of management and performance measurement tools which required dedicated schemes for training and change management to be set up.

These far-reaching measures have resulted in regular information and awareness-raising for staff with respect to the commitments, actions and results of their organisation in terms of sustainable development: sustainable development has thus become part of the day-to-day life of employees.

**Examples of strategic vision**
- **Danone** and the Danone / Grameen Bank + Danone Communities project
- **Rhodia** and the Rhodia Way initiative
- **ST Micro**

**The initial signs of application in training and management tools and implementation of leverage for change to become firmly established**

In order to rise to the challenge of long-term change, some companies have gone as far as to adjust managers' training to equip them for this question, which requires new knowledge and skills. Other populations have also had to appropriate sustainable development rapidly, in order to be able to function as internal relay personnel. This is particularly the case for sustainable development contact people, whose initial profiles vary from one organisation to another (HSC, HR, Communications, volunteer staff, etc).

**Examples of training**
- **Caisse d’épargne**: Training of managers and project officers: "Bénéfices futurs"
- **La Poste** (Mail Department) and training for internal consultants reporting to the Quality and Research Department
- **Bouygues**: training sustainable development officers in change management
- **Accor**: training Hotel Managers by means of the hotel operators’ best practices Guide

Once training action has been carried out, regular actions are implemented to maintain the dynamic over time. These often involve the organisation of internal competitions.

**Examples of competitions**
- **EDF** (SD Trophies and bonuses)
- **Dexia** SD Innovation Awards
- **Accor** with the Earth Guest programme

**2005-2007: Education of external groups**

**Historic involvement in issues relating to society at large**

Sponsorship has long been a way for companies to promote their image at the same time as they participate in citizen education. These actions, mainly involving stakeholders in civic society (campaigns organised by public stakeholders, NGOs, etc) formerly addressed major social concerns (the environment in the broadest sense, waste, climate, water, AIDS and
road safety). In this first approach, the role of companies was first and foremost one of providing resources (funding and sometimes technical skills) to support a project.

Some adopted a "riskier" approach, for instance by launching the debate on plastic bags at checkouts. Lastly, a small number linked their products to a specific cause by earmarking some of their sales income for a charity (charity-linked products).

Most of these actions are aimed at the general public or even targets which do not have a direct economic relationship with the company (for instance, primary school children). However, some actions aim to raise awareness or engage in dialogue with indirect stakeholders: future employees, potential clients, specifiers, etc.

Examples of awareness campaigns

- **Monoprix** and its "Penguin" campaign
- **Axa and Véolia** road safety campaigns
- **CFAO** in AIDS prevention in local communities in West Africa
- **Total** (in partnership with universities): organisation of symposiums on ethics for faculty; organisation of a summer school on the topic of sustainable development.

However, throughout the period between 2005 and 2007, an increasing desire to focus on the core business and involve internal stakeholders can be noted. This trend is particularly due to a desire on the part of companies to be credible with respect to the fields in which they have decided to raise awareness. For instance, a power company will no longer talk in terms of the environment in the broader sense but rather of the impact of energy-related choices and routine gestures on climate change and the management of natural resources.

Increasingly, employees are expected to get behind the projects being supported. Similarly, company foundations have refocused their sphere of intervention on topics which are closer to their core business and identity, as has been the case for instance with the **Lully Foundation** (Schneider Electric).

- The educational message which was formerly associated with the corporate entity is now focused on the product/service which provides leverage for commitment on the part of the user

Some "militant" companies constructed their identity and their offer and thus their relationships with the outside world on the basis of a commitment to SD. This option enabled them to set up a privileged dialogue and relationship with their customers by inviting them to "vote with their wallets" and create a community spirit together.

Examples

- **Ideo** in textiles
- **Alter Eco** in food products
- **Body Shop** in cosmetics

In more recent times, one major trend has been a pressure on the part of company stakeholders for the company to make its sustainable development commitments part of its own DNA. Product and service offers are now expected to embody this approach, and customers, users, end users and so on are becoming the key target of educational initiatives. Pioneer initiatives were undertaken during 2007 to assist consumers to make "the right decision" on the basis of new resources (labels, product labelling incorporating sustainable development performance).
Examples of initiatives

- **Casino** for labelling of mass retail products
- **Caisse d’Épargne** for labelling of financial products
- **Voyages-sncf.com** for its eco-comparison tool (showing the environmental impact depending on the choice of vehicle)

Review as of mid 2008

A turning point in 2008: 2008 has been characterised by an unprecedented economic and environmental context which has created new conditions for inciting companies to be involved in sustainable development in a highly practical manner (the price of crude oil, tensions on commodities markets, undeniable signs of the first effects of climate change, etc).

- The pressing need to associate clients/users in the approach in order to make sustainable development a competitive advantage.

In order to be able to continue investing and progressing in sustainable development initiatives, companies need to educate consumers and be chosen by the latter when they make purchasing decisions. To make their educational messages appear objective, they are therefore seeking to create internal labels involving objective stakeholders who will add credibility to their undertakings.

Examples of labels

- **Philips** and its internal label to raise public awareness of energy savings
- **Lapeyre** and the FSC label for exotic wood essences
- **Findus** raising customer awareness of sustainable fishing using the MSC label

- The opportunity to make suppliers into partners.

Faced with a tougher economic climate threatening profitability or even the survival of companies, the latter have sought new means of improving their performance. More than ever before, suppliers have become precious allies in the search for sources of innovation. This has led several companies to implement awareness and mobilisation campaigns vis-à-vis their suppliers, building "strategic" partnerships with them.

Examples of awareness and mobilisation campaigns

- **ADP**: mobilisation campaign directed at all suppliers on Greater Paris sites
- **Redcats**: joint actions with printers and transport companies to reduce the environmental impact of catalogues.
- **L’Oréal**: diversity awareness campaign directed at suppliers
• An approach via innovation: a new horizon in terms of mobilising teams

To respond to these new challenges, companies have also turned to their employees, calling on the latter’s creativity to devise innovations which incorporate the notion of sustainable development (be they technical, structural, partner-based, etc).

This has also led them to bring together groups which had previously remained distinct in order to take up the challenge of a fundamental change in procedures and a shift in internal culture which requires the involvement of every link in the internal chain.

**Examples of innovation**

- **Accor**: creativity module on the "hotel of the future"
- **Areva T&D**: “SD Focus” project to create initiatives incorporating the three pillars of sustainable development on each of its sites
- **Clarins**: Training in eco-design (marketing staff, R&D, etc)

**Recommendations for 2009-2014**

- A genuinely integrated approach to all three aspects of sustainable development related to companies’ core businesses.
- Major integration into professional practices, reflected in management tools and processes
- An innovation-based approach with the involvement of diversified teams: inter-job and inter-company (competitors, suppliers, etc)
- A global approach initiated by employees but also designed to incorporate external populations
- Recognition, in internal awareness campaigns, of the societal actions supported by the company (for instance, via an NGO partnership, with the implementation of skills sponsorship initiatives).

*************************
Appendix 2

Thematic workshop on Education for Sustainable Consumption
Background paper

by Dr. Fabienne Pierre,
Sustainable consumption consultant at UNEP Division of Technology, Industry and Economics

Under the high patronage of UNESCO responsible for the implementation of the 2005-2014 United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (DESD) and in the context of the French presidency of the European Union, France will hold in Bordeaux, in October 2008, a conference gathering the French, European, Mediterranean and Francophone actors on themes relating to education, training, information and awareness raising in the field of environment and sustainable development.

The International Bordeaux Conference is meant to help identify the outcomes of the DESD at mid-term as well as its objectives for the next five years (2009 – 2014) and therefore to contribute as preparation for the "World Conference on Education for Sustainable Development – Moving into the Second Half of the UN Decade" to be held in Bonn, Germany, from 31 March to 2 April 2009.

In this framework, the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) has accepted to pilot a thematic workshop on Education for Sustainable Consumption (ESC) in cooperation with the Marrakech Task Force on Education for Sustainable Consumption, chaired by Italy, acting within the Marrakech Process.

The objective of this workshop is to fully integrate ESC into the discussions and contribute to the conference’s final recommendations by assessing the progress made and identifying the priority objectives for the next five years of the UN DESD. It will address the following questions:

• The integration of ESC in national strategies on sustainable development within the framework of the United Nations Decade on Education for Sustainable Development.

• The implementation of the recommendations for ESC (policy makers, educational institutions and actors) resulting from the joint work of the Marrakech Task Force on ESC, the Hedmark University College and UNEP, presented in Here and Now (attached in the background document).

• ESC and cooperation, more specifically from a Euro-Mediterranean perspective.

Here and Now: Education for Sustainable Consumption. Recommendations and Guidelines

Here and Now has been jointly developed by the Marrakech Task Force on ESC, the Hedmark University College and UNEP in order to help fulfill the recommendations of the Johannesburg Plan of Implementation with regards the elaboration of a 10-year Framework of Programmes for Sustainable Consumption and Production (Marrakech Process). It has

30 The International Bordeaux Conference follows up with a previous International Conference on Education for Sustainable Development held in 2006.

31 The Marrakech Process on Sustainable Consumption and Production (SCP) is a global multistakeholder process to promote SCP and to elaborate a 10-Year Framework of Programmes to support regional and national implementation of SCP. The Marrakech Task Force on Education for Sustainable Consumption was launched during the 14th Session of the UN Commission on SD (CSD14 - New York, May 2006) as a tangible contribution of Italy to the Marrakech Process. http://www.unep.fr/scp/marrakech/taskforces/education.htm
notably been drafted in close collaboration with the ConsumerCitizenship Network (CCN), an interdisciplinary network of educators, researchers and civil society organizations representing 136 institutions in 37 countries that was created in 2003 to work on education for sustainable consumption and global solidarity.\(^{32}\)

Aimed at policy makers, educational institutions and actors, _Here and Now_ mostly focuses on formal education. It contains three documents (I-Addressing the challenges; II-Optimizing opportunities; III-Relevant resources), with the objective of providing these actors with an instrument for policy-making and integration of ESC into education and sustainable development strategies. These guidelines are also aimed at providing educators and trainers with pedagogical information and tools.

2 - Objectives of this background document

This document aims at providing the workshop participating experts with background information and recent facts on Education for Sustainable Consumption as related to the discussion themes to be developed. It is aimed at summarizing the main progress made in the field of ESC internationally as well as the main remaining issues with regards national strategies (formal education, professional training, awareness-raising, multi-stakeholder cooperation and evaluation) and cooperation in the context of the Euro-Mediterranean region.

This background information will set the context for specific questions to be discussed by the workshop participants, these specific questions being highlighted and framed in this document under “Workshop discussion”. For each of these specific questions, “proposals” have been developed to serve as guiding ideas for discussions and debate on the recommendations the workshop should lead to on ESC.

Contents

1. The key elements of the debate: consumption and citizenship
2. ESC within National Sustainable Development Strategies
   2.1. Education for Sustainable Consumption: rethinking formal education
      2.1.1. Developing education and research policies for sustainable consumption
      a) Adapting school programmes and curricula
      b) Fostering research on ESC
      2.1.2. Providing teachers with the right means through initial and continued training
      2.1.3. Building supportive educational institutions
      2.1.4. Developing appropriate pedagogical approaches and tools
      a) Pedagogical guidelines for ESC
      b) Cooperation between teachers and pedagogical staff
      c) Methodological approaches
   2.2. Education for Sustainable Consumption within professional training
   2.3. ESC through Awareness-Raising
   2.4. Multi-Stakeholder Cooperation for ESC
   2.5. Evaluating ESC
3. ESC and cooperation in the Euro-Mediterranean region
   3.1. Challenges and opportunities for a Euro-Mediterranean cooperation
      3.1.1. The Mediterranean Action Plan (MAP), the Barcelona Convention and the Mediterranean Strategy for Sustainable Development (MSSD
      3.1.2. The Euro-Mediterranean Partnership and the Union for the Mediterranean
   3.2. ESC, national and regional Strategies
   3.3. Existing initiatives on ESC in the Mediterranean region
   3.4. Pilot projects and development agencies
4. Resources

---

\(^{32}\) For further information see: [http://www.hihm.no/concit/](http://www.hihm.no/concit/)
1. THE KEY ELEMENTS OF THE DEBATE: CONSUMPTION AND CITIZENSHIP

The workshop does not aim at discussing definitions that have already been developed by many experts at the international level. This introduction is therefore aimed at presenting the generic notions that constitute the key elements of the debate but does not entail specific questions of discussion for the workshop itself.

**Education**, defined in the broadest sense here, refers to both the teaching and learning of knowledge and behaviours, social, moral and intellectual skills that contribute to the development and socialization of human beings. UNESCO focuses on five types of fundamental learning: learning to know, learning to do, learning to be, learning to live together, and learning to transform oneself and society. In addition, education does not only entail actions integrated to formal education but also refers to professional training and lifelong learning as well as to information and sensitization of citizens.

**Consumption**, which entails all actions that imply selecting, buying, using, caring and disposing of goods and services, is also considered as profoundly constitutive of contemporary lifestyles, representations, attitudes and behaviours. Mass consumption is now a key component of economic and social life as well as a core value in an increasing number of societies worldwide. Media and advertisements portraying materialistic lifestyles and promoting consumerism values have an influence on attitudes and consumption patterns globally (American children spend between 4 and 5 hours watching television every day and, according to the Consumers Union (USA), they watch 30 000 advertising spots within a year). In this context, and given its social and environmental impacts today, consumption should be considered not only through its economic dimension but also through its ethical and political dimensions. Indeed, consumption can be seen as deeply connected to the core values of citizenship, which goes beyond nationality and refers to individual's rights and responsibilities within his/her community of life and values. Consumption is connected to both rights and responsibilities: it is about individual and collective security, about providing means to enhance quality of life and sometimes express one’s individuality, about being provided with clear and transparent information to make deliberate consumption choices. But just as citizens’ responsibilities goes beyond voting, consumption is also something through which we can show responsible towards and in solidarity with others and our communities, especially when the choices we make have an impact on their lives.

**Sustainable consumption** is based on this idea and aims at three complementary objectives: a rational utilization of natural resources necessary to human life, an equitable economic and social development, a better quality of life for all. For the Consumer Citizenship Network, it implies the emergence of “consumer citizens”, i.e. individuals making choices based on ethical, social, economic and ecological considerations. In UNESCO’s definition, it integrates a range of social, economic and political practices not only at the individual and household levels but also at the community, business and government levels. As highlighted in *Here and Now*, sustainable consumption consequently refers to a new social and cultural paradigm resulting from the necessity to rethink definitions of human needs and desires: principles of moderation and sufficiency become means of curbing social, economic and environmental imbalances and of stimulating responsible citizenship, while the oneness of humanity and the right of all to have their basic needs met remain fully recognized. Worldwide but especially in developing countries, individuals are increasingly facing the consequences of unsustainable patterns of consumption and production. Therefore, both developed and developing countries, whose natural and social environments are even more at stake, are concerned with sustainable

---

consumption. In such a context of globalization and interdependence, sustainable consumption becomes a major expression of global citizenship.

**Education for Sustainable Consumption (ESC)** is therefore essential to train responsible citizens and consumers: individuals need to be aware of their fundamental rights and freedoms, appropriately informed to participate actively in the public debate, oriented towards a rational participation in the markets. Hence, ESC has become a core component of education for sustainable development and global citizenship: “Citizens need training in how to define issues; gather, handle and apply relevant information; consult; plan courses of action; make choices; analyze and assess the consequences of their actions, and reflect upon the effect they have made locally, nationally and in a global context. This is particularly true in their roles of consumer.”

ESC can be seen as an integrated approach partly based on the merging of sustainable development and consumer education. Consumer education policies at the national level generally aim at individual empowerment (consumer rights, household budgeting, and critical thinking skills) but can also be aimed at promoting public interest. However, the promotion of public interest through consumer education generally focuses on social and environmental rather than on political dimensions of consumerism. ESC, as a crosscutting issue, could go further to combine all those aspects and become a new educational paradigm to raise education levels without creating an ever-growing demand for resources and consumer goods, to foster responsible individual and collective choices towards the environment and society.

In this perspective, *Here and Now* defines ESC as follows: “Education for sustainable consumption consists of the acquisition of knowledge, attitudes and skills necessary for functioning in today's society. It is responsibility learning which aims to contribute to the individual's ability to manage his own life while also participating in the stewardship of the global society's collective life.” The objective is to empower people so that they are able to responsibly manage their social and environmental impacts, but also to participate in and stimulate the public debate about values, quality of life, responsibility and accountability.

2. ESC within National Sustainable Development Strategies

2.1. Education for Sustainable Consumption: rethinking formal education

Despite increased awareness of the human impact on the environment and a greater focus on the consequences of individual lifestyle choices, sustainable consumption is still not always seen as a central topic in educational systems today and is not identified as a priority in national education policies. In fact, many aspects of sustainable consumption are already taught in schools, but ESC often remains sporadic or hardly visible due to a lack of cohesiveness and innovation.

Yet, meeting the challenge of sustainable consumption will demand an appropriate reorientation of formal education, both in terms of institutions and curricula. Including ESC into national sustainable development strategies is an opportunity to do so at different levels: development of education policies from primary schools to high schools, adaptation of teacher training, promotion of sustainable education institutions, creation of pedagogical approaches and tools based on constant interaction between educators and other ESC actors, especially at the local level.

---

2.1.1. Developing education and research policies for sustainable consumption

The recent OECD review\textsuperscript{36} of national consumer education policies demonstrates that central governments often play the leading role in promoting formal consumer education. At the regional and local levels, authorities also carry out these ESC policies in their areas and when consumer education is fully decentralised, cooperation with local consumer and citizen groups is reinforced. However, in most of the countries surveyed by the OECD, consumption is included as a non-compulsory topic in primary and secondary schools and is rarely addressed in higher education. As to education for sustainable development (ESD), it can be progressively integrated into education policies. In France for example, a first three-year plan for ESD was initiated in 2004 and a second one in 2007 in order to adapt primary and secondary schools curricula, institutions as well as teacher training at the national level. UNESCO has recommended turning ESD into a mandatory educational component: “If sustainability is mandated, it is far easier to reorient the curriculum to address it than if incorporating ESD into the curriculum is optional”\textsuperscript{37}.

What about education for sustainable consumption?

a) Adapting school programmes and curricula

• A national initiative

ESC first needs to be given the coherence and consistency it currently lacks in national education policies at the primary and secondary levels. As stated in \textit{Here and Now}, this implies “\textit{including themes, topics, modules, courses and degrees about education for sustainable consumption in established curriculum\textsuperscript{38}}”. The full integration and recognition of ESC into school programmes can be achieved through obligatory courses: according to \textit{Here and Now} guidelines, a minimum of one hour a week each year and for all grades (either part of existing classes or as interdisciplinary themes and projects) should be required. Centralizing ESC policy-making and implementation, at the national level, could be done through further development and reorientation of \textit{consumer education} when this field has already been integrated into school programmes and curricula. In Norway, sustainable consumption has been well integrated in the new school curriculum\textsuperscript{39} through collaboration between the ministry of education, the ministry of children and consumer affairs and the ministry of environment. Norway has given through this an example of how political will and collaboration between competent public authorities can create the context for ESC.

Similarly in Mexico, consumer education is approached through its social and ethical goals defined as the recognition of the universal value of consumer rights and awareness of issues such as sustainable consumption, food and health or mass media. The Consumer Protection Federal Agency (Profeco) of Mexico, which is present nationwide, is mandated by the Federal Consumer Protection Law to prepare and carry out consumer education programmes in partnership with other governments agencies. As such, it has worked with the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources to develop educational materials on sustainable consumption.

\textsuperscript{36} OECD, Directorate for Science, Technology and Industry, Committee on Consumer Policy, \textit{Consumer Education}, background document for the OECD CCP Joint Conf. on Consumer Education, Oct. 2008

\textsuperscript{37} UNESCO, \textit{Guidelines and Recommendations for Reorienting Teacher Education to Address Sustainability, Education for Sustainable Development in Action}, Technical Paper N°2, Education Sector, October 2005, p.37


\textsuperscript{39} OECD, Directorate for Science, Technology and Industry, Committee on Consumer Policy, \textit{Consumer Education}, draft report and background document for the OECD CCP Joint Conference on Consumer Education, October 2008
• **Inter-disciplinarity: a key dimension of ESC**

ESC deals with all aspects of everyday life and therefore needs to be addressed, through programmes and curricula, in a holistic and interdisciplinary way. This stands as strongly different from consumer education or environmental education, which are of course closely related to education for sustainable consumption but also often covered in specific disciplines: consumer education is usually treated under domestic sciences or home economics, environmental education is more easily integrated in natural sciences. When consumer education is traditionally focused on individual life management (purchasing, budget issues) and environmental education on nature preservation, sustainable consumption has to be approached as a crosscutting issue encapsulating lifestyles as a whole (attitudes, relation to nature and to the others, responsibility towards one’s community, behaviors as an economic actor, etc.).

• **Implementation options**

Taking into account this interdisciplininary dimension, *Here and Now* suggests several ESC implementation options to be adopted by education policies: 1) mainstreaming ESC as part of existing subjects/disciplines; 2) teaching ESC as a cross-cutting interdisciplinary theme and/or incorporated into projects and other activities as well as in schools clubs and after school activities; 3) integrating ESC as a specific subject.

In any case, ESC addresses topics as diverse as life quality and lifestyles, resources, economics, consumption and the environment, consumer rights and responsibilities, media literacy, health and safety or global issues (environment, poverty, human rights, etc.).

• **ESC learning outcomes and skills**

ESC can be associated with common learning outcomes and targeted skills. The Earth Charter provides a broad definition of ESC related competencies, highlighting their ethical and political dimensions such as the ability to adopt patterns of consumption which safeguard human rights, community well-being and the regenerative capacities of the earth. *Here and Now* goes further into details when describing ESC related skills and distinguishes basic learning outcomes from generic learning outcomes. Basic learning outcomes cover critical awareness, ecological and social responsibility, action and involvement, global solidarity. In terms of knowledge, ESC basic learning outcomes refer to major topics such as understanding of economic and social systems in a globalised world as well as of what links consumption and territories at the local level, understanding of consumer and citizen rights, or ability to deal with media and information. On the other hand, generic competencies refer to moral and pragmatic qualities such as appreciation of nature and human diversity, concern for justice, peace and cooperation, ability to make critical and reflected decisions or to apply knowledge in practice, creativity and capacity to adapt oneself to new situations. Above the crosscutting and inter-disciplinary nature of ESC, those skills should also be reactive to social changes as well as relevant to various contexts, taking into account local and cultural diversity. In addition, these skills are associated with ESC in whatever context (formal, life-long education or awareness-raising) of implementation.

b) **Fostering research on ESC**

Comprehensive research is essential to strengthen the foundation for what is taught in ESC. It is meant to provide data on consumption patterns and their various impacts, as well as on how different cultures accept or reject changes. Research can examine a diversity of

---


41 The Earth Charter is a declaration of fundamental principles aiming at building a just, sustainable, and peaceful global society for the 21st century. It has been formally endorsed by more than 2,500 organizations in the world, including UNESCO. For more information, see: [http://www.earthcharter.org/](http://www.earthcharter.org/)
approaches to sustainable consumption based on different social, economic, geographic and cultural conditions. Didactic questions are also important: how can we teach sustainable consumption? How can we select topics and facts? What are the pedagogical approaches relevant to diverse cultural contexts?

At the international and European levels, the Consumer Citizenship Network42, the International Federation of Home Economics Teachers43, the Children’s Identity and Citizenship in Europe Network44 and SCORE (the Sustainable Consumption Research Exchange Network)45 are the main groups involved in research focused on ESC. International organizations and programmes can also conduct specific international surveys on consumption patterns related to sustainability: for example, the OECD is currently conducting a quantitative research on environmental household’s consumption in 10 countries which results will be published around March 200946. UNEP DTIE, working with actors and networks already involved in research on ESC, is equally developing a qualitative survey on sustainable lifestyles among young adults worldwide in order to identify cultural perceptions and understanding of sustainability including from a consumption point of view. Initiatives have been taken at the national level as well. In the UK, the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) has established a programme of research on sustainable consumption (individuals and businesses)47. Universities and researchers are involved in inter-disciplinary projects focused on sustainable consumption, such as in RESOLVE (University of Surrey, UK), a project funded by the Economic and Social Research Council and aimed at understanding behaviours and practices of energy consumers48.

2.1.2. Providing teachers with the right means through initial and continued training

Developing teacher-training policies, programs, tools and information systems on ESC is essential to integrating ESC into educational institutions and curricula as a crosscutting issue.

As stated by UNESCO: “One of the great challenges of Education for Sustainable Development is to have student teachers understand the interrelatedness of the environment, society and economy and have this interrelatedness be evident in their teaching and their lives as community members. (...) Addressing ESD will require student teachers to think about their profession from a different perspective and learn skills that perhaps, teachers in previous eras did not learn or use49.”

This is particularly true for ESC: one of the main conditions for educational curricula and pedagogical tools on ESC to be efficiently developed and implemented is for teachers and trainers to understand its relevance in education patterns as well as in their own disciplines. They first need to be told what is at stake and what is the difficulty – bringing sustainability into young people’s core values, translating abstract and complex issues into individuals’ daily life - but also to be given well adapted tools to develop lesson plans.

Reorienting teacher education therefore stands as a strong recommendation in Here and

42 Consumer Citizenship Network: http://www.hihm.no/concit/
43 International Federation of Home Economics: http://www.ifhe.org/about.html
44 Children’s Identity and Citizenship in Europe Network: http://cice.londonmet.ac.uk/
45 SCORE: http://www.score-network.org
46 This OECD (Environment Directorate) project aims at better understanding household environmental behaviour in order to improve policies in five key areas: residential energy use, water consumption, transport, organic food, and waste generation and recycling. For more information on this subject, see: http://www.oecd.org/department/0,3355,en_2649_33713_1_1_1_1_1,00.html
47 For more information see: http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/business/scp/research/index.htm
48 RESOLVE: http://www.surrey.ac.uk/resolve/
49 UNESCO, Guidelines and Recommendations for Reorienting Teacher Education to Address Sustainability, Education for Sustainable Development in Action, Technical Paper N°2, Education Sector, October 2005. p. 43
Now: “Facilitate teaching and teacher-training which strengthens global, future-oriented, constructive perspectives within education for sustainable consumption”.

A number of initiatives have been taken at the national level, illustrating that teacher training related to sustainability and more specifically to ESC seems to be more often provided and taken on a voluntary basis by teachers already involved in classroom activities, through long term training systems or events. In Portugal for instance, the Consumer Directorate-General, in co-operation with the Ministry of Education and consumer organizations, provides internal and external training programmes for teachers involved in specific areas related to consumer education, including sustainable consumption. This initiative has led to the development of a Guide to Consumer Education to help teachers implement consumer-related topics in school curriculum from a citizenship and sustainability perspective. Local actors can also participate in teacher training on ESC: in France, the Center of Pedagogical Documentation and the Environment Agency of Val-de-Marne have organized workshops on education for sustainable development in 2007 to provide voluntary teachers and education actors with resources and concrete projects on responsible behaviours. Of course, universities and institutions responsible for delivering professional education programmes are directly concerned. The Rhodes University Environmental Education and Sustainability Unit has set up a teacher professional development course “Schools and Sustainability” aimed at strengthening participation of local teachers and pupils in curriculum-centered environmental learning and change processes. This course also encourages teachers to reflect on their changing practice over a period of time, while trying out new ideas.

At the international level, important reports and tools on teacher education and training have been developed. They provide guidelines for integrating ESC into both teachers’ initial and continuing training. The Consumer Citizenship Network has developed some Guidelines for Consumer Citizenship Education (vol.1) available online, prepared for teachers in higher education in general and teacher trainers in particular. The UNESCO Guidelines and Recommendations for Reorienting Teacher Education to Address Sustainability is also an important source of inspiration for making ESC an integral part of teacher training. Along with the existing national and local initiatives, they show how interdisciplinary coursework on sustainable consumption and materials can be provided to help current and future teachers understand better their mandated curriculum and identify topics or themes related to sustainable consumption. They mainly recommend building courses with local actors such as NGOs, institutions, clubs, religious organizations as well as with government agencies, businesses, etc. to teach about local sustainable consumption issues and solutions. This allows participants to translate directly sustainability into their local reality, to build and strengthen local or regional networks by sharing ideas, experiences and materials. Partnerships between teacher-education institutions and elementary and secondary schools, and other educational organizations (e.g. museums, outdoor education sites and nature centers) can also be efficient tools to integrate ESC into teacher training, initially and in the long run.

2.1.3. Building supportive educational institutions

ESC policies without relevant infrastructures and means at the institutional level are unlikely to be implemented efficiently. This is why integrating ESC into campus management is one of the objectives of School Agenda 21 in the framework of the Local Agenda 21 process.

52 UNESCO, Guidelines and Recommendations for Reorienting Teacher Education to Address Sustainability, Education for Sustainable Development in Action, Technical Paper N°2, Education Sector, October 2005, p. 46
53 See: http://www.hihm.no/eway/custom/ccn_otr/introduction.htm
Teachers and students need their educational institutions to adapt their own management systems to recognize sustainable consumption as a legitimate issue and to understand the actions it refers to.

For educational institutions, adapting management systems takes effect through sustainable procurement, equipment, building management, public administration and services, or participation of staff and students in school events on sustainable consumption. Important and successful initiatives aiming at integrating ESC into educational institutions have been successfully developed at the international, national and local level such as:

- International projects and competitions: the Eco-Schools international award programme, initiated by the Government in England in 2006 (Department for Children, Schools and Families), aims at mainstreaming sustainability issues and practices into everyday school life. The programme provides guidelines for school to address a variety of environmental themes, ranging from litter and waste to healthy living and biodiversity. 40 countries are currently involved in Eco-Schools (more than 40,000 schools) from the UK to South Africa 54.

- Regional partnerships: in Africa, MESA (Mainstreaming Environment and Sustainability into African Universities), led by UNEP and its partners, is supporting a partnership programme to mainstream environment and sustainability concerns in African universities. It addresses community engagement and campus management but also teaching and research 55. The non-governmental sector can also be involved, as shown by the Ideas Bank in Norway, a private foundation that is coordinating an educational project for sustainable consumption, in co-operation with Eco-net of Denmark and Ekocentrum of Sweden (15 high schools have signed up the project so far) 56.

- Pilot projects: at the national level, pilot projects offer a good opportunity to illustrate how sustainable campuses can be managed. The Taiwan Sustainable Campus Program (TSCP), launched in 2002, provides funds renovation and has created a platform for first-hand teaching and learning experiences at the National Taiwan Normal University (NTNU). An old administration building of the College of Sciences and the surrounding school garden have been converted into a Sustainable Campus, which has been visited by about 1400 students and teachers since April 2005 57.

- Reorientation of regulatory frameworks: in France, public procurement standards integrate sustainability since 2006 through the new code for public markets that reinforces the possibility for public buyers to favour sustainability criteria 58. Ensuring that educational institutions reflect the priority given to sustainable consumption in their daily management is one of the important recommendations of Here and Now, which echoes with the UNESCO guidelines on reorienting teacher education.

2.1.4. Developing appropriate pedagogical approaches and tools

ESC relies on the ongoing and coherent development of pedagogical approaches and tools. But ESC faces several challenges, tackled by those who develop and disseminate resources and tools. Here and Now identifies three main obstacles to ESC: at the conceptual, didactic and socio-cultural levels. The concept of sustainable consumption itself is perceived as difficult to translate into people’s daily reality; didactic resources available are fragmented, sometimes based on outdated scientific data or models not adapted to real life and students’ experience; and students tend to express disillusionment, passivity and a sense of powerlessness that makes it difficult to create the motivation for them to be actors of change.

54 For more information, see: http://www.eco-schools.org.uk/
55 For more information see: http://www.unep.org/Training/features/mesa.asp
57 Development in Action, Technical Paper N°2, Education Sector, October 2005, p.44
a) Pedagogical guidelines for ESC

Numerous resources have been developed at the international, regional and national levels, all tools for setting up projects and lesson plans on ESC at school and outside the classroom. They could be adapted to different contexts and disseminated through educational networks and platforms.

- At the international level, *Here and Now* provides a number of methodological recommendations for sustainable consumption teaching and learning. The Resources section of *Here and Now* contains a comprehensive list of existing tools developed in the field of ESC. *Teaching and Learning for a Sustainable Future*, a multimedia teacher education programme (25 modules) published by UNESCO, addresses sustainable consumption as a cross-curricula issue. The *Education for Sustainable Development Toolkit*, also published by UNESCO, contains general guidance and tested exercises that can be used in ESC as well. The *UNEP/UNESCO YouthXchange programme* has produced a toolkit with a guidebook for teachers to help them raise awareness on sustainable consumption. This guide has been translated into 19 languages and has been adapted to national and local contexts by YXC partner countries (e.g. Mexico, United Arab Emirates, Japan, etc.). UNEP/UNESCO youthXchange is a contribution of the two agencies to the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development and is their flagship project on educating for sustainable consumption.

- At the European level, *ChangeLab* is a European initiative (UK and other EC countries) through which a research on pedagogical approaches to SCP has been done. The *European Diary initiative* offers an interdisciplinary and thematic approach to numerous topics including ESC. This Diary describes the social, economic and environmental consequences of young people’s actions. The annual diaries and their accompanying teacher guidelines have been adapted, translated and used in 19 European countries since 2004.

- At the national level, examples of educational institutions and actors developing tools and channels of communication for setting up teaching plans on ESC can be found. In Portugal, a “Guide on Consumer Education” has been developed to help teachers in their activities on consumption from a citizenship and sustainable development perspective. In France, two document centers provide teaching resources on consumer education (Pedagoteca of the National Consumer Institute and the National Centre for Pedagogical Documentation) and the *EduSCOL* pedagogical website, developed by the Ministry of National Education, provides resources and examples on how to integrate sustainable development issues into school curricula. An increasing number of countries have taken the initiative to translate, adapt and implement the *UNEP/UNESCO YouthXchange Training Kit on Sustainable Consumption* at the national level: the guide is currently being translated and adapted by Germany, Argentina (with an additional section focused on Buenos Aires), Ecuador, the UK, the Philippines and Israel. Finalized translations include France, Spain (including Catalan), Italy, Norway, Belgium, Slovenia, Hungary, Greece, Peru, Colombia, Mexico, China, Japan, Korea and the United Arab Emirates.

b) Cooperation between teachers and pedagogical staff

Establishing a common understanding of ESC among teaching and pedagogical staff in

---

59 To access the online version: http://www.unesco.org/education/tlsf/
61 For more information on YouthXchange: http://www.youthxchange.net/fr/main/home.asp
general facilitates interdisciplinary cooperation and makes mainstreaming ESC in established subjects easier. Hence, comparative and interdisciplinary approaches should be encouraged to go beyond traditional frontiers between hard sciences and social sciences and towards the development of more efficient pedagogical methodologies and tools. Cooperation between teachers and pedagogical staff on ESC also contributes to reinforce the school’s commitment towards sustainable consumption. Enhancing cooperation between professionals from diverse disciplines in order to develop integrated approaches to education for sustainable consumption counts among the strong recommendations of Here and Now in terms of ESC implementation⁶⁴.

### c) Methodological approaches

Given the holistic and inter-disciplinary nature of ESC, various methodological approaches are promoted:

- Those methods are mainly based on **participation and reality-based exercises**. They include dialogue and discussions, seminars, tutorials and future workshops, case studies and field trips to bring experiences into the classroom, project planning, role-playing, drama and games, etc. Hence, students’ active learning is at the core of ESC pedagogical approaches. Specific school projects can be developed in this perspective, such as in India through the **Gobar Times Green Schools Programme** (GTGSP), which involves the survey of schools’ environmental practices by their own students.

- The use of **media, information and communication technology**, the Internet and online resources, is also an important component of ESC implementation. This is particularly true with regards to media literacy. In this field, specific networks and tools are being developed in which ESC could easily be integrated such as: The **Media awareness Network**, which is one of the world’s most comprehensive collections of media education and Internet literacy resources. Developed by a Canadian non-profit organization since 1996, it promotes media and Internet education by producing online programs and resources, series of lessons related to media literacy and consumerism⁶⁵; **MediaSmart**, a media literacy programme aimed at children and implemented in Canada, Sweden and the United Kingdom among other countries⁶⁶; **The European Charter for Media Literacy**, which aims at fostering greater clarity and wider consensus in Europe on media literacy and media education through the development of a voluntary network of media educators in Europe⁶⁷.

- Fostering cooperation between education institutions and local stakeholders is an important component of ESC pedagogy and implementation. The overall objective is to structure education around young people’s everyday lives and interests. Therefore, local environments and cultures need to be taken into account when the objective is to integrate the culture of sustainable consumption into people’s habits and attitudes. In addition, teaching and learning tools for ESC benefit from a better understanding of local territories as countries have greater geographic, cultural and economic diversity that a singular national curriculum cannot address properly. For example, researchers at the University of Bath (UK), who led the project on “**Listening to Children - Environmental Perspective and the Schools Curriculum**”, in partnership with teachers, 11 to 12 years old students and community representatives, have demonstrated that young people are more attracted to curricula addressing directly their community issues. In this framework, non-formal education tools or activities complement more traditional approaches, such as theme days, school competitions and contests, after school activities, discussions for parents, etc.

---


⁶⁵ For more information, see: [http://www.media-awareness.ca/](http://www.media-awareness.ca/)

⁶⁶ See: [www.mediasmart.org.uk](http://www.mediasmart.org.uk)

- A local and multi-stakeholder approach also allows developing a sense of citizenship among students towards their environment. This can lead to linking of ESC and community service, offering opportunities for the practical application of theoretical study. For example, a manual on how to conceptualize, structure and facilitate the participation of young people in the community development process, Creating Better Cities with Children and Youth, has been field-tested through the work of UNESCO’s Growing Up in Cities project68. In Portugal the school project “Fair Trade Clubs” contributes to educate school children on sustainable development. In the city of Macaé (Rio de Janeiro, Brazil), the Eco-citizen Programme, which was developed to face the problems caused by oil production and chaotic urban growth (garbage, tree felling, pollution, settlement patterns, lack of water, etc.), has contributed to the improvement of the local environment’s sanitation and wastes.

Workshop discussion
How can ESC be efficiently integrated into educational institutions and curricula (schools and universities) as a crosscutting issue?

Proposal
ESC needs to be given the coherence and consistency it currently lacks in national education policies at the primary and secondary levels, which implies “including themes, topics, modules, courses and degrees about education for sustainable consumption in established curriculum” (Here and Now recommendation) at the national level.

This can be achieved through obligatory courses with, for instance, a minimum of one hour a week each year and for all grades. Focusing on ESC integration into official programmes at the national level also impacts teacher training policies which will adapt accordingly.

2.2. Education for Sustainable Consumption within professional training

ESC is a life-long process and is not restricted to formal or non-formal education aimed at children and young people. In many cases, sustainable consumption could be considered a key topic in professional trainings, starting with university programmes. Sustainable consumption patterns are about to become core components of contemporary life from an economic, social and environmental point of view. In this context, young adults, whatever their training and career plans are, should be trained on sustainable consumption both as citizens and as professionals. Hence, universities are a driving force of change towards sustainability: while training young adults to enter the labour market, one of their main objectives is to offer high quality teaching in line with trends that orient the future towards sustainable development. Additionally, universities are frequently involved in continuing education, another important field of ESC implementation through which professional practices can be reoriented.

Sustainable development is progressively becoming an important issue for universities worldwide. For example, the association of University Leaders for a Sustainable Future supports sustainability as a critical focus of teaching, research, operations and outreach at colleges and universities worldwide. It also serves as the Secretariat for signatories of the Talloires Declaration, a ten-point action plan committing institutions to sustainability and environmental literacy in teaching and practice that was signed by over 350 university presidents and chancellors in more than 40 countries 69. At many levels (national, regional, interregional), partnerships between several universities can also be built to encourage the greening of campuses and curricula: hence, the ACES network (acronym for Curriculum Greening of Higher Education) has been coordinated by the University of Girona in Spain.

68 For more information, see: http://www.unesco.org/most/guic/guicbcci.htm
69 For more information see: www.ulsf.org

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
since 2000 with five European and six Latin-American universities ⁷⁰.

• **Highlights: ESC and media literacy**

In the framework of citizenship and media literacy, information management (digital and media, advertising and persuasion, labelling) is also among the important themes covered by sustainable consumption. With other key elements, media literacy stands as a crucial pillar of ESC, a necessary condition for informed and responsible behaviours. Education has a role to play in protecting individuals and giving them the means to keep making free and informed choices. In the framework of education for sustainable consumption, media literacy is therefore needed for people to be able to understand, analyze and evaluate the overwhelming amount of messages they receive everyday.

Receiving or seeking information, being able to evaluate it, to question dissemination devices are all media literacy-related skills that provide individuals with the critical competencies necessary to exercise their freedom, the adoption of responsible behaviors and their participation in sustainable development: "The present situation indicates the need for the further development of analytical, reflective thinking skills in order to decode the extensive and aggressive commercial messages to which individuals around the world are constantly exposed.”

- However, ESC is still rarely represented in university programmes. It can still be taught as a specific topic in the framework of highly specialized degrees, in marketing for example or in international politics and economics: at Mahidol University in Bangkok (Thailand), courses about Consumer Rights and Human Rights have been held as part of the International Studies programme ⁷¹.

- Beyond these sporadic cases, a real integration of ESC in higher education can be achieved through policies at the government or at the university level, fostering the development of **interdisciplinary courses** on sustainable consumption, likely to be used to fulfil degree requirements across disciplinary departments.

- Degrees on sustainable consumption could also be put in place: for example, a call for proposals was launched by the European Commission in February 2007 to develop a **European master’s course in consumer affairs**, which should start in September 2008 ⁷². At the regional as well as at the national level, it would be crucial to integrate the principles and objectives of ESC in such initiatives.

- Sustainable consumption issues and challenges are also particularly legitimate and relevant in the framework of professional trainings in fields such as marketing, communications and advertising. Students in the advertising and marketing sectors have to be prepared for the growing challenge of consumers no longer satisfied with opportunistic claims and green washing. In this context, a growing number of educators and professionals in these fields are conscious of the rising importance of sustainability but effective tools are needed to help them respond to sustainable consumption issues and demand. In this context, UNEP DTIE has produced a CD-ROM - **Sustainability Communications- A Toolkit for Marketing and Advertising Courses**, in partnership with the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development and the International Association of Universities. This CD-ROM is aimed at higher education professors training tomorrow’s marketing, advertising and communication

---


⁷² For more information see: http://ec.europa.eu/consumers/empowerment/cons_education_en.htm#master
managers as well as students interested in these issues. It provides a synthesis of theoretical and methodological knowledge as well as pedagogical resources (e.g. case studies, exercises, resource documents). It can also be useful for professional associations, marketing, advertising and communication experts, as well as for educators. ESC can be integrated into many other specific fields of study such as tourism. At the international level, "Sowing the Seeds of Change: an Environmental and Sustainable Tourism Teaching Pack for the Hospitality Industry" (SSC), developed by UNEP, introduces environmental and sustainable tourism issues into the hospitality curricula.

In any case, developing ESC within degrees, programmes and courses could be done in partnership with public actors involved in career services, NGOs, consumers associations, companies and business associations (such as Chambers of Commerce). Their role in implementing ESC still needs to be further defined and illustrated through specific projects.

**Workshop discussion**

How can we encourage the development of ESC within professional training (trade, marketing, communications, advertising, etc.)? What are the roles of universities, public actors involved in career services, NGOs, consumers associations and businesses in this process?

**Proposal**

At the university level, interdisciplinary courses on sustainable consumption should be developed but this topic should primarily become compulsory in specific disciplines and curricula closely interlinked with consumption issues such as marketing, advertising and communications in general. In terms of continuing training, public actors involved in career services should be able to recommend trade, marketing and advertising professionals with specific training programmes on sustainable consumption.

More professional degrees on sustainable consumption should be developed at the international, European and national levels.

### 2.3. ESC through Awareness-Raising

For society to evolve towards sustainable consumption and production patterns, communication and public information as well as awareness-raising initiatives are necessary. Those actions, campaigns and initiatives participate in building new values and in motivating the adoption of new behaviours. Along with formal, non-formal education and professional training, communication and awareness-raising are crucial components of ESC in a perspective of life-long learning. Informing, sensitizing, influencing citizen’s perceptions and behaviours, supporting public policies are all objectives encapsulated in ESC understood here as awareness-raising. Communication campaigns on sustainable consumption, at the international, national and local levels, led by public institutions as well as by NGOs and businesses, have been multiplying to inform, sensitize, influence citizens’ perceptions and behaviours and support public policies.

- At the level of intergovernmental organizations, UNEP’s Division for Technology, Industry and Economics has been developing communication campaigns and tools on sustainable consumption for several years: a Resource Kit on Sustainable Consumption & Production, composed of 12 fact sheets (advertising, eco-design, energies, food, housing, leisure, lifestyles, mobility, New Information and Communication Technologies, textiles,

---

73 The CD-Rom is available online: [http://www.unep.fr/shared/publications/cdrom/DTIx0886xPA/](http://www.unep.fr/shared/publications/cdrom/DTIx0886xPA/)

74 More information on UNEP DTIE website at [http://www.unep.fr/scp/education/materials.htm](http://www.unep.fr/scp/education/materials.htm)
tourism and water), which aim at providing background information on selected themes by analyzing the environmental and/or social impacts of related activities and featuring examples of good practices around the world; more recently, the TV-spot *Eco- tips for jeans* that explains in a humorous way how to fight against climate change by adopting good practices during the use phase of a pair of jeans.75.

- **Public institutions**, at the level of ministries, specialized agencies or local authorities also have an important role to play in raising awareness on sustainable consumption among citizens. They also involve various stakeholders from civil society and the private sector in their campaigns. In **France**, the national environmental agency ADEME (Agence de l’Environnement et de la Maîtrise de l’Energie) has run several national campaigns (recently on energy savings and on waste management) and provides online information on eco-consumption. In France, the French ministry of Ecology and Sustainable Development also promotes the « Eco-gestes » (Environmental Actions) on its general public web page. In **Spain**, the Spanish Ministry of the Environment organizes « Hogares verdes » (Green Households) programme. In **Sweden**, "Think twice! – an action plan for sustainable household consumption" is a four-year program developed by the Swedish Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Consumer Affairs to sensitize individual households to sustainable consumption. The communications and education campaign addresses Swedish citizens on their food, housing and transportation habits. In **Italy**, at the local level, the “Town with another Economy” (Città dell’altra economia) in **Rome** stands for a significant example of an initiative taken by local authorities in partnership with other local stakeholders. Since 2006, a part of the city is dedicated to the development and promotion of "Another Economy" with exhibitions and various events. In **Venice**, the initiative “Cambieresti?”, led by the City of Venice and developed with numerous partners, aimed at involving citizens in a wide “social game” to reduce and reorient consumption through communicative strategies and information.

- Among the main communicators on sustainable consumption, **NGOs** are particularly active. **ChangeLab** website (mentioned above) provides, through a large project database, a lot of examples / case studies on sustainable consumption. As an example, **ECODES** in Spain, an NGO dedicated to sustainable development and working on ESC, has organized a video contest on sustainable consumption. With the support of the Spanish Ministry of the Environment, this NGO is also currently setting up an internet-based "Climate Ranking" campaign, to be launched in November 2008, with the objective of providing consumers with information on specific products’ impact on climate change (computers, mobile phones, textile, etc.). **Equiterre**, a Canada-based NGO, has developed a “Guide des Consom’acteurs” (Guide for consum’actors) in French and is running a campaign “Change the World, step by step”, to communicate on 12 simple individual actions to be taken everyday as a responsible consumer.

- **Business and advertisers** have a special role to play that requires further research. Numerous companies, especially in developed countries, have created communication and advertising campaigns on issues related to sustainable consumption. The social pressure put on business with regards to its role in the promotion of unsustainable consumerism values and habits is an important factor in this phenomenon. Those campaigns are diverse and...
often quite controversial, ranging from green marketing campaigns (promoting environmentally and socially responsible products, information on green labels) to sensitization targeting the general public. In addition, informing consumers on responsible and sustainable consumption choices has become a given place to the emergence of a social entrepreneurship market. For example, in Canada, the social enterprise “Ethiquette.ca – the Responsible Consumer Network” offers Quebec consumers online information on consumption choices (products, services) that reduce harm to the environment and improve social conditions 82.

The role of advertising in ESC is a subject of discussion, especially with regards to young people and children. Besides advertising campaigns explicitly promoting sustainable consumption, the regulation of the advertising sector has a specific status with regards ESC, in the sense that norms and limits also stand for strong societal and cultural signals in terms of what our society can accept when it comes to consumption patterns (e.g. in France, alcohol ads cannot represent human beings and tobacco ads are forbidden). One third of the European Union countries have already enacted specific rules on children and advertising in the framework of the Television without Frontiers Directive (Audiovisual Media Services Directive since 2007). Sweden remains a special case as it has enacted particularly restrictive rules to limit advertising aimed at children on TV: since 1991, advertising is forbidden during children TV shows. In Luxembourg and in Belgium, advertising is also forbidden prior to and after children TV shows 83. Self-regulation tools can also be developed, such as in France where a Charter for Ecoresponsible advertising was signed between the government and the president of the BVP (Bureau de Vérification de la Publicité) 84.

A great number of campaigns on sustainable development and from all sectors are presented and described in the Creative Gallery on Sustainability Communications developed by UNEP. This Gallery is a database that compiles communication and advertising campaigns from all around the world produced by companies, NGOs, governments, local authorities and all stakeholders concerned by the promotion of sustainable development in general as well as by the development of green products and services 85. The Council of Europe, in the framework of its actions on social policy also offers a review of initiatives on responsible consumption country by country in Europe 86. However, the gap between people’s recognition of and commitment to sustainability issues and their actual consumption habits remains a real challenge in terms of communication, primarily for public institutions but also for non-governmental actors involved in the sensitization of citizens. Guidelines and tools have been developed to help communicators organize campaigns on sustainable development, including sustainable consumption, adapted to their targets and objectives.

- With Futerra, a UK-based communications agency, UNEP has produced Communicating Sustainability. How to produce effective public campaigns, which offers guidelines to policymakers and communicators within public institutions to develop communication campaigns on sustainable development. The guide is intended to work as a toolkit, providing tips, ideas and best practice case studies for inspiration. Its success (more than 500 000 downloads on UNEP website only) demonstrates the intensity of the demand on behalf of public institutions 87.

---

82 See: http://www.ethiquette.ca
84 To see the BVP recommendations: http://www.bvp.org/fre/informations-generalistes/recommandations-deontologiques/integral-desrecommandations/
85 Numerous campaigns on sustainable consumption can be found on UNEP DTIE’s website through this database: http://www.unep.fr/scp/communications/ad/list.asp?cat=all
- The *Framework for a DESD Communication Strategy* in support of the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (2007) can also be an inspiring tool for communication on sustainable consumption to different target groups (policy makers, community leaders, trainers, educators, youth, households and families, etc.). It also identifies seven action areas: knowledge-building and knowledge sharing, advocacy and lobbying activities, capacity-building and training, support and advocacy for ESD, identifying key issues, platforms for dialogue, assessment of effectiveness and monitoring progress.

- Regarding business and awareness-raising, UNEP has produced a specific publication: *Talk the Walk-Advancing Sustainable Lifestyles through Marketing & Communications* which proposes key tips to develop appropriate marketing strategies and communicate effectively on sustainable goods and services. It notably targets marketing and communication departments of companies, advertising agencies and all communication experts.

### Workshop discussion

*Is it the role of public communication and awareness raising campaigns to integrate the principles and objectives of media literacy? How can businesses participate in raising public awareness with regards to sustainable consumption?*

**Proposal**

Public campaigns on sustainable consumption behaviours are useful in the long run but they should be associated with actions aimed at providing citizens the means to deal with advertising messages, which can be initiated by public actors and civil society. Businesses could contribute also through responsible communication.

### 2.4. Multi-Stakeholder Cooperation for ESC

The holistic dimension of ESC has rendered multi-stakeholder cooperation a common practice that calls for further development, especially at the local level. From formal education to public awareness, it has been recognized that education for sustainable consumption should be designed as a transversal approach requiring the involvement of all actors: public authorities, educational institutions and actors, youth networks, civil society, businesses, development and cooperation actors. NGOs concerned with sustainability and more specifically with sustainable consumption are particularly likely to build partnerships with other educational actors and stakeholders. For example, *ANPED, Eco Forum and EEB* among other NGOs are prepared to cooperate as partners in concrete national and international projects towards sustainable consumption and production to provide reliable public information and education as well as to ensure the accountability of policy makers (Ostend NGO Statement towards Sustainable Consumption and Production Patterns, EU Stakeholder Meeting 24-26.11.2004).

As mentioned above, **formal and non-formal education** on sustainable consumption are efficiently implemented through cooperation between education institutions and other stakeholders, especially at the local level.

- Teacher training on ESC benefits from multi-stakeholder involvement, which provides relevant and concrete resources. As an example, the College of Education at Florida Gulf Coast University, the School of Education at the Zurich University of Applied Sciences, the

---


89 To download this publication: http://www.unep.fr/shared/publications/pdf/DTIx0763xPA-TalkWalk.pdf.

City of Zurich and private sponsors have developed together the **Swiss International Program** (STIP), a custom-designed and university-based experience on ESD for elementary and secondary school teachers. Participants study ecology, economics, social and political issues pertinent to their respective countries in the world and learn how to understand the environmental and social impacts of their decisions as individuals 91.

- Overall, educators can cooperate with a great variety of partners (governments, civil society, media, businesses) in order to improve the quality of education on sustainable consumption. **Sandwatch**, a project supported by UNESCO, is a significant example in this regard. First developed locally then spread internationally, Sandwatch is a volunteer network of students, teachers, youth groups, nongovernmental and community based organizations working together to modify lifestyles and to develop awareness of marine and coastal fragile environment. It started in 1999 in the Caribbean and has become an inter-regional project involving other islands in Europe, Africa, Asia and South America. Education tools have been developed through this project such as guidelines for students to develop sustainable approaches to solve the problems facing their local environments 92. Specific initiatives and tools, built on the multi-stakeholder cooperation principles, have been developed at the international level:

- The United Nations University develops **Regional Centers of Expertise on ESD**, aimed at involving universities in community sustainability plans and strategies. Those centers bring together educators (schools and universities but also zoos, museums, NGOs, corporate trainers) and sources of relevant local information (governments, private sector, researchers) to enhance the quality of education as well as sense of citizenship. This model could be adapted to ESC as building coalitions and partnerships between individuals and organizations can provide up-to-date bases of expertise upon which teachers and students can draw 93.

- The 2008 **UNEP / UNESCO YouthXchange** Training Kit on Sustainable Consumption (available in 19 languages and through a complementary English/French website) is a train the trainer tool that aims to promote sustainable consumption patterns among young consumers worldwide. It provides statistics, case studies of community-based consumer actions, games, and alternatives for more sustainable lifestyles in a clear and entertaining approach to how sustainable development issues affect the daily lives of consumers. In the latest edition of the guidebook are the following features: a clear link between our consumption patterns and climate change, a more substantial e-waste section, updated data and scientific information and two new chapters: one on the UN Decade on Education for Sustainable Development and one on ethical fashion. Among these novelties, this guide strikes a balance between youths’ consumer aspirations while at the same time being aware of the impact of their consumption on, for example, climate change 94.

- The **LOLA** project (Looking for Likely Alternatives), launched in 2005 within the Consumer Citizenship Network, contains a learning and teaching pack that is focused on strengthening the connection between students and local communities to identify, evaluate and document cases of social innovation towards sustainable lifestyles 95.

**Here and Now** contains several recommendations on building partnerships between education institutions (schools, universities) and local stakeholders, including non-educational actors outside the school: it highlights the need to **strengthen connections**

---


92 For more information: [http://www.sandwatch.ca/](http://www.sandwatch.ca/)


94 YouthXchange website: [http://www.youthxchange.net](http://www.youthxchange.net)

95 For more information on Lola: [http://www.sustainable-everyday.net/lolaprocess/](http://www.sustainable-everyday.net/lolaprocess/)
between researchers, lecturers, teacher trainers and socio-economic actors and stakeholders, which can also involve intergenerational learning as an integrated aspect of education for sustainable consumption.

The integration of ESC in professional training, while being developed, should also build on multistakeholder cooperation and partnerships.

Although ESC is still rarely integrated in professional training institutions and programmes, it is clear that students and professionals benefit from the experience of various actors such as NGOs and businesses in this field. Such partnerships can be developed with universities: for example, in Kenya, non-governmental organizations (Consumers’ Voice, Consumer Unity and Trust Society, Youth Education Network) have cooperated with universities such as Kenyatta University and Nairobi University in presenting courses on consumer issues, including sustainable consumption 96. This could be developed within other institutions and organizations involved in professional and life-long learning, as well as within companies’ training programmes.

In the field of communication and awareness-raising, these kind of multi-stakeholders partnerships are often used as a dissemination tool. The ADEME’s national campaigns on energy use and waste management, mentioned above, are spread locally through numerous partnerships and events.

Another concrete example of local partnership to promote sustainable consumption is the initiative developed in the city of Heidelberg (Germany), where consumers have access to a card for purchasing “sustainable” goods and services (the “Umwelt.plus.karte or “eco-plus” card). This card was launched in 2002 and instigated by the Institute for Research on the Ecological Economy, the municipal department responsible for Agenda 21 and various local NGOs. An advertising agency is responsible for the operation, which receives 45,000 euros in funding from the Federal Ministry of Education and Research. This initiative has brought together more than 1700 users who can benefit from discounts on purchases and created a local network to foster social cohesion and good neighborhood relations 97.

| Workshop discussion |
| How can we mobilize all actors and bring them to cooperate for the development of methodologies and tools that are adapted to local realities and cultural contexts? |

Proposal

Strengthen connections between researchers, lecturers, teacher trainers and socio-economic actors and stakeholders, which can also involve intergenerational learning as an integrated aspect of education for sustainable consumption.

Bring NGOs and businesses to cooperate with universities to develop courses on sustainable consumption in the framework of professional and life-long learning.

Encourage companies to integrate the sustainable consumption topics in their own training programmes.

2.5. Evaluating ESC

Assessing and analyzing the impacts of ESC on perceptions, attitudes and behaviours among individuals but also among institutions and organizations from the public and private spheres is a necessary condition to adapt ESC to diverse populations, targets and societies.


97 More information is available on the website of the Council of Europe (Social Policy): http://www.coe.int/t/dg3/socialpolicies/platform/Observatory/pracRespCon_en.asp

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008
As highlighted in *Here and Now*: “**Education for sustainable consumption is, by definition, a form of education which evolves and requires modification and updating. Many topics which today are central to education for sustainable development were topics not imagined fifty years ago.**”

- Efficient ESC implementation also rests on a good understanding of the perceptions from various targets, and especially among young people. In this regards, research and reporting have a core role to play. The research networks working on ESC (Consumer Citizenship Network, SCORE, RESOLVE, etc.) are continuously conducting surveys and collecting useful data on people’s availability towards sustainability issues as related to their everyday life and as well as on the way they react to ESC actions. International organizations, such as the OECD or UNEP also run such surveys.

- Evaluating ESC, in order to enhance and update it on a regular basis, also means assessing the impacts of ESC policies and actions, in whatever field, on the project specificity itself and on both people’s attitudes and behaviours.

Every project, in formal and non-formal education, professional training or awareness-raising should include clear targets and evaluation objectives that can be used for future developments and shared with other actors of ESC. Indicators of different kinds can be used: such as a number of partners involved in the project, population reached, impact in the media, lifespan of the project, economic benefits including social and environmental criteria, impacts on representations and behaviors (through surveys, market research with the contribution of businesses). The latter is certainly the most difficult to measure.

- National public institutions are fully concerned with ESC evaluation when they have the means to create platforms where data can be collected from ESC actors, centralized and disseminated.

This stands as a strong recommendation of *Here and Now*: “**By sharing good practices, establishing indicators of progress and implementing mechanisms for monitoring, governments can follow and facilitate the development of education for sustainable consumption in their country.**”

- The United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE) has set up an Expert Group on Indicators for Education for Sustainable Development which report was released early 2008.

### Workshop discussion

*How can we assess the impact of ESC on attitudes and behaviors in educational institutions, at work and within the private sphere?*

**Proposal**

Encourage governments to follow and facilitate the development of ESC by sharing good practices, establishing indicators of progress and implementing mechanisms for monitoring. Encourage businesses and marketing specialists to communicate on the state of the markets and consumption trends.

Develop tools (including indicators, markets analysis) to assist projects, from formal education to awareness-raising, in defining clear targets and evaluation objectives and to communicate on their impacts in order to share information other ESC actors.

---

3. ESC AND COOPERATION IN THE EURO-MEDITERRANEAN REGION

3.1. Challenges and opportunities for a Euro-Mediterranean cooperation

Euro-Mediterranean cooperation is particularly important for the region, which is particularly interesting in terms of North-South contacts. Apart from the fact that a number of Mediterranean countries are also EU countries, the Mediterranean region and the EU as a whole are closely linked and interdependent by trade (e.g. the EU accounts for 75% of Tunisia’s total trade), energy interconnections, migratory flows and tourism (218 million visitors in 2000 in the Mediterranean region, 85% of whom were Europeans) 99. This interdependence is both a challenge and an opportunity to promote cooperation for ESC, as in many Mediterranean countries stability and prosperity depends on the capacity to implement sustainable development policies and patterns and involving citizens in this process.

In terms of initiatives and cooperation, the Mediterranean region has been involved in the Marrakech Process on Sustainable Consumption and Production. More specifically, Italy is leading the Marrakech Task Force on Education for Sustainable Consumption, and France is leading the Marrakech Task Force on Sustainable Tourism.

3.1.1. The Mediterranean Action Plan (MAP), the Barcelona Convention and the Mediterranean Strategy for Sustainable Development (MSSD):

The Mediterranean Action Plan (MAP) was adopted in 1975 by 16 Mediterranean countries and the European Community under the auspices of UNEP. Today it involves 21 countries and aims at protecting the environment and at fostering sustainable development in the Mediterranean region. It was revised in 1995, just as the Barcelona Convention for the Protection of the Mediterranean Sea Against Pollution first adopted in 1976, which is comprised in its legal framework of seven specific protocols100. A Mediterranean Commission on Sustainable Development was also created in 1995. The Mediterranean Action Plan works with several Regional Centers and among them the Blue Plan Regional Activity Center (BP/RAC) whose mission is to evaluate the future prospects of the region and offer comprehensive analysis of the potential impacts of development on the environment 101.

The Contracting Parties of the Barcelona Convention approved the Mediterranean Strategy for Sustainable Development (MSSD) in 2005. This strategy intends to adapt international commitment, such as the Millennium Development Goals, to regional conditions, to guide national sustainable development strategies and to initiate a dynamic partnership between countries at different levels of development. It notably recognizes sustainable consumption and production as a major and crosscutting objective in the Mediterranean region.

Among the regional activity centers involved in the development and implementation of the Mediterranean Action Plan, the Information and Communication Centre of the Barcelona Convention (INFO/RAC) and the Regional Activity Center for Cleaner Production (CP/RAC) are involved in Education for Sustainable Consumption 102. The INFO/RAC is designing and implementing the Information and Communication Strategy for the Mediterranean Strategy for Sustainable Development (MSSD) 103. The CP/RAC works on a practical level and plays a

100 For more information on the Mediterranean Action Plan and on the Barcelona Convention: http://www.unepmap.org/
101 Blue Plan Regional Activity Center: http://www.planbleu.org/indexUK.html
102 The CP/RAC aims at promoting sustainable production in the industrial, agricultural and tourism sectors as well as sustainable consumption in the Mediterranean region.
103 Information and Communication Centre of the Barcelona Convention: http://www.inforac.org/
key role in making sustainable consumption and production (SCP) an important part of the MSSD as well as of the Mediterranean Action Plan (MAP). As an illustration of this role, the Center is currently organizing the Mediterranean Roundtable on SCP in Barcelona (November 2008) to engage local stakeholders to move towards SCP and get their support for the inclusion of major related issues, such as Education for Sustainable Consumption, in the middle-term strategy of the Mediterranean Action Plan.

The Mediterranean Strategy for Sustainable Development echoes the Agenda MED 21 that was adopted in 1994 (Tunisia). In this document, Mediterranean countries commit to consumer education and protection, recognizing the importance of rethinking lifestyles and behavior patterns leading to waste and excessive consumption, depleting resources, as well as of promoting new concepts of prosperity, taking into consideration the heritage value of natural resources, securing a better quality of life while reducing the region’s dependence on non-renewable resources (Chapter IV “Changing consumption patterns”). In the Euro-Mediterranean cooperation context, the MSSD could also be linked to the European Strategy for Sustainable Development (adopted in 2001 and updated in 2006). This strategy includes sustainable consumption and production, as well as educating and training (for example, in 2006, the European parliament and Council adopted a lifelong learning programme to run 2007 – 2013) 104.

3.1.2. The Euro-Mediterranean Partnership and the Union for the Mediterranean:

In 1995, the Barcelona Euro-Mediterranean Conference gave birth to the Euro-Mediterranean Partnership between all EU members and some non-EU countries bordering the Mediterranean Sea. The creation of this partnership had several objectives: peace and stability, the gradual establishment of a free trade area, a social and cultural dialogue. Today, the Euro-Mediterranean Partnership has 39 members: 27 European Union member states, 3 EU Candidate States Croatia, Macedonia and Turkey, and 9 Mediterranean Partners (Algeria, Egypt, Israel, Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco, the Palestinian Authority, Syria and Tunisia). Libya has had observer status since 1999 105.

The Union for the Mediterranean, established on the 13th July 2008, is a development of the Euro-Mediterranean Partnership with projects that integrate sustainable development issues and objectives particularly related to coastal and marine areas and to energy. The establishment of a Mediterranean University aimed at enhancing cooperation in the field of higher education could also be an opportunity for the development of ESC at that level.

Inter-regional and regional institutions play an important role in promoting sustainable consumption through awareness-raising campaigns, market research but also regulatory frameworks and fiscal or economic incentives, technology and infrastructures necessary for encouraging sustainable behaviors.

3.2. ESC, national and regional Strategies

Shifting to sustainable consumption and production patterns in the Mediterranean region has become an urgent need. The economic development of its 21 countries exerts an important pressure both at the social and environmental levels that is expected to increase and to eventually undermine development itself. ESC as a major component of the regions’ needs in terms of sustainable development: water scarcity (with 60% of the world’s “water-poor” populations), population growth and rapid urbanization in coastal areas (427 million inhabitants today), growing waste generation and climate change (increasing 8.3% of CO2 emissions), massive tourism (with 32% of international tourism, and 218 million visitors). The Blue Plan’s Environment & Development Outlook has shown that, if nothing is done, the problems already encountered by the region and the resulting pressure on its environment and societies will reach critical stages. By 2025, tensions on water resources are expected for several countries (Egypt, 104 For more information on ESSD: http://ec.europa.eu/environment/eussd/
105 For more information: http://ec.europa.eu/external_relations/euromed/index_en.htm
Israel, Libya, Palestinian Territories, Spain, as well as in Malta, Syria, Tunisia and Morocco). 74% of population could become urban in the South and East of the region, with consequences in terms of waste management given that total volumes of produced waste could almost triple in the South and double in the North. Even though car ownership rates are still low in the South (124 cars per 1000 inhabitants in 2003 versus 592 in the North), they could increase up to the ‘automobile transition’ with major impacts in terms of congestion, noise, greenhouse gas emissions and air pollution. Under the pressure of tourism, coastal zones, a priceless capital for the region, could suffer grave degradation and loss 106.

The Mediterranean region is not one block and many differences exist between its Northern countries, which spread from Spain to Greece, including two insular states (Cyprus and Malta), and its Southern and Eastern Mediterranean countries, which spread from Morocco to Turkey. Mediterranean countries are very different in terms of consumption levels and patterns, household consumption in particular resulting from levels of development and living standards.

At the national level, national sustainable development strategies are well advanced in the region. According to the UN Division on Sustainable Development (National Sustainable Development Strategies NSDS map 2008): 7 countries are currently implementing their national strategy for sustainable development (Spain, France, Italy, Greece, Montenegro, Algeria, Tunisia) and 3 are developing their strategy (Morocco, Malta, Israel) 107. Through the development of these national strategies as well as the various mechanisms of Euro-Mediterranean cooperation, the challenge is also to reach new consumption and production patterns to contribute to more sustainable management of natural and human resources in the interest of economic and social development.

3.3. Existing initiatives on ESC in the Mediterranean region

The shift towards sustainable water and energy demands, urban growth, coastal zones and tourism will not be possible without responsible consumption behaviours. In all these sectors, efforts in communication and training are needed. Key conditions for change include information on progress towards sustainable development, raising awareness, evolution of training and progress monitoring through observatories and indicators.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Highlights: ESC and tourism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>According to the World Tourism Organization (WTO), 1.6 billion tourists could be traveling by 2020. The environmental, social and economic impacts of such of phenomenon are very important, significantly for the Mediterranean region that represents 32% of international tourism. Education for Sustainable Consumption is key for a sustainable development of tourism, contributing to the improvement of living conditions, preserving local environments and resources, and respecting cultural identities. Indeed, tourists have an impact as consumers through the choices they make in terms of destinations and activities: an increasing demand for more sustainable tourism services and facilities can greatly influence the development of this sector as well as national development policies.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Training and awareness tools for tourists and professionals on good practices can be developed and adapted to regional contexts such as the Mediterranean (e.g. on water and energy use in hotels). UNEP has notably launched the Green Passport, a global Internet-based campaign for responsible travel that provides tourists with green travel tips and means to contribute to sustainable development during their holidays.</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The CP/RAC has taken several initiatives in this perspective: in 2008, a magazine on sustainable consumption of fish\textsuperscript{108} and a leaflet on sustainable alternative ways of tourism\textsuperscript{109} have been developed; in 2009, CP/RAC will launch a short video on sustainable consumption as well as a database on sustainable consumption of domestic products.

At the national level, ESC initiatives taken by public authorities in the Mediterranean region are more frequent in its northern part. Spain, Italy and France have organized or supported campaigns on sustainable consumption, among which a number have been mentioned above (campaigns organized by the ADEME or by the Ministry of Ecology in France, local campaigns and events in Italy such as “Ribelli per Natura” campaign, environmental household education in Spain). Initiatives taken in the southern Mediterranean countries more often focused on water use. Tunisia has implemented a national irrigation water-saving strategy including the creation of user associations. This policy has stabilized irrigation water demand despite agricultural development, and the needs of both the tourism sector and cities have been assured. On the other hand, the priorities defined in the sustainable development strategy of the Moroccan Ministry for Land-Use Planning, Water and the Environment focus on water management, biodiversity, energy use, renewable energies, and sustainable tourism but do not make direct reference to programmes aimed at consumers\textsuperscript{110}.

NGOs are well involved in sustainable development in the Mediterranean region. The Regional Activity Center for Cleaner Production (CP/RAC) produced a report on “Sustainable Consumption and Civil Society in the Mediterranean” in 2007 to analyze the role of civil society in the development and implementation of policies and initiatives related to sustainable consumption. It has notably shown that three different stages of development can be described in the Mediterranean region: “On one side, Southern Europe, where CSOs, administrations and, to a lesser extent, businesses are accepting and incorporating criteria for responsible consumption; te Balkan region, still underway, with active organizations that are attempting to raise public awareness and pressure current governments; and the Middle East and Maghreb, in early stages where, timidly, sustainable consumption is beginning to be promoted as a tool for solving major problems such as poverty, disease, erosion or a shortage of basic resources.”\textsuperscript{111}

The Mediterranean Information Office for Environment, Culture and Sustainable Development (MIOECSDE)\textsuperscript{112}, a federation of NGOs based in Greece, gathers 105 members from 24 countries. This federation participates in the regional arenas where sustainable development and especially education issues are discussed, develops and supports initiatives as well as sensitization campaigns. For example, MIOECSDE, HELMEPA and Clean-up Greece, with the support of UNEP, have launched the “Keep the Mediterranean Litter-free Campaign”. This campaign is aimed at raising public awareness on the pollution of the sea from solid waste. A brochure has been produced in 11 languages (Albanian, Arabic, English, French, Greek, Hebrew, Italian, Maltese, Portuguese, Spanish and Turkish). MIO-ECSDE has produced several publications and guidelines on awareness-raising: for example, “Public Awareness for the Management of Marine Litter in the Mediterranean” which presents, in the framework of the above mentioned campaign, a common regional approach on how to raise awareness and educate all stakeholders in the Mediterranean about solid waste management; “Public Participation, Environmental

\textsuperscript{108} More information in the leaflet downloadable at: \url{http://www.cprac.org/pdf/triptics/peix/peix_eng.pdf} in English and at \url{http://www.cprac.org/pdf/triptics/peix/peix_fr.pdf} in French

\textsuperscript{109} More information at: \url{http://www.cprac.org/pdf/triptics/turisme/turisme_eng.pdf} in English and at \url{http://www.cprac.org/pdf/triptics/turisme/turisme_fr.pdf} in French

\textsuperscript{110} Regional Activity Centre for Cleaner Production, Sustainable consumption and production in the Mediterranean. Innovative approaches to sustainable consumption and production, Annual Technical Publication n°7, March 2008

\textsuperscript{111} “Sustainable Consumption and Civil Society in the Mediterranean”, Regional Activity Centre for Cleaner Production (CP/RAC), 2007

\textsuperscript{112} MIO-ECSDE: \url{http://www.mio-ecsde.org/}

« Working together on Education for Sustainable Development »
Bordeaux international conference, October 27-29, 2008

MIO-ECSDE is also a close partner of the UNEP / UNESCO YouthXchange programme in the Mediterranean region since 2007: through this partnership, the content of the YXC guide has been adjusted to the Greek local context and capacity-building workshops are being held among schools, environmental NGOs and youth networks.

As an international programme aimed at supporting ESC through educators and multi-stakeholder partnerships, the **YouthXchange programme** is currently proposing to develop a specific project in the Maghreb region (Tunisia, Algeria, Morocco) in partnership with local stakeholders, UNESCO and UNDP. The Regional Activity Center for Cleaner Production (CP/RAC) has already actively contributed to the implementation of the UNEP UNESCO YouthXchange programme in Greece. It has adapted the UNEP Resource Training Kit on Sustainable Consumption and Production to Arabic, Spanish and Catalan. The Center also has co-organized a seminar on eco-labeling in Egypt and is participating in a new one in Syria this year.

The **Euro-Mediterranean Clearing House for the Environment** is a model of a platform that could be developed to exchange experiences and information on ESC in the Mediterranean region. This online portal aims at facilitating access and exchange of environmental information in the Mediterranean region: the information is collected and published through joint efforts of a network of environmental actors in the region including regional environmental projects and organizations, Ministries of environment and affiliated agencies, universities, etc.

### 3.4. Pilot projects and development agencies

Strengthening multilateral and bilateral regional cooperation for sustainable development is another major prerequisite for change. ESC can be implemented through co-development and the concept of pilot projects based on exchange of experiences between actors (resources, methodologies, tools, evaluation).

The role of development agencies in this process should be highlighted and reinforced. Development agencies provide development assistance, i.e. international transfers through loans or grants at the bilateral or multilateral level. In the Framework of the Marrakech process on sustainable consumption and production, UNEP has conducted a **review with 19 development agencies** (10 bilateral and 9 multilateral) to identify their SCP-related projects, find mechanisms for cooperation and better integrate SCP in their programmes. The results of this review show that all agencies place poverty reduction, as targeted through the Millennium Development Goals, and environmental issues high up on their agenda. In this context, sustainable consumption and production issues are also addressed through sectoral approaches such as energy efficiency (86% of the agencies), waste management (75%) and water resource management (76%).

The French development agency is largely involved in Mediterranean projects and works closely with the Blue Plan. GTZ, a German international cooperation enterprise for sustainable development, (Algerian-German programme for environmental management, integrated water management programme in Algeria, environment management in Morocco and environmental management in Adriatic coastal zones in Croatia).

However, it also appears that 79% of the agencies are not familiar with and do not use the concept of SCP. In addition, training and education are among the sectors in which SCP is least integrated (only 44%). There are also major differences between bilateral and multilateral agencies: 60% of bilateral agencies promote environmental education

---

113 See: http://smap.ew.eea.europa.eu/
programmes, against 22% of multilateral agencies. On the other hand, public awareness campaigns tend to be more supported by multilateral agencies (44%) than by bilateral agencies (only 10%). A review of the projects supported by bilateral cooperation agencies in Europe and North America shows that education is also high up on agencies' agenda, especially in the Mediterranean region. The Canadian International Development agency has several projects on supporting the development and modernization of vocational training and education system (e.g. in Morocco, Tunisia, Algeria). The French development agency, largely involved in the Mediterranean region, also has a few projects related to education or teacher training (e.g. in Morocco, Lebanon, Algeria). However, both types of agencies seldom support education for sustainable consumption and research on consumer behaviour. Poverty reduction being the number one priority of all development agencies, it is important to put into light the link between this objective and the promotion of SCP patterns, making better use of the natural resources and creating new job and market opportunities.

Resources are available. For example, the **Clean Development Mechanisms** for projects that reduce CO2 emissions at the **World Bank** can be used to develop ESC projects promoting sustainable energy use, sustainable transports or tourism.

Environment management projects supported by development agencies are likely to participate in the promotion of ESC in the Mediterranean. However, the review of agencies’ current activities shows that only a few projects include information and sensitization objectives, which are not identified as directly related to sustainable consumption. For example, the GTZ supports several projects in Mediterranean countries that involve environmental education (e.g. Algeria, Tunisia). More specifically, the Algerian-German programme for environmental management is working to raise the population’s awareness of environmental protection. Seminars, a “Green Theatre” and a “Green Radio” are used as instruments. An “environment train” helps put across environmental messages. The Environment Train was an exhibition that introduced people to environmental issues and national policy, shown in a train carriage. The ‘gallery’ traveled round the Algerian rail network for five months, visiting 23 cities and reaching over a million people.

Of course, other campaigns at the local level certainly exist but they still remain out of our vision, it is important to build tools that will give all ESC initiatives in the region a better visibility and that will allow actors to exchange information and experiences. More visibility and interaction between actors will also contribute to highlight the way these experiences could be replicated in other parts of the world.

**Workshop discussion**

*How can we integrate ESC in the implementation of the Mediterranean Action Plan, in particular the Mediterranean Strategy for Sustainable Development (MSSD)? What is the role of development agencies in this?*

*Can we identify specific issues for the different Mediterranean countries in the field of ESC and what kind of pilot projects can be developed with which expected outcomes?*

**Proposal**

Building partnerships with Euro-Mediterranean institutions in order to encourage the integration of ESC into related policies and cooperation frameworks (especially poverty and environment); test through demo projects (YXC Maghreb).

Organize surveys and consultations in the Mediterranean countries in order to identify specific issues and priorities in the field of ESC that can lead to pilot projects. In this perspective, relate sustainable consumption and tourism in national sustainable development strategies.
4. RESSOURCES


- Regional Activity Centre for Cleaner Production, *Sustainable consumption and production in the Mediterranean. Innovative approaches to sustainable consumption and production*, Annual Technical Publication n°7, March 2008

- Australian Research Institute in Education for Sustainability (ARIES), *Whole-school approaches to sustainability: An international review of whole-school sustainability programs*, 2004


*************
Also supported by:
Région Provence-Alpes-Côte d’Azur
Éco-Emballages - Association Naturalia et Biologia
SNCF - Air France
the UNESCO Office in Venice - BRESCE